

# G.L.S. Shackle's library and his readings: An archival excursus and an addendum to Meadows (1997)

Constantinos Repapis<sup>1</sup>

25/07/2017

## Abstract

This brief note gives an addendum to Meadows (1997) of G.L.S. Shackle's working library during his lifetime and an account of his marginal annotations during the first, formative period of his academic life- this is the period from the early 1930s until the end of WWII. The narratives that this material can give rise to, have been explored in a companion paper (Repapis (2017)). What this note details is the extent and wealth of the material, showing that it is both unique, and an important source in our efforts to understand the contemporary reception of the developments in economic theory in the 1930s, and more broadly during the 20<sup>th</sup> century.

## I. Introduction

*Pigmei Gigantum humeris impositi plusquam ipsi Gigantes vident*  
(*Didacus Stella (in Luc. 10, tom. 2) as reported in Merton, 1965, 3*)

Archival material takes many forms: unpublished letters between academics, drafts of published papers, unpublished papers by celebrated authors, to name a few. Most of this material is used to reconstruct the thought pattern and intellectual influences behind the key writings of an academic that made contributions that advanced aspects or even changed the discipline in which these contributions were made. In this mind frame historians of economic thought have compiled the working libraries that key economists had in their homes or studies- celebrated examples are Anne Robert Jacques Turgos' library (Tsuda (1974-5)), Adam Smith's library (Bonar (1932), Yainahara (1951), Mizuta (1967)), Thomas Robert Malthus' library (Harrison (1983)) and more recently Piero Sraffa's library (De Vivo (2014)). For want of a better name, I call these examples of *the writer's library*.<sup>2</sup> Adjacent, if conceptually separate to this category, are libraries that have become central in the history of economic thought because they bring together an almost complete corpus of material published in an era. In this category the most celebrated examples are the two libraries compiled by Herbert Foxwell, now the core of two world known collections in the history of economic thought:

---

<sup>1</sup> Institute of Management Studies, Goldsmiths, University of London. E-mail: [c.repapis@gold.ac.uk](mailto:c.repapis@gold.ac.uk). I would like to thank Victoria Chick for suggesting that I compile Shackle's working library, and Geoff Harcourt for comments and feedback.

<sup>2</sup> Calling it a writer's library almost comes from the title of Bonar's (1932) catalogue, which is *A catalogue of the library of Adam Smith: author of the "Moral sentiments" and "The wealth of nations"*.

the Kress Library of Business and Economics, at Harvard University and the Goldsmiths Library of Economic Literature, in Senate House Library, University of London. Other examples of this type are the personal collections of Luigi Einaudi (Spinazzola (1981)), Jacob Hollander (Marsh (1937)) and Gustave Schelle (Schelle (1962)). This second category of libraries come some way towards another type of list, which I will call *the reader's library*. We can therefore view these different libraries and their compositions as three distinct points on an axis. At the writer's corner we have the celebrated example of Adam Smith's library, and the substantial effort that has gone into compiling his library. All of this work is because we wish to know the books that influenced him in writing *The Wealth of Nations* and *The Theory of Moral Sentiments*. The middle ground is occupied by libraries of titanic proportions. Foxwell's effort to capture more broadly and exactly the intellectual atmosphere of the period, by compiling a list not only of its celebrated books, but also of secondary literature, and even of ephemera and anonymous pamphlets and broadsheets, yielded libraries that were encyclopaedic in their scope and reach. But because of their size they defy human proportion. No reader, academic or lay, had read all of this material. More so the library by its size and all-inclusiveness does not give us a good indication of the importance of one text vis-à-vis another in the mind of the period's reading public. We do not know which texts a reader kept with him/her for some time, which became instant but easily forgotten successes and which planted seeds, humble at first that blossomed only after some time.<sup>3</sup> If we follow the axis of this taxonomy to its other end we may come up with an entirely different reason for compiling working libraries; not because an author is in himself/herself important, nor also because we want to map completely the published output of an era, but also because we want to see an example of a reader and how he/she charted his/her way through the published output of the period. From this perspective, *a reader's working library* together with his/her marginal annotations gives us an example of this process of reception of ideas—an example that is bound in space and time and can give us a wealth of information on the intellectual context of the material printed at that time.

This note is devoted to the material that compose both a *writer's* and a *reader's* library. G.L.S. Shackle is an important economist of the 20<sup>th</sup> century and as such his library and the marginal annotations that we find in his books and periodicals are important in helping us chart his intellectual evolution, and the influences that contributed to his theoretical output. He is, however, also important as a reader. From this angle we can get a view of reader responses to some of the key texts of the profession during the 20<sup>th</sup> century. As a reader the material that survives from the start of his career is extremely rich. We have both a list of his books and the periodicals that he read. Furthermore, Shackle devised an intricate system of marginal annotations that is described in Repapis (1997) and allows us to chart in detail the evolution of his reading, especially during the first formative decade of his academic life. This is the subject of Repapis (1997). In this note, in the next two sections, we simply outline the material available in the archives that may be of interest to researchers working on Shackle or on the reception of economic ideas more generally.

---

<sup>3</sup> The only strong indication that these libraries give of the importance of a monograph is the times it has been republished, and therefore, by proxy its popularity in sales. This is very useful –if partial information on the contemporary reception of ideas-, and it has led to interesting lists of best-selling books in economics (see Carpenter (1975)).

## II. Shackles' Working Library of Academic Writings

Shackle's working library was comprised of periodicals and books that he bought throughout his life.<sup>4</sup> We have little knowledge of the periodicals to which he subscribed and kept outside his earlier period that ends with WWII. For this earlier period most of the periodicals he subscribed to and are annotated could be found in the University Library, Cambridge. This collection is discussed in the next section. A large part of his collection of periodicals of the period after WWII was donated to the Andersonian Library of Strathclyde University, and presumably to Liverpool when he retired in 1969. However, no list of these donations survives.

Although our knowledge on Shackle's periodicals ends abruptly during WWII, we can piece together a more complete picture of the books Shackle owned over his lifetime- his working library, and when and where he donated which of his books. The majority of Shackle's books, the location of which is still known, are in the following four collections: Shackle Archive, University Library, Cambridge; St. Edmund's College Library, Cambridge; Shackle Archive, Liverpool University, and Sydney Jones and Associate Libraries, Liverpool University. By far the greatest collection of these is Shackle's donation of books to the University of Liverpool in 1969, the year he retired. The circumstances and a complete list of this donation can be found in Shackle's archive in the University Library, Cambridge.<sup>5</sup>

Table 1 lists the books that we know Shackle donated to the various libraries during his lifetime or were donated by Catherine Shackle after his death. This table, which also includes a number of volumes that we know that Shackle owned but have been lost, together with the list compiled by Meadows (1997), forms a fairly complete list of Shackle's books over his lifetime.<sup>6</sup> The about 200 books found in Meadows (1997) have been sold off, but the catalogue that exists gives an extensive list of the markings (readings or other marginalia) that existed in these books. From this list and from what Meadows (1997) notes in his introduction when he was compiling this list, it can be argued that the most heavily annotated volumes still survive in the archives and can still be accessed. These two lists together amount to about 400 books that Shackle owned over his lifetime, almost evenly distributed in the two lists (Meadows (1997) and table 1).<sup>7</sup> This does not mean that Shackle bought- or even read- every one of these books. A number of them are presentations by the authors, or/and may have been bought by Shackle but never opened, or only sections read. This is quite expected for any academic- the advantage that Shackle's library offers is that he almost always left some kind of marginalia when he was reading academic books and papers, so there is a trail that gives us an idea of his interaction with every book extant. Even the ones we know only through Meadows (1997) we can still have an idea of Shackle's interaction with this material, as Meadows noted for every book entry if it has substantial marginalia or not, occasionally also transcribing some of the annotations.

---

<sup>4</sup> This section is devoted to Shackle's library of academic books. We know very little of his books in other fields- literature, religion, etc. These parts of his personal library remain entirely unknown. They are not catalogued in Meadows (1997) and there are almost no donations of these books anywhere.

<sup>5</sup> Liverpool does not hold a list of the donations, and until recently, such a list was considered lost. It was found in 2016 after an extensive search of the Shackle archive in the UL, Cambridge which unearthed uncatalogued sections of the Shackle archive. The file is Add. 7669/13 and this is material given by Frowen or Victoria Chick sometime after 1995. Victoria Chick would have given part of these notes in 2008 (according to her recollections) and Frowen possibly earlier in that decade. The exact day these and other folders entered the Shackle archive remains unknown, other than the knowledge that they remain outside the formal catalogues compiled during Shackle's lifetime or close to his death.

<sup>6</sup> These lists do not include pamphlets, offprints and other ephemera that can be found in Shackle's archives. Some are listed in Meadows (1997).

<sup>7</sup> These lists do not include the books he wrote or contributed chapters to. A list of these writings can be found in (Ford, 1994, 490-503) and an Addendum in (Meadows, 1997, 3-4).

Table 1 and Meadows (1997) allows us to make some general observations about Shackle's working library and its evolution over his lifetime. Its beginnings can be found in the early 1930s, when he decided to become an academic, and did a Ph.D. at the LSE. Table 2 lists all the books owned by Shackle which were published until 1946. These 36 books show his interest and readings at the start of his academic career. It is immediately apparent that Shackle was interested in business cycle theory and the developments in the field that will claim the name 'macroeconomics' after WWII. Thus, until 1946 we find in Shackle's bookshelves two copies of Keynes' *General Theory*<sup>8</sup>, and with it books by Meade, Hayek, Harrod, Pigou, Haberler, Kalecki, Myrdal and Lindahl. Another but related group- if we create a dichotomy- is empirical and 'econometric' studies of business cycles. There we find J.M. Clark's *Strategic Factors*, and the two monographs by Tinbergen that relate to the exchange with Keynes on econometric validation of theories. Also, Shackle is following what is happening in imperfect competition, and he buys books by Chamberlain, Triffin and Standl. His increasing interest in the theory of probability and its relation to human behaviour can also be charted: he buys a copy of Keynes' *Treatise on Probability*, (1943 reprint), A first edition of Von Neumann's and Morgenstern's, *Theory of Games* (1944) and Kerrich's *An Experimental Introduction to the Theory of Probability* (1946). What is very interesting to observe is Shackle's continued interest in the 30s and 40s in algebra, calculus and general maths textbooks. Some of these he read in detail, and indeed Albert's *Introduction to Algebraic Theories* is one of the most heavily annotated books in the whole collection.

After this formative period Shackle's book collection both expands and becomes more directly related to the work he devoted a large part of his academic life to: uncertainty and decision theory. Table 1 gives a good indication of the topics that Shackle was interested in. It can be seen that Shackle has extensive collections of some authors' work, and this could be either because he was following their research and buying their latest book or because the book was given to him, usually by the author himself/herself. An example of the first category would be John Hicks where Shackle owned not only the four books listed in table 1, but also *Capital and Growth* (1965) and a *Market Theory of Money* (1989) (Meadows, 1997, pp. 78-9), which shows that Shackle followed and read Hicks' work throughout his lifetime. Of the second kind, an example is Fosatti's books in Italian, published from the 1950s until the early 1960s, which Shackle donated to the University of Liverpool in 1969.

Furthermore, in later life Shackle's library got increasingly more volumes on what would now be called history of economic thought, and heterodox economics, especially Austrian and Post-Keynesian Economics. This is not necessarily because he substantially bought volumes in these categories. More often than not, these were presentations by authors who quoted, referred or were influenced by Shackle's work. His readings from the 1970s and 1980s that survive also show an interest in a return to central or key books; an example would be his purchase of Keynes' *Treatise on Money* which is from the collected works edition in 1971, and he read extensively in the 70s. This is because during this time he wrote a number of articles and book chapters on Keynes, Marshall and more generally on the history of economic thought.

In later life Shackle's eyesight deteriorated, with Mrs Shackle and Mrs Dyter read to him, making marginal annotations of what Shackle said and the dates that the readings took place. It is because of this practice that we know of Shackle's last reading which was Loasby's, *Equilibrium and evolution. An exploration of connecting principles in economics*. On page 3, in the section *Reliable Knowledge*,

---

<sup>8</sup> One of the rare instances where we can be certain that Shackle owned two copies of the same book. The only other case when this seems to be the case is Leijonhufvud (1968).

next to the sentence “no matter how many instances we have found that conform to a proposed general rule, we can never be quite certain that the next instance which we come across will also conform to it” (Loasby, 1989, 3), we find the following marginal annotation by Mrs. Dyter “3/3/92 Prof. Shackle died while I was reading this” (Dyter, 1992, marginalia on Loasby, 1989, p. 3, in St. Edmund’s College Library, University of Cambridge).

### III. The Shackle Archives

G.L.S. Shackle’s papers are divided across a number of archives, with the two most prominent collections found in the Manuscripts Room, University Library, Cambridge and the Special Collections and Archives, Sydney Jones Library, University of Liverpool.<sup>9</sup> In both collections and elsewhere, the material from the 1930s and early 1940s is limited, and we have no diaries, notebooks, notes from lectures he attended or perhaps gave, not even extensive drafts with notes and changes of the articles that Shackle wrote at that time or even much correspondence, with only a few letters for the period 1938-1949 in the University Library, Cambridge and Nuffield College, Oxford, Archives.<sup>10</sup> The most substantial unpublished material from this period are his marginal annotations and pasted-in notes, in books and periodicals that he owned during that time. A run of volumes from the following academic periodicals: *The Economic Journal*, *Economica*, *Review of Economic Studies*, and *Oxford Economic Papers*, can be found in box 17 of the Shackle collection (catalogue no. Add. 7669), University Library, Cambridge, and were given by Professor Stephen Frowen to the then keeper of the library, Dr. P.N.R. Zutshi in February 1993. The complete list of volumes, that includes also single volumes owned by Shackle and found in other parts of the Cambridge archive and in other archives, is given in Table 3. I discuss in turn the strengths and limitations of the material found that constitute two parts (periodicals and books) of Shackle’s working library during the first fifteen years of his academic life.

The collection in the University Library seems to have half of all *Economica* volumes published between 1934 and 1938,<sup>11</sup> and 1/3 of the *Economic Journals* published between 1931 and 1940. The collection is thinner for the *Review of Economic Studies*<sup>12</sup> and *Oxford Economic Papers*.<sup>13</sup> Furthermore, nineteen of the thirty volumes found are from the period 1934-37, which broadly corresponds to Shackle’s LSE period, including the year exactly before joining in January 1935 and after moving to Oxford in 1937. This agglomeration goes well with the biographical fact that this was an active period intellectually, exploring new ideas that formed core parts of his later theoretical outlook. His readings at the time together with the lectures he attended and the intellectual environment at the LSE left a lifelong impression on him.

---

<sup>9</sup> A catalogue of the Shackle papers in the University Library can be found in (Cann 2000) but this list does not record later donations, and a more up to date catalogue is on-line at Janus. A catalogue of the Liverpool archive is also available on-line.

<sup>10</sup> The correspondence that survives before 1950 in the University Library, Cambridge is nine letters between Shackle and Keynes, Harrod and Robertson. Furthermore, Nuffield College Library holds correspondence between Shackle and Lord Cherwell from 1940-45. Shackle’s epistolary at the time must have been much more extensive. For example, we know through a number of biographical sources (see e.g. Ford 1993, 685 footnote IV) that Shackle received letters from Jacob Marschak and Henry Phelps Brown offering him a research position in Oxford in 1937. These letters are in none of the known Shackle archives.

<sup>11</sup> There is another *Economica* volume from February 1939 in another part of the Shackle UL archive, but it has no marginal annotations.

<sup>12</sup> It is worth noting that Shackle was on the editorial board of the RES from 1936 until the war (unspecified exact date) according to the archives of the RES.

<sup>13</sup> For *Oxford Economic Papers* this is to be expected given it was first published only in 1938.

However, a question of ‘why only these volumes?’ remains. From the biographies of this period that have been compiled (see e.g. Repapis (2017)) he appears to have had subscriptions to the *Economic Journal* at least since 1931 and *The Review of Economic Studies* and *Oxford Economic Papers* from their first issue. So the question is what happened to the rest of the volumes? Why are they not in the archive?

Earl and Littleboy in their recent biography also noted gaps in the archive. They write: “Although Shackle did much to invite researchers to study his ideas, there may be gaps in the archival materials he chose to disclose. He says nothing about the theology he may have read. His private library remains private” (Earl and Littleboy, 2014, 16). This may explain to some extent why there are some important missing pieces, and it is worth noting that box 17 of the Cambridge Library Collection, where the bulk of the periodicals are found, was put under restricted access as long as Frowen lived, in case some of the marginal annotations were found to be offensive.<sup>14</sup> Also, some (very few) marginal annotations appeared to have been erased prior to the journals joining the archive. Even if we consider this cautious attitude when the selection of the journals to be preserved in the archive was made, the question why only these volumes remains.

The most likely explanation, supported by Zutshi<sup>15</sup> is that only these volumes from Shackle’s private library had any marginalia and therefore were deemed worth preserving. Zutshi notes that the archive would not accept duplicates of journals the library already held in its open shelves if they had no marginal annotations. Zutshi further noted that the selection of the journals was done probably by Professor Frowen, and definitely not by him or anyone else of the library staff. One remaining question is: Had any marginalia, or marginalia worth preserving according to whoever did the selection? There are indications that whoever did the selection did not consider dates, which signified readings, or indeed other minor marginalia, like vertical lines at the side of a passage that highlight a section of the text, as important annotations. Therefore, it is reasonable to assume that the selection process preserved all volumes that had any marginalia that articulated at least a thought by Shackle, but not volumes with marginalia on readings only- if such readings existed. If this conjecture is correct, we at least know that articles that captured Shackle’s attention enough to motivate him to make at least one written comment are preserved, but we have no way of knowing for certain if he read and dated other articles from the missing volumes.<sup>16</sup> It is worth remembering that Shackle had a very active life moving between places from the early 30s until his death. Volumes may have been lost and this may be the reason they are not in the collection,<sup>17</sup> so we should treat these readings as, at places, a partial picture of his academic journal readings at the time.

---

<sup>14</sup> A reading of the annotations does not explain this extreme caution, but Shackle, and Frowen by proxy, appeared to be very sensitive in case some mild critical comments gave offence to other economists.

<sup>15</sup> Private correspondence on 5/8/2015.

<sup>16</sup> Two volumes, one of *Economica* (February 1939) and of *The Economic Journal* (September 1938), that have been found outside box 17 hold no marginal annotations of any kind, which gives further evidence in favour of the hypothesis that the volumes with annotations have, almost entirely, been preserved.

<sup>17</sup> For example, a glaring gap in the archive is the volumes (issues 33-35) of *Economica* that debated Keynes’ *Treatise on Money*. We know from his published work (Shackle (1933)) that he read at least the exchange between Hayek (Hayek (1931, 1932)) and Keynes (Keynes (1931)) as well as Hawtrey’s review of *Prices and Production* (Hawtrey (1932)). It is, however, possible that he did not subscribe to the Old Series of *Economica*, as we find in his archive the first volume from the New Series, and the volumes from then onwards. So maybe he read this material by accessing library copies. A similar question arises on whether he owned a copy of Keynes’ *Treatise on Money* is discussed below.

It is partial picture for two other reasons as well. First, we do not know what he read outside these four journals; that is, from periodicals he presumably did not subscribe to but would have been found in the LSE library, the Bodleian or elsewhere. For example, we know from his later reminiscences that he considered Keynes' 1937 article in *the Quarterly Journal of Economics* as very influential at the time, but we do not know when he read it and what notes he made. No substantial notes of 1930s readings from other journals survive in notebooks or loose leaf, to give us a picture of his other readings.<sup>18</sup> Nevertheless, if we take a realistic view of the material that survives, supported by the fact that he held the copies of these journals until the end of his life, we can argue that we have an almost complete schedule of his readings of these four main journals. If we further argue that his readings outside these journals was nowhere near as extensive, and definitely not habitual, then we have one of the most complete resources on the reception of theoretical developments in economic journals during the 1930s from the perspective of a contemporary reader.

Furthermore, knowledge of his ownership and reading of academic books is a more laborious affair because the remaining volumes are in a number of collections and in Meadows (1997). His books can be found primarily in the following collections:

- 1) University Library, Cambridge. Therein we have a box of books [Box 16] with marginal annotations probably picked and donated by Frowen from Shackle's working library after his death.
- 2) Special Archive, Liverpool University Library. Therein there are 28 books owned by Shackle, picked from his 1969 donation to the university as the books with most of his marginal annotations.
- 3) General Collection, Liverpool University Library. Most books hold few or no annotations by Shackle except, perhaps, indications of dated readings, (and this is why they have not been placed in the Special Archive), but there are exceptions to this rule especially for books from the 1930s and 40s, which appear to have been donated before 1969, when the Liverpool Shackle archive was created. Some of these earlier donations have extensive annotations.
- 4) St. Edmund's Library, Cambridge University. This holds a list of books given to the library by Catherine Shackle and/or Frowen and his family after Frowen's death. The library holds mostly books from the last period of Shackle's life.

An important piece of the puzzle in discovering a sizable part of Shackle's working library was found in the Shackle's archive in Cambridge which yielded a list of the books he donated to Liverpool upon his retirement in 1969.<sup>19</sup> Table 1 lists all the books donated by Shackle in 1969 to Liverpool, together

---

<sup>18</sup> However, some loose notes relating to articles in other journals are found attached in the journals he owned. For example, attached to an article by Gifford in the *Economic Journal* Shackle had read (Gifford (1933)), we find a note relating to an *Econometrica* article by Gifford on the same topic (Gifford (1935)). It is therefore reasonable to assume that he read articles in academic journals he did not subscribe to but found in the libraries he had access to.

<sup>19</sup> Liverpool University Library has no list of the gift of books Shackle gave to the library when he retired in 1969 or at any other time. From the list found in the Shackle archive in the University Library, Cambridge, we know that all the books in the Shackle archive are from his donations in 1969. It is also clear that the ones preserved in the Liverpool Shackle archive are the most heavily annotated books of that donation. However, there are books that clearly belonged to Shackle and are part of the general collection in Liverpool- but do not appear on the 1969 donation list. This must have been a donation at an earlier date, much smaller in quantity than the 1969 one, and of books he was not using anymore. It is safe to assume that most of that smaller donation was in the single digit numbers, and probably on inter-war business cycle theory he was not following any more (circa late 50s or 60s). An extensive search of the open stacks of the Sydney Jones Library has been undertaken and a number of books found. It is, of course, possible that single volumes have been missed; Liverpool library has an extensive economics section, and it is impossible to do a complete search.

with the books found in all other collections. To return to the earlier formative period of Shackle's academic life, for which we also have his periodical readings, there are 36 books that have been identified as owned by Shackle and published before 1946. These are listed chronologically in table 2.

From this earlier period there are four books which from a variety of biographical narratives, reminiscences, and other archive material (letters, notes, unpublished papers), appear to be important to Shackle, and there are clear indications that Shackle read them during the 30s, but, unfortunately, are now lost. I discuss these in turn:

- 1) There is clear evidence that Shackle owned two copies of Keynes' (1936) *General Theory*. One of the copies survives in St. Edmund's library in Cambridge. This is an almost pristine copy, with only one marginal annotation, and not his 'working copy'. We know that Shackle owned another copy which was heavily annotated, which Catherine Shackle gave to Frowen upon Shackle's death, on the understanding that it will join the Cambridge archive after Frowen's passing. Professor Victoria Chick found this copy in Frowen's study and remembers presenting it to Zutchi in 2009. However, the staff of the University Library, Cambridge has not recorded this donation, and it cannot be found in the Shackle archive upon extensive inspections of the papers held in the archive.
- 2) Shackle's copy of Meade's *The rate of Interest in a Progressive State* was presented to James Ford after Shackle's death by Catherine Shackle. Unfortunately, extensive searches by Professor Ford could not locate this book in his library any more.
- 3) Shackle's copy of Hayek's *Prices and Production* has been lost without a trace. Shackle mentions explicitly *Prices and Production* in his 1933 article, and loose-leaf notes found in the Cambridge Shackle Archive indicate that Shackle had a copy until –probably– the late 70s at least. However, a copy is not found anywhere, and does not appear in Meadows (1997).<sup>20</sup>
- 4) There is a real question if Shackle owned a 1931 edition of Keynes' *Treatise on Money*. He mentions the book in Shackle (1933), but the article could be written from a library copy, and it can be argued that in 1933 Shackle had read Hayek more closely than he had read Keynes. The copy of Keynes' *Treatise on Money* in the Shackle Archive in the University Library, Cambridge, is from Keynes' *Collected Writings* printed in the 1970s, and holds extensive marginal annotations from that period. It may be the case that Shackle did not buy a copy of the *Treatise* in the 1930s, possibly because he originally worked on Hayek's theory, and when he switched to Keynes' theory in 1935, he may have been told by the Cambridge Keynesians that it was an outdated book by that time. However, this narrative leaves a lot of open questions- for example, didn't Shackle own a copy when he wrote his *Years of High Theory*, or Shackle (1951) article.

In addition to the 36 books we know Shackle owned and read prior to 1945, there are eight books he reviewed for academic journals. Three of the eight books reviewed survive in various archives (Lindahl (1939), Kalecki (1943), Myrdal (1939) reviewed in Shackle (1940a, 1944, 1945)), and five do not (Dahlberg (1938), Dennison (1938), Saulnier (1939), Stratchey (1940)<sup>21</sup>, Timlin (1942) reviewed in

---

<sup>20</sup> Frowen's Hayek (1935) copy of *Prices and Production* is owned by me, as I bought it in 2009 when Victoria Chick sold some of Frowen's book during that year's Shackle lecture. If this is Shackle's copy, which seems improbable, it means that he did not own the first edition of *Prices and Production*, and instead bought in 1935 the second edition. This conjecture seems improbable- furthermore this copy has Frowen's signature in it.

<sup>21</sup> Copies of Saulnier (1939) and Stratchey (1940) can be found in the Liverpool Library general collection. They may be Shackle's copies donated prior to 1969, although there are no distinctive marginalia that can prove this to be the case.



(Shackle (1938, 1939a, 1939b, 1940b, 1943)). These book reviews can be seen as supplementary material on contemporary reading responses, and add to the information we have from marginal annotations and other contemporary sources on the reception of ideas at the time. The fact that these books do not survive in the archives is in itself an indication that Shackle did not consider the books important enough to keep, and may have disposed of them at one of his –many– moves before or after the war.

All of this material is brought together in the appendix. Table 4 gives us the raw data of all readings up to the end of WWII. Table 4 shows us what he read, when he did so, and how heavily annotated that article or book is. Thus table 4 provides us with the most complete data set we have of an individual contemporary academic reader in economics of the 1930s. This allows us to consider different narratives of how the theoretical developments of the 1930s unfolded from the perspective of a reader, and answer questions of the form: what captured his attention and what did not? When was it read? Did this reader return to it in the future? How are these different readings, as the decade progresses, related? Did the reader's focus or mind frame change in later readings of the same article? These questions formed the basis of two narratives of the 1930s explored in Repapis (2017). Nevertheless, these two narratives do not exhaust the material provided by this archive, and the table can give raw data for other investigations, other stories- paths outside those explored in Repapis (2017).

#### **IV. Some concluding thoughts on the use of this material**

This note intends to make available to the academic community what we know of Shackle's working library, and a detailed account of his reading habits and marginalia from the 1930s up to WWII. This material makes it possible for us to say that Shackle is an almost unique case of a 20<sup>th</sup> century UK academic economist for whom we have so much data on both the overall composition of his working library and his readings. This material could help us develop the following perspectives:

First, to further illuminate the evolution of Shackle's thought and how it influenced him in formulating his theory of knowledge and expectations. This material is particularly useful as in Shackle's writings it is not always clear which books or articles influenced him or indeed if he had read a particular contribution. This ambiguity is partly because Shackle does not use that much direct quotation and attribution to source in his writings, and prefers to put things in his own words, with no direct references.

Second, this material can give us a more complete picture of how academics interacted during this period, where reading monographs and articles went side by side with correspondence, academic talks, teaching and writing. This would complete the picture of the intellectual atmosphere in the academic community of economists during the 20<sup>th</sup> century. It can further illuminate how ideas formed, common terms were created and standardized, and appropriate use of these terms was defined and delineated.

Third, this material can help us observe how specific readers interacted with texts, created their marginal glosses, understood these abstract ideas and how these started framing the way they understood and analysed economic and social reality. This can give us a window on the wider reception of these readings, not only in the small circle of academic writers, but more broadly among economic readers who studied and practiced economics in their professional lives.

Table 1: Shackle's Working Library- An Addendum to Meadows (1997). All books with \* were donated to the university of Liverpool in 1969.

Books organised alphabetically by leading author	Current Location and notes
<b>A</b>	
*Abramovitz M., 1959, <i>The allocation of economic resources: essays in honor of Bernard Francis Haley</i> , Stanford: Stanford University Press	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Ackley, G., 1961, <i>Macroeconomic theory</i> , New York: Macmillan	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
Albert, A.A., 1942, <i>Introduction to algebraic theories</i> , Chicago: University of Chicago Press	University Library Cambridge [Box 16, Add 7669]
*Albert, A. A., 1949, <i>Solid analytic geometry</i> , New York: McGraw-Hill	Harold Cohen Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Åkerman, J., 1939, <i>Ekonomisk teori 1</i> , Leipzig: Harrassowitz	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Åkerman, J., 1955-1957, <i>Structures et cycles économiques</i> , ouvrage traduit du suédois par B. Marchal et G. Augot, (3 volumes) Paris: Presses Universitaires de France	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Åkerman, J., 1960, <i>Theory of industrialism: causal analysis and economic plans</i> , Lund: Gleerup	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Allais, M., 1960, <i>L'Europe Unie: Route de la Prosperite</i> , Paris: Calmann-Levy	Donated to the university of Liverpool in 1969, current location unknown.
*Anstey, V., 1964, <i>An introduction to economics for students in India and Pakistan</i> , London: Allen & Unwin	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>B</b>	
Backhouse, R., 1985, <i>A History of Modern Economic Analysis</i> , Oxford: Blackwell	St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
*Bain, J. S., 1966, <i>International differences in industrial structure: eight nations in the 1950s</i> , New Haven: Yale University Press	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Barker, T.C. and J.R. Harris, 1954, <i>A Merseyside town in the industrial revolution: St. Helens, 1750-1900</i> , Liverpool: Liverpool University Press	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Baumol, W. J., 1951, <i>Economic dynamics: an introduction; with a contribution by Ralph Turvey</i> . New York : Macmillan	Special Collections, SJL, Liverpool
*Baumol, W. J., 1952, <i>Welfare Economics and the Theory of the State</i> , London: London School of Economics and Political Science	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Baumol, W.J., 1959, <i>Business behavior, value and growth</i> , New York: Macmillan	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Baumol, W. J., 1959, <i>Economic dynamics: an introduction</i> , with a contribution by Ralph Turvey, 2 <sup>nd</sup> edition, New York:	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.

<b>Macmillan</b>		
*Baumol, W. J., 1965, <i>Economic theory and operations analysis</i> , 2nd ed, Englewood Cliffs (N.J.): Prentice-Hall		Brunswick Library Store, Liverpool Univ.
Bensusan-Butt, D.M., 1978, <i>On Economic Man</i> , Canberra: Australian National University Press		St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
Blaug, M., 1985, <i>Great Economists since Keynes</i> , Brighton: Wheatsheaf Books		St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
*Boulding, K. E., 1950, <i>A reconstruction of economics</i> , New York: Wiley		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Brooman, F.S., 1962, <i>Macroeconomics</i> , London: Allen & Unwin		Brunswick Library Store, Liverpool Univ.
*Brown, E.H. Phelps, 1962, <i>The economics of labor</i> , New Haven: Yale University Press		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Bruner, J. S., J. J. Goodnow, G. A. Austin, 1956, <i>A study of thinking</i> , New York: Wiley		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Buchanan, J.M., 1960, <i>Fiscal theory and political economy : selected essays</i> , Chapel Hill (NC): University of North Carolina Press		Special Collections, SJL, Liverpool
<b>C</b>		
*Carr, E. H., 1961, <i>What is history?</i> London: Macmillan		Brunswick Library Store, Liverpool Univ.
Carter, C.F., and J.L. Ford, 1972, <i>Uncertainty and Expectations in Economics. Essays in Honour of G.L.S. Shackle</i> . Oxford: Blackwell		St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
*Carter, C. F., W.B. Reddaway and R. Stone, 1948, <i>The measurement of production movements</i> , Cambridge: Cambridge University Press		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Carter, C. F. and B.R. Williams, 1958, <i>Investment in Innovation</i> , London: Oxford University Press		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Carter, A.M., 1959, <i>Theory of wages and employment</i> , Homewood (Ill.): Irwin		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Chamberlin, E.H., 1938, <i>The theory of monopolistic competition: a reorientation of the theory of value</i> , (3rd ed.) Cambridge (MA): Harvard University Press.		Special Collections, SJL, Liverpool
Chopoid, T., 1963, <i>Switzerland, present and future: a small country re-examines itself</i> , Bern: New Helvetic Society		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
Clark, J. M., 1934, <i>Strategic Factors in Business Cycles</i> , New York: National Bureau of Economic Research		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
Coddington, A., 1983, <i>Keynesian Economics: the Search of First Principles</i> , London: George Allen and Unwin		University Library Cambridge [Box 16, Add 7669]
*Courant, R. and H.E. Robbins, 1941, <i>What is mathematics?: an elementary approach to ideas and methods</i> , London: Oxford University Press		Harold Cohen Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Cramer, H., 1955, <i>The elements of probability theory, and some of its applications</i> , New York: Wiley		Brunswick Library Store, Liverpool Univ.

<b>D</b>		
*Dobb, M. 1960, <i>An essay on economic growth and planning</i> , London : Routledge & Paul		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>E</b>		
*Eastham, J. K., 1960, <i>Graphical economics</i> , London: English Universities Press		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
El-Kamman, M. M., 1969, <i>Collected economic papers from Ernst W. Swanson</i> , Raleigh: North Carolina State University		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Elton, G.R., 1967, <i>The practice of history</i> , Sydney: Sydney University Press		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>F</b>		
*Faxen, K. O., 1957, <i>Monetary and fiscal policy under uncertainty</i> , Stockholm : Almqvist & Wiksell		Special Collections, SJL, Liverpool
Ferrar, W.L., 1945, <i>High Algebra For Schools</i> , Oxford: Clarendon Press		University Library Cambridge [Box 16, Add 7669]
*Fellner, W.J., 1949, <i>Competition among the few: oligopoly and similar market structures</i> , New York: Knopf		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Findlay, J.N., 1961, <i>Values and intentions: a study in value-theory and philosophy of mind</i> , London: Allen & Unwin		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Fleming M., 1969, <i>Introduction to economic analysis</i> , London: Allen & Unwin		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
Ford, J. L., 1987, <i>Economic choice under uncertainty: a perspective theory approach</i> , Aldershot: Elgar		St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
*Fossati, E., 1950, <i>Elementi di economia razionale</i> , Milani: Padova		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Fossati, E., 1952, <i>Frammenti di Teoria Dinamica</i> , Trieste: Editrice Universita di Trieste		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Fossati, E., 1955, <i>Elementi di politica economica razionale</i> , Milano: Giuffre		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Fossati, E., 1958, <i>Introduzione di calcolo statistico all'econometria</i> , 2. ed., riveduta , Pubblicazioni Scientifiche di Ingegneria		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Fossati, E., 1959, <i>Problemi dei nostri giorni: note economiche del periodo 1946-1957</i> , Milano: Giuffre		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Fossati, E., 1960, <i>Oeconomica varia: excerpta</i> , Milano: Giuffre		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Fossati, E., 1961, <i>L'alfabeto della economia razionale</i> , Edition 8. ed. riveduta ed arricchita dell' introduzione di G.L.S. Shackle all'ed. Inglese. Millano: Giuffre		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
Frowen, S.F., 1983, <i>Controlling Industrial Economies</i> , London: Macmillan		St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
Frowen, S.F., 1990, <i>Unknowledge and Choice in Economics</i> , London: Macmillan		St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
*Furlong, E.J., 1961, <i>Imagination</i> , London: Allen & Unwin		Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.

<b>G</b>	
<b>*Gallie, W. B., 1952, <i>Peirce and pragmatism</i>, Harmondsworth: Penguin</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>Gilbert, J.C., 1982, <i>Keynes's impact on monetary economics</i>, London: Butterworth Scientific</b>	University Library Cambridge [Box 16, Add 7669]
<b>Greenaway, D. and J.R. 1989, <i>Pioneers of Modern Economics in Britain</i>, Vol. 2, London: Macmillan</b>	St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
<b>Gillies, D.A., 1973, <i>An Objective Theory of Probability</i>, London: Methuen and Co.</b>	University Library Cambridge [Box 16, Add 7669]
<b>H</b>	
<b>Haberler, 1946, <i>Prosperity and Depression</i>, 3rd ed., New York: United Nations</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>*Hadar, J., 1966, <i>Elementary theory of economic behaviour</i>, Reading (Mass.): Addison-Wesley</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>Hamouda, O. and R. Rowley, 1988, <i>Expectations, Equilibrium and Dynamics</i>, Harvester: St. Martin's Press</b>	St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
<b>*Hansen, A. H., 1953, <i>A guide to Keynes</i>, New York: McGraw-Hill</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>Harrod R.F., 1936, <i>The Trade Cycle</i>, Oxford: The Clarendon Press</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>*Hart, A.G., 1951, <i>Anticipations, uncertainty, and dynamic planning</i>, New York: A.M. Kelley</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>Hayek, F.A., 1931, <i>Prices and Production</i>, London: Routledge</b>	Book lost, but extensive notes in loose leaf on the book's argument [undated-probably from the 60s or later] in Shackle Archive, Cambridge University Library [ADD7669/11]
<b>Hayek , F.A., 1939, <i>Profits, Interest and Investment</i>, London: Routledge</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>*Hegeland H., 1954, <i>The multiplier theory</i>, Lund: Gleerup</b>	Special Collections, SJL, Liverpool
<b>Hicks, J. R., 1939, <i>Value and Capital: an enquiry into some fundamental principles of economic theory</i>, Oxford: Clarendon Press</b>	University Library Cambridge [Box 16, Add 7669]
<b>*Hicks, J. R., 1956, <i>A revision of demand theory</i>, Oxford: Clarendon Press</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>Hicks, J.R., 1961, <i>A Contribution to the Theory of the Trade Cycle</i>, Oxford: Clarendon Press</b>	University Library Cambridge [Box 16, Add 7669]
<b>Hicks, J.R., 1979, <i>Causality in Economics</i>, Oxford: Blackwell</b>	University Library Cambridge [Box 16, Add 7669]

*Homan, P. T., 1958, A.G. Hart, A.W. Sametz, <i>The economic order: an introduction to theory and policy</i> , New York: Harcourt Brace	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Hugh-Jones, Edward Maurice, 1956, <i>Automation in theory and practice: a course of lectures</i> , Oxford: Blackwell	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
I	
*Iles, D. J., C.A. Tucker, 1960, <i>Problems of full employment</i> , London: Routledge & Kegan Paul	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
J	
*Johansen, L., 1965, <i>Public economics</i> , Amsterdam: North-Holland	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Johr, W.A., and H.W. Singer, 1955, <i>The rôle of the economist as official adviser</i> . Foreword by E.A.G. Robinson. Translated from the German by J. Degras and S. Frowen, London: Allen & Unwin	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Jouvenel, B. de, 1957, <i>Sovereignty: an inquiry into the political good</i> , Cambridge: Cambridge University Press	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
K	
*Kaldor, N., 1960, <i>Essays on economic stability and growth</i> , London: Duckworth	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Kaldor, N., 1960, <i>Essays on value and distribution</i> , London: Duckworth	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Kalecki, M., 1943, <i>Studies in economic dynamics</i> , London : George Allen & Unwin	Special Collections, SJL, Liverpool
*Kalecki, M., 1956, <i>Theory of economic dynamics: an essay on cyclical and long-run changes in capitalist economy</i> , London: Allen & Unwin	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Katona, G. and E. Mueller, 1956, <i>Consumer expectations, 1953-1956</i> , Michigan: Survey Research Center, Institute for Social Research, University of Michigan	Donated to the university of Liverpool in 1969, current location unknown.
*Kerrich, J. E., 1946, <i>An experimental introduction to the theory of probability</i> , Copenhagen : E. Munksgaard	Donated to the university of Liverpool in 1969, current location unknown.
Keynes, J.M., 1936, <i>The General Theory of Employment, Interest and Money</i> , London: Macmillan	St. Edmund's college library. Purchase date 4/2/1936 with Shackle's signature. This was the second copy that Shackle owned. The heavily annotated copy which he left to Frowen has been lost.
Keynes, J.M., 1943, <i>Treatise On Probability</i> , London: Macmillan	University Library Cambridge [Shackle's archive, uncatalogued section]
Keynes, J. M., 1971, <i>A treatise on money</i> , in the <i>Collected Writings of John Maynard Keynes (2 vol.: Vol. 5&amp; 6)</i> , London:	University Library Cambridge [Box 16,

<b>Macmillan</b>	Add 7669]
<b>Kierstead, B.S., 1953, <i>An Essay in the Theory of Profits and Income Distribution</i>, Oxford: Blackwell</b>	University Library Cambridge [Box 16, Add 7669]
<b>*Kierstead, B.S., 1959, <i>Capital interest and profits</i>, Oxford: Blackwell</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>Kirzner, I.M., 1982, <i>Method, Processes, and Austrian Economics. Essays in Honour of Ludwig von Mises</i>, Toronto: Lexington Books</b>	St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
<b>*Klein, L. R., 1948, <i>The Keynesian revolution</i>, New York: Macmillan</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>Knight, F. H., 1933, <i>Risk, Uncertainty, and Profit</i>, London: London School of Economics &amp; Political Science</b>	St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
<b>*Knight, F. H. 1956, <i>On the history and method of economics: selected essays</i>, Chicago: University of Chicago Press</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>*Krupp, S.R., 1966, <i>The structure of economic science: essays on methodology</i>, Englewood Cliffs (N.J.): Prentice-Hall</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>L</b>	
<b>Lachmann, L.M., 1977, <i>Capital, Expectations, And the Market Process</i>, Kansas: Sheed Andrews and McMeel.</b>	St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge (Also in Meadows, 1997, 89).
<b>*Landgren, K. G., 1957, <i>Economics in modern Sweden</i>, translation by Paul Gekker, Washington: Reference Department, Library of Congress</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>*Lesourne, J., 1964, <i>Le Calcul économique</i>, Paris: Dunod Saint-Amand</b>	Donated to the university of Liverpool in 1969, current location unknown
<b>Leijonhufvud, A., 1968, <i>On Keynesian economics and the economics of Keynes: a study in monetary theory</i>, New York: Oxford University Press.</b>	University Library Cambridge [Box 16, Add 7669][Another copy of the first edition in Meadows (1997) P. 91. The UL copy is heavily annotated. The Meadow's is a review copy, and does not appear to have annotations]
<b>*Lindahl, E. 1939, <i>Studies in the Theory of Money and Capital</i>. Translated from the Swedish by Tor Fernholm. London: Macmillan</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>*Llau, P., 1962, <i>La détermination des taux d'intérêt : étude des théories économiques contemporaines</i>, Paris: Éditions Cujas</b>	Special Collections, SJL, Liverpool
<b>Loasby, B.J., 1989, <i>The mind and method of the economist: a critical appraisal of major economists in the 20th century</i>, Aldershot, Hants, England: Edward Elgar Pub</b>	St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
<b>Loasby, B.J., 1991, <i>Equilibrium and evolution. An exploration of connecting principles in economics</i>. Manchester: Manchester</b>	Shackle archive, St. Edmund's library,



University Press	University of Cambridge.
*Lundberg, E. F., 1955, <i>Studies in the theory of economic expansion</i> , New York: Kelley & Millman	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Lundberg E. F., 1968, <i>Instability and economic growth</i> , New Haven: Yale University Press	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>M</b>	
Maggi, R., 1960, <i>La monaca di Monza all'esame psicoanalitico</i> , Milano : Giuffre	Donated to the university of Liverpool in 1969, current location unknown.
*Majumdar, T., 1958, <i>The measurement of utility</i> , London: Macmillan	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
Marrama, V., 1948, <i>Teoria e politica della piena occupazione</i> , Roma: Edizioni italiane, stampa	Donated to the university of Liverpool in 1969, current location unknown
Marshall, A., 1961, <i>Principles of Economics. Volume II notes</i> , Ninth (variorum) edition, London: Macmillan	St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge.
*Masieri, W., 1965, <i>Notions essentielles de statistique et de calcul des probabilités</i> , Paris: Sirey	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
Meade, J. E., 1933, <i>The rate of Interest in a Progressive State</i> , London: Macmillan	Given by Catherine Shackle to J.L. Ford. Current location unknown.
*Meade, J. E., 1952, <i>A geometry of international trade</i> , London: Allen & Unwin	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Meade, J.E., 1968, <i>The Growing Economy: Principles of Political Economy</i> , London : Allen & Unwin	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Mehta J.K., 1964, <i>Economics of growth</i> , Bombay: Asia Publishing House	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Mehta J.K., 1967, <i>Rhyme, rhythm and truth in economics</i> , London: Asia Publishing House	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
Mellon, D.H., 1980, <i>Science, Belief and Behaviour. Essays in honour of R.B. Braithwaite</i> , Cambridge: Cambridge University press	University Library Cambridge [Box 16, Add 7669]
Moggridge, D.E., 1974, <i>Keynes: Aspects of the Man and His Work</i> , London: Macmillan	St. Edmund's library, University of Cambridge
Murphy, A.E., 1986, <i>Richard Cantillon: Entrepreneur and Economist</i> . Oxford: Clarendon press	St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
Myrdal G., 1939, <i>Monetary Equilibrium</i> , London: William Hodge	University Library Cambridge [Box 16, Add 7669]
<b>N</b>	
*National Bureau of Economic Research. 1962, <i>Aspects of labour economics: a conference of the Universities - National Bureau Committee for Economic Research</i> , Princeton: Princeton University Press	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.



*Neumann, J. Von and O. Morgenstern, 1944, <i>Theory of games and economic behaviour</i> , Princeton (N.J.): Princeton University Press	Harold Cohen Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>O</b>	
O'Brien, D.P., 1970, <i>J.R. McCulloch. A Study in Classic Economics</i> , London: Allen and Unwin	St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
*Ozga, S.A., 1967, <i>The rate of exchange and the terms of trade</i> , London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>P</b>	
*Papandreou, A.G., 1958, <i>Economics as a science</i> , Chicago: Lippincott	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
Peacock, A.T., R. Turvey, W. Stolper, E. Henderson, 1956, <i>International economic papers: translations prepared for the International Economic Association</i> , London: Macmillan	Brunswick Library, Liverpool Univ.
Pheby, J., 1988, <i>Methodology and economics: a critical introduction</i> , Basingstoke : Macmillan	St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
Pigou, A.C., 1941, <i>Employment and Equilibrium</i> , London: Macmillan	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Polanyi M., 1958, <i>Personal knowledge: towards a post-critical philosophy</i> , London: Routledge & Kegan Paul	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Postan, M.M., 1967, <i>An economic history of Western Europe, 1945-1964</i> , London: Methuen	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Puthuchear, J.J., 1960, <i>Ownership and control in the Malayan economy: a study of the structure of ownership and control and its effects on the development of secondary industries and economic growth and Malaya and Singapore</i> , Singapore: Eastern Universities Press	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>Q</b>	
<b>R</b>	
Rescher, N., 1973, <i>Conceptual Idealism</i> , Oxford: Blackwell	University Library Cambridge [Box 16, Add 7669]
*Rist, C. 1961, <i>The Triumph of Gold</i> , translated from the French with an introduction by Philip Cortney, New York: Wisdom Library	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Robbins, L., 1954, <i>The economist in the twentieth century, and other lectures in political economy</i> , London: Macmillan	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Robbins, L., 1963, <i>Politics and Economics. Papers in Political Economy</i> , London: Macmillan	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Robbins, L., 1968, <i>The theory of economic development in the history of economic thought</i> , London: Macmillan	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.

*Robertson, D.H., 1957, <i>Lectures on economic principles</i> , London: Staples Press	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Robertson, W., 1960, <i>Welfare in trust: a history of the Carnegie United Kingdom Trust, 1913-1963</i> , Dunfermline: Carnegie United Kingdom Trust	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Robinson, J., 1947, <i>Essays in the Theory of Employment</i> , Oxford: Blackwell	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Robinson, J., 1952, <i>The rate of interest, and other essays</i> , London : Macmillan	Special Collections, SJL, Liverpool
*Rostow, W.W., 1960, <i>The stages of economic growth: a non-communist manifesto</i> , Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Rostow, W.W., 1948, <i>British economy of the nineteenth century</i> , Oxford: Clarendon Press	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Rowan, D.C., 1968, <i>Output, inflation and growth: an introduction to macroeconomics</i> , London: Macmillan	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Russell, B., 1946, <i>History of western philosophy and its connection with political and social circumstances from the earliest to the present day</i> , London: Allen & Unwin	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Ryan W.J.L. , 1958, <i>Price Theory</i> , London: Macmillan	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>S</b>	
*Schneider, E., 1944, <i>Investering og rente</i> , Nyt Nordisk Forlag, Arnold Busck, Kjobenhav	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Schneider, E., 1962, <i>Pricing and equilibrium: an introduction to static and dynamic analysis</i> , London: Allen & Unwin	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Schneider, E., 1962, <i>Money, income and employment</i> , London: Allen & Unwin	Special Collections, SJL, Liverpool
*Schultz, T.W. 1964, <i>Transforming traditional agriculture</i> , New Haven: Yale University Press	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
Seldon A., and P.G. Pennance, 1965, <i>Everyman's Dictionary of Economics</i> , London: J.M. Dent and Sons	St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
Seldon A., and P.G. Pennance, 1975, <i>Everyman's Dictionary of Economics</i> , London: J.M. Dent and Sons	St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
*Sen, A., 1960, <i>Choice of techniques: an aspect of the theory of planned economic development</i> , Oxford: Blackwell	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Sharp, C. H., 1965, <i>The problem of transport</i> , Oxford: Pergamon	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Sherrington, C. , 1940, <i>Man on his nature</i> , Cambridge: Cambridge University Press	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Simon, H.A., 1957, <i>Models of man, social and rational : mathematical essays on rational human behavior in a social setting</i> , New York : John Wiley & Sons ; London : Chapman & Hall	Special Collections, SJL, Liverpool
Skidelsky, R., 1983, <i>John Maynard Keynes. Volume 1: Hopes Betrayed 1883-1920</i> , London: Macmillan	St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
*Sowelem, R.A., 1967, <i>Towards financial independence in a developing economy: an analysis of the monetary experience of the Federation of Rhodesia and Nyasaland</i> , London: Allen & Unwin	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Spengler, O., 1934, <i>The decline of the West</i> [trans. by C.F. Atkinson], London: George Allen & Unwin	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.

*Spiegel, H.W., 1952, <i>The development of economic thought: great economists in perspective</i> , New York: Wiley	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Sraffa, P., 1960, <i>Production of commodities by means of commodities: prelude to a critique of economic theory</i> , Cambridge: Cambridge University Press	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Steindl, J., 1945, <i>Small and big business: economic problems of the size of firms</i> , Oxford: Blackwell	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Stevens, C. M., 1963, <i>Strategy and collective bargaining negotiation</i> , New York: McGraw-Hill	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Stigler, G.J., 1946, <i>The theory of price</i> , London: Macmillan	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Stone, J. R.N., 1951, <i>The role of measurement in economics: the Newmarch lectures, 1948-1949, given at University College, London</i> , Cambridge: Cambridge University Press	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Stonier, A.W. and D.C. Hague, 1964, <i>A textbook of economic theory</i> , London: Longmans	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Stuvel, G., 1950, <i>The exchange stability problem</i> , Oxford: Blackwell	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>T</b>	
*Theocharis, R. D., 1961, <i>Early developments in mathematical economics</i> , foreword by Lord Robbins, London: Macmillan	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
Thomas, B., 1973, <i>Migration and Economic Growth</i> . Second edition, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press	St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge. [Includes the following note: To George, to recall the beginning of our odyssey in the golden years of high theory at L.S.E., 1935-1939. April 15, 1974. Brinley].
Tinbergen J., 1937, <i>An econometric approach to business cycle problems</i> , Paris: Hermann	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
Tinbergen J., 1939, <i>Statistical testing of business-cycle theories. I: A method and its application to investment activity</i> , Geneva: League of Nations	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
*Triffin, R., 1940, <i>Monopolistic competition and general equilibrium theory</i> , Cambridge MA : Harvard University Press	Special Collections, SJL, Liverpool
<b>U</b>	
<b>V</b>	
Vickers, D., 1978, <i>Financial Markets in the Capitalist Process</i> , Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press	St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge. [May have been owned by Frowen instead of Shackle, ownership unclear].

<b>W</b>	
<b>*Wallas, G., 1926, <i>The art of thought</i>, London: Cape</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>*Walras, L., 1954, <i>Elements of pure economics</i>; translated by William Jaffe, London: Allen &amp; Unwin</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>Waterlow, S., 1982, <i>Passage and Possibility. A Study of Aristotle's Modal Concepts</i>. Oxford: Clarendon Press</b>	University Library Cambridge [Box 16, Add 7669]
<b>*Waugh, A. E., 1943, <i>Elements of Statistical Method</i>, 2d ed., New York and London, MacGraw-Hill</b>	Donated to the university of Liverpool in 1969, current location unknown. It is unknown which of the three editions (12938, 1943, 1952) Shackle owned.
<b>*Weintraub S., 1958, <i>An approach to the theory of income distribution</i>, Philadelphia: Chilton</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>Wicksell, K., 1962, <i>Interest and Prices</i>, translated by R.F. Kahn, New York: Augustus M. Kelley</b>	St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
<b>*Wijnholds H.W.J., 1957, <i>International trade and payments: an introduction to the theory of international trade, commercial policy and other international economic relations</i>, Pretoria: Academic Press</b>	Brunswick Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>*Williams, B. R. and W.P. Scott, 1965, <i>Investment proposals and decisions</i>, London: Allen &amp; Unwin</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>X</b>	
<b>Y</b>	
<b>*Yeager, L.B., 1966, <i>International monetary relations: theory, history, and policy</i>, New York: Harper &amp; Row</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>Young W., 1987, <i>Interpreting Mr. Keynes. The IS-LM enigma</i>, Oxford: Polity Press</b>	St. Edmund's College Library, University of Cambridge
<b>*Youngson, A.J., 1967, <i>Overhead capital: a study in development economics</i>, Edinburg: Edinburgh University Press</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>Z</b>	
<b>*Zellner, A., 1968, <i>Readings in economic statistics and econometrics</i>, Boston: Little Brown</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.
<b>*Zeuthen, F., 1955, <i>Economic theory and method</i>, London: Longmans.</b>	Sydney Jones Library, Liverpool Univ.

Table 2: List of Academic books owned by G.L.S. Shackle, and published until 1946. Books with \* in Meadows (1997) all other volumes appear in table 1.

date	Author	Title
<b>1926</b>	G. Wallas	<i>The art of thought</i> , London: Cape
<b>1927</b>	A. Cournot	* <i>Researches into Mathematical Principles of the Theory of Wealth 1838</i> . (Translated by Nathaniel T. Bacon with an Essay on Cournot and Mathematical Economics and a Bibliography of Mathematical Economics by Irving Fisher, New York: Macmillan)
<b>1931</b>	F.A. Hayek	<i>Prices and Production</i> , London: Routledge
<b>1933</b>	F.H. Knight	<i>Risk, Uncertainty, and Profit</i> , London: London School of Economics & Political Science
	J.E. Meade	<i>The rate of Interest in a Progressive State</i> , London: Macmillan
<b>1934</b>	J. M. Clark	<i>Strategic Factors in Business Cycles</i> , New York: National Bureau of Economic Research
	O. Spengler	<i>The decline of the West</i> [trans. by C.F. Atkinson], London: George Allen & Unwin
<b>1936</b>	J.M. Keynes	<i>The General Theory of Employment, Interest and Money</i> , London: Macmillan
	R.F. Harrod	<i>The Trade Cycle</i> , Oxford: The Clarendon Press
<b>1937</b>	J. Tinbergen	<i>An econometric approach to business cycle problems</i> , Paris: Hermann
	R. Courant	* <i>Differential and Integral Calculus</i> (translated by E.J. McShane) Vol. I Second edition (1937), Vol. II First edition (1936). London: Bladine and Son Ltd.
<b>1938</b>	E. Chamberlin	<i>The theory of monopolistic competition: a re-orientation of the theory of value</i> , Third edition, Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
<b>1939</b>	J. Åkerman	<i>Ekonomisk teori 1</i> , Leipzig: Harrassowitz
	F.A. Hayek	<i>Profits, Interest and Investment</i> , London: Routledge
	J.R. Hicks	<i>Value and Capital: an enquiry into some fundamental principles of economic theory</i> , Oxford: Clarendon Press
	G. Myrdal	<i>Monetary Equilibrium</i> , London: William Hodge
	J. Tinbergen	<i>Statistical testing of business-cycle theories. I: A method and its application to investment activity</i> , Geneva: League of Nations
	E. Lindahl	<i>Studies in the Theory of Money and Capital. Translated from the Swedish by Tor Fernholm</i> , London: Macmillan

<b>1940</b>		
R. Triffin	<i>Monopolistic competition and general equilibrium theory</i> , Cambridge MA : Harvard University Press	
C. Sherrington	<i>Man on his nature</i> , Cambridge: Cambridge University Press	
<b>1941</b>		
A.C. Pigou	<i>Employment and Equilibrium</i> , London: Macmillan	
R. Courant and H.E. Robbins	<i>What is mathematics?: an elementary approach to ideas and methods</i> , London: Oxford University Press	
<b>1942</b>		
A.A. Albert	<i>Introduction to algebraic theories</i> , Chicago: University of Chicago Press	
<b>1943</b>		
J.M. Keynes	<i>Treatise On Probability</i> , London: Macmillan	
M. Kalecki	<i>Studies in economic dynamics</i> , London : George Allen & Unwin	
C.C. Macduffee	<i>*Vectors and Matrices. Number Seven in the Carus Mathematical Monographs</i> . The Mathematical Association of America	
A.E. Waugh	<i>Elements of Statistical Method, 2d ed.</i> , New York and London: MacGraw-Hill	
<b>1944</b>		
E. Schneider	<i>Investering og rente</i> , Nyt Nordisk Forla: Arnold Busck, Kjobenhav	
J. Von Neumann O. Morgenstern	<i>Theory of games and economic behaviour</i> , Princeton (N.J.): Princeton University Press	
<b>1945</b>		
W.L Ferrar	<i>High Algebra For Schools</i> , Oxford: Clarendon Press	
J. Steindl	<i>Small and big business: economic problems of the size of firms</i> , Oxford: Blackwell	
<b>1946</b>		
A.A. Albert	<i>College Algebra</i> , New York: McGraw-Hill Books Company	
B. Russell	<i>History of western philosophy and its connection with political and social circumstances from the earliest to the present day</i> , London: Allen & Unwin	
G.J. Stigler	<i>The theory of price</i> , London: Macmillan	
G. von Haberler	<i>Prosperity and Depression, 3rd ed.</i> , New York: United Nations	
J. E. Kerrich	<i>An experimental introduction to the theory of probability</i> , Copenhagen : E. Munksgaard	

*Table 3: Periodicals from the 1930s and early 1940s owned by G.L.S. Shackle*

*All in Add. 7669 Box 17 of the Shackle archive, in University Library, Cambridge unless otherwise stated.*

<b>Journal</b>	<b>Date of issue</b>	<b>Volume number</b>
<b><i>The Economic Journal</i></b>	1931, June	Volume 41, no. 162
	1933, December	Volume 43, no. 172
	1934, March	Volume 44, no. 173
	1934, June	Volume 44, no. 174
	1935, March	Volume 45, no. 177
	1935, June	Volume 45, no. 178
	1935, September	Volume 45, no. 179
	1936, September	Volume 46, no. 183
	1937, March	Volume 47, no. 185
	1937, June	Volume 47, no. 186
	1937, September	Volume 47, no. 187
	1937, December	Volume 47, no. 188
	1938, June	Volume 48, no. 190
	1938, September	Volume 48, no. 191 <sup>22</sup>
	1939, March	Volume 49, no. 193
1940, March	Volume 50, no. 197	
<b><i>Economica</i></b>	1934, February	Volume I (New Series), no. 1
	1934, August	Volume I (New Series), no. 3
	1935, February	Volume II (New Series), no. 5
	1935, August	Volume II (New Series), no. 7
	1936, May	Volume III (New Series), no. 10
	1937, August	Volume IV (New Series), no. 15
	1937, November	Volume IV (New Series), no. 16
	1938, February	Volume V (New Series), no. 17
	1938, August	Volume V (New Series), no. 19
1939, February	Volume VI, No. 21 <sup>23</sup>	
<b><i>The Review of Economic Studies</i></b>	1933, October	Volume 1, no. 1
	1936, June	Volume 3, no. 3
	1937, February	Volume 4, no. 2
<b><i>Oxford Economic Papers</i></b>	1941, June	No. 5

<sup>22</sup> This volume is in the St. Edmund's college archive, University of Cambridge.

<sup>23</sup> This volume is in Box 2 of the Shackle archive (class mark Add. 7669) at the University Library, Cambridge.

Table 4: Readings in the 1930s and early 40s by G.L.S. Shackle

Date	Publication in the Shackle Archive at Cambridge	When read and involvement with the text <sup>24</sup>
<b>1931</b>		
June	<u>The Relation of Home Investment to Unemployment</u> , by R. F. Kahn, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 41, No. 162, pp. 173-198	There are a number of notes, but the reading is without a date. From the notes it appears that this is a later reading when the multiplier was well known. There is no clear evidence that Shackle read this sometime in the early 30's, other than the fact that he dated his reading of the next article in the same volume of EJ on 30/7/31 (see entry below).
	<u>Marshall's Time Analysis</u> , by R. Opie, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 41, No. 162, pp. 199-215	A reading on 30/7/31. Because of a later reading (from 1956) of this article, it is unclear how much of the marginalia relates to this as opposed to the later reading.
	<u>Mr. Keynes' Treatise on Money</u> , by J. C. Stamp, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 41, No. 162, pp. 241-249	The only note at the end of the article reads: "Read twice: 27-29 July 1931".
<b>1933</b>		
	<i>The rate of Interest in a Progressive State</i> , by J.E. Meade, London: Macmillan	According to J.L. Ford this book was purchased on 23 April 1934, and has extensive annotations. One reading is noted in (Ford, 1994, 14) for the period 30/12/34-5/1/35.
Oct.	<u>Pareto and Pure Economics</u> , By U. Ricci, <i>RES</i> , Vol. I, No. 1, pp. 3-21	Two readings: 24/1/34 and 26-7/1/34
	<u>I.-A note on Relative Shares</u> by P.M. Sweezy, <i>RES</i> Vol. I, No. 1, pp. 67-8	A 'preliminary reading' on 12/4/34
	<u>The Diagrammatical Representation</u> by A.P. Lerner, <i>RES</i> Vol. I, No. 1, pp. 68-71	A partial 'preliminary reading' on 8/4/34 and a first reading on 17-18/4/34.
	<u>The Elasticity of Substitution and the Relative Share of a Factor</u> by R.F. Kahn, <i>RES</i> Vol. I, No. 1, pp. 72-78	Two readings noted: 12/4/34 and 17/4/34
Dec.	<u>The Period of Production and Industrial Fluctuations</u> , by M. Hill, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 43, No. 172, pp. 599-610	Repeatedly read and heavily annotated. Includes newspaper cutting from January 13, 1934. Readings of whole or part of the article noted in the following days: 7-10-11-14-17-23-27/12/33.
	<u>The Concept of the Length of the Period of Production</u> , by C. H. P. Gifford, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 43, No. 172, pp. 611-618	Undated reading. Loose leaf note makes reference to Gifford's article in <i>Econometrica</i> , vol. 3, No. 2 April 1935.

<sup>24</sup> Only 'contemporary' readings, -i.e. readings up to 1945/6- are noted in this table. Shackle revisited a number of these articles later in life and dated those readings, but these are not noted here. Whereas journal articles are placed by month of publication, books are placed in the beginning of the entry for the year that they were published in.



<b>1934</b>	<i>Strategic Factors in Business Cycles</i> , by J.M. Clark, New York: National Bureau of Economic Research	Two reading, with mostly notes in the later reading. First reading 18-20 and 25/1/35. A 'fresh' reading on 21,22,28,29/4 and 1,7/5/38.
<b>Feb.</b>	<u><i>A Reconsideration of the Theory of Value. Part I</i></u> by J. R. Hicks and R. G. D. Allen <i>Economica</i> , Vol. 1, No. 1, pp. 52-76	Repeatedly read and heavily annotated. Three temporally distinct readings noted: 6-9/4/34, 20-22/4/34, and 3-10/8/34. Each of these readings also have re-readings of specific sections. For example two separate readings (a preliminary and a second reading) are noted for 21 and 22 of April 1934.
	<u>Book reviews of: The Masquerade of Monopoly. By F. A. Fetter. The Dynamics of Industrial Combination. By H. A. Marquand. By A. Pant,</u> <i>Economica</i> , Vol. 1, No. 1, pp. 108-110	A reading on 5/8/34
	<u>Book review of: Aspects of the Rise of Economic Individualism. By H. M. Robertson. By A.V. Judges</u> <i>Economica</i> , Vol. 1, No. 1, pp. 110-113	A reading on 5/8/34
<b>Mar.</b>	<u><i>A Note on the Period of Production</i></u> , by J. Marschak <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 44, No. 173, pp. 146-151	Extensive marginalia on technical elements of the period of production. A reading on 16-17/10/35.
<b>June</b>	<u><i>On the Relationship Between Investment and Output</i></u> , by F. A. von Hayek, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 44, No. 174, pp. 207-231	Repeatedly read and heavily annotated. Three distinct periods of readings : 15-23/6/34, 6/9-5/10/34 and 12-13/4/35. These periods also include re-readings of part of the article. At the end of the article the second period of readings ending on 5/10/34 was still noted as "not definitive reading".
	<u>Book review of <i>The Rate of Interest in a Progressive State</i>, by J.E. Meade. Review by J. Robinson,</u> <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 44, No. 174, pp. 284-5	A reading on 9/9/34
	<u>Book review of <i>What Everybody wants to know about Money</i>, edited by Cole. Review by J.H. Richardson,</u> <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 44, No. 174, pp. 290-1	A reading on 9/9/34
	<u>Fisher's Real Rate Doctrine</u> , by B. P. Adarkar, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 44, No. 174, pp. 337-342	A reading on 9/9/34
<b>Aug.</b>	<u><i>Capital, Time, and the Interest Rate</i></u> By F. H. Knight, <i>Economica</i> , Vol. 1, No. 3, pp. 257-286	Repeatedly read and heavily annotated. Two readings at several dates in the period 11/8-13/9/34, as Shackle seems to have re-read the same parts of the article before moving on. A separate third reading 24/3/35-3/4/35.
	<u><i>The Expansion of Credit in an Advancing Community</i></u> . By R. F. Harrod. <i>Economica</i> , Vol. 1, No. 3, pp. 287-99.	Some notes, and interestingly some marginal annotations have erased. [Unknown when] A reading on 7-12/1/35.
	<u>Mrs. Robinson's "Economics of Imperfect Competition"</u> By N. Kaldor, <i>Economica</i> , Vol. 1, No. 3, pp. 335-41	A reading on 24/3/35.

	<u>Book review of: <i>Monetary Theory and the Trade Cycle</i>. By F. A. Hayek. Review by C. Bresciani-Turroni, <i>Economica</i>, Vol. 1, No. 3, pp. 344-7</u>	A reading on 30/8/34.
<b>1935</b>		
<b>Feb.</b>	<u><i>A Suggestion for Simplifying the Theory of Money</i>, By J. R. Hicks, <i>Economica</i>, Vol. 2, No. 5, pp. 1-19</u>	Repeatedly read and heavily annotated. A number of dated readings: First reading 4/3/35. Another reading 25-26/9/35. "Fresh" reading 2/10/35. Second "fresh" reading 3/10/35, (noted as a "definitive reading of whole article completed in one day"). Third "fresh" reading 4/2/37.
<b>Mar.</b>	<u><i>The Monetary Doctrines of Professor Davidson</i>, by B. Thomas, <i>The Economic Journal</i>, Vol. 45, No. 177, pp. 36-50</u>	Few notes from two readings: 8/3/35 and 15/3/35.
	<u><i>Professor Hayek and the Theory of Investment</i>, by F. H. Knight, <i>The Economic Journal</i>, Vol. 45, No. 177, pp. 77-94</u>	No marginal notes but dated readings on two days 10 and 13/3/35.
	<u><i>Book review of The Great Depression</i>, by L. Robbins. Review by H. D. Henderson, <i>The Economic Journal</i>, Vol. 45, No. 177, pp. 117-123.</u>	A reading on 11/3/35.
<b>June</b>	<u><i>Net Income and Capital Depletion</i>. By A. C. Pigou, <i>The Economic Journal</i>, Vol. 45, No. 178, pp. 235-241</u>	Repeatedly read and heavily annotated. A number of dated readings: 23-27-28-30/9/35.
	<u><i>A Note on the Equilibrium Rate of Interest</i>, by J. Stafford, <i>The Economic Journal</i>, Vol. 45, No. 178, pp. 259-268</u>	A number of marginalia. First reading 8/6/35. Revisited 20/6/35.
	<u><i>A Mathematical Note on the Economics of Electricity Supply</i>, by G. W. Stubbings, <i>The Economic Journal</i>, Vol. 45, No. 178, pp. 376-378</u>	A reading with some notes on 6/6/35.
	<u><i>A student's recollections of Edwin Cannan</i>, by L. Robbins, <i>The Economic Journal</i>, Vol. 45, No. 178, pp. 393-398</u>	A reading on 7/6/35
	<u><i>Sir Henry Cunynghame</i>, by J.M. Keynes, <i>The Economic Journal</i>, Vol. 45, No. 178, pp. 398-406</u>	A reading on 8/6/35
<b>Aug.</b>	<u><i>The Maintenance of Capital</i>, By F. A. von Hayek, <i>Economica</i>, Vol. 2, No. 7, pp. 241-76</u>	Repeatedly read and very heavily annotated with a lot of marginalia and loose-leaf pages. Reading dates range from 24/8/35 until 23/9/35. Dates for readings of parts of the article are: 24-30/8, 2-3-4-5-6-12-13-15-16-18-19-21-23/9/35.
	<u><i>Book review of Kapital und Produktion</i>. By R. von Strigl. And <i>Kapitaltheoretische Untersuchungen</i>. By W. Eucken. Reviewed by F. Machlup, <i>Economica</i>, Vol. 2, No. 7, pp. 332-36</u>	A reading on 21/8/35.
<b>Sept.</b>	<u><i>Wages and Interest: The Dynamic Problem</i>, by J. R. Hicks, <i>The Economic Journal</i>, Vol. 45, No. 179, pp. 456-468</u>	Few notes, and a reading completed on 12/9/35.
	<u><i>Book review of: The Theory of Money and Credit</i>, by L. von Mises,</u>	A reading of 17/9/35 with few notes.

	review by R. G. Hawtrey, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 45, No. 179, pp. 509-518	
	<u>Book review of Kapital und Produktion.</u> By R. von Strigl. Review by R. Opie, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 45, No. 179, pp. 552-554.	A reading on 3/10/35
	<u>Book review of Etudes Econometriques</u> , by R. Roy. Review by R.G.D. Allen, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 45, No. 179, pp. 554-6.	A reading on 1/10/35
<b>1936</b>		
	<i>The Trade Cycle</i> , by R.F. Harrod, Oxford: The Clarendon Press	Two readings with some notes originally attached (now lost). First reading 22,25,27/1 and 9-10,12,14/2/38. Second reading 22,24,25,28/2 and 1,4/3/38.
<b>May</b>	<u>Mr. J. M. Keynes' General Theory of Employment, Interest and Money</u> , by A. C. Pigou, <i>Economica</i> , Vol. 3, No. 10, pp. 115-32	Some marginalia. A reading on 16/5/36, unclear if Shackle read the whole article.
	<u>Time and Investment</u> , by K. E. Boulding, <i>Economica</i> , Vol. 3, No. 10, pp. 196-220	Shackle may have read it in the 30s. But it is an undated reading, if it happened and only a typo correction on page 199 to indicate that he, at some point, would have looked through part of the text.
<b>June</b>	<u>The Place of Interest in the Theory of Production</u> by O. Lange, <i>Review of Economic Studies</i> , Vol. 3 No. 3, pp. 159-92	A number of marginal notes and a loose leaf page on the mathematical formulas of the article. Notes of two readings (possibly not of the whole article) first on 7-8/7/36 second 23-6/8/36.
<b>Sept.</b>	<u>The Supply of Gold</u> , by J. M. Keynes, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 46, No. 183, pp. 412-418	A reading with few notes on 23/1/37
	<u>Irrationality in Consumers' Demand</u> , by W. B. Reddaway, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 46, No. 183, pp. 419-423.	A reading on 17/7/38
	<u>The Definition of Prime and Supplementary Costs</u> by G. D. A. MacDougall, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 46, No. 183, pp. 443-461.	Readings on the following days: 15,17/11/36. No clear evidence that he read the whole article.
	<u>Some Theoretical Aspects of Forward Exchanges</u> , by Paul Einzig, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 46, No. 183, pp. 462-470	A reading on 14/8/39
<b>1937</b>		
	<i>An econometric approach to business cycle problems</i> , by J. Tinbergen, Paris: Hermann	A reading of part of the book on 5/10/37.
<b>Feb.</b>	<u>A Theory of the Business Cycle</u> , by M. Kalecki, <i>Review of Economic Studies</i> , Vol. 4 No. 2. pp. 77-97	A reading across four days: 6-9/1/38. Extensive notes and comments.
<b>Mar.</b>	<u>The Problem of Duopoly</u> , by R. F. Kahn, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 47, No. 185, pp. 1-20	Few notes from a reading on 19,20,21/3/38

	<u>Some Notes on the Stockholm Theory of Savings and Investment I</u> , by B. Ohlin, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 47, No. 185, pp. 53-69	Few notes including "a splendid article". Reading on 12-13/7/38.
	<u>Book review of <i>An Introduction to Economic Analysis and Policy</i> by J. E. Meade.</u> Review by: Ursula K. Hicks, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 47, No. 185, pp. 90-94	A reading on 19/3/38
	<u>Book review of <i>The Framework of the Pricing System</i>, by E. H. P. Brown.</u> Review by: F. A. Hayek, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 47, No. 185, pp. 94-95	A reading on 19/3/38
	<u>Liquidity-Premium and the Theory of Value</u> , by H. Townshend, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 47, No. 185, pp. 157-169	A few notes, two readings: 30/6/38 and 16/8/38
<b>June</b>	<u>Some Notes on the Stockholm Theory of Savings and Investments II</u> , by B. Ohlin, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 47, No. 186, pp. 221-240	A few notes on the margin from a number of readings. Readings noted: 5/9/37, with a complete reading by 9/4/38. He also read this article in conjunction with Ohlin's March (part I) article on two separate readings, on 17/7/38 and on 25/4/39.
	<u>Alternative Theories of the Rate of Interest</u> , by J. M. Keynes, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 47, No. 186, pp. 241-252	A few notes, from two readings: 3-4/6/37 and 21/7/38.
	<u>Special Obstacles to Full Employment in a Wealthy Community</u> , by W. B. Reddaway, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 47, No. 186, pp. 297-307	A reading on 18/5/38
	<u>Book review of <i>Capital and Employment</i>, by R. G. Hawtrey.</u> Review by: Hugh Townshend, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 47, No. 186, pp. 321-326	Two readings: 10/5/38 and 29/6/38.
<b>Aug.</b>	<u>Uncertainty and Liquidity-Preference</u> , by L. M. Lachmann, <i>Economica</i> , Vol. 4, No. 15, pp. 295-308	A note on uncertainty from a reading on 9/1/38.
<b>Sept.</b>	<u>Book review of <i>A Simple Theory of Capital, Wages, and Profit or Loss</i>, by E. C. Dorp,</u> Review by: K. E. Boulding <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 47, No. 187 (Sep., 1937), pp. 522-524	A reading on 27/7/38
	<u>Book review of Berechn,ung und Ausschaltung von Saisonschwankunyen.</u> By A. Wald. Review by: C. T. Saunders, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 47, No. 187 (Sep., 1937), pp. 536-538	A reading on 27/7/38
<b>Nov.</b>	<u>The Principle of Increasing Risk</u> , by M. Kalecki, <i>Economica</i> , Vol. 4, No. 16, pp. 440-47	Few notes from a reading on 1-2/1/38.
	<u>Book review of <i>The Trade Cycle</i> by R.F. Harrod.</u> Review by: H. T. N. Gaitskell, <i>Economica</i> , Vol. 4, No. 16, pp. 472-476.	A reading on 20/1/38.
<b>Dec.</b>	<u>The "Ex-Ante" Theory of the Rate of Interest</u> , by J. M. Keynes, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 47, No. 188, pp. 663-669	Not many contemporary notes, but a number of readings: First on 7/12/37, second 12/12/37, third, 27/7/38,

	<u>The League of Nations Enquiry into the Trade Cycle</u> by R. F. Kahn, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 47, No. 188, pp. 670-679	A reading on 7/12/37.
<b>1938</b>		
	<i>The theory of monopolistic competition: a re-orientation of the theory of value</i> , by E. Chamberlin, third edition, Cambridge: Harvard University Press.	Indications of a reading on 16/8/39.
<b>Feb.</b>	<u>The Rate of Interest and the Optimum Propensity to Consume</u> , by O. Lange, <i>Economica</i> , Vol. 5, No. 17, pp. 12-32	A few notes from a reading on 27/2/38.
<b>June</b>	<u>Alternative Formulations of the Theory of Interest</u> , by A. P. Lerner, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 48, No. 190, pp. 211-230	A number of marginal notes and a reading on 18-19/7/38.
	<u>The Concept of Hoarding</u> , by J. Robinson, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 48, No. 190, pp. 231-236	A reading on 28/7/38 with the comment "excellent article".
	<u>Book review of <i>Studies in the Theory of Economic Expansion</i>. By E. Lundberg.</u> Review by R. F. Kahn, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 48, No. 190, pp. 265-268	A reading on 1/7/38
	<u>Book review of <i>Volkswirtschaftliche Theorie der öffentlichen Investitionen</i></u> , by H. Richter-Altschaffer. Review by H. W. Singer, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 48, No. 190, pp. 276-278	A reading on 14/10/38
	<u>Book review of <i>An Introduction to Money</i>. By W. A. L. Coulborn.</u> Review by H. Smith, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 48, No. 190, pp. 278-279	A reading on 1/7/38
	<u>Book review of <i>Modern Money</i>. By M. Curtis and H. Townshend.</u> Review by W. B. Reddaway, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 48, No. 190, pp. 279-281	A reading on 1/7/38
	<u>Mr. Keynes and "Finance"</u> by D. H. Robertson and <u>Comments</u> by J. M. Keynes. <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 48, No. 190, pp. 314-322	Shackle notes that he read both Robertson's article and Keynes' comments on 28/7/38.
<b>Aug.</b>	<u>Assets, Prices and Monetary Theory</u> , by H. Makower and J. Marschak, <i>Economica</i> , Vol. 5, No. 19, pp. 261-288	A reading on 12-13/8/38, and another reading on 20/12/46.
	<u>Live and Dead Issues in the Methodology of Economics</u> , by L. Robbins, <i>Economica</i> , Vol. 5, No. 19 pp. 342-352	A reading on 13/8/38.
<b>1939</b>		
	<i>Value and Capital: an enquiry into some fundamental principles of economic theory</i> , by J.R. Hicks, Oxford: Clarendon Press	A note of the following date on the front flyleaf 9/2/39. No other evidence that Shackle interacted with the text prior to a 1968 reading.
	<i>Monetary Equilibrium</i> , by G. Myrdal, London: William Hodge	There is evidence of two reading, one on 8/4/41, and a more involved reading on 5-17/6 and 13,17/7 and 6-9/8/43.

	<i>Statistical testing of business-cycle theories. I: A method and its application to investment activity</i> , by J. Tinbergen, Geneva: League of Nations	Two readings noted, 28/5/43, and 29/8 to 13/9/45. The first appearing to be a partial reading in one day. The second reading is far more involved spanning half a month with discussions on technical elements of the text.
<b>1940</b>	<i>Monopolistic Competition and General Equilibrium Theory</i> , by R. Triffin, Cambridge: Harvard University Press	Three readings recorded with some marginal notes. First reading 23-26/12/41. Second reading 28-29-30-31/12/41. New reading 30/9-2/10/43.
<b>Mar.</b>	<u><a href="#">A Model of the Trade Cycle</a></u> , by N. Kaldor, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 50, No. 197, pp. 78-92	A few notes from a reading on 30/3/40 and another reading on 26/5/47.
	<u><a href="#">On a Method of Statistical Business-Cycle Research. A Reply</a></u> , by J. Tinbergen, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 50, No. 197, pp. 141-154	Two readings. One on 30/3/40 and a 'fresh' reading on 28/5/43.
	<u><a href="#">On a Method of Statistical Business-Cycle Research. A Comment</a></u> , by J. M. Keynes, <i>The Economic Journal</i> , Vol. 50, No. 197, pp. 154-156	Two readings. One on 30/3/40 and a 'fresh' reading on 28/5/43.
<b>1941</b>	<i>Employment and Equilibrium- A Theoretical Discussion</i> , by A. Pigou, London: Macmillan	An undated reading, which appears to be from about 1940s with few marginal annotations. Reading dates may have been given in attached notes now missing.
<b>June</b>	<u><a href="#">A Theory of Long-Run Distribution of the Product of Industry</a></u> , by M. Kalecki, <i>OEP</i> , No. 5, pp. 31-41	A few notes from a reading on 6/8/41.
	<u><a href="#">On Risk</a></u> , by J. Steindl, <i>OEP</i> , No. 5, pp. 43-53	Second reading on 13/3/42 (with no notes or dates for a first reading).
<b>1942</b>	<i>Introduction to Algebraic Theories</i> , By A. A. Albert, Chicago: The University of Chicago Press	A very heavily annotated book, with math explanations on matrix manipulation and readings that range from January 1942 to 1945. This book has the most elaborate reading system, explained by Shackle himself in an attached note.
<b>1943</b>	<i>Studies in Economic Dynamics</i> , by M. Kalecki, London: G. Allen & Unwin	A number of readings with minor marginal annotations: 4-7/8/44 second reading 8-10/8/44, other readings and re-readings on 16-18/8/44. [Shackle reviewed this book in <i>Economica</i> (Shackle (1944))]
<b>1945</b>	<i>High Algebra For Schools</i> , by W.L. Ferrar, Oxford: Clarendon Press	A reading with annotations between 30/1 and 11/2/46.

Appendix A

[First letter: Add. 7669/13, Shackle Archive, University Library, Cambridge]

[Letterheads from Liverpool University]

DHV/nbd/G20

28th May, 1969

Professor G.L.S. Shackle,  
Social Studies Building.

Professor Shackle,

We shall be delighted to accept your generous offer to resent to the University Library the books, papers and records that you mention in your letter of 25th May.

I have discussed your letter with Mr. Michael Cook, the University Archivist, and we agree that in view of the nature of this material it is probably better placed in the Library than in the University Archives. It would of course be well looked after in either place.

Perhaps you will let me know when you are ready to transfer these items to the Library, and we can then make arrangements to collect them from you.

I am sure that the Library Committee will be as please as I am to learn of your very kind offer.

May I take this opportunity of wishing you a happy and fruitful retirement?

Yours sincerely,

D.H. Varley

[second letter: Add. 7669/13, Shackle Archive, University Library, Cambridge]

[letterheads Univ. of Liverpool]

DHV/nbd/G20

4th June, 1969

Professor G.L.S. Shackle,  
Social Studies Building.

Dear Professor Shackle,

Thank you for your letter of 2nd June.

The Library Committee warmly welcomed your proposals at its meeting last Friday.

I can quite imagine the difficulties of deciding which parts if any of your "archive" should be retained and which disposed of.

Would it be helpful if we were to arrange to collect the papers from your home and either leave them in the Department for your final look-through, or to assemble the two batches of papers here, for you to look through at your leisure?

I have a car, and live at Heswall, so it would be no inconvenience for me to help with the transport, if this fits in with your wishes.

Perhaps you will let me know what you decide.

Yours sincerely,

D.H. Varley

[six pages typescript of Shackle's book donation to Liverpool attached with a clip to the above letters, that have been incorporated in table 1]



## References

- Bonar, J., 1932, *A catalogue of the library of Adam Smith: author of the "Moral sentiments" and "The wealth of nations"*, 2nd ed., London : Macmillan
- Carpenter, K.E., 1975, *The Economic Bestsellers before 1850*, Cambridge (Mass.): Baker Library
- Cann, K., 2000, "Catalogue of the Shackle Papers", in P. E. Earl and S. F. Frowen (ed.), *Economics as an Art of Thought*, London and New York: Routledge, pp. 368-418.
- Dahlberg, A., 1938, *When capital goes on strike; how to speed up spending*, New York, London: Harper & brothers
- De Vivo, 2014, *Catalogue of the library of Piero Sraffa*, Milano: Fondazione Raffaele Mattioli ; Torino: Fondazione Luigi Einaudi
- Dennison, H. S., L. Filene, R. E. Flanders, and M. E. Leeds, 1938, *Toward full employment*, New York, London: Whittlesey House, McGraw-Hill Book Company
- Earl, P. E. and B. Littleboy, 2014, *G.L.S. Shackle*. Basingstoke: Palgrave.
- Ford, J. L., 1993, "G. L. S. Shackle (1903-1992): A Life with Uncertainty", *The Economic Journal* **103** (418): 683-697.
- Ford, J. L., 1994, *G.L.S. Shackle. The dissenting economist's economist*. Aldershot: Edward Elgar
- Gifford, C. H. P., 1935, "The Period of Production under Continuous Input and Point Output in an Unprogressive Community." *Econometrica* **3**(2): 199-212
- Harrison J., 1983, *The Malthus library catalogue: the personal collection of Thomas Robert Malthus at Jesus College*, New York: Pergamon Press.
- Hawtrey, R. G., 1932, "Book Review of *Prices and Production*. By F.A. Hayek." *Economica* **35**: 119-125
- Hayek, F. A., 1931, "Reflections on the Pure Theory of Money of Mr. J.M. Keynes." *Economica* **11**(33): 270-295
- Hayek, F. A., 1932, "Reflections on the Pure Theory of Money of Mr. J.M.Keynes." *Economica* **12**(35): 22-44
- Keynes, J. M., 1931, "The Pure Theory of Money. A Reply to Dr. Hayek." *Economica*, **11**(34): 387-397
- Lindahl, E., 1939, *Studies in the theory of money and capital*, London, G. Allen & Unwin
- Loasby, B.J., 1989, *The mind and method of the economist: a critical appraisal of major economists in the 20th century*, Aldershot, Hants, England: Edward Elgar Pub.
- Marsh, E. A. G., 1937, *The economic library of Jacob H. Hollander*, Baltimore: J. H. Furst company [Private printing].
- Meadows, G., 1997, *Books, Pamphlets and Offprinted Articles from the Working Library of Professor G.L.S. Shackle*. Private Printing, [A copy exists in the Shackle Archive, University Library, University of Cambridge]
- Merton, R.K., 1965, *On the Shoulders of Giants*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press
- Mizuta, H., 1967, *Adam Smith's library: a supplement to Bonar's catalogue with a checklist of the whole library*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Timlin, M. F., 1942, *Keynesian Economics*, Toronto: University of Toronto Press

- Tsuda, T., 1974-5, *Catalogue des livres de la bibliothèque de Turgot d'après le catalogue manuscrit conservé dans la Bibliothèque nationale*, Paris, (Three Vol.) Tokyo : Institut d'études économiques, Université Hitotsubashi
- Repapis, C., 2017, "F.A. Hayek vs. J.M. Keynes in Shackle's marginal gloss", *working paper*, Institute of Management Studies, Goldsmiths, University of London.
- Saulnier, R.J., 1939, *Contemporary monetary theory: studies of some recent theories of money, prices, and production*, New York: Columbia University
- Schelle G., 1962, *Catalogue de la bibliothèque du Professeur Gustave Schelle de L'université de commerce d'Otaru*. Otaru: L'Université de Commerce
- Shackle, G. L. S., 1933, "Some Notes on Monetary Theories of the Trade Cycle", *The Review of Economic Studies*, **1**(1): 27-38.
- Shackle, G. L. S., 1938, "Book review of When Capital goes on Strike. By A. Dahlberg." *The Economic Journal*, **48**(191): 525-526.
- Shackle, G. L. S., 1939a, "Book review of Toward Full Employment. By H. S. Dennison and others" *The Economic Journal*, **49**(193): 100-102.
- Shackle, G. L. S., 1939b, "Review of *Contemporary Monetary Theory* by R.J. Saulnier." *The Economic Journal*, **49**(195): 501-502.
- Shackle, G. L. S., 1940a, "Review of *Studies in the Theory of Money and Capital*. By Erik Lindahl." *The Economic Journal*, **50**(197): 103-105.
- Shackle, G. L. S., 1940b, "Review of *A Program for Progress*. By John Strachey." *The Economic Journal*, **50**(200): 486-488.
- Shackle, G. L. S., 1943, "Review of *Keynesian Economics*. By Mabel F. Timlin." *Economica*, **10**(39): 260-262.
- Shackle, G. L. S., 1944, "Review of *Studies in Economic Dynamics*. By M. Kalecki." *Economica*, **11**(44): 217-218.
- Shackle, G. L. S., 1945, "Myrdal's Analysis of Monetary Equilibrium." *Oxford Economic Papers*, (7): 47-66.
- Shackle, G.L.S., 1951, "Twenty Years On: a survey of the theory of the multiplier", *The Economic Journal*, **61** (242): 241-260.
- Shackle, G.L.S., 1967, *The Years of High Theory*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Spinazzola, D.F., 1981, *Catalogo della biblioteca di Luigi Einaudi : opere economiche e politiche dei secoli XVI-XIX*, (Two Vol.) Torino: Fondazione Luigi Einaudi. [A supplementary volume was published in 1991]
- Strachey, J., 1940, *A programme for progress*, London: Gollancz
- Yanaihara, T., 1951, *A full and detailed catalogue of books which belonged to Adam Smith, now in possession of the Faculty of Economics*, University Of Tokyo , Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten