

**Posthumous Temporality and Encrypted Historical Time
in Fiction and Life Writing**

J. P. Randall

Goldsmiths, University of London

Ph.D.

Declaration of Authorship

I, James Patrick Randall, hereby declare that this thesis and the work presented in it is entirely my own. Where I have consulted the work of others, this is always clearly stated.

Signed:

Date: 2 March 2018

Posthumous temporality and encrypted historical time in fiction and life writing

James Randall

Abstract

This thesis considers ways of reading posthumousness in narrative in various theoretical and literary constellations by focusing on temporality and historical time. Defining posthumousness in terms of a narrative perspective adopted after the death of a character or the narrator, I consider how writers reanimate historical characters, adopt imagined posthumous perspectives and reconstruct historical memory. I combine approaches to temporality by Paul Ricoeur and Mark Currie, incorporating elements of psychoanalytic and poststructuralist theory including Nicolas Abraham and Maria Torok's writing on crypts, Ned Lukacher's analysis of primal scenes and prosopopoeia, and Jacques Derrida's writing on the archive.

Each chapter considers how historical time is imagined within narratives concerned with posthumousness. Chapter 1 considers how historical time is given a place within the posthumous narrative of Iain Sinclair and Rachel Lichtenstein's *Rodinsky's Room*. Chapters 2 and 3 develop ideas of historical time and the posthumous in relation to Wilhelm Jensen's *Gradiva* and Orhan Pamuk's *The Black Book*. Chapter 4 compares Fernando Pessoa's *The Book of Disquiet* and José Saramago's *The Year of the Death of Ricardo Reis*. Chapter 5 analyzes posthumousness in Bruno Schulz's stories, and how these are reimagined by Jonathan Safran Foer (*Tree of Codes*), David Grossman (*See Under: Love*) and Cynthia Ozick (*The Messiah of Stockholm*).

I focus on these novels' engagement with posthumousness, including how primal elements of memory and historical time are given new presences. I consider how this approach to fiction and historical time gives the past a new life in narrative, giving time for what Schulz describes in his story 'The Age of Genius': 'events that have no place of their own in time; events that have occurred too late, after the whole of time has been distributed, divided and allotted; events that have been left... hanging in the air, homeless and errant.'

[Image excluded in this version for copyright reasons:
Andrzej Klimowski's *The Secret*, linocut, 2002]

Posthumous temporality and encrypted historical time in fiction and life writing

Contents

Acknowledgements	p. 6
Introduction Posthumousness and readings of temporality, crypts and historical time	p. 7
Chapter 1 Temporality and the narrative crypt: Posthumous archival presences in Rachel Lichtenstein and Iain Sinclair's <i>Rodinsky's Room</i>	p. 31
Chapter 2 Posthumous temporality and fictional crypts: Posthumous presences of historical time in Wilhelm Jensen's <i>Gradiva</i> and Orhan Pamuk's <i>The Black Book</i>	p. 69
Chapter 3 Posthumousness in fictional and historical time: Doubling, ruptures and resolutions in Wilhelm Jensen's <i>Gradiva</i> and Orhan Pamuk's <i>The Black Book</i>	p. 104
Chapter 4 Posthumous temporality and crypts of historical time: The presence of posthumous scenes in Fernando Pessoa's <i>The Book of Disquiet</i> and José Saramago's <i>The Year of the Death of Ricardo Reis</i>	p. 141
Chapter 5 'Spring dusk': Posthumous and primal scenes in Bruno Schulz's fictions and fictions that reimagine his work and life	p. 187
Conclusion Posthumousness and fictional conjunctions and encryptions of historical time	p. 238
Bibliography	p. 248

Acknowledgements

This thesis has benefitted greatly from the ongoing faith and patience of my supervisor Professor Josh Cohen, without whom this thesis may have remained encrypted. While it remains cryptic, this work exposes some of the forces at play when we try to decrypt and uncover the life of the past that writing might convey and that our thinking remains possessed by. Acknowledgements here are a hint at these obscured presences.

My exploration of the posthumous has taken on a number of forms since the inception of this research, explored at conferences in Bristol, Vilnius, Canterbury, Colchester and London, including various British Comparative Literature Association conferences for which I gave papers. The European Network for Comparative Literature Studies conference in London in 2012 led to the electronic publication of ‘Sculpting in Lost Time: the Fragmentation of Bruno Schulz’s *The Street of Crocodiles* in Jonathan Safran Foer’s *Tree of Codes*’ in *Comparative and Critical Studies* (Edinburgh University Press, 2013), which forms much of the argument in Chapter 5.

Various contributions from the English and Comparative Literature department at Goldsmiths, University of London have helped to develop my research and cohere my approach, including helpful critiques from Professor Lucia Boldrini, Dr Carol Sweeney, Dr Andreas Kramer and Dr Caroline Blinder. Before that (going back further in time), thanks to Professors Steven Connor and Roger Luckhurst at Birkbeck, University of London (2001-03), whose respective work on ventriloquism and telepathy prompted me to consider the textual life of posthumousness further.

Prior to this, Erasmus-funded MA ethnographic research in Granada, Southern Spain, via the University of Edinburgh and Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona took me into new Islamic communities of Andalusia and on my first vertiginous ventures into posthumous fictional accounts of history via Juan Goytisolo (*Count Julian* and *The Virtues of the Solitary Bird*) and Jan Potocki (*The Manuscript Found in Saragossa*) and more contemporary returns of the repressed.

This has all been written with the care, inspiration and support of my partner Eleanor and our children Charlie and Josefa, and my parents and other family and a host of friends and colleagues, mostly in Devon, London and now also Bath and Bristol.

Introduction

Posthumousness and readings of temporality, crypts and historical time

Outline

In my approaches to posthumousness, I will explore narratives chiefly in terms of perspectives and temporalities relating to the real or imagined death of a main character or the narrator and how their pasts are brought to life within writing. These deaths change how narratives may approach historical time, creating a new relation between narrative, the past and the temporality of the character or narrator. Afterlife and other narratives can use the posthumous perspective to reconsider historical time, using imagined future anterior times of looking back and also through the senses of the present being encrypted with past time.

Fiction provides settings for reconsidering and reimagining temporality. Gérard Genette writes that fiction's engagement with time in narrative is not just 'the temporality of the narrative but in the final instance governing it: the temporality of the narrating itself'.¹ Posthumousness is a concept bound in ideas of time, yet sometimes may appear or promise to be a liberation from them, especially perhaps when the narrator or a character participates in the temporalities opened up by posthumousness. When Paul Auster's narrator describes Quinn in *The New York Trilogy* 'as if he had managed to outlive himself, as if he were somehow living a posthumous life',² he is presenting the ambiguity of the temporality of posthumousness, living and outliving. Posthumousness indicates an idea of the afterlife, but it also includes how a life already lived exists in relation to death.

Temporalities of posthumousness may appear to exist among the veils of theories of haunting and spectrality that can seem to dematerialise understandings of the past. However, the concept of posthumousness is constitutive and structuring in terms of fictional time, bringing historical figures back to life and representing past times. I refer to posthumous temporality to describe how past times imagined after death are made present, while also interposing within historical time, as if mimicking and creating new ruptures of the past. These temporalities draw on experiences of everyday life and

¹ Gérard Genette, *Narrative Discourse: An Essay in Method*, trans. by Jane E. Lewin (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1983), p. 157.

² Paul Auster, *The New York Trilogy* (London: Faber and Faber, 1988), p. 5.

reading, in which the past comes alive and memories are incorporated within the present, informing our understandings of historical time while also disrupting them.

Posthumous temporality comes after life, but it can be imagined in terms of flashing back into historical time from a perspective projected into the future, after a death. To consider posthumousness in relation to temporality and historical time, I am focusing on how specific historical lives and times are explored in fiction posthumously and how these reimagine the relationship between fictional time and historical time. I combine various theoretical approaches including narratology and poststructuralism together with analyses of selected texts. My readings of the posthumous relate to various wider fields, which I outline below. The key areas of my argument relating to posthumousness are: 1. Temporality; 2. Crypts; and 3. Historical time, my focus being how historical time is encrypted within narratives.

1. Posthumousness and temporality

Posthumousness in fictional narratives creates new configurations of narrative temporalities; I will consider a range of narratives to show how it relates to historical time. Paul Ricoeur commented that historical time, for at least two centuries, had concerned the ‘totality of the course of events and the totality of narratives referring to the course of events’.³ Intentionally moving towards an enlarged definition of history, including historical consciousness, he argues that the ‘narrative function, taken in its full scope, covering the developments from the epic to the modern novel, as well as those running from legends to critical history, is ultimately to be defined by its ambition to refigure our historical condition and thereby to raise it to the level of historical consciousness’ (*Time*, p. 102).

This shift in emphasis from historical condition to consciousness develops our interest in what narrative does with temporality. Ricoeur observes that, ‘With the interplay of references among expectation, tradition, and the untimely upheaval of the present, the work of refiguring time by narrative is completed’ (*Time*, p. 103). Time is refigured by narrative, but its completion is at a formal level, for each narrative operates its own refiguration which may disrupt other narratives. Posthumousness is an agent of this temporal refiguring by the author, disrupting the present as the past appears to

³ Paul Ricoeur, *Time and Narrative*, vol. iii, trans by Kathleen Blamey and David Pellauer (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990), p. 102.

invade or open what has come after it. Disruption by the posthumous is in part anticipated and described in emerging modern thought in the 19th century, particularly by Friedrich Nietzsche, with associated new understandings of historical time. Commenting on his essay “On the Utility and Liability of History for Life” Elizabeth Grosz describes this time as ‘dynamized, active, unpredictable, a time that does not forget the past but does not find itself constrained to its terms, for the future has a past inherent in it’.⁴

While Genette’s analysis in *Narrative Discourse* provides Ricoeur with models of the ordering of time within narrative, Ricoeur develops in his *Time and Narrative* series a sense of temporal significance within narrative, including how narrative incorporates lived time, historical time and fictional time. The deeper sense of temporal significance that I will explore involves how analepsis, the return to the past in narrative, is used in relation to the posthumous. Mark Currie builds on analyses of narratology in relation to anachronisms, among other temporal aspects, including analepsis, in *About Time*. This approach provides a way to develop our understanding of the role of the posthumous in fiction in relation to historical time. Analepsis is a way of bridging into the past, while prolepsis allows the development of the future anterior, anticipating future events and their completion. Currie notes how ‘the present of a fictional narrative and the lived present outside of fiction are both experienced in a future anterior mode,’⁵ a mode which conjoins different senses of time within narrative.

Posthumous temporality includes both movements, backwards and forward in time, and always involves a form of future projection. The recognition of heterogeneous and complex representations of time, beyond the basic tenses, within fiction is echoed in various analyses by Currie, considering how ‘fictional narrative in various ways forges together anticipation and retrospect, as the anticipation of retrospect’ (*About*, p. 144). He notes how prolepsis ‘does this by incorporating into the present a future from which that present will be viewed, whether that future is a fictional event or the event of its reading’ (*About*, p. 144).

In some senses, posthumousness and narratives of afterlives are post-historical, in a temporality that is ecstatic or displaced from history. When Nietzsche remarked that ‘it is only after death that we come *into* our life and become alive, oh, very much

⁴ Elizabeth Grosz, *The Nick of Time: Politics, Evolution and the Untimely* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2004), p. 114.

⁵ Mark Currie, *About Time: Narrative, Fiction and the Philosophy of Time* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2012), p. 30.

alive, we posthumous ones!’,⁶ while there’s an intimation of release from time, there’s also an anticipation of a future analepsis, in terms of an expected return to the past after death. Nietzsche’s comments refer to the untimeliness of posthumousness in how it appears to distance the present from time, as if somehow suspended from the moment, awaiting a return. In this untimeliness of posthumousness, just as the uncanny, the *unheimlich*, relates to the home, temporality is fundamental to the posthumous in its untimeliness, surprise, disruptive and anachronistic senses.

Currie, drawing on Grosz’s work, refers to the ‘untimely’ in terms of the unexpected and the surprising, including ‘interruptions in the continuity of time’⁷ as well as things that do not appear to fit in with standard narrative approaches to time. He refers to how ‘The event can only arise in the absence of anticipation. It must arrive without appearing in any horizon of expectation, from above’ (*Unexpected*, p. 91). The event is the appearance of time via the untimely, and so posthumousness, a form of extratemporality, might relate to historical time. Bruno Schulz describes certain elements of the untimely in his story ‘The Age of Genius’: ‘events that have no place of their own in time; events that have occurred too late, after the whole of time has been distributed, divided and allotted; events that have been left in the cold, unregistered, hanging in the air, homeless and errant.’⁸ His stories present these events through his reimagining of time, including his development of a posthumous approach to narrative which I will explore later in this introduction and in Chapter 5.

Posthumousness as a form of untimeliness relates to the future anterior which Currie describes as having ‘a tense structure for the arrival of the unexpected, an impossible arrival which promoted interruption above presence, which anticipates without having content, and which yet has the characteristics of a moral or political responsibility.’⁹ The posthumous turns the anticipation into the *fait accompli*, a temporality of an imagined past caught within the horizon of the returning gaze of the future anterior. The content is delivered posthumously, a temporal presence hidden within the text, complicating past presence. This presence includes interiorised, silenced, buried and hidden times, not restricted to performative and visible times.

⁶ Friedrich Nietzsche, *The Gay Science*, trans. by Josefine Nauckhoff (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), p. 230.

⁷ Currie, *The Unexpected: Narrative Temporality and the Philosophy of Surprise* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2015), p. 78.

⁸ Bruno Schulz, ‘The Age of Genius’, in *The Street of Crocodiles and other stories*, trans. by Celina Wieniewska (London: Penguin, 2008), p. 129.

⁹ Currie, *Unexpected*, p. 95.

Reflecting the evolution and emergence of new ideas relating to concepts of temporality, historical memory and consciousness in the late 19th and early 20th centuries, when Nietzsche refers to ‘we posthumous people’ in 1882, he is engaging with ideas of lived time and historical consciousness that emerge in fiction more emphatically with Modernism. He is recognising temporal existence outside of a standard historical time and how lived time may acquire new meanings in relation to a new (and disruptive) historical understanding.

Posthumously, a more developed sense of historical consciousness is made possible. Cacciari comments that, like the hikers in Nietzsche’s *Human, All Too Human*, posthumous people ‘silently collect and maintain their multiple voices’ and ‘only after the death of “we the subject” – and therefore only after death – will they have their lives’.¹⁰ Paul S. Loeb includes Zarathustra as an embodiment of this posthumous character,¹¹ a phantom representing a self that dies and is recreated, haunting but also releasing the memories of the living. This presence interrupts narrative temporality. Cacciari describes posthumous people further in the light of Nietzsche’s comments, writing that, ‘Not only do posthumous people indicate the end of “we, the subject,” but they are the only ones to survive, as mere phantasms, after the end of the subject. They are the only ones to initiate the hearing of the abyss, the *Ab-grund*, the dimension gaping beyond the foundation of the ground, the *fundamentum veritatis*’ (*Posthumous*, p. 5).

Developing the idea of the ‘posthumous people’ as if they are born with Nietzsche, Cacciari states: ‘They are the hikers in Nietzsche’s *Human, All Too Human* who seek to understand how things of the world proceed and who silently collect and maintain their multiple voices. In this way, posthumous people come alive’ (*Posthumous*, p. 5). Cacciari’s comments hint at presences of the posthumous in narrative and how we might reconsider the nature of historical time in relation to this spectralism. Writing on the developing meaning of the posthumous, he comments that, ‘to call people posthumous is not to call them untimely. The term “untimely” carries, however unconsciously, the possibility of becoming timely. Untimely people can always look ahead to their own time. Not so for posthumous people; they are absolutely protected from the risk of expectation’ (*Posthumous*, p. 5). Cacciari’s interpretation suggests that their time isn’t completed by posthumous presence, for posthumousness disrupts narratives of lived time, excluding a sense of time’s ending, while emphasising

¹⁰ Massimo Cacciari, *Posthumous People: Vienna at the Turning Point*, trans. by Rodger Friedman (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996), p. 5.

¹¹ Paul S. Loeb interprets Nietzsche’s *Thus Spake Zarathustra* in *The Death of Zarathustra* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2010).

time's fragmentation and its folding, as if backwards, bringing the past into the present. The temporal aporias of narrated time and historical time discussed by Ricoeur in *Time and Narrative* are not resolved – they are refigured.

In narrative, posthumous time is sometimes used to respond to conflicts of historical memory indicated by the archive and the crypt; in its untimeliness, as Cacciari notes, the posthumous does not satisfy expectation – it surprises and confuses it. Commenting on Derrida's essay 'At This Very Moment in This Work Here I Am'¹² on Emmanuel Levinas, Currie writes how we might be able to 'regard the future anterior and the messianic, the strange combination, on one hand, of anticipation and retrospect, and the unforeseeable arrival, on the other, as the same structure.'¹³ The unexpected is retold as that which has happened: an untimely history.

Engaging with posthumousness, I will explore how the novel develops and reimagines a new time, reconsidering the place of historical memory within fiction, as if death is imagined in order to reconsider historical time. Following Cacciari's comments above, the untimely does not become timely, it interrupts narrative temporality, demands a new idea of historical time. Posthumousness must be understood in relation to historical time beyond standard readings of past, present, and future time. Ricoeur noted that 'history in some way makes use of fiction to refigure time and, on the other hand, fiction makes use of history for the same ends' (*Time*, p. 181). Narratives concerned with posthumousness engage with and change our ideas of historical time.

Reimagining temporality has been integral to modernist and postmodern writing, as Brian McHale argues in *Postmodernist Fiction*, showing how the accommodation, incorporation and reimagination of different temporalities has been intrinsic to narrative reinvention. Fictional uses of history and historical time include the analeptic and the proleptic, which refer respectively to backward temporal projection (which can include from the position of death) and forward projection (including towards death). Understanding hybrid, complex temporalities which appear to be looking back and forward simultaneously demands further interpretation, relating temporality to consciousness as well as to historical time and memory, including its fragmentation, supplementation, defacement and encryption.

¹² Jacques Derrida, 'At This Very Moment in This Work Here I Am', in *Psyche: Inventions of the Other*, vol. ii, trans. by Ruben Berezdivin and Peggy Kamuf (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2007), pp. 143-190.

¹³ Currie, *Unexpected*, p. 95.

I will be considering posthumous temporality within a broad analytic framework, in the context of critical and theoretical literature that connects narratology with psychoanalysis and deconstruction. Posthumousness creates a narrative space in which historical time is disrupted, but where reconstruction also takes place. There's a restlessness and uncanniness of these narrative temporalities, requiring analyses in terms of both temporality and narrative form, where normative notions of time and presence are disrupted. In the following passage from Schulz's story 'Sanitorium Under the Sign of the Hourglass' the posthumous represents a kind of hidden or illusory temporality that disrupts the normal visible flow of time. Temporality is reconfigured but also operates as the major character of the story. At the beginning, the dying father is taken to a sanatorium, where, though he has died by the time he gets there, the time at the sanatorium is just behind real time, and slowed down, so death does not appear to arrive. The father's son is told:

“You know as well as I that from the point of view of your home, from the perspective of your own country, your father is dead. This cannot be entirely remedied. That death throws a certain shadow on his existence here.”

“But does Father himself know it, does he guess?” I asked him in a whisper.

He shook his head with deep conviction. “Don't worry,” he said in a low voice. “None of our patients know it, or can guess. The whole secret of the operation,” he added, ready to demonstrate its mechanism on his fingers, “is that we have put back the clock. Here we are always late by a certain interval of time of which we cannot define the length. The whole thing is a matter of simple relativity. Here your father's death, the death that has already struck him in your country, has not occurred yet.”¹⁴

Schulz's story presents a scene in which, with a little manipulation, both perception and experience of time are altered. In this alteration, death is overcome, and so the narrative finds itself within a temporality outside a standard idea of lived time, for the father's death only 'throws a certain shadow on his existence here.' This cryptic temporality includes both lived time and death, thanks to what Schulz calls the 'secret of the operation', unknown to those people who experience it, mirroring a character's own unconscious sense of their own temporality within a novel. The story suggests new interpretations of historical time, refiguring lived time through the incorporation of the posthumous.

¹⁴ Schulz, 'Sanitorium Under the Sign of the Hourglass', *Street*, p. 244.

I will explore how posthumous temporality reconfigures the future anterior and the analeptic, operating from a perspective as if beyond death, narratives returning to and excavating sites of death, lost memory and buried historical time, concerned with prehistory, archive and cryptic sites. Narrative use of posthumous temporality changes how historical time is understood, encrypting senses of historical time within fiction. I have limited my analyses to texts that best illuminate temporality in relation to posthumousness, including the fictional development of historical time by José Saramago and by various writers on Schulz.

The major limitation of my research and argument in terms of temporality is historical period, ranging from Fernando Pessoa's *The Book of Disquiet* from the early 20th century (the book compiles texts written throughout his writing career, to his death in 1935) to Jonathan Safran Foer's *Tree of Codes*, published in 2010. This range demarcates a literary historiography from Modernism to later Postmodernism, a historical period which raises specific questions of how we understand temporality, questions that appear in relation to various writers who have engaged with problems of time. These include authors ranging from Walter Benjamin to Roland Barthes, whose texts have a direct bearing on how we understand posthumousness in relation to narrative temporality.

2. Posthumousness and crypts

Exploring temporality in relation to posthumousness in narrative reveals different forms of time, including hidden and cryptic presences. Defining a crypt in terms of this hidden time within narrative, I consider how fiction approaches historical time via crypts, including where a writer supplements voids of historical memory.

There are basic cryptic qualities of literature, each page holding traces of someone who once existed (if the author is no longer alive), marking also moments that have ceased to exist. The material, printed body of the text is left by the author, in which characters, narrative voices and dramatic moments convey presence and leave traces, indicating hidden presences but also apparent voids. Imprinted by the author's time, a book accumulates invisible and visible times as it is read: critical analyses, secondary works, sequels, readings and re-readings, as well as the imprints of annotations, fingerprints, underlinings and question marks. A book's life also develops through the public archive and other cultures of engagement, as archives are generated and cryptic

presences within texts are recognised, though senses of absence also remain and may indeed expand.

Decryption of a text reveals how narrative temporality conceals or excludes certain aspects of historical time, including the act of hiding. Jacques Derrida asks, as if commenting on detective mystery: ‘What is a crypt? No crypt presents itself. The grounds are so disposed as to disguise and hide: something, always a body in some way. But also to disguise the act of hiding and to hide the disguise: the crypt hides as it holds.’¹⁵

Crypts conceal different times within narrative; we may open these crypts, not simply to look inside to discover what has been concealed, but with the anticipation that what is inside resists decay, operating according to a different time or semantic system that disrupts a simple notion of presence, having its own logic of survival or resistance against defacement. Nicolas Abraham and Maria Torok’s psychoanalytic use of the idea of the crypt develop it in terms of how memories, figures and signs are hidden, particularly within language. They write, ‘The crypt works in the heart of the Ego as a special kind of Unconscious: each fragment is conscious of itself and unconscious of the realm “outside the crypt.”’¹⁶ The schism between the crypt and its outside is necessary for the incorporation of the crypt of historical time. If it was conscious of exteriority, historical time would lose its claim to pastness: it would have become present. Posthumousness and encryptedness ensures historical time’s pastness, and the representing of the past is conditional on its unconscious existence.

Understanding narrative time benefits from knowing this mode of temporal encryption, through which we might find the work of the posthumous. The sense of how narrative works cryptically, holding unconscious elements of historical time is referred to in Ricoeur’s work. Following Genette’s work on narratology, he explores the role of ‘games with time’, in which ‘characters unfold their own time in the fiction, a time that includes a past, a present and future – even quasi-presents – as they shift their temporal axis in the course of the fiction. It is this fictive present that we attribute to the fictive author of the discourse, to the narrator.’¹⁷

¹⁵ Derrida, ‘Foreword: *Fors*: The English Words of Nicolas Abraham and Maria Torok’, trans. by Barbara Johnson, in *The Wolf Man’s Magic Word: A Cryptonymy*, by Nicolas Abraham and Maria Torok, trans. by Nicholas Rand (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986), p. xiv.

¹⁶ Abraham and Torok, *Wolf*, p. 80.

¹⁷ Ricoeur, *Time and Narrative*, vol. ii, trans by Kathleen McLaughlin and David Pellauer (University of Chicago Press, 1985), p. 98.

The ‘fictive present’ is created by the ‘fictive author’, but it is also the place of the burial of the actual author. Barthes’ reflections on what he described as ‘The Death of the Author’,¹⁸ bringing attention to authorial absence in terms of determining signification, marked not just a new sense of the modern text’s presence as a form or system of writing with its own life. It also offered a new life to the author, beyond concept or textual authority, having forms of existence within the text. Dead in terms of the imagined Author’s orchestrating or determining meaning, the author survives as a body textually submerged through the act of writing, in the movement from thought to narrative.

The ‘Author’ as concept, pronounced dead, isn’t simply spirited away outside of and at a remove from the text. Barthes writes of the more figuratively spectral and embryonic authorial presence within writing in his opening to *Roland Barthes*, his auto-obituary: ‘*you will find here, mingled with the “family romance,” only the figurations of the body’s prehistory – of that body making its way toward the labor and the pleasure of writing.*’¹⁹ Here he describes a life as if foetally, this prehistory of the body, writing emerging from this prehistory. Two sentences later, Barthes writes (*Barthes*, p. 2):

Once I produce, once I write, it is the Text itself which (fortunately) dispossesses me of my narrative continuity. The text can recount nothing; it takes my body elsewhere, far from my imaginary person, toward a kind of memoryless speech which is already the speech of the People, of the non-subjective mass (or of the generalized subject) even if I am still separated from it by my way of writing.

With the emergence of writing, there is this simultaneous sense of disappearance or hiddenness of the author’s self within the text. There are other bodies and times hidden within the text, which decryption may connect to the earlier historical time. Considering the role of the posthumous in fictional and non-fictional writing, I will look at the decrypting pursuit of historical time in the writing of Iain Sinclair and Rachel Lichtenstein, Wilhelm Jensen, Pamuk, Pessoa, Saramago, David Grossman, Cynthia Ozick and Foer.

Each of these writers’ narratives include a sense of historical time as a palimpsestic layer. We find the life of David Rodinsky in Sinclair and Lichtenstein’s book, not as a

¹⁸ Roland Barthes, ‘The Death of the Author’, in *The Rustle of Language*, trans. by Richard Howard (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1989), pp. 49-55.

¹⁹ Barthes, *Roland Barthes*, trans. by Richard Howard (London: Macmillan General Books, 1995), p. 1.

phantom Golem, but brought to life as a historical figure; we have the historical Pessoa and his heteronym of Ricardo Reis in Saramago's *The Year of the Death of Ricardo Reis*; and the historical figure of Schulz, redrawn in Grossman's *See Under: Love* and Ozick's *The Messiah of Stockholm*.

These revived, decrypted historical figures aren't the afterlives of angels or gods, but of characters taking on new mythical lives within a new historical time. Where Modernists including Jean Cocteau and James Joyce resurrected classical gods and figures, these historical figures appear as new gods in the form of phantom historical characters. The ghosts of gothic fiction are displaced by posthumous lives, imagining the lives of Rodinsky, Pessoa, Moses, Schulz, Walter Benjamin, de Man and others. Crypts and archives, phantasms and other post-life forms appear in fictional narrative offering new ways of presenting temporality, changing how the historical past is framed and reframed, as well as remembered, resurrected, reconstructed and encrypted.

Novelists are drawn to lives of writers such as Benjamin and Schulz, whose lives, archived and erased, present the opportunity for retelling and completion, if only via imaginative means through a posthumous perspective. Fiction offers new ways of incorporating the imagination of the past, changing our idea of time in the novel with respect to historical memory and the posthumous perspective. Partial or structural voids of historical knowledge offers the opportunity – or more actively – demands supplementation. A writer's concern for the historical does not eliminate the fictional, and a fictional approach does not exclude the historical, but posthumous engagement with the past involves dealing with conflicts between different modes of representing temporality in fiction and historical narratives.

How writers address crypts of historical time informs their approach to narrative development. Their engagement with crypts and archives can be a radical reactivation and realignment of history, for while the archive is an act of conservation, it is also a place of conflict between versions of historical memory and historical time. Fiction can include these historical crypts, which are transformed through the posthumous perspective, through which historical time is disrupted and reconfigured. Superficial considerations of archives give the impression that they conform to a historicist's idea of an unchanging history, where the past remains forever static. Writing on the archive in his essay 'The Archives of Eden', George Steiner comments on USA institutions' accumulation, preservation and archiving of European cultural artefacts. He refers to 'the exhibitionist conservatism, the archival ostentation, of American cultural emporia.

The *incunabula* and first editions shimmer inert in the hushed sanctuary of the Beinecke Library in New Haven, untouched by human hands....The Stradivarius hangs mute in the electronically guarded case.²⁰

Steiner brings to our attention the appearance of the archive freezing the past, with no future life beyond this static preservation. This archival appearance represses more complex ideas of historical time. An archive can alternatively be understood as a place of interpreting, analyzing, translating and transforming the past. The archive, then, not as stasis (and as an ideal to be preserved) but as metamorphic, as past culture is actively remembered, decrypted and reused. This active sense is present in many US (and other) novelists' relationships with modern European history, intentionally animating and rethinking the past.

In literature, the archive has a posthumous and prosthetic life that Derrida draws out in *Archive Fever*. Fiction and other writing on biographical memory offers new engagement with the past via posthumous temporality. What is hidden in crypts within writing is not just the body, it is the time of the body, of whoever buried the body, and the time of the body in relation to its past and future. The opening of the crypt is the beginning of a decryption, revealing what is hidden, including that which doesn't present itself – systems of meanings, presences, traces and references that are concealed. Abraham and Torok show how words hide meanings and how narratives can conceal secrets and bodies that have been incorporated cryptically. By exploring posthumous temporality, we might understand a form of cryptic historical presence within the novel concerned both with historical time (the having been) as well as the 'to come' (including death and posthumousness).

Cryptic senses of historical time, including a simulated future anterior (of the dead) and exhumation (of the pre-born), are found in Samuel Beckett's novel *The Unnamable*. The narrative is written as if from a coffin and/or womb, reflected in the doubling and confusing of times ('it's tiring in the end, and it's only the beginning'²¹). The novel presents the author itself as a body indeterminate, unborn and dead, alive and insensate, unsure of its sense of historical time, decomposing within the narrative, foetal yet corpse, a presence that has lost its sense of time, part of its dematerialisation. It states (*Unnamable*, pp. 123-124):

²⁰ George Steiner, 'The Archives of Eden', in *No Passion Spent* (London: Faber and Faber, 1997), p. 413.

²¹ Samuel Beckett, *The Unnamable* (London: Faber and Faber, 2010), p. 105.

...I don't feel a mouth on me, that means nothing, if only I could feel a mouth on me, if only I could feel something on me, I'll try, if I can, I know it's not I, that's all I know, I say I, knowing it's not I... perhaps he's here, in my arms, I don't feel any arms on me, if only I could feel something on me, it would be a starting-point...

This material absence is a form of encryption, bringing together the past and future in a mysterious union. Beckett writes (*Unnamable*, p. 100):

...perhaps that's what I feel, an outside and an inside and me in the middle, perhaps that's what I am, the thing that divides the world in two, on the one side the outside, on the other the inside, that can be as thin as foil... I'm the partition, I've two surfaces and no thickness, perhaps that's what I feel, myself vibrating, I'm the tympanum, on the one hand the mind, on the other the world...

It is a life close to death, knowing its own encryptedness, while offering an opening into an historical time, awoken or replayed from memory, the unconscious yielding to consciousness. The body is dematerialized, the disappearance marking a cryptic time, as if historical time has been erased or internalised, almost invisible.

Beckett's narrative appears to be posthumous, and yet it encrypts a form of presence in spite of or perhaps enabled by death. Derrida writes that writing has a sense of inherent absence and implicit death: 'The statement "I am alive" is accompanied by my being dead, and its possibility requires the possibility that I be dead; and conversely. This is not an extraordinary tale by Poe but the ordinary story of language.'²² This 'story of language' indicates the presence of the posthumous, as if language always carries hidden bodies within it, holding and hiding what remains what is alive from the past.

We find these encryptions in other books that at first may appear to be excursions in historical or biographical time. In his analysis of Barthes' *Camera Lucida*, Badmington considers how the text refers to Barthes' posthumously published *Mourning Diary*. Barthes' writing on his dead mother in *Camera Lucida* goes back to earlier descriptions of maternal feeling in *Mourning Diary*, his words forming the crypt in which his memory of her is rearticulated. Within this space of death, it is as if Barthes is returning from the tomb to the womb (Barthes is buried in the same graveyard as his mother in Urt, France).

This textual encryption points to my wider consideration of the encryption of historical time within narrative. In *The Museum of Innocence*, Pamuk remarks that 'Real

²² Derrida, *Speech and Phenomena and Other Essays on Husserl's Theory of Signs*, trans. by David. B. Allison (Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1973), pp. 96-97.

museums are places where Time is transformed into Space',²³ and my approach to reading posthumousness is to turn a text's development of a cryptic space into an understanding of the encryptedness of historical time within narrative. Posthumous spaces are often heavy with memory, as we find in Pamuk's *The Black Book*, which I explore in Chapters 2 and 3, presenting historical time in relation to a posthumous temporality incorporated within narrative. The text can be read within modern Turkey's and Istanbul's history, reflecting the uneasy transition and historical rupture under Atatürk, but it is also about intimate encryptions. The main character Galip returns to an apartment that he'd once known:

The room was exactly as it had been a quarter century earlier, when Celâl the young unmarried journalist had lived here. Everything - the furniture, the curtains, the placement of the lamps the colors, the shadows, the smells - exactly replicated the room of twenty-five years ago. If there was anything new, it was a simulation of something old...²⁴

What Galip finds is more than a museum. It is an archive re-activated, preserved in a continuous past as if active time hadn't occurred. This space gives him the opportunity to try to understand the nature of his lost past. Pamuk writes of Galip: 'he felt less like a detective in forced pursuit of his missing wife than a man who has just gained entry to the first museum ever to exhibit his primary passion in life and is strolling from room to marvelous room in openmouthed awe'.²⁵ This posthumous temporality integrates the past as a fiction within historical memory, an approach that runs through my analyses of Jensen's *Gradiva*, Pamuk's *The Black Book*, Saramago's *The Year of the Death of Ricardo Reis*, Grossman's *See Under: Love* and also Schulz's *The Street of Crocodiles*.

In my first chapter, I focus on two rooms to begin my exploration of posthumousness – the room in the Rue Morgue of Poe's story, and Rodinsky's bedsit in Sinclair and Lichtenstein's book. In both narratives, history is recreated within the fictional text, but as a posthumous, cryptic presence. In Grossman's *See Under: Love*, which I refer to in Chapter 5, we are presented with a mysterious, magical crypt of historical memory. The main character, Momik, has an obsession with the Polish writer Bruno Schulz's life. While researching within the Israeli Holocaust museum (Yad Vashem), Momik learns about the (fictional) White Room, 'at the end of one of the subterranean corridors of

²³ Pamuk, *The Museum of Innocence*, trans. by Maureen Freely (London: Faber and Faber, 2010) p. 700.

²⁴ Pamuk, *The Black Book*, trans. by Maureen Freely (London: Faber and Faber, 2006), p. 237.

²⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 240.

Yad Vashem',²⁶ which is described as not 'a room at all, in fact, but a kind of tribute... a tribute from all the books, all the pictures and words and films and facts and numbers about the Holocaust at Yad Vashem to that which must remain forever unresolved, forever beyond our comprehension' (*Love*, p. 121).

This description helps us to understand the relation between posthumousness and historical time, and how crypts might serve as places for reimagining the past. These crypts are spaces we can recognise the presence of in everyday life. In Neil Badmington's analysis of Barthes' *Mourning Diary*, he refers to the apartment which Barthes shared with his mother. After her death, Barthes describes a living space that is 'now also a non-living space, a space of absence, of the lost, of a demand to dwell differently.'²⁷ Badmington quotes Barthes' diary: 'What separates me from *maman* (from the mourning that was my identification with her) is the density (enlarging, gradually accumulating) of the time when, since her death, I have been able to live without her, inhabit the apartment, work, go out, etc.'²⁸

It is as if a crypt is being created – this 'density' – in which Barthes is creating his new life. Badmington writes that 'This sense of separation, this long and slow acceptance of dwelling alone, this work of mourning, is bound to the apartment, to the living space where death is admitted' (*Afterlives*, p. 18). Barthes is conscious of his own encryptedness within this space, and how he is seeking life within it. In his notes he refers to written sketches towards a possible new work, 'filed away in a red cardboard folder marked with the words 'VITA NOVA' (*Afterlives*, p. 23). Badmington refers to Barthes stating: 'I must choose my last life, my new life, 'Vita Nova'...I must emerge from that shadowy state.'²⁹ This new work, this emergence is written in the space of mourning, a new life that is an incubation of what remains alive of the past. Barthes writes *Camera Lucida* 'around *maman*' (*Mourning*, p. 133) as if he is holding her life and body within the text, 'as if I had to make *maman* recognized' (*Mourning*, p. 133).

In his encryptions of his dead mother's life, Barthes evokes a sense of the posthumous inhabitation of historical time. This encrypted maternal presence recalls W. G. Sebald's *Austerlitz*, images of Austerlitz's mother being discovered within a film of the Nazi

²⁶ David Grossman, *See Under: Love*, trans. by Betsy Rosenberg (London: Vintage, 1999), p. 121.

²⁷ Neil Badmington, *The Afterlives of Roland Barthes* (London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2016), p. 17.

²⁸ Barthes, *Mourning Diary: October 26, 1977 – September 15, 1979*, trans. by Richard Howard (New York: Hill and Wang, 2010), p. 228.

²⁹ Barthes, Lecture, 19 October 1978, quoted in Badmington, *Afterlives*, p. 23.

encampment at Theresienstadt. Austerlitz slows down these images, as if, like Barthes, he is seeking to move from the cinematic to the photographic, as if, posthumously, he may find the true image within a frozen historical time. Slowed down, time decrypted, Austerlitz finds presence caught within the frame of dead time. By slowing down time, the punctum is discovered. Barthes writes of this presence of death in photographs: ‘I observe with horror an anterior future of which death is the stake. By giving me the absolute past of the pose... the photograph tells me death in the future... Whether or not the subject is already dead, every photograph is this catastrophe.’³⁰ Posthumously, historical time is reimagined, defined by this early presence of death; Barthes writes of photographs, ‘there is always a defeat of Time in them: that is dead and that is going to die’ (*Camera*, p. 96).

Just as Austerlitz does when in search of images of his mother, and as Barthes does as he understands the presence of his mother in his apartment, after her death, a form of posthumous temporality can be found within the crypt, to be understood within a new sense of historical time. The encryption is also a form of rupture in historical time, Barthes writing that ‘each photograph always contains this imperious sign of my future death’ (*Camera*, p. 97). This is like the vision of historical time represented by Benjamin when he remarks that ‘To articulate the past historically does not mean to recognize it ‘the way it really was’ (Ranke). It means to seize hold of a memory as it flashes up at a moment of danger.’³¹ This moment of danger includes narratives of death, crypts of historical time in which life appears in suspense, posthumously holding life which threatens to reorder a sense of the historical. Momentary disturbance of time brings time into a new focus.

The return to cryptic historical time in narratives is a recurring theme of my argument. In relation to posthumousness, the writing after the death of the narrator or a character forms a new configuration of historical time within narrative. As Sebald describes episodes of encrypted historical time, as if found among palimpsests of the archive, compressed and interleaved layers of historical time, so we may find in posthumous fictions other encryptions of historical time, and other hidden bodies that are given new life.

³⁰ Barthes, *Camera Lucida: Reflections on Photography*, trans. by Richard Howard (London: Vintage, 1993), p. 96.

³¹ Walter Benjamin, ‘Theses on the Philosophy of History’, in *Illuminations*, ed. by Hannah Arendt, trans. by Harry Zorn (London: HarperCollins, 1992), p. 247.

3. Posthumousness and historical time

While focusing on posthumousness in relation to temporality, I will be considering how specific fictional narratives appear to aspire to a condition of history or simulation of lost historical time. There are mimeses of historical memory and time in these fictions, but also reconfigurations of what this might mean. I am defining historical time as more than what happened and the attempt to represent that, to include also what is encrypted, defaced and masked, so that we may understand how fiction might decrypt, re-face and unmask. Posthumous fiction reconstructs, reimagines and presents dramatizations of past fragments in ways that regard the historical as more than an aspect of mourning for or reconstruction of past time.

The posthumous novel develops fictional approaches to historical time, exploring how narrative inhabits or incorporates the past. Posthumousness in fiction changes our sense of the relatedness between historical time and being-in-time, as if trying to resolve a deeper conflict. Giorgio Agamben observes that, ‘The fundamental contradiction of modern man is precisely that he does not yet have an experience of time adequate to his idea of history.’³² This is not an absence of time but a sense of confusion. He is, Agamben says, ‘therefore painfully split between his being-in-time as an elusive flow of instants and his being-in-history, understood as the original dimension of man’ (*Infancy*, p. 109).

Agamben’s observation regarding temporality is relevant to how narrative may seek to resolve conflicts over historical time, introducing new complexities, for example in a conflict between being-in-time and being-in-history. My focus on posthumous elements of these temporalities, including ruptures and upheavals in time, show writers in pursuit of ‘an experience of time adequate to his idea of history’ (*Infancy*, p. 109). While I am not seeking to outline broad theories of historical time, and nor am I examining at great length, for example, Benjamin’s or Nietzsche’s engagement with this, I am nonetheless considering ways in which understanding posthumousness and the crypt in relation to narrative might suggest new approaches to historical time within specific posthumous fictions.

Benjamin proposes explanations of historical time in relation to biography, theology, historical materialism and natural history; key recurring motifs in his writing include

³² Giorgio Agamben, *Infancy and History: The Destruction of Experience*, trans. by Liz Heron (London: Verso, 2007), p. 109.

senses of transformation and disruption within time. In *Berlin Childhood Around 1900*, Benjamin describes how, ‘Like a mollusk in its shell, I had my abode in the nineteenth century, which now lies hollow before me like an empty shell’,³³ hollow and yet still containing elements from his childhood, aural memories that survive distorted, transformed as if a crypt of the past. Eduardo Cadava, in his evocative elucidation of this passage, describes the mollusk as ‘The perfect autobiographical form, it registers, inscribes and imprints every moment of the process whereby what is living becomes petrified.’³⁴ Life continues alongside this petrification – a doubling of historical time that reflects the complexity of posthumous temporality.

Benjamin’s figure of the ‘Angel of History’ conveys the vision of ‘one single catastrophe which keeps piling wreckage upon wreckage.’³⁵ He writes, ‘the angel would like to stay, awaken the dead, and make whole what has been smashed’ (‘Theses’, p. 249). Benjamin’s description moves on, the angel propelled into the future anterior. Historical time is not only the place of rupture, it is also something appearing as if posthumously, for ‘This storm irresistibly propels him into the future to which his back is turned, while the pile of debris before him grows skyward’ (‘Theses’, p. 249). This is another image of historical time proliferating, both as spectacle and material reality.

In Benjamin’s description, historical time is reimagined as a violent process in which the posthumous perspective might offer some clarity, in a temporality marked by death yet resistant to death. Posthumousness disrupts how historical time may be considered, developing our understanding of being-in-history and historical consciousness. Ricoeur’s concept of ‘games with time’ include narrative engagements with historical time; where historical memories, crypts and archives are incorporated within literature, fiction forms new relationships with historical time.

The narratives I will be analysing reflect this historical complexity, including Freud’s return to Moses, Pamuk’s return to Rumi, Saramago’s return to Pessoa, and various writers’ returns to Schulz. These fictional narratives frame historical time, constructing a relation of the posthumous to the once living. These narratives are largely imaginary, fictional crypts of historical time. Saramago’s novel describes a posthumous life of Pessoa, in the period of the dictatorship in Portugal and the Spanish Civil War. He uses

³³ Benjamin, *Berlin Childhood Around 1900*, trans. by Howard Eiland (Cambridge: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2006), p. 98.

³⁴ Eduardo Cadava, *Words of Light: Theses on the Photography of History* (Princeton: Princeton University Press), p. 122.

³⁵ Benjamin, ‘Theses’, p. 249.

the posthumous perspective to offer a new sense of how this historical moment developed, incorporating it within a fantasy of historical time.

The narratives of posthumous time reveal transformations, not just of the dead into the living, but also of the past into a crypt within the present. In these fictional constructions of historical time, the past sometimes flashes up in unexpected ways. Sebald's *Austerlitz* has been read as a portrayal of Benjamin, as if there is a ruin or broken simulacra of Benjamin surviving within the text, a form of prosthetic memory, what Eric L. Santner refers to as 'a family resemblance to certain of Benjamin's interests and procedures.'³⁶ Historical time is dematerialised (Santner refers to 'spectral materialism' (*Creaturely*, p. 52)), through the disorientation of Austerlitz in his evacuation to North Wales and then given new life, a posthumous time, in which his past is recovered.

Sebald not only appears to resurrect Benjamin, he also reflects some of his thinking on historical time, which I explore within various other texts, particularly in terms of the historical time in relation to biography. In her essay on Sebald's *The Emigrants*, Ozick describes the 'posthumous sublime',³⁷ his signature form of writing that recovers, gives a new life to and poeticizes memory after death. Sebald created numerous narrative crypts, from *The Rings of Saturn* to *Austerlitz*, his own life and the lives of his subjects intentionally crossing over as he finds life narratives that are buried but open to revivification. He reveals imagined buried, encrypted narratives hidden within other narratives of historical memory. *Austerlitz* moves between personal memories and objective histories; the narrator conveys how, while in the Breendonk fort outside Antwerp: 'I think how little we can hold in mind, how everything is constantly lapsing into oblivion with every extinguished life, how the world is, as it were, draining itself, in that the history of countless places and objects which themselves have no power of memory is never heard, never described or passed on.'³⁸

Sebald moves through personal memories as if transfixed by a sublime or elusive historical memory. There is a sense of posthumousness as he gathers dead things, or things that have fallen out of time, finding new ways to incorporate memory within narrative, creating new senses of history's temporality as he moves towards the uncovering of childhood history, including Austerlitz's evacuation from Prague to

³⁶ Eric L. Santner, *On Creaturely Life: Rilke, Benjamin, Sebald* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006), p. 54.

³⁷ Cynthia Ozick, 'The Posthumous Sublime', in *Quarrel & Quandary* (New York: Knopf, 2000), pp. 26-41.

³⁸ W. G. Sebald, *Austerlitz*, trans. by Anthea Bell (London, Penguin Books, 2011), p. 31.

North Wales. His fictions reactivate historical memories and concepts of historical time in ways which I will explore further in relation to other texts. Historical time haunts the posthumous novel, invading it with phantoms, counter memories and retrieved selves, and this informs my analyses of each text.

Via the posthumous, Sebald attempts a portrait of the historical condition. Ozick describes him as being ‘haunted by Jewish ghosts’, how he ‘allows himself to discover his ghosts almost stealthily, with a dawning notion of who they really are. It is as if he is intruding on them, and so he is cautious, gentle, wavering at the outer margins of the strange places he finds them in’ (‘Posthumous’, pp. 30-31). The narrator of *Austerlitz* moves from lost, dead or repressed memory to live, activated memory that transforms an understanding of history, animating historical memory. Memory returns as if it is historical, the present possessed by the past, Sebald using spaces of transitional memory: archives, dark rooms, museums, abandoned houses, forgotten zones, cemeteries, libraries, where memory’s potential return is always present. History’s eruption is imminent, the past retold in order to develop new beginnings and new interpretations of historical time.

In my emphasis on historical time, my perspective on the posthumous complements (by means of contrast) other writing in this area, including Jeremy Tambling’s *Being Posthumous* and Alice Bennett’s *Afterlife and Narrative in Contemporary Fiction*. Bennett argues,

The afterlife provides a ready-made testing ground for this kind of [narrative] speculation. It offers various spaces which are defined by their unusual temporalities: heaven and hell in eternity, in contrast with the passing yet highly relative time of purgatory, and the liminal time of the *bardo* between lives and *berzah* before judgement.³⁹

While temporal experimentation is evident, I disagree with her ex-temporalising observation that (*Afterlife*, p. 5),

The afterlife is therefore a place of thinking through what is other than time, and what is other than the laws of physics: what hell would break loose in a heaven in which second law of thermodynamics *did* operate?... The afterlife is an economical conceptual space in which natural laws have already been suspended and which allows for narrative experiment with time.

³⁹ Alice Bennett, *Afterlife and Narrative in Contemporary Fiction* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012), p. 5. In Tibetan Buddhism, *bardo* is the state of existence intermediate between two lives on earth; in Islam, *berzah* is an intermediate state of the soul after death, awaiting judgment and redemption.

The narratives I will be looking at include those where ‘natural laws have already been suspended’, for they are largely works of fiction. As fictions engaging with history they are more concerned with the hidden workings of historical time rather than abstract or alien physical universes, narrating afterlives as a way of reconsidering historical time.

Bennett refers to how Tambling’s *Becoming Posthumous* shows how ‘the posthumous invites a disturbance of the categories of both past and present, indicating that the past is never entirely over and done with’ (*Afterlife*, pp. 193-194). Her observation, following Tambling, that the ‘idea of the uncertainty of categories, blurred boundaries and the undecidability of presence or meaning is the antithesis of the apocalyptic model for a narrative’s sense of an ending’ (*Afterlife*, p. 194) doesn’t necessitate an abandonment of history, however.

The use of posthumousness can signal an embrace of history, contrasting with Bennett’s observation following Tambling that ‘we have experienced the end of history and the death of subjectivity’ (*Afterlife*, p. 194). The temporal complexity of posthumous narratives changes how we perceive historical time, countering her assertion that ‘afterlife fictions refer to the future and to non-existence, to things which are antithesis and aftermath of writing about life’ (*Afterlife*, p. 196).

Posthumousness is not a monument to history, or to an idea of the end of history, though endings and finitude haunt fictions of historical time. Paul de Man explores historical flatness and a tendency in historiography towards finitude in his essay on Percy Bysshe Shelley, writing:

For what we have done with the dead Shelley, and with all the other dead bodies that appear in Romantic literature... is simply to bury them, to bury them in their own texts made into epitaphs and monumental graves. They have been made into statues for the benefit of future archaeologists “digging in the grounds for the new foundations” of their own monuments.⁴⁰

Concern for posthumousness and a more complex historical consciousness is a form of response to de Man’s observation on the problems of monumentalising the past, while understanding how narrative might reimagine the past. This includes the posthumous reconsideration of de Man’s own life by Gilbert Adair in *The Death of the Author* (1992) and John Banville in *Shroud* (2002). Through understanding how historical time is encrypted within both fictional and non-fictional narrative, I aim to follow Ricoeur’s

⁴⁰ Paul de Man, ‘Shelley Disfigured’, in *The Rhetoric of Romanticism* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1984), p. 121.

pursuit of a more complex sense of historical time. While historical time in fiction is under threat from erasure, fragmentation and defacement, fiction is also a source of reinvigoration. This includes the disruption of historical time, returning to primal memories and revealing buried histories, which I consider further in posthumous fictional versions of Schulz and Pessoa.

Through this embrace of the posthumous perspective, historical time opens out. Just as Barthes reimagined the space around his mother after she died, so we might consider how historical time is recreated after death in posthumous fictions. In ‘The Deaths of Roland Barthes’ Derrida writes,

In its classical form, the funeral oration had a good side, especially when it permitted one to call out directly to the dead, sometimes very informally [*tutoyer*]. This is of course a supplementary fiction, for it is always the dead in me, always the others standing around the coffin to whom I call out in this way... The interactions of the living must be interrupted, the veil must be torn toward the other, the other dead *in us* though other still, and the religious promises of an afterlife could indeed still grant this “as if.”⁴¹

Derrida is redefining the afterlife in this engagement with historical time, presenting Barthes himself as if he is interrupting the life of his survivors. Barthes wrote of experiencing death through photography, referring to ‘that rather terrible thing which is there in every photograph: the return of the dead.’⁴² What we might seek in this return of the dead is the frame for reimagining ‘the other dead *in us*’ which might create a new space for reimagining historical time in which the ‘supplementary fiction’ might exist. By reading texts in relation to posthumousness, we can consider how crypts operate within narratives, and how spectral presences narrate such stories including those about other buried lives.

I will begin to consider these themes in the first chapter via scenes of disappearance and death in the writing of Poe and Sinclair and Lichtenstein, considering voids in which historical time is reimagined through posthumous presences. Here we can begin to understand the nature of the ruptures in historical time that the posthumous narrative encounters and reveals, responding to that which has been buried or forgotten, and how these cryptic bodies are given new life.

⁴¹ Derrida, ‘The Deaths of Roland Barthes’, *Psyche*, vol. ii, p. 282.

⁴² Barthes, *Camera*, p. 9.

Chapter summary

In **Chapter 1**, I consider how absent or hidden past is given a place within a posthumous narrative, beginning with ‘The Murders in the Rue Morgue’. Poe uses the site of murder as a place in which narratives of death and their aftermath may be reimagined. Here historical time is reconstructed by the detective, Auguste Dupin, as if buried within a crypt that demands decryption. The detective develops the site of the murder as a point at which historical time can be retold. I then consider Sinclair and Lichtenstein’s *Rodinsky’s Room*, considering how the bedsit left by David Rodinsky after his death becomes a place in which historical time is reimagined. Investigating the crypt as a site of rupture of historical memory, Sinclair and Lichtenstein are caught between the search for the historical crypt and posthumous reimaginings of the time of the crypt, producing their own imagined versions of both the crypt and Rodinsky. Posthumous temporality appears to displace the historical time that they seek to discover, as they find the abandoned site holds multiple versions of historical time.

Chapters 2 to 5 demonstrate different ways in which historical time is imagined and incorporated in fictional narratives concerned with posthumousness, using comparative approaches to fiction. Each chapter shows how specific uses of posthumousness can inform interpretation of narrative temporalities. I show how various narrative concepts can contribute to ways of reading texts in terms of posthumous temporality, considering how writers reanimate historical characters, using imagined posthumous perspectives and reconstructing historical memory, engaging with absences, fragmentations and attempts at supplementation of historical time.

In **Chapters 2 and 3**, I develop complex ideas of historical time and posthumousness in relation to Jensen’s *Gradiva* and Pamuk’s *The Black Book*. In *Gradiva* this is in relation to a historic figure (Gradiva) through which the past and the present appear to be in a form of mutual mimesis via the character of Zoë. In *The Black Book* the main character Galip is in search of hidden historic signs in order to solve the mystery of his wife and her half brother, Celâl. To understand these, he takes on the life of Celâl, obsessively acting out his daily routines while trying to resolve the mystery of their disappearance. Posthumousness characterises both the nature of Galip’s search and its conclusion. I consider the nature of crypts in each text, including what the posthumous temporality in the narrative approach is achieving, reflecting on the role of doubles and the relation

of the posthumous with historical time. I examine how posthumous fictional texts reframe and give new life to the past, creating encrypted senses of historical time within writing.

In **Chapter 4**, I compare Pessoa's *The Book of Disquiet* with Saramago's *The Year of the Death of Ricardo Reis*, showing how Saramago creates posthumous scenes in an engagement with Pessoa's writing and his heteronym Ricardo Reis, as if reconfiguring historical time. Saramago presents animated historical time within fictional narrative, creating a historical fantasy. This chapter develops ways of understanding wider significances of cryptic approaches to temporality in relation to narrative, including how Pessoa incorporates death within his biographical narratives and then how Saramago uses a spectral approach to Pessoa together with primal elements of memory and other historical time.

In **Chapter 5**, I analyse uses of the posthumous in Schulz's stories, and then how these are mutated and reimagined in relation to fictional historical time by other writers, including Foer (*Tree of Codes*), Grossman (*See Under: Love*) and Ozick (*The Messiah of Stockholm*). I explore how these fictions give Schulz new lives and how they encrypt his historical time and his narrative and poetic styles. Presenting close readings of Schulz and Foer's texts while showing how fragmentation and supplementation are part of how we might read the posthumous, I consider posthumousness in relation to primal memories and fictional perspectives on historical time.

I conclude by attempting to define further the literary presence of posthumousness and how posthumous readings open up new understandings of historical time in relation to fiction. This includes understanding how temporalities may be conjoined, including primal memories and posthumous narratives, as lives transform after death, in a perpetual process of archival disintegration, rejuvenation, and reintegration.

Chapter 1

Temporality and the narrative crypt: Posthumous archival presences in Rachel Lichtenstein and Iain Sinclair's *Rodinsky's Room*

1. The crypt and posthumous approaches to historical time

In this first chapter I will focus on Lichtenstein and Sinclair's *Rodinsky's Room*, developing an understanding of the role of posthumousness within postmodern literary narrative. Their narrative approach is a form of detection, reconstructing historical time after a death while engaging the reader with their decryption of the room and Rodinsky. I will draw on psychoanalytic and literary criticism relating to crypts, particularly in terms of how meanings or events might be hidden within cryptic spaces, using the cryptic analogy to approach narrative.

Cryptic narrative spaces possess hidden times and posthumous lives. In my introduction, I described how Barthes wrote about his apartment after the death of his mother, writing as if around his mother, not to entomb her, but to preserve what was still alive about her, what survived of her. This posthumous activity is a form of detection, preserving a scene for the clues that it might hold, but is also an understanding of absence, of what has been lost, and how that might be conserved within the cryptic space. In the apartment, Barthes does not make a direct representation of his mother; instead, reference to her absence begins to give weight to her posthumous existence.

In *Camera Lucida*, Barthes refers frequently to the 'Winter Garden Photograph'. He writes: 'There I was, alone in the apartment where she had died, looking at these pictures of my mother, one by one, under the lamp, gradually moving back in time with her, looking for the truth of the face I had loved. And I found it.'¹ Later he comments: 'I had discovered this photograph by moving back through Time' (*Camera*, p. 71). While he reproduces various photos in the book, this one is not included, as if he is preserving the absence as part of his preservation of her memory, and concealing (and revealing) the void to which he knows he now belongs: 'From now on I could do no more than await my total, undialectical death' (*Camera*, p. 72). Similarly, Sinclair and Lichtenstein return to the life of Rodinsky through his empty bedsit and remaining artefacts, as if uncovering a hidden temporality, exploring the

¹ Barthes, *Camera*, p. 67.

room's posthumous time as a way of recognizing his life. Photographs of the room preserve this absence in which he may be imagined. Their book is a kind of decryption, its narratives forming an exploration of the room's crypts, showing how time can be encrypted within spaces, characters and structures of narrative.

The authors' searches for Rodinsky reveal the role of posthumous temporality in narrative. *Rodinsky's Room* demonstrates the potential openness of a cryptic space to alternative versions of historical time, including a posthumous temporality, which is incorporated within but also exceeds the crypt of the room. The crypt's openness to the past, while inviting a new writing of the past, ruptures historical time. It is as if it is incorporating the perspective of death, the space of the dead extending beyond physical walls. Regaining time is more than the recollection of memory after death; it involves recovering lost structures of meanings too.

I will develop my approach to this subject by considering Edgar Allan Poe's 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue', a story that illuminates the changing role of the crypt within literary narrative, involving a site of death that must be analysed, evidence found at the murder scene being decrypted by the detective Auguste Dupin. He does not create the crypt, but enters the scene as if it encrypts a secret time, which he attempts to reconstruct. The historical time constructed following the death must accord with what has happened, with all surviving pieces of evidence accounted for. In this site, Poe's narrator brings together the time after and before death, the detective relating his posthumous perspective to what has happened, including what is unknown. Sinclair and Lichtenstein follow the posthumous narrative structure while incorporating Rodinsky's absence within their posthumous histories. In this process, the idea of historical time changes, for it is revealed as consisting of ruptures, while also incorporating elements of the consequences of these ruptures, posthumously.

In similar ways, Freud's approach in *Moses and Monotheism* attempts to consider absences and disruptions of historical time in the life of Moses to express and incorporate what might have been repressed within versions of his biography. As with *Rodinsky's Room*, Freud's posthumous act of reconstruction of historical time becomes part of historical time. Reconstructions of historical time in terms of what happened within the site are both disrupted by and yet formed by death. The site's incorporation within narrative is achieved through the imagining of absent historical time, detective work which recognises the possibilities of narration from a posthumous perspective. The intertwining of narratives of the past with new investigations reanimates the past,

as if bringing a new form of fictional temporality into being.

2. Detecting historical time via the scene of death

In ‘The Murders in the Rue Morgue’, Dupin adopts a posthumous temporal perspective, which I will briefly outline here. Poe’s introduction of the analytic detective as a protagonist within narrative offers a new presentation of narrative perspective within fiction. Dupin’s interpretation of the mystery represents a kind of posthumous presence enfolded within the narrative, his analysis having an analeptic quality within the site of death, going back to the past from a future time, a projected flashback. Poe, through Dupin, creates an analytic confidence in fictional narrated time via the analytic time of the detective novel. Historical time is turned, however illusorily, into a metaphysical problem that can be solved.

The solution to the mystery is perceived and expressed by Dupin as if he has witnessed the murders from a point of view after death. The narrative inhabited by both Dupin and the victims is a cryptic space of both the mystery and the solution, as if Dupin adopts the position of (or the space vacated by) the victims in order to explain what has happened. In this story Poe developed more than a model of analysis, communicating also an idea of posthumous temporality – not just analepsis, flashing back from a future time, but flashing back from a point after death, the point after death being a site of significance, where the crypt might be revealed.

In early-19th-century literature, the idea of the crypt was more simply related to the housing of the dead and to what was secret or hidden, but the meaning of cryptography since then has moved from a simple meaning of coding and decoding to more complex forms. As Shawn James Rosenheim discusses in *The Cryptographic Tradition*, the development of cryptography propelled the related field of cryptonymy; what was encrypted needed a site of storage, so the crypt took on new meanings of hiding, concealing and encoding other cultural material. He writes that, ‘Cryptographic narratives perpetually return to this tension between the crypt of writing and the hidden place in which bodies are laid.’² This tension clearly used the metaphoric possibilities of the crypt, but also the actuality of writing concealing buried life within it.

² Shawn James Rosenheim, *The Cryptographic Imagination* (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1997), p. 46.

My interest in posthumous presence and temporality relates to how narrative crypts are created which hold concealed things, which in turn hide or withhold time or memories. This idea of the crypt has become more complex as the nature of hiding as well as what is hidden becomes more subject to encryption and technological complexity. As decryption becomes more complex, narrative is increasingly the means of explanation and revelation, as well as re-encryption. In reading *Rodinsky's Room*, we can interpret textual crypts and archival survivals and contents in order to understand the narrative ordering of the past as something encrypted and yet decryptable. While the historical crypt has become more complex technologically, archaeology and other techniques of retrieval and decryption, including psychotherapy, promise access to crypts of the past. Through these, what was once hidden or buried becomes the new content of an active historical memory that is incorporated within narrative. The salvaged and analysed archive, of voices, images and other electronic traces, transforms the representation of historical memory in the novel.

This modern evolution of the crypt changes how we consider the archive, which often contains a number of crypts, or operates as a crypt itself. Within these archival crypts, meanings are concealed, while also keeping them alive. Texts can also operate like this and Rosenheim considers the cryptic nature of literary narrative, writing that 'in the detective stories... Poe the cryptographer is divided into the narrator and Dupin' (*Cryptographic*, p. 33). Narration can include encryption, and can become part of what is encrypted, as we consider the crypts explored in *Rodinsky's Room* and in the next chapter *The Black Book* and *Gradiva*.

The nature of Dupin's split in Poe's work shows how the crypt can be understood in relation to both the characters and to how historical time is constructed within a story. The narrative crypt has a double structure, being part of both the writer and the written. The encrypted archive is fundamental to 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue.' Poe's Dupin possesses an ability to understand encrypted narrative, the narrator writing on Dupin that 'Observing him in these moods, I often dwelt meditatively upon the old philosophy of the Bi-Part Soul, and amused myself with the fancy of a double Dupin – the creative and the resolvent.'³ This not only reflects Dupin's doubleness but also his ability to perceive interior thoughts, offering 'very startling proofs of his intimate knowledge of my own' ('Murders', p. 146). Dupin applies this ability to the mysterious deaths in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue', enabling him to detect the motives, the unconscious

³ Edgar Allan Poe, 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue', in *The Fall of the House of Usher and Other Writings* (London: Penguin Books, 2003), p. 146.

feelings and the identity of the murderer, the Ourang-Outang, which appears to mimic a pre-meditative murderer, its noises and movements choreographed to create the mystery for Dupin to solve.

Dupin does not simply understand who or what might have committed the murders, but imagines the sequence of events as if they were being re-enacted in the present. His decryption involves setting out this action to explain what was found in the apartment, but the narrator also presents Dupin as a mystery, as the 'Bi-Part Soul.' His own complex existence allows him to live in the present with a secret knowledge as if he has access to the hidden past. The narrator and the analyst require this multiple sense of time in order to communicate the story and solve the mystery. Dupin is as if doubled, projecting his active thoughts into the past of the suspect, a knowledge that is as if posthumous, appearing at the site of death, a knowledge only possible after death when the crypt is made.

Dupin's entry to the crypt is the point at which his posthumous knowledge becomes apparent. Poe places Dupin at this site of death to demonstrate this knowledge; in doing so, Poe creates a new narrative cryptic spatiality and temporality, beyond traditional cryptography because the crypt takes over the time of the story. The locked room of the building in the Rue Morgue is a site of posthumous knowledge that becomes part of the realist narrative that attempts to explain what has happened.

The role of the archive and the crypt that Poe's writing proposes is one that creates a deductive form that subordinates realist explanation to the phantasmal or posthumous presence of a mysterious event that has its own secret explanation. Towards the end of the story, Dupin uses his knowledge of the mystery to produce an explanation, addressing the sailor whose Ourang-Outang has committed the double murder: 'you must know that I have had means of information about this matter – means of which you could never have dreamed' ('Murders', p. 172). Dupin's words indicate a formal deduction while acknowledging the presence of a phantasmal reality which both the narrator and the protagonists draw their strength from.

Rosenheim writes that from one perspective, 'Poe's writing gathers itself into an apparition that, like the shrouded figure cast on the sky at the end of the *Narrative of A. Gordon Pym*, stands as the emblem of an unimaginable future, in which we are all involuntary mediums through which the pulses of our culture gather and evanesce.'⁴ Dupin, as detective, discovers, enters and describes the cryptic space of the story, as if

⁴ Rosenheim, *Cryptographic*, p. 138.

conjuring forth the apparitions that must be decrypted. There are similar senses of posthumous presence in *Rodinsky's Room*, as I will demonstrate. Postmodern narratives present phantasmal and cryptic contexts in which narratives of historical time are brought to life. The doubled nature of detective narrative, which Tzvetan Todorov observes, includes 'the story of the crime and the story of the investigation',⁵ the narratives of the event and the investigation introduce the possibility of other narratives within the context of the death scene where mystery and a sense of absence persists. This scene opens up how historical memory might be narrated, introducing the presence of a posthumous perspective, combining analeptic and proleptic temporal perspectives, in which the past appears to take on a new life.

3. Lichtenstein and Sinclair's *Rodinsky's Room*: posthumous presences in the crypt

A Dupin-like analytic narrative presence is presented via the first-person narrators in *Rodinsky's Room*. In this non-fiction narrative, the archival and cryptic room is problematized, not as a place of crime, but as an elusive idea of what persists within historical memory and animates or possesses a space after death, the former inhabitant Rodinsky having long died. Both authors are drawn to the apparent and possible posthumous presences of the space, including objects, referents and archives which offer active senses of inhabitation, and within which the phantom body of Rodinsky may be found. Sinclair defines the crypt of 19 Princelet Street partly in terms of what possesses a resonance with it, the crypt not being restricted to the immediate physical space of the room.

The room, its significance and its resonances are not accessible to everyone; the visitor appears to have to grasp the room's unknowability in order to understand its power. Sinclair writes that, 'The room dominates the temporary trespasser. Rodinsky thrives on what can never be known. He auditions the archetypes. And that is the hook for the unwary. His play is unwritten.'⁶ Sinclair acknowledges the power of the room over himself and others; it is not a straightforward crypt, for it appears to invite the visitor to participate, or make them feel that they are already part of some performance. There is something staged about the room, as if its discovery is part of how it is being

⁵ Tzvetan Todorov, 'The Typology of Detective Fiction', in *Modern Criticism and Theory: A Reader*, 2nd edn., ed. by David Lodge with Nigel Wood (Harlow: Pearson Education, 2000), p. 139.

⁶ Iain Sinclair, *Rodinsky's Room*, co-written by Rachel Lichtenstein (London: Granta Books, 2000), p. 11.

formed. Sinclair notes that Rodinsky's presence, in which he 'auditions the archetypes', gives an opportunity for the self-selected visitor to perform their versions of the room's history, whether researched or unscripted. It is as if the room is destined to be haunted by other bodies, other voices, not just Rodinsky's. The visitors imagine him, reconstruct him from the available but selectively arranged material.

The crypt that Sinclair discovers invites a new presence, and new senses of archival order, including the order of the body that is missing, as if he might bring back the real Rodinsky through performed suggestion, speculation and reconstruction. Through carefully formed and structured narrative, Sinclair approaches Rodinsky as if there is a mystery to explain, and as if information found after his death might provide the answer. He presents Rodinsky as a mysterious figure, mediated through other writers and witnesses, some of whom, including Lichtenstein, have seen him while he was alive. But what is missing is more than a figure; what is hidden within the Princelet Street flat is a sense of historical time that might be recovered or at least partially re-assembled.

Both Sinclair and Lichtenstein try to capture a sense of order within the crypt, using memories, remnants, speculations and associations, indexical and imaginary. Sinclair writes, 'There is too much evidence. It will take a fine recklessness to complete the story that this stifled writer began: a room that was so purposelessly disarranged, stacked with hints and echoes' (*Rodinsky's*, p. 11). Sinclair is declaring that he is trying to interpret what is purposefully upside down, while presenting his own instinctive methodology as the means to try to 'complete the story'. The evidence of Rodinsky's life is all there, but the nature of the life itself is complicated and elusive, the room drawing Sinclair further into its private spaces: 'Open the wardrobe. Sample the diary. Begin anywhere and you will find more material, tributaries branching from tributaries, than any one life can hope to unravel' (*Rodinsky's*, p. 11).

Sinclair acknowledges the apparent boundarilessness of the Rodinsky crypt, while also being conscious of how it began to be curated, its rudimentary construction from basic artefacts, references and associations. Sinclair's spatial and biographical focus, sometimes defined as psychogeographical, is a form of misdirection, however. What Sinclair is most interested in is time: lived time, biographical time, historical time, and an historical time that includes a sense of rupture, from which new stories may emerge.

The search by Sinclair and Lichtenstein reveals a sense of violation in their

attempt to uncover time and retrieve explanations for the apparent mystery of Rodinsky's disappearance. This violation is expressed spatially (in terms of transgressing the space of the crypt), but the crypt also possesses an idea of temporality which may also be disturbed. Mark Wigley, writing on Derrida, comments that, 'The crypt hides the forbidden act within the very space in which it is forbidden. It breaks the law merely by occupying that space.'⁷ Hidden and forbidden life occupies the place reserved for the dead. Wigley argues that deconstructive discourse is a way into this space, gaining access to this hidden time, but 'the crypt cannot simply take its place in the topography it preserves. The traditional demarcations between inside and outside, the closure established by the drawing of a line, the division of a space by a wall, is disturbed by the internal fracturing of the walls by the crypt' (*Architecture*, pp. 144-145).

This disruption of space resonates with Sinclair and Lichtenstein's descriptions of Rodinsky's room, in terms of the opening out of the crypt. Wigley continues (*Architecture*, p. 145):

The crypt organizes the space in which it can never simply be placed, sustaining the very topography it fractures. However, these fractures are not new. They have been present in the topography ever since the original traumatic scene, organizing the self and making the illusion that the scene never occurred possible. The fantasy of incorporation maintains a crypt that was already secreted within a pocket in the topography.

Sinclair's sense of violation of the crypt shares this urge to break out of the preserved topography of the crypt. Sinclair uses Gustav Meyrink's *The Golem* (1915), the story of a fictional creature that moves beyond boundaries in time and space, to explain Rodinsky's existence, posthumous and historical.⁸ Sinclair writes of Rodinsky as a 'A man whose life is open to all. A man who has attempted to erase the barriers between worlds, states of existence. A man who has successfully vanished while, at the same time, persuading others to launch a lifelong quest for his biography.'⁹ These are grand claims for Rodinsky in terms of inferring agency, when the agency may be attributed to those whom, like the authors, have sought to 'erase the barriers between worlds', and been self-persuaded to 'launch a lifelong quest for his biography.'

⁷ Mark Wigley, *The Architecture of Deconstruction* (Cambridge, Ma.: MIT Press, 1995), p. 149.

⁸ The Golem also appears in various folktales, as well as novels including Michael Chabon's *The Amazing Adventures of Kavalier & Clay* (2000).

⁹ Sinclair, *Rodinsky's*, p. 185.

The sense of Rodinsky's agency is identified posthumously, part of the authors' sense of discovering another time of the past. This 'man whose life is open to all' presents cryptic challenges for the narrators, but these form his attraction to them as a disappeared historical subject. Sinclair explains that there is no cryptic closure for Rodinsky, a characteristic he shares with the Golem: doors do not close him off and the apparent lack of sealed doors or windows indicate his existence outside of closed rooms. However, there is still the sense of a crypt; time appears to be sealed off, regardless of how easy it may be to make connections to Rodinsky's historical time.

Sinclair also notes how 'Lichtenstein becomes an emanation of Meyrink's fiction' (*Rodinsky's*, p. 189). The crypt is teeming with alternative, reconstructed and imagined times. Sinclair refers to Patrick Wright's 1991 non-fiction work *A Journey Through Ruins*, which makes the first published reference to Rodinsky. Wright describes the room as 'a secret chamber still floating above the street just as it was left.'¹⁰ The description is like an echo reframed in the past, Sinclair creating a sense of temporal depth after death.

Both Sinclair and Lichtenstein add to the accumulation of narratives about Rodinsky. Their development of a historical perspective relating to the cryptic space develops new senses of virtual presences, as if the room has become more than an archive. They are not just auditioning, they are interrogating the space, conjuring how the crypt might reveal its past life, and how it may be retold alongside other remembered traces of historical time. In this process they produce new versions of the historical time of Rodinsky that must be incorporated by the crypt. The book shows how posthumous temporality can be actively developed, contributing to how we perceive historical time.

Sinclair is alive to Lichtenstein's interpretative role as a detective, as if in the mould of Poe's Dupin. He writes: 'She tells me that treating her quest like a detective story brings the Spitalfields investigation into a parallel relationship with her Talmudic studies... The search for truth, illumination, and the meditations on Rodinsky were indivisible acts. The scholar had vanished into the text.'¹¹ The authors both operate within a posthumous temporality, writing to reveal buried time, in which historical time may be reconstructed within a new mythic framework. While disappearing 'into the text', both authors are protagonists within the crypt. Sinclair describes Lichtenstein as 'a returnee, coming back to territory that is under the threat of development. She

¹⁰ Patrick Wright, *A Journey Through Ruins: The Last Days of London* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), p. 115.

¹¹ Sinclair, *Rodinsky's*, p. 189.

believes that solving this mystery will unlock all the secrets of the city' (*Rodinsky's*, pp. 188-189).

Through making Rodinsky's life visible, it is as if in this posthumous discovery a whole system will become visible too. Sinclair writes: 'The room is his doctored autobiography. It contains all the clues, everything he touched and arranged. Solitary, haunted, obsessed, she takes to spending long hours in that room, the dim attic. Clairvoyance. She's waiting for a voice' (*Rodinsky's*, p. 189). Lichtenstein, auditioning archetypes, is searching for the spectral or unknowable archetype, 'haunted by the face of a man she has never seen' (*Rodinsky's*, p. 189): an archetype of the disappeared, the invisible, as if there is someone whose face, drawn in words, will fit this description, who can stand in for the remembered body without memories, be at once known and unknown; anonymous and yet named; immaterial, and yet through words, the traces of memories and virtual re-imaginings, materialized.

4. Multiplying posthumous presences within the narrative crypt

Crypts traditionally conceal bodies, and the archive is a form of re-ordering of the artefacts of the dead, as Derrida explores in *Archive Fever*. However, the crypt, classical, gothic or modern, while hidden or invisible, is not beyond life: its contents remain alive in some way, as if awaiting decryption. And yet, Rodinsky's crypt appears to be operated by an external, unnamed agency, though there is no salaried archivist at work here. Rodinsky's room contained both the intentional archive and the accidental crypt, open and yet concealed. It appears to live, and to contain life.

This life is what we may be able to discover in biographical writing on the dead, or in posthumous writing in which the dead are imagined to be alive. Derrida wrote in his foreword to Abraham and Torok's work on cryponymy that: 'The inhabitant of a crypt is always a living dead, a dead entity we are perfectly willing to keep alive, but as dead, one we are willing to keep, as long as we keep it, within us, intact in any way save as living.'¹² A non-fiction narrative such as Sinclair and Lichtenstein's contains bodies, real and imagined; sometimes, narratives such as A. S. Byatt's *The Biographer's Tale*¹³ include multiple biographical portraits that compositely might create real bodies through combining textual effects. The body of Rodinsky that Sinclair and

¹² Derrida, Foreword, *Wolf*, p. xxi.

¹³ Byatt's novel refers to a biographical project that aims to create a composite portrait of the 19th-century figures Francis Galton, Carl Linnaeus and Henrik Ibsen.

Lichtenstein's implies is archival, remnant, ideal, and encrypted, spectral, multiple and elusive. There is no simple opposition between real and imagined bodies, but a variety of real and imagined representations and conjectures.

Literary texts play with cryptic versions of bodies using different representations, including doubles. Sometimes these cryptic bodies are set in opposition to each other, as in Robert Louis Stevenson's *Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde* (1886) while in other works they signal other disruptions of the self, from Adelbert von Chamisso's novella *Peter Schlemihl* (1814), to Fyodor Dostoyevsky's *The Double* (1846) and Saramago's novel of the same title (2002). While Sinclair and Lichtenstein continue to look for the real body of Rodinsky, there is an awareness that they will not find him and that they may be simply generating another form to add to the multiple composite portrait. *Rodinsky's Room* generates posthumous figures, showing how these can be incorporated, textually, into the crypt. These imaginary constructs of Rodinsky's persona are part of the re-imagining of the space, and of the time in which Rodinsky lived. While there is a sense of the absent body and life of Rodinsky, the posthumous presences of the narratives of Sinclair and Lichtenstein represent a further building up of the crypt, in an excess of exterior or prosthetic archive. This excess is not pure *jouissance* or fever. The narrators believe this material will create a sculptural cast of Rodinsky, out of which a new, more authentic figure might emerge, drawn out by the archivist's and archaeologist's desire to uncover the hidden form.

The authors have a corresponding conviction that the more images of him being created the closer the composite might be to the historical Rodinsky, and the more likely his true image might be found. This excavation veers close to sacrilege, obsessing with image as the source of truth. The authors' interest in figurative forms and how they may be narrated, including the Golem myth, connects to Freud's own interest in figurative reliefs and statues, evident in his large personal collection of figures¹⁴ and his fascination with Michelangelo's marble statue of Moses in Rome, this considered in his essay 'The Moses of Michelangelo' (1914).

¹⁴ This collection is considered by James Fenton in his essay 'On Statues', in *Leonardo's Nephew* (London: Penguin Books, 1999), pp. 1-19.

5. Temporal alternation and virtual presences of the past within the crypt

Rodinsky's Room presents various ways of considering the spatial presence of crypts and archives within literary texts, reflecting some of the ideas developed by Poe that I began with. Poe's use of cryptic space shows how an approach to literature that takes account of posthumous presences might open up new ways of considering the relation between the crypt and historical time in narrative. The book shows how elements of the virtual archive, considered by Derrida in *Archive Fever*, can become incorporated within articulations of historical memory. *Rodinsky's Room* has two versions of the archive and the crypt being created and redefined by Sinclair and Lichtenstein, who author different chapters, reflecting on the creation of the spaces and history around the real historical figure of Rodinsky.

As Lichtenstein hovers around the scene of death, the crypt acts on her writing, offering a frame for her work as spectral archivist of the room, while Sinclair exerts his sense of the archive, pressing on Rodinsky's life literary and mythical tropes including the Golem. Sinclair writes that Lichtenstein, an artist, had 'reassembled the lineaments of Rodinsky. A second Rodinsky. Another life on the pattern of the first.'¹⁵ He is doubled. Sinclair seeks to represent Lichtenstein's mythic role in relation to Rodinsky; he describes her when seeing her in a photograph taken in the room: 'Backlit, looking away, at the beginning of the performance. Learning how to interpret herself, how to work the compromise between detective, revealer of Rodinsky's history, and artist of the room' (*Rodinsky's*, p. 72). He asks, 'How will she articulate this "unmanifest existence," this pulling and drifting between worlds? How will she transcribe a work whose essence is to remain unfinished, incomplete, abandoned?' (*Rodinsky's* p. 72). In his questions, he presents the outline of the answers: a semi-rhetorical announcement of the almost manifest.

Lichtenstein herself sometimes resists Sinclair's narrative of Rodinsky's (and her own) mythic personality, imposing her own narrative of historical and cultural memory, as both collector and co-narrator. The text of Sinclair and Lichtenstein's work presents alternative approaches to the life of a crypt, two competing and intertwining posthumous temporalities adopted by the authors. They are both concerned with hidden time; together their voices sound out the room, present it as a theatre of memories, of visual remains, encrypted memories and imaginary associations. They contribute to the

¹⁵ Sinclair, *Rodinsky's*, p. 268.

formation of the crypt through the interplay of their texts, two narrative times crossing with each other.

These two times, including the fictive times referenced by Sinclair and the biographical trails of Lichtenstein, present the conflict of the crypt, the unresolved sense of posthumous temporality, of recovered time being a work in progress and memory being a history that can be redramatized and performed. Sinclair presents his own path as biographical interpretation, while Lichtenstein is given (by Sinclair) the role of metaphysical agent. Sinclair finds the archive possessed by Lichtenstein. Their intertwining narratives reflect the integration of historical time within both literary and the physical space, their portrayal of the crypt offering new elements for incorporation, including photographs and eyewitness memories. The room is a place of permeability and adaptation, where objects are reshuffled and memories are reordered and replayed.

The posthumous presences created and evoked by their texts unlock the room, while asserting the power of its separation from the outside. It is guarded as a crypt, while at the same time allowing intrusion and extrusion. In their text, the room develops its own sense of posthumous temporality in which memories have a new existence. Sinclair and Lichtenstein's archival urge is attracted to both the room's hiddenness and its openness to the worlds and mythic associations that various people (including artists, writers, filmmakers, archivists and historians) bring to it. Their representation of the room is a composite of these impressions, memories overlaying each other, so that what began as material historical memories become composite artefacts, combining elements of historical memory and fictional accounts, including photographs, films and other relics and representations of the world of Rodinsky's time and place.

While Lichtenstein collects items and narrative records for her archive, Sinclair offers his views on the nature of the encryptions of historical time, focusing on spaces of the past, the disappearance of Rodinsky and the time after his death. He considers how dead bodies relate to the historic spaces on the edge of the City of London, describing the act of searching for Rodinsky as being like the excavations of the nearby crypt of Christ Church, Spitalfields (*Rodinsky's*, p. 185),

As if the measuring and photographing of mummified remnants could bring back those lives, powder the air with lost time. The archaeological project, excavating the vaults beneath Hawksmoor's church, analysing bones and artefacts – around one thousand skeletons were 'recovered' – took place between 1984 and 1989, during the period when the Museum of London were interesting themselves in Rodinsky.

Sinclair presents a skeptical approach to the crypt and the posthumous power of their contents, interested in disappearance as much as possible survival. Both authors are concerned for not only the actual dead body, but also the idea of the dead or missing body, and how imagination might approach it. The missing body is incorporated within the literary imagination as something that can be contacted, imagined and connected to. Rodinsky's body appears to be absent from historical memory, yet they try to record it as if it is a fossil, through impressions of what is lost. The book is a crypt of multiple bodies (real and virtual) and also the attempts to reconstruct these bodies within texts. Sinclair describes how: 'Feverishly the memory thieves fell on Rodinsky's maps, his marked up copies of the *London A-Z*. Perhaps these charts would show the peregrinations of an invisible man? If his walks could be repeated, might he be brought back to life?' (*Rodinsky's*, p. 185). Sinclair and Lichtenstein's recuperation of Rodinsky is an animation of sorts, limited to their text.

The spaces of crypts mark the site of historical and revenant bodies and these bodies and spaces find their ways into literature; Sinclair eagerly draws them into his narrative, referring to Meyrink's *The Golem* once more: "The Golem, deactivated, broken up, is locked in the attic: the word inscribed on his brow, Emeth (Truth), has become Meth (Death). The door has been locked, 'barring anyone from entering ever again'" (*Rodinsky's*, p. 194). The Golem is intrinsically linked to the locked room, as if the dead never completely leaves the cryptic space, a space preserved as if a tomb.

Sinclair's reference to Meyrink's novel again displays his use of external phantoms to haunt the crypt of *Rodinsky's Room*. He comments: 'The shape that cannot be seen, the golem of the room, remains in perpetual movement. An old woman, trapped in a council flat, remembers some of the story. A cabbalist in Jerusalem suggests that important chapters are still to be written' (*Rodinsky's*, p. 199). In a similar way to how the room appears to be inhabited by these phantoms, texts also contain encrypted bodies. A text concerned with the historical past contains bodies, sometimes multiple bodies of the same person. The images duplicate, appearing like multiple exposures within a dark room. Each phantom invited or witnessed by Sinclair reflect his impulse to invoke a posthumous or exterior temporality, bringing figures from the past into the present, into his text, changing and deepening its relation to historical time.

6. Encryptions of authorial presences within the crypt

As the lived time of the authors participates in the historical time of the room, so this temporality leaves traces on other experiences. Lichtenstein is haunted by Rodinsky's crypt in her travels elsewhere, for example when she visits the abandoned Temple Synagogue in Kraków. She writes: 'We entered the musty, deep pink interior, which was faintly lit by light filtering through the dirty but magnificent stained-glass windows. The place had the same intoxicating smell as Princelet Street.'¹⁶ Lichtenstein carries the memory of Rodinsky with her, as if it helps her inhabit other spaces, other times; the spectral persona or memory of Rodinsky enabling her to sense the posthumous capturing of the past. Memories of Rodinsky enlarge and deepen her sense of his presence, becoming part of her experience of other time: a form of posthumous temporality incorporated within her sense of presence.

Sinclair is drawn into the crypt as a witness, but it is the room that appears to be the active subject as a fountain of historical memory, witnessed as if from outside. He describes the room as a 'camera obscura':¹⁷ 'A beam of light, breaking through a knothole in the shutters, printed the outline of an eye on the dust of the table.' The image suggests a projection of the eye of Rodinsky, looking down upon the room. The camera obscura is a cryptic metaphor, forming a distorted representation of the outside, the image appearing upside down, offering a mysterious presence of the outside within the otherwise enclosed space of a room. As the book moves towards Lichtenstein's final chapter ("David in Focus"), it is as if the camera obscura might signify the authors' success in finding a real image of Rodinsky, developed through witness statements of people who knew him.

Lichtenstein connects her search for the past with her being pregnant: 'I desperately sought information about a man who had died before my own birth while feeling the first flutterings of the new life inside me.'¹⁸ The crypt appears to be a medium of primal or historical memory becoming incarnated or incorporated within the present, as if projected from the past. Lived time and historical time are represented as encrypted, the virtual sense of the archive invading Sinclair and Lichtenstein's sense of the present. Their lived time is made historical through the transfer of their witnessing to the written text. For Sinclair, the first sense of a living body possessing the room is Lichtenstein

¹⁶ Rachel Lichtenstein, *Rodinsky's Room*, co-written by Iain Sinclair (London: Granta Books, 2000), p. 223.

¹⁷ Sinclair, *Rodinsky's*, p. 261.

¹⁸ Lichtenstein, *Rodinsky's*, p. 286.

herself, ‘already in possession of the room’ (*Rodinsky’s*, p. 263). There’s no passive existence within the crypt and Sinclair’s acknowledgement of Lichtenstein demonstrates his vivid sense of historical presence. He writes: ‘The room might as well have been sealed with the symbol of the Holy Ghost, its door painted with blood. Rodinsky had found his witness. There would be no let-up, no prevarication, until the story was told’ (*Rodinsky’s*, p. 263).

Witnessing is performed as if lived time and historical time were both experienced posthumously. The layering of Sinclair’s and Lichtenstein’s texts, incorporating what can materially be found within and what can be seen without, develops an open, breathing sense of the crypt, alive and pulsing, an interior offering both resemblances and direct sensations of its presence. The double movement of Sinclair and Lichtenstein’s texts generates a new cryptic presence of Rodinsky, established through new virtual and material reconstructions of his life, decrypting the remains of his historical time.

7. The disappearing, encrypted and virtualised body within the archive

Both Sinclair and Lichtenstein are aware of how their posthumous intervention may be treacherous or violating, both of the crypt and life of Rodinsky. This sense of violation is integral to their project. Derrida writes of decryption as a violation:

To track down the path to the tomb, then to violate a sepulcher: that is what the analysis of a cryptic incorporation is like. The idea of violation [*viol*] might imply some kind of transgression of right, the forced entry of a penetrating, digging force, but the violated sepulcher *itself* was never “legal.”¹⁹

It is as if making the crypt is a transgression in itself, and that the posthumous temporality, this intrusion on the time of the dead, also violates the presence of the crypt, uncovering its forbidden time. Derrida continues writing on the crypt that, ‘It is the very tombstone of the illicit, and marks the spot of an extreme pleasure [*jouissance*], a pleasure entirely *real* though walled up, buried alive in its own prohibition.’²⁰ Sinclair and Lichtenstein both take this path of violation by entering the crypt, while sensing with Derrida that the crypt itself is a sign of violation. Their search for Rodinsky highlights a continued sense of violation, including the reordering of the room that they

¹⁹ Derrida, Foreword, *Wolf*, p. xxxiv.

²⁰ *Ibid.*

discover, and their own attempts to find new orders within it. While they articulate what they find within the crypt, they also want to preserve its authentic historicity.

Their investigation of the posthumous time that inhabits the past, and the mimetic quality of the textual crypt that they create suggests not a melancholy for this history but an alternative approach to historical time in which crypts of lived time might be reimagined and recreated. The authors, conscious of their violation of the crypt, construct their narratives while desiring to remove traces of their violation by displacing Rodinsky's absence with a new presence that honours the crypt's formation, its marking of a rupture in historical memory, and the person (Rodinsky) who inhabited it.

The crypt is a site where a kind of mourning is possible, as Lichtenstein also shows in her final sections of her writing, in which she recounts her search for, discovery and commemoration of Rodinsky's life at his grave in Waltham Abbey cemetery. However, their narrative crypt offers more than a reconsideration of the past, for it animates an idea of historical time that is otherwise repressed. Crypts created in narrative acknowledge what has been hidden, but also what remains alive; Sinclair and Lichtenstein's text tries to make the reader a witness to historical time, while showing how narrative can produce cryptic spaces and times. These can be mimetic, the crypt taking on other forms. Jodey Castricano, who develops the concept of cryptomimesis, describing this as 'a burial practice that, like incorporation, preserves desire, keeping it alive in a complex architecture.'²¹

The violation of the crypt allows an opening on to historical time to bring it alive again. The writer acknowledges the life of the dead within the crypt by trying to release the libidinal power associated with it, without destroying the crypt itself in doing so. Castricano writes: 'Rather than being restorative, crypt-analysis is productive, which is why Derrida insists that the crypt is always already "*built* by violence".²² Where there is a crypt, a space of hiddenness, there is also the opportunity for decryption as well as re-encryption, so hidden things may be revealed and then re-incorporated. Posthumous temporality can itself be buried within the crypt as part of the crypt's afterlife; this is what Sinclair and Lichtenstein appear to try to do. Their attempts to reconstruct historical time through narrative marks their desire for their versions of Rodinsky to be encrypted within his biography, capturing disappeared time and his invisible body.

²¹ Jodey Castricano, *Cryptomimesis: The Gothic and Jacques Derrida's Ghost Writing* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2001), p. 43.

²² Ibid. Derrida (Foreword, *Wolf*, xv), is referring to the opposing forces constructing the crypt.

Their approach to cryptic bodies within narrative as phantasmal, developing senses of posthumous presence, reflects their use of imagined bodies of Rodinsky to act as a spectral armature upon which historical time can be imagined.

While Sinclair's narrative incorporates bodies from outside the crypt, Lichtenstein is haunted by the space and the phantasmal presence of Rodinsky. She comments how: 'He didn't bury his books, he didn't need to, he just locked the door and left a tomb without a body, maybe hoping someone in the future would find it and decode his tale.'²³ She repossesses the space with a posthumous reconstruction of Rodinsky's desire, and how it might be fulfilled through narrative. The phantom tomb Lichtenstein's imagined Rodinsky lives in has no body, just layers of time, implied figures and obscured lived time, all demanding posthumous interpretation. Through this, narratives produced by the witnessing of the analyst or investigator becomes part of the historical time of the crypt. It is as if the future is being impelled by the past to inhabit it, Lichtenstein being the active agent for this, possessed as she is by her thinking about Rodinsky: 'I dreamed about him, stuck in a black hole that spirals from the centre of his room, a tight dark tunnel that will not allow him to move either above or below' (*Rodinsky's*, p. 219).

The crypt is spiraling out but this is contained, as if Lichtenstein is echoing Beckett's narrator in *The Unnamable*: 'I must have got embroiled in a kind of inverted spiral, I mean one the coils of which, instead of widening more and more, grew narrower and narrower and finally, given the kind of space in which I was supposed to evolve, would come to an end for lack of room.'²⁴ Lichtenstein declares that she is haunted by Rodinsky, for she had 'discovered Rodinsky's place of death but I did not know where he was buried' (*Rodinsky's*, p. 245). Sinclair later describes how 'Rodinsky's room was a necessary metaphor, a symbol of transition. The room was the only way of getting *inside* the story that had to be told' (*Rodinsky's*, p. 255-256). Both narrators focus on spatial elements of narrative and how it might reveal the past. They seek to inhabit this past in order to decrypt it, putting themselves in the place of a detective, after Poe's Dupin, in the space opened up both by Rodinsky's death and the nature of what still survives.

The encrypted body that Sinclair and Lichtenstein are concerned with is not simply Rodinsky's physical body, but a body of memory and an outline of temporal presence,

²³ Lichtenstein, *Rodinsky's*, p. 219.

²⁴ Beckett, *Unnamable*, p. 28.

much as Dupin was in search not just of the actual body (of the victim or of the murderer), but the body of the temporal moment that marked the scene of death (using the body's variant definition as an amorphous, subordinate topology, conforming to the shape of another form, like a body of water to the land). The reconstructed network of narratives, when known, provide a figurative representation of the past Sinclair complements Lichtenstein's more materialist approach to the imagining of Rodinsky with ideas and associations that allow him to get closer to the historical Rodinsky. He uses other witnesses of the crypt to create the sense of accumulating and composite presence, including referring to photographs of Rodinsky's room by Danny Gralton (*Rodinsky's*, p. 173):

The series of photographs taken by Danny Gralton defined the set. Defined number 19 Princelet Street as a set. Slow light processed through a large-format camera nudged Rodinsky's attic out of the mundane stream of time. It was removed, fixed in the eternal now, anchored by a catalogue of particulars.

These representations offer access to historical time, the eye within the crypt as if it has entered by an act of endoscopy, the presence of the intruding eye bringing the room to life. It makes the dead space come alive, makes it perform another time, while the 'sumptuous entropy of detail...locks the observer into a dark space' (*Rodinsky's*, p. 173). Sinclair notes, marking the moment of decryption: '...very gradually, it breaks on us: the room is the drama. Rodinsky will never appear. There is nothing he could say. He is an absence' (*Rodinsky's*, p. 174).

Sinclair develops this sense of absence as a revelation of how historical time can be reconceived, the crypt transforming how we might reconstruct or be in contact with the past. Rodinsky no longer belongs to the room, and is no longer confined within it and so Sinclair sees a cryptic space that goes beyond the room's meagre realm. He asserts that Rodinsky 'doesn't belong in his own story. The incontinent clutter of things, uncollectable sub-antiques, displaces his consciousness. He is represented by whatever has survived his disappearance' (*Rodinsky's*, p. 174). Historical time appears to be displaced by new senses of the past and posthumous time; Rodinsky himself is displaced by new imaginings of his historical memory. Sinclair asserts that this posthumous temporality is accessible through the room, as if a text waiting to be read, an index to both Rodinsky and the world outside: 'The room is the map of a mind that anyone capable of climbing the stairs can sample. Rodinsky's life has been sacrificed to construct a myth, mortality ensuring immortality' (*Rodinsky's*, p. 174). Rodinsky has

not simply disappeared, but is still disappearing from view or being erased, a dispossession and loss of historical time being reported by Sinclair.

What remains both materially and spectrally of the historic Rodinsky is the crypt and yet also the fantasy of the crypt, an historical setting that has a new posthumous existence. The filmic set, as Sinclair describes it, operates as its own reconstruction, while pretending to being untouched, uncurated, uncleaned. Within this set the cryptic body takes on a different life, visible and invisible.

Rodinsky's Room goes in search for the absent body as if it is invisible but present, yet this is also the absence of normal history, an everyday death and lost memory, not the mystery of a myth. The book moves beyond this normal absence, developing a sense of a gathering virtual, posthumous presence in the place of the lost real presence. Sinclair and Lichtenstein desire the time of the disappeared body and the abandoned crypt, but they also desire each other's sense of time of the crypt. Together, they are more possessed by the crypt.

Rodinsky, encrypted in their text, becomes a figurative representative of something more than himself, a hidden body of signs, the form traced by the contents of the crypt and how these are narrated within a text. Rather than working towards a single body, Sinclair and Lichtenstein produce complementary ways of reading the posthumous body within a text. There are no photographic portraits, but networks and composites of signs that produce versions of the historical body, as if countering the repression. While Lichtenstein believes Rodinsky might have wanted to be remembered, the book is also about bodies and lives refusing incorporation, artefacts also being part of this resistance, and how historical narratives might address this.

Both authors are concerned with Rodinsky's disappeared body, and how they may reconfigure him if they cannot resurrect him. Sinclair writes that Rodinsky is 'A man of whom there is no photograph. A man whose story is the story of a sealed room. The room is his doctored autobiography. It contains all the clues, everything he touched and rearranged.'²⁵ While material memory remains invisible, repressed or fragmented, the imagined body and life of Rodinsky is incorporated into historical time. The virtual body of Rodinsky is encrypted in the room and beyond it; while his body remains undiscovered, it has a posthumous presence. The authors present virtual traces of the body as incorporated within the text, allowing it to become part of historical time.

²⁵ Sinclair, *Rodinsky's*, p. 189.

Sinclair, articulating posthumous presence, attempts to define the crypt while also finding a way to decrypt it, building up an archive of hidden time. He writes: ‘The room promotes “unmanifest existence”; its fanciful arrangement of objects is intended as a sequence of biographical prompts for the unwary. Touch any book, rifle any of the diaries, and you are hooked’ (*Rodinsky’s*, p. 199). It is as if the intention to exist is manifested, as if the archive has presence beyond the objects themselves. The precise nature of the posthumous presence eludes the visitor, except in its mobility: ‘The shape that cannot be seen, the golem of the room, remains in perpetual movement’ (*Rodinsky’s*, p. 199). In the room, Sinclair writes, Lichtenstein says ‘She’s waiting for a voice. She wants Rodinsky to dictate his story’ (*Rodinsky’s*, p. 189), while at the same time she ‘becomes an emanation from Meyrink’s fiction: “brooding on past events... that strange recurring dream I kept having that I was in a house containing a certain room the door of which was locked to me”’ (*Rodinsky’s*, p. 189).

They reconstruct the body of Rodinsky through the text, a golem of their own making, omniscient in its own terms (all-seeing of its microcosm), with occult powers that enable historical time to be erased, remade, reconstructed and reimagined. Through this crypt, an imaginary body is created through which historical time is witnessed and remade. The absent body of Rodinsky marks the rupture of historical time and the attempt to reconstruct this time, the biography of the missing tenant whose surviving memory takes the form of a cryptic space. Sinclair and Lichtenstein’s engagement with posthumous temporality, recovering and re-imagining historical time from the point of the posthumous, is an attempt also to resurrect, in so doing creating an archaeology of what has been repressed and erased.

8. Posthumous temporality, virtual archives and reconstructions of historical bodies

Freud’s *Moses and Monotheism* is also a book in search of a body, Moses’ body, its virtual presences and the explanation for his death and his role within Judaic history. Freud writes as if Moses’ historical body will be found, reflecting a belief in the contemporary possibilities of archaeology as well as in historical interpretation made possible by psychoanalysis. In 1934, Freud wrote to Arnold Zweig, referring to a current excavation in Egypt that he thought might find the body that he thought was Moses. He writes: ‘If I were a millionaire I would finance the continuation of these excavations. This Thotmes [an Egyptian ruler] could be my Moses, and I would be able to boast that

I had guessed right'.²⁶

The material body is a parallel to the body that Freud seeks to evoke in his narrative. Yosef Hayim Yerushalmi and subsequently Derrida both interpret the nature of the body that Freud aims to retrieve from the archive. *Moses and Monotheism* forms a crypt of Moses' absent body within historical memory, intended to change understandings of religious history via psychoanalytic interpretation and a historical theory of the 'return of the repressed' beyond the individual, working through religious tradition.

Yerushalmi's *Freud's Moses* reflects on the crypt of Moses presented within Freud's book, at the same time as if burying or encrypting Freud's archive within religious history. Yerushalmi tries to understand Freud's motives in writing *Moses and Monotheism*, and quotes from Freud's unpublished original introduction to his work: 'My immediate purpose was to gain knowledge of the person of Moses, my more distant goal to contribute thereby to the solution of a problem, still current today, which can only be specified later on.'²⁷ Freud is referring to the role of Moses in religious history, not simply his character, as Freud attempts to offer insights into the nature of religious history and tradition. Freud's work is, he says, a work of historical construction, using fiction. In spite of the lack of reliable material, which Freud admits, he considers that 'the grandeur of the figure outweighs its elusiveness and challenges us to renewed effort.' He continues (*Freud's*, p. 17):

Thus, one undertakes to treat each possibility in the text as a clue, and to fill the gap between one fragment and another according to the law, so to speak, of least resistance, that is – to give preference to the assumption that has the greatest probability. That which one can obtain by means of this technique can also be called a kind of "historical novel," since it has no proven reality, or only an unconfirmable one, for even the greatest probability does not necessarily correspond to the truth. Truth is often very improbable, and factual evidence can only in small measure be replaced by deductions and speculations.

Yerushalmi notes that Freud's comments on his method reflect his reliance on 'psychoanalytic probability'²⁸ and his change of mind. Three months after having drafted the introduction, he wrote in a letter to Max Eitingon in Jerusalem that, 'I am no

²⁶ Freud, Letter to Arnold Zweig, May 2, 1934, quoted in Yosef Hayim Yerushalmi, *Freud's Moses*, trans. by (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1991), p. 22.

²⁷ Freud, unpublished original draft introduction (1934) to *The Man Moses: An Historical Novel*, quoted in Yerushalmi, *Freud's*, p. 17.

²⁸ Yerushalmi, *Freud's*, p. 18.

good at historical novels; let us leave them to Thomas Mann.’²⁹ Yerushalmi comments that Freud was still intent on reconstructing a historical narrative based around a study of the figure of Moses, but the focus had changed. Yerushalmi emphasizes that ‘the true axis of the book... is the problem of tradition, not merely its origins, but above all its dynamics.’³⁰

Freud’s study of Moses is not a straightforward biography, despite his rejection of historical fiction. It is as if through the body of Moses he is investigating an alternative crypt: a crypt not concealing a body, but how beliefs, stories and structured concepts are transmitted from one generation to the next and how repression might be part of this. Freud considers how narratives might act like a crypt and how with careful analysis something hidden may be found. What Castricano describes as cryptomimesis relates to how repressed historical content can be active in the formative dynamics of tradition and memory. Freud’s psychoanalytic approach in *Moses and Monotheism* is not to excavate Moses’ body, but to produce insights into how historical and religious narrative might be affected by hidden or repressed bodies. He offers a version of narrative history, excavating narrative disjunctures and elements that might be buried or encrypted.

Freud comments that ‘repressed material retains its impetus to penetrate into consciousness’ while ‘the recent material gets strengthened by the latent energy of the repressed, and the repressed material produces its effect behind the recent material and with its help.’³¹ In this process of surfacing, Freud asserts that the material ‘must always undergo distortions which bear witness to the not entirely overcome resistance derived from the counter-cathexis, or else to the modifying influence of a recent experience, or both’ (*Moses*, pp. 121-122). Analyzing the textual crypt of Moses, Freud implies that the crypt’s surviving material is always at a remove from the origin. The new crypt is therefore an approximation or imagined space to accommodate the salvaged body. This is Freud’s concession to or accommodation with historical fiction that he achieves in relation to Moses’ life.

Freud refers to the ‘tradition of a great past that continued to exert its effect from the background’ (*Moses*, p. 159), observing, regarding tradition, that, ‘It must first have suffered the fate of repression, the state of being unconscious, before it could produce

²⁹ Freud, Letter to Max Eitingon, November 13, 1934, quoted in Yerushalmi, *Freud’s*, p. 18.

³⁰ Yerushalmi, *Freud’s*, p. 29.

³¹ Freud, *Moses and Monotheism*, trans. by Katherine Jones (New York: Vintage Books, 1967), p. 121.

such mighty effects on its return, and force the masses under its spell' (*Moses*, p. 130). Freud refers to the repressed's 'powerful effects', the posthumous life of memory acting on and with the original historical time. Freud perceives in the character of Moses the symptoms of a previous religious order in the formation of Judaism, contributing to his belief in how repressed material may become productive and influential in the subsequent redefinition and reimagining of historical time, and in the archival formation of the past.

9. Biographical time, conjunctions of historical time, phantoms and fictional time

Derrida refers to the cryptic nature of historical time in *Archive Fever*, in which he analyses Yerushalmi's *Freud's Moses* as well as Freud's original text. Derrida's engagement with Freud's attempt to relate the historical Moses follows Yerushalmi's incorporation of Freud within Judaic history. Derrida considers how archives can be incorporated into histories, focusing on their role as a phantasmal element. This, he shows, is the case in Yerushalmi's 'Monologue with Freud'³² addressed to the dead Freud. Yerushalmi writes to Freud, as if turning him into a phantom, 'As a concealer you have of course, outstripped your hero [Goethe]' (*Freud's*, p. 81), while then going on to decrypt Freud's position within Jewish history and the place of psychoanalysis within this. Yerushalmi inserts his voice, prefacing his comments that, 'I know only that this fiction which I somehow do not feel to be fictitious enables me a mode of speech which has hitherto not been possible but which now becomes imperative because we have reached a time of reckoning' (*Freud's*, p. 81).

Yerushalmi here intentionally confuses the fictive and the historical by directing his text towards Freud. He is decrypting the past, his address to Freud presenting us with the complex relationship of the crypt within narrative, contesting Freud's assertion that Moses' murder could have so easily been repressed in historical memory. He refuses Freud's interpretation of Moses' repressed history, while also seeking to place Freud firmly within Judaic history. Yerushalmi wishes to examine the cryptic status of psychoanalysis within Judaic history and culture. Derrida writes that Yerushalmi is trying to speak to 'the phantom of an expert in phantoms. The expert had even stressed that what is most interesting in repression is what one does not manage to

³² Yerushalmi, *Freud's*, pp. 81-100.

repress. The phantom thus makes the law – even, and more than ever, when one contests him.’³³

Posthumous engagement with the past animates it, and Derrida shows how Yerushalmi attempts to create a new life of Freud, as a phantom, while writing as if he is being acted upon by Freud. This is how Lichtenstein invokes or imagines Rodinsky’s desire for his own life to be archived, the posthumous invading and invoking historical memory. Derrida tries to understand the interruption that Yerushalmi stages (*Archive*, p. 62):

A phantom speaks. What does this mean? In the first place or in a preliminary way, this means that without responding it disposes of a response, a bit like an answering machine whose voice outlives its moment of recording: you call, the other person is dead, now whether you know it or not, and the voice responds to you.

The voice speaks, not knowing that it has become historical, while defying historical time, for it survives. Derrida asserts (*Archive*, pp. 62-63) that ‘there would be neither history nor tradition nor culture without’ the possibility of a spectral response from the dead. He implies that the possibility of posthumous response is integral to history and tradition, while Freud observes that repression is intrinsic to historical memory too. Freud’s work on Moses, and Yerushalmi’s writing on this, indicate the role of both the potential return and repression within the historical process.

Derrida considers the nature of the virtual and the actual within historical memory and tradition, referring to the competing demands of what is believed to be repressed from Yerushalmi’s and Freud’s perspectives, these conflicts compounded by the fact that (*Archive*, p. 65-66),

The unconscious does not know the difference here between the virtual and the actual, the intention and the action... the unconscious may have kept the memory and the archive of the intention to kill, of the acting out of this desire to kill... even if there has been repression; because a repression also archives that of which it dissimulates or encrypts the archives.

This is the ambiguity of Freud’s historical fiction of Moses, for we cannot always know when a repression is archiving ‘that of which it dissimulates’ or when it ‘encrypts the archives.’ This aspect of posthumousness reappears in my later analyses of fictional narratives, particularly in how they simulate historical time, through mimesis encrypting

³³ Derrida, *Archive Fever: A Freudian Impression*, trans. by Eric Prenowitz (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996), p. 61.

the archive.

The confusion of virtual and actual archives of historical memory is intrinsic to Sinclair's and Lichtenstein's fascination with the crypt of Rodinsky. They offer insights into the process of reconstructions of history, including how absence may be incorporated within history. Their concern for absence appears to generate a posthumous temporality that reimagines historical time, including the lived time of Rodinsky within historical memory. Their narratives seek to displace the absence of the crypt, including virtual spaces and the space of repression, finding a role for posthumous temporality to reimagine historical time. In *Rodinsky's Room*, there is no archive without the crypt, without the possibility of virtual presence. The cryptic presence is phantasmal, but we sense this not through the space, but through how it is constructed by the writers in the text, via reminiscence, reconstruction and selective association. The narratives inhabit the crypt but also build it. By reading we enter it, each sentence being a way in through to the space of an interior formed by words, images, and associations that attempt to reconstruct the original crypt of the room.

Rodinsky's Room shows how a crypt contains time, and Sinclair's reference to the Golem and other narratives presents how these times are reconciled, not through biography, but through the cryptic space of memory and death. The posthumous temporality within the text attempts to bring conflicting times together, times historical, lived, and imagined. Posthumous temporality reimagines historical time as it may have been lived, adding to our understanding of historical memory. Posthumous temporalities are incorporated into the crypt, bringing to life a reimagined sense of historical time.

The crypt is recognized as a site of potential repression, where what is remembered and forgotten must be considered part of the reconstruction of historical time. As if at the scene of Rodinsky's death, Sinclair's approach is to decrypt the space, as if a detective transfixed by the virtual traces of the archive as much as those that are manifest. Out of these traces he believes Rodinsky's memory can be brought back to life and reincorporated into the space. He acknowledges Rodinsky's disappearance, viewing the rupture in historical time as a site of reimagining.

The site of Rodinsky's disappearance is a site of rupture. Michel de Certeau argues in *The Writing of History* that rupture is not the disruption of history but a condition of it. Writing on Freud's *Moses and Monotheism*, he observes that in Freud's analysis of tradition, 'Rupture does not intervene as a separation between regions (the past and the present, the individual and the collective, etc.), but as the very principle of

their functioning.’³⁴ Rupture provides the opportunity for inscription and retelling, while demanding the interpreter of historical time to attend to the virtual archive. De Certeau comments that Freud is writing in the wake of death being announced ‘to the Jews through the horror of anti-Semitic totalitarianism and through the violence of an “undying hatred’ (*Writing*, p. 314). To some, Freud’s reference to a new sense of tradition that transcends continuous written historical memory is subversive (for example, against Judaism), but it also offers a form of survival and therefore continuation. Recognition of rupture may help to achieve continuation, including as a psychotherapeutic approach.

De Certeau writes that Freud’s imagined Egyptian history of Moses in *Moses and Monotheism* is ‘the enigma that Freud opposes to the hatred’ and ‘appears to belong to a rhetoric of dreams’ (*Writing*, p. 314). However, de Certeau is interested in a Mosaic tradition ‘repressing the memory without entirely effacing the scar of an initial wound. This body can only be “represented” by a discourse that in turn is wounded – that is analytical and fragmented – while what it narrates as true assumes the form of fiction’ (*Writing*, p. 314). De Certeau is describing part of what is intrinsic to posthumous temporality, the sense of recovery and recuperation, though this is fragmentary. The rupture remains, but acts as a site at which historical time may be disclosed or decrypted, and where fictional time might offer supplementation of what has been lost. He continues later: ‘The Freudian fable [of Moses] presents itself as “analytical” because it restores or admits the rupture that recurs and shifts; and as “fictional” because it grasps only substitutes for other things and illusory stabilities in relation to the division that makes them castle within the same place’ (*Writing*, p. 315).

De Certeau’s use of the verb ‘to castle’ (*roquer*) here is apposite – a form of hiding in chess of that which is most precious, necessary or vulnerable – but in a cryptic move that permits some mutual protection – of both the fictional and the historical. He notes that Freud does not see an ‘exclusive disjunction’ but a ‘conjunction’³⁵ between these, putting ‘his novel in the place of history, just as he puts the Egyptian Moses in the place of the Jewish Moses – in order to have them shift around the “little piece of truth” that their play represents’ (*Writing*, p. 316). His analysis indicates how Freud’s

³⁴ Michel de Certeau, *The Writing of History*, trans. by Tom Conley (New York: Columbia University Press, 1988), p. 313.

³⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 315. In this section on the novel and history, de Certeau refers to the Marquis de Sade’s distinction of two ways of knowing man, through history and through the novel: ‘The engraving stylus of history depicts him only when he makes himself seen, but then it is not he... the paintbrush of the novel, to the contrary, seizes his inner nature to the quick... takes him when he lets this mask fall.’ (Preface to *Les Crimes de l’amour*, 1800).

approach to Moses sheds light on history, positioning virtual memory in relation to recorded memory. As part of my development of an understanding of posthumous temporality, I will now look at the conjunction of history and fiction further, through the role of the virtual in the archive and in historical memory.

10. Historical time, phantoms and virtual figurative spaces within the crypt

The concept of the virtual, as considered by Derrida in *Archive Fever*, is a disruption of an orthodox view of the archive. Using Yerushalmi's text, he shows how the 'archive of the virtual'³⁶ interrupts traditional narrative versions of the past and historical memory, and how this changes our thinking on the crypt and the archive. Writing on Freud and Yerushalmi's *Freud's Moses*, Derrida comments: 'The moment has come to accept a great stirring in our conceptual archive, and in it to cross a "logic of the unconscious" with a way of thinking of the virtual which is no longer limited by the traditional philosophical opposition between act and power' (*Archive*, p. 67).

Derrida is reimagining the role of the virtual here, not as a subsidiary part of the archive but as fundamental to its structure. He shows how this might work for a Freudian interpretation of the unconscious as archive. Commenting on the repression of violent thoughts, he considers how repressed thought becomes part of memory and the archive. Writing with Freud's conjectures on Moses' possible murder in mind, he writes (*Archive*, p. 66):

the unconscious may have kept the memory and the archive of the intention to kill, of the acting out of this desire to kill... even if there has been repression; because a repression also archives that of which it dissimulates or encrypts the archives. What is more, we see well that the repression was not all that efficient: the will to kill, the acting out and the attempt to murder are avowed, they are literally inscribed in the archive.

Historical time is reconsidered in this after-scene of murder, for what remains includes virtual traces that might become significant, as if clues uncovered by Poe's Dupin. The virtual memory's incorporation within the archive is disruptive, its phantasmal presence remaking what is understood as historical. The repressed thought's relation to memory is comparable to how fictive history relates to the historical in the archive, as something that is incorporated into the body of the past which might otherwise be considered alien, having been previously rejected. These virtual traces disturb understandings of

³⁶ Derrida. *Archive*, p. 66.

historical time, making new reconstructions of it possible.

This conjunction of the virtual with the historical links Freud's Moses with Sinclair and Lichtenstein's Rodinsky. The remains of a life may hint at alternative ways of reading history, and how virtual elements of memory might be read as being present. The archive creates a home for hidden, silent, unspoken and imagined bodies, which narrative might begin to awaken or expose. Sinclair and Lichtenstein aim to uncover the figure of Rodinsky as if he has been repressed, existing virtually. The implication of repression makes absences a mystery, possessing hidden meaning, and secret or silent deaths and histories prompt investigation. Sinclair and Lichtenstein cannot explain Rodinsky's absence, but try to find what is hidden; their acknowledgement of his absence is a sign of their desire to salvage something from his absent body, trying to make up for what is absent, making past things present, posthumously.

Sinclair and Lichtenstein recover Rodinsky's body through reconstructed memory; like Freud's version of Moses, Rodinsky doesn't need to exist for the historical fiction to be generated. Historical memory is reconstructed using elements of the recovered virtual archive and material traces. Literary texts such as those by Poe and other detective stories provide narratives of crypts, hidden rooms and concealed meanings, in which narratives within a posthumous temporality displace absence. When a fictional text incorporates the archive as a presence, it awakens new senses of historical memory. The crypt acts as a place of retelling, incorporating the posthumous presence of narrative. Sinclair and Lichtenstein acknowledge historical time in *Rodinsky's Room*, intending that the alternating, dialectical structure of their reimaginings of Rodinsky's life might reveal more about his past.

11. Archaeology, crypts and textual constructions of posthumous bodies

Freud's use of archaeology as a model in *Moses and Monotheism* opens up ideas of how posthumous temporality is imagined and how imagined historical time may be reincorporated within the body of historical memory. However, the crypt, appearing to contain this posthumous temporality, is like an X-ray image in which only some material things become visible. New imaging technologies in the early 20th century changed the idea of the body as it is represented, offering new ways to understand interiors and exteriors of the body. This was paralleled by a new dematerialisation of the body in literature, evident in Modernist texts such as Beckett's *The Unnamable*, Virginia Woolf's *The Waves* and James Joyce's *Finnegans Wake*. These novels'

dematerialized and dislocated bodies superseded the ghosts and spirits of 19th-century fiction. The X-rayed body reveals a body's hidden interior as externalized, as if a body outside of itself.

Freud worked alongside the French neurologist and professor of anatomical pathology Jean-Martin Charcot, developing thinking on how bodies manifested signs of the interior, including symptoms of hysteria. Freud's concern for bodies, real, imagined and sculptural (including Michelangelo's Moses) is for how they are haunted, possessed or inhabited. The X-ray offered a new way of thinking about how to consider bodies and Freud's *Moses and Monotheism* suggests an X-ray into the history of Judaism via the spectral body of Moses. Freud tries to uncover hidden palimpsest layers of narrative history to tell a true version, as if recovering or decrypting the historical body of Moses, apart from mythology and tradition. While Yerushalmi argues that Freud is creating an apostatic, counter history, Freud's interpretation of Moses takes normal historical absence and creates a new possibility for what might be concealed. The missing or repressed element is interpreted as the sign of something hidden, and so the mythical remains of Moses stands in a more complicated relationship with the past, which he attempts to explain.

The psychoanalytic approach to the body changes how we preserve, represent and reconstruct memory. Freud uses psychoanalysis to recreate the body of the crypt, the text materializing that which has been lost to history, while also describing the process of dematerialization, or repression, and the return of the repressed. In this crypt, a new archive is constituted, forming a new version of religious history. Freud's version of Moses, in his text without a historical body, aims to 'fill the gap between one fragment and another... [giving] preference to the assumption that has the greatest probability.'³⁷ This encourages us to look more closely at how the body within the fictional text might be reimagined, and how, as in the model of the X-ray, the interior and the visible surface of the body are confused. The new framing of the interior and exterior of the body was part of a changing understanding of the encrypted historical body. Akira Mizuta Lippit describes how:

X-rays retain the contours of their object while rendering its inside, generating an impossible perspective. Figure and fact, an object's exterior and interior dimensions, are superimposed in the X-ray, simultaneously evoking and complicating the metaphysics of topology in which the

³⁷ Freud, unpublished original draft introduction (1934) quoted in Yerushalmi, *Freud's*, p. 17.

exterior signifies deceptive surfaces and appearances while the interior situates truths and essences.³⁸

Sinclair brings appearances of Rodinsky and associated figures to the foreground, while also making Lichtenstein another spectral presence, as if encrypting his co-author within the text, a repeated trope in his writing.

Sinclair and Lichtenstein search for Rodinsky's body inside and outside of the archive, the revealed bodies of Rodinsky in the text more than spectres of repressed memory. They hint at a faded, posthumous presence incorporated into the crypt of the text. Fellow writers, photographers and other artists also become encrypted within the narrative, their interlocutionary or background presence making Sinclair's own narrative presence more emphatic. The visitors' appearance blends with the spectral figure of Rodinsky.

Psychoanalysis draws us towards the time of the invisible or spectral body, recreating historical time while incorporating the sense of absence. As cryptic elements of the past become animated, Sinclair and Lichtenstein conjure Rodinsky's body in the text, disfigured, screened or distorted, 'invisible in the sense that he is absorbed by the room in which he was the last tenant',³⁹ yet giving a physical, manifest presence to Rodinsky's life.

12. Posthumous temporality and the narrative pursuit of historical time

Derrida's analysis of repressions within history in the light of Yerushalmi's writing on Freud further illuminates the structural presence of crypts within literature. He identifies Yerushalmi's text as a way of re-encrypting Freud's writings, particularly *Moses and Monotheism* within a Jewish history, by identifying the book as Freud's repressed concern for religious historical memory, the book acting as 'not merely history, but a countertheology of history in which the Chain of Tradition is replaced by the chain of unconscious repetition.'⁴⁰

Derrida shows how Yerushalmi's work is dominated by a sense of posthumous temporality, and a need to reassess the time of Freud's thinking from after his death. Yerushalmi's book is an archival work in itself, incorporating Freud within a religious

³⁸ Akira Mizuta Lippit, *Atomic Light (Shadow Optics)* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005), p. 53.

³⁹ Sinclair, *Rodinsky's*, p. 187.

⁴⁰ Yerushalmi, *Freud's*, p. 35.

history; in this act, he is pulled inwards to Freud's archive. As Derrida comments: 'Yerushalmi's book, including its fictive monologue, henceforth belongs to the corpus of Freud (and of Moses, etc.), whose name it also carries. The fact that this corpus and this name also remain spectral is perhaps a general structure of every archive' (*Archive*, pp. 67-68). He then explains, 'By incorporating the knowledge deployed in reference to it, the archive augments itself, engrosses itself, it gains in *auctoritas*' (*Archive*, p. 68). Encryption is a form of animation here, a giving of life to the crypt.

Freud's 'virtual' analysis of Moses must be reconciled with narratives of historical memory that form religious tradition; however, Yerushalmi's attempt to historicize psychoanalysis within a Jewish tradition finds himself compelled by Freud's afterlife. He is absorbed by the posthumous perspective, entering a dialogue as if with a phantasmal Freud. The archive takes on a posthumous life, in which the nature of tradition and memory within history become visible and repressed elements come to life.

Derrida's analysis of Yerushalmi's engagement with Freud changes how we see the archive. He notes that the archive 'loses the absolute and meta-textual authority it might claim to have. One will never be able to objectivize it with no remainder. The archivist produces more archive, and that is why the archive is never closed. It opens out of the future' (*Archive*, p. 68). The archive is threatened by its own power, in the form of an emerging and expanding empire in which new territories (the future) are able to redefine the past.

The posthumous position, taken by Dupin in Poe's stories as the point of knowledge in his analysis of mysteries of the past, becomes both more fragile and volatile. The detective is driven to recreate the past, producing what historical knowledge can be reconstructed, and yet there is an indeterminacy. The site of the archive 'opens out of the future', taking the scene of death and developing it beyond the event or immediate aftermath. Historical time is redefined from this point, as the analyst or interpreter, moving backwards in time, finds new potential ways of understanding the past. Where the site of death might use posthumous knowledge to create historical closure, such as is Dupin's aim in Poe's stories, posthumous temporality might also create a sense of unendingness, in which historical time is perpetually open to reconsideration.

In *Rodinsky's Room*, Lichtenstein's chapter 'Who Will Say Kaddish Now?' is seeking closure while at the same time developing the story of Rodinsky further,

opening his life out for new interpretation. She discovers, on her travels in Poland, that her quest is not one of solitude, but possesses a specific generational post-war, post-Holocaust desire: ‘Everyone had their own golem to chase.’⁴¹ At the same time she learns more about Rodinsky’s family history, and how his hunger for knowledge, both religious and secular, paralleled contemporary attempts to store and protect knowledge from annihilation. Lichtenstein recounts how ‘archives were assembled in the Warsaw ghetto in milk cans, then sealed with lead before being buried, in the vain hope that they would survive as a record of their authors’ existence. The line printed boldly in the books I retrieved from the synagogue in Greatorex Street came to mind: FOR FUTURE REFERENCE’ (*Rodinsky’s*, p. 219).

Knowledge was stored with a sense of anticipated posthumous discovery, a reordering after the feared destruction. Lichtenstein likens this to Rodinsky’s attitude to knowledge, but ‘he didn’t bury his books, he didn’t need to, he just locked the door and left a tomb without a body, maybe hoping someone in the future would find it and decode his tale’ (*Rodinsky’s*, p. 219). Lichtenstein then narrates a sequence of stories focusing on visits to graves and cemeteries, at a cemetery in Galicia (Poland) in which gravestones that had been used as paving stones have been returned to a cemetery; and in Lesko, Poland, where she discovers the ‘remains of a seventeenth-century Sephardic cemetery, fantastical, set deep inside a dark forest on a steep incline... There is a sense of discovery here, as if these are ancient ruins in a tropical rain forest, a living resting place full of birdsong and crumbling beauty’ (*Rodinsky’s*, p. 232). Her discovery is a ‘posthumous sublime’,⁴² Ozick’s phrase relating to Sebald’s writing. The past opens out in new, unexpected ways, while the ‘romantic vision would often be shattered as we learned we were standing on a mass grave’.⁴³ Another cemetery Lichtenstein describes as a ‘secret garden’ (*Rodinsky’s*, p. 235); the sites of the dead offer presences of illumination and confrontations with historical memory.

Lichtenstein believes one of her purposes has been to find Rodinsky’s grave and say the Kaddish for him. Her final chapter traces her steps to his grave at Waltham Abbey cemetery, where she reads the prayer for him. In the Afterword of the paperback edition, Lichtenstein recounts a service at Rodinsky’s graveside. She writes, ‘Just as the story was ending it folded back on itself to the very beginning’ (*Rodinsky’s*, p. 338), as she remembers how she began her path, searching her own family’s roots. The site of

⁴¹ Lichtenstein, *Rodinsky’s*, p. 212.

⁴² Ozick, ‘Posthumous’, p. 26.

⁴³ Lichtenstein, *Rodinsky’s*, p. 233.

remembrance is an opening on to her past, enabling a discovery of historical memory. Her search for historical time changes both her sense of her own history and a wider history, beyond mourning, beyond melancholy, in which memory is the possibility of a deeper incorporation of the past in the present. Historical time is recreated and redefined through this process.

The book moves beyond the spatial borders of the cryptic room and the life of Rodinsky has taken on a new form, becoming a crypt of historical time through which the past can be reconstructed and retold. Having gained knowledge of Rodinsky's material existence, Lichtenstein is able to incorporate this within the archive, but her sense of the past has changed. Historical time is transformed through her engagement with his posthumous life. Having located Rodinsky's grave, Lichtenstein acknowledges and honours his existence, without closing historical time. The book is an interruption, and an anticipation of future interruptions of memory. The crypt is as if open, keeping alive the posthumous temporality in which new versions of the past multiply, an ongoing palimpsest that Sinclair and Lichtenstein's text contributes to.

13. Repressions, ruptures, the future and posthumous temporality

Rodinsky's Room shows how posthumous temporality may be incorporated within narratives of historical memory, the rupture in memory offers a site for the virtual presence of Rodinsky, including figurative references and spectral portraits. In this site of lost memory, the past is recreated to be incorporated. At points of rupture, virtual bodies, from Moses to Rodinsky, present a threat to historical memory and historical time, but this threat can itself be incorporated. Posthumous memory, while potentially dangerously disruptive, seeks integration with, not separation from the archive.

Crypts allow historical time to be reimagined, and Derrida points to this posthumous disruption being affirmative and generative. Posthumous temporality does not supersede historical time, but integrates or conjoins with it. In his discussion of Yerushalmi's *Freud's Moses*, Derrida writes, 'if there is an affirmation shielded from all discussion (psychoanalytic or talmudic), an unconditional affirmation, it is the affirmation of the future *to come* [*l'à-venir*].'⁴⁴ What is this affirmation? What might the future be? Derrida refers to 'the coming of an event' and an 'opening toward the future.' He describes openings on to the future as doors, and summarises three aspects

⁴⁴ Derrida, *Archive*, p. 68.

of these doors: a place ‘where nothing is decided’; ‘a promise of a secret kept secret’ (*Archive*, p. 69) and an ‘indetermination forcefully and doubly potentialized, indetermination *en abyme*’ (*Archive* p. 70). His affirmation of a future perspective is a form of affirmation of absence, that the future is encrypted and yet open to ‘a future radically *to come*’ (*Archive* p. 70). Derrida is responding to Yerushalmi’s addressing of Freud, and how the archive, history and tradition might be open to future ordering, signification and structuring. He embraces this future as a time to be incorporated within the archive, a virtual presence subject to future re-ordering or incorporation.

Derrida’s interpretation of Yerushalmi translates ideas of Jewishness, including the ‘experience of the promise (the future) and the injunction of memory (the past)’ (*Archive*, p. 76). He remarks that these ‘two absolute privileges are bound the one to the other. As if God had inscribed only one thing into the memory of one single people and of an entire people: in the future, remember to remember the future’ (*Archive*, p. 76). Derrida asserts a future of memory, transcribed as a virtual presence that exists phantasmally, without predicting or knowing what might happen. This includes an anticipated posthumousness, of having happened and being exterior to that historical time. He writes, ‘The condition on which the future remains to come is not only that it not be known, but that it not be knowable as such’ (*Archive*, p. 72). He interprets Yerushalmi in order to grasp this space of posthumous life, and whose temporality might come to invade the past, just as Freud invades the life of Moses and Yerushalmi invades Freud. As Derrida notes, ‘The Freud of this *Freud’s Moses* is indeed Yerushalmi’s Moses’ (*Archive*, p. 67).

These phantasmal creations of Freud and Yerushalmi, and also of Derrida – who writes on Marx, Barthes and Freud among others in ways that offer them a posthumous existence – show how alternative temporalities can be incorporated within narrative, including historical time within fiction and fictional time within history. The historical fictions of Freud and Yerushalmi operate as virtual bodies within historical time, competing with other historical memories. This bodily incorporation is apparent in Sinclair and Lichtenstein’s search for Rodinsky, and is also visible in other writing by Sinclair, such as *American Smoke*. In this book he pursues a disappearing or dead generation of writers, from Malcolm Lowry to William Burroughs. Describing his search for Charles Olson on a beach in Gloucester, Massachusetts, he writes, ‘I follow Olson’s obliterated footprints. There is the long shadow of a drowned man on the beach. And he is walking, rolling heavy shoulders. You have to be dead yourself, more than a

little, to register him'.⁴⁵ Olson's traces here are the imagined body within the crypt, taking over the crypt of narrative, the body coming alive within an archive being recreated, a posthumous mimesis.

In this posthumous time, bodies duplicate and appear to spectrally materialize; in Lichtenstein's comments in her afterword in *Rodinsky's Room*, she reveals the multiplicity of different, sometimes conflicting memories of a room and a man. She recalls how, 'At least six different people told me they had been the first into Rodinsky's room.'⁴⁶ One of these visitors was photographer Mike Pattison, who had taken photos of the room at an earlier stage, prior to what appeared to have been the subsequent arrangement and curation of Rodinsky's effects. Each new perspective adds to the presence of the crypt. Sinclair and Lichtenstein's dealing with the crypt, following Dupin, is to consider the future not prophetically, but as a space in which the past is re-ordered and remembered.

Transfixed by the archive as a site of rupture of historical memory, Sinclair and Lichtenstein are caught between the search for an imagined pure state of the crypt, the historical crypt and the posthumous reimaginings of the time of the crypt. They must narrate both the rupture and the attempt to contain it. Lichtenstein tracks down people, including Sinclair, whom she believes saw the room above the synagogue in its original state; in so doing, she produces more imagined versions of the crypt and Rodinsky. Posthumous temporality appears to be inserting itself in the place of the historical time that she is seeking to discover.

Through the authors, other visitors and witnesses, the time after death infiltrates into the crypt, forming a fossil or a memory traced on to the space of the body of the dead. Thus memory is encrypted, becoming part of the crypt, a posthumous form of developed memory within the receptive crypt. *Rodinsky's Room* shows this penetration of posthumous temporality, the crypt holding future and alternative temporalities, as if waiting to be discovered. Historical time is remade and a new temporality of the crypt is indicated in terms of the future operating on it, awakening virtual memories discovered posthumously.

Rodinsky's Room excavates material traces of the crypt while establishing new posthumous presences of time in narratives of historical memory. Posthumous temporality, in which historical time is reconsidered from a posthumous point of view,

⁴⁵ Sinclair, *American Smoke* (London: Penguin Books, 2014), p. 7.

⁴⁶ Lichtenstein, *Rodinsky's*, p. 317.

offers the opportunity to reconsider conjunctions of historical and fictional time. These conjunctions offer insights into how historical time is constructed in narrative.

The virtual senses of the archive that Derrida introduces in *Archive Fever* change how we think about historical memory and historical and fictional time, including in relation to posthumous temporality. The returns of Freud to Moses, Yerushalmi to Freud, and Derrida to various contemporary and historic writers develop the potential of the posthumous, not as a perspective solely focused on afterlives but concerning the nature of historical time and historical and fictional approaches to the past.

In considering posthumous temporality, we are caught between different future-anticipating historical forms, including historical fictions that operate as pre-histories following the more traditional forms of European realism and some temporal tropes of science fiction, what Fredric Jameson described as ‘Archaeologies of the Future’.⁴⁷ Where classical literature uses the afterlife to consider the posthumous futures of souls, as in Virgil’s *Aeneid*, I am considering writing incorporating posthumous temporality that presents historical time in a new light – replaying past narratives, finding new voices and perspectives, and developing new senses of the remembered past.

Sinclair and Lichtenstein’s achievement in *Rodinsky’s Room* is not to mythologise Rodinsky, but to understand and question the role of historical time in relation to literary and mythic narratives. Lichtenstein remains drawn to resonances that develop mythic qualities of her own search, quoting words by Schulz from his story ‘The Comet’: ‘And so it stood, unprepared and unfinished, in an accidental intersection of time and space, without closing of accounts, without reaching any goal, caught in a half sentence as it were, without full stop or exclamation mark, without trial.’⁴⁸

Lichtenstein uses this sense of broken apocalypse as a point of reconsidering the past and the future, writing as if from an end point, while suggesting this does not come. The past must be retold, again and again, as memory is resurrected, reincorporated and new senses of historical time are imagined as the future opens out, including towards new understandings of historical time. To return to Poe’s Dupin, the scene of death operates as a site in which posthumous temporality may appear to become active, incorporating a posthumous knowledge into the historical time. Through uncovering

⁴⁷ Fredric Jameson, *Archaeologies of the Future: The Desire Called Utopia and Other Science Fictions* (London: Verso, 2005); he describes how science fiction’s ‘multiple mock futures serve the... function of transforming our own present into the determinate past of something yet to come’, p. 288.

⁴⁸ Lichtenstein, *Rodinsky’s*, p. 203. This section of Schulz’s ‘The Comet’ is also partially included, in a different translation, in Foer’s *Tree of Codes*, which I consider in Chapter 5.

repressions, the posthumous temporality changes our knowledge of historical time.

I will now explore conjunctions of posthumous temporality, fictional time and historical memory in relation to Jensen's *Gradiva* and Orhan Pamuk's *The Black Book*, both of which present an openness to the past. These texts will allow us to consider further the nature of the crypt within literature and how we might read posthumous temporality within fictional narrative in relation to historical time.

Chapter 2

Posthumous temporality and fictional crypts: Posthumous presences of historical time in Wilhelm Jensen's *Gradiva* and Orhan Pamuk's *The Black Book*

1. Ghost houses, archaeological ruins and other fictional crypts of time

In the next two chapters I will consider further the relationship of posthumous temporality to narration and how historical time is incorporated within narrative, focusing on fiction, primarily Pamuk's *The Black Book* and Jensen's *Gradiva*, as well as Freud's interpretation of this short novel. Both works develop and demonstrate complex ideas of fictional historical time in relation to crypts of historical time. Chapter 3 will then focus on aspects of posthumousness in fiction in relation to historical time, including the role of doubling.

A key element of posthumous temporality in narrative is the return to and representing of the past and how this is achieved. In *Rodinsky's Room*, Sinclair and Lichtenstein develop the archive of Rodinsky, creating a phantom figure from impressions and associations. Pamuk presents contents of crypts as concealing other secrets of historical time; through a growing awareness of posthumous temporality, hidden meanings of time become accessible and readable within the text. His novel describes Galip's search for his missing wife Rüya and her half-brother, the newspaper columnist Celâl. On the multiple paths he takes, he enters old apartments, underground crypts and other hidden places in Istanbul that present time as encrypted, entwined with memories and other people's histories. His search includes memories and cryptic spaces in which Rüya and Celâl are implied but not discovered, until the final scenes.

This chapter looks at how a narrative is developed as a crypt, not just of the dead, but where dead life is preserved and old things may come alive or be retrieved, the crypt being open to new life. In Jensen's *Gradiva*, the main character Norbert Hanold appears to find the spectral figure of Gradiva in a historical crypt in Pompeii, the story revealing her true identity and the nature of Hanold's delusion. Freud's analysis of *Gradiva* in terms of delusion shows how fictional narrative can incorporate the posthumous, while working through ideas of repressed and historical time. The presence of the past in fictional narrative informs our understanding of cryptic survivals

of the past and how they mark interruptions and crises historical time. In Pamuk's and Jensen's novels, historical time at first appears to be an objective element, until its hidden or mysterious life is revealed, erupting within the narrative.

Crypts within fictional narrative are open to a complex archaeology of time, holding different senses of historical time together. In *Narrative Discourse*, while analyzing Marcel Proust's *Remembrance of Things Past*, Genette considers what he calls 'completing analepses, or "returns."' These comprise 'the retrospective sections that fill in, after the event, an earlier gap in the narrative (the narrative is thus organised by temporary omissions and more or less belated reparations, according to a narrative logic that is partially independent of the passing of time).'¹ The retrospective sections in Pamuk's and Jensen's novels do not explain everything in the past, indeed they create their own ruptures in historical time. Genette's idea of 'returns' indicate the potential role of posthumous temporality, though Pamuk's and Jensen's novels create this in a more complex way. *The Black Book's* returns do not simply retrospectively fill in a gap at the site of a death or disappearance, but use the returned-to time as a site of rupture between the past and the present that produces new possibilities of meaning and revelations of historical time.

In these cryptic sites, aspects of historical time are hidden. Historical memory is brought to life and discovered in these spaces in both novels, often relating to a dislocated or repressed desire. The sense of posthumous temporality, including historical time appearing to come to life in *Gradiva*, contrasts with the archive's being brought to life in *The Black Book*. Galip's experiences of cryptic spaces are part of his discovery of an archaeology that he must inhabit in order to fully understand his relation to historical time. The fictional crypts are constructed from historical memories, historical time being an ongoing process of archivization and reinscription. The novel's mystery is in part the complex relation of historical time to fictional time, including an archaeology of multiple temporalities, inscriptions and impressions.

In these fictional narratives new conjunctions of historical time and fictional time are created, indicating the past's encryptedness and the productive potential of posthumous perspectives. Currie argues that tenses become conjoined within narrative, taking into account the nature of 'time in the way that it is lived and perceived by human beings.'² Temporal mimesis in narrative is not a straightforward recreation of historical

¹ Genette, *Narrative*, p. 51.

² Currie, *About*, p. 146.

time, but reworks experiences and perceptions of temporality in relation to the position of the narrator. Ricoeur presents prefiguration, emplotment and figuration as the key elements of mimesis, but notes that the ‘mimetic relation between the verb tenses and lived time cannot be confined to discourse if... we are more interested in the role of discourse *in* narrative’ (*Time*, vol. ii, p. 64), implying that ‘past events, whether real or imaginary’ (*Time*, vol. ii, p. 64) are also influenced by the temporal position of the narrator. Currie observes that mimesis works both ways, for ‘emplotment may imitate the human world of human action, but human action already bears the marks of refiguration.’³ In the case of posthumous temporality, which frames either or both the temporal status of the narrator and the characters, while this falls outside of normal direct lived experience, the posthumous reconfiguration of historical time is still engaged in mimesis. My subsequent readings of historical time in fiction relating to posthumousness has this context of mimesis in mind. The posthumous reconfiguration of time involves the conjunction of prolepsis and analepsis, the posthumous perspective taking the place of the analeptic, but from a position after death, which we find in scenes of disappearance and death in *The Black Book* and of delusion within *Gradiva*.

Posthumous temporality includes narrative that looks forward and from that position looks back, and vice versa, movements found in other fiction. Currie writes how ‘The double time of detective fiction gives prolepsis an elaborate power to conjoin the forwards motion of narration to the backwards motion of explanation, and therefore to instruct the experience of events in the light of their outcome’ (*About*, p. 144). This conjunction is fundamental to the fictional development of the role of posthumousness, though sometimes it is reverted: a backward motion of narration is conjoined with a forward motion of explanation, as if, following the events of *The Black Book*, the events of the present will explain the secrets of historical time.

2. Fictional scenes of historical memory and posthumous temporality

In its reconstruction of historical time via memories, traces and intimations, Jensen’s *Gradiva* shows how historical time may be used within fictional narrative. The story relates Hanold’s (the protagonist and archaeologist) repressed feelings, as they come to

³ Currie, *Unexpected*, p. 45. Currie develops his argument regarding mimesis further including the narrative relation to the time of the narrator and reception, engaging with Ricoeur and also Meir Sternberg’s ‘Telling in Time: Chronology, Teleology, Narrativity’, *Poetics Today*, vol. 13, no. 3 (1992).

light in a dream and then in a series of encounters, leading to his realisation that the object of his love is someone he previously knew. The story begins with his discovery of an archaeological object, a bas-relief depicting a female figure which he names 'Gradiva.' The narrative shows how this has entered his psychic life when he dreams of her, a way in which historical time may become part of the present. The sense of posthumous temporality experienced later by Hanold is more than a delusion or fantasy: the archaeology and his desire is incorporated into the present. This allows us to consider the nature of this incorporation and how the past is resurrected in the present.

When Hanold sees someone in real life who reminds him of the bas-relief and his dream, he is drawn further into the past. The novel, as a historical fiction, moves between Pompeii at the time of its destruction (79 AD) and the late 19th century, as Hanold returns to Pompeii, the subject of the bas-relief, where he discovers the young woman Zoë. She appears to Hanold to take on the form of the Pompeian woman Gradiva represented on the bas-relief. Jensen's novel reveals the repressed love incorporated within Hanold's memory, which his discovery of Gradiva helps to release. Zoë, the story reveals, is someone he loved many years earlier.

The narrative of *Gradiva* contrasts Hanold's experiences of historical time by returning him to its origins. He travels to Pompeii to try to uncover the mystery of his dream, returning to a crypt (created by the volcano of 79 AD), a site hiding buried lives while possessing traces of those whom once lived there. Jensen writes that the 'city of Pompeii assumed an entirely changed appearance, but not a living one; it now appeared rather to become petrified in dead mobility.'⁴ Hanold is portrayed as breaking into this crypt, but sensitive to what might be found there. Out of this 'dead mobility' there 'stirred a feeling that death was beginning to talk, although not in a way intelligible to human ears' (*Gradiva*, p. 50). This sense of life in the crypt is at the height of the sun at midday, 'in whose ghostly hour life must be silent and suppressed, because during it the dead awake and begin to talk in toneless spirit language' (*Gradiva*, p. 51).

In this scene, investigating the ruins of Pompeii, Hanold's senses were awoken, going beyond 'a lifeless archaeological view' and towards 'a comprehension with soul, mind and heart' (*Gradiva*, p. 55). His inhabitation of the crypts of Pompeii is an awakening to what appears to be a sense of posthumous temporality, as 'the sun dissolved the tomb-like rigidity of the old stones, a glowing thrill passed through them, the dead awoke,

⁴ Wilhelm Jensen, *Gradiva*, trans. by Helen M. Downey (Copenhagen and Los Angeles: Green Integer, 2003), p. 50.

and Pompeii began to live again' (*Gradiva*, p. 56). During this scene Hanold witnesses another apparent appearance of Gradiva: 'Quite indubitably it was she; even if the sunbeams did surround her figure as with a thin veil of gold, he perceived her in profile as plainly and as distinctly as on the bas-relief' (*Gradiva*, p. 57).

In this moment the past appears to come to life – from the historical past, the bas-relief representation, his dream and his own repressed memory: 'As soon as he caught sight of her, Hanold's memory was clearly awakened to the fact that he had seen her here once already in a dream, walking thus, the night that she had lain down as if to sleep over there in the Forum on the steps of the Temple of Apollo' (*Gradiva*, pp. 57-58). Jensen's narrative creates a crypt in which Gradiva's appearance takes place and Hanold is caught between a sense of witnessing historical time and wondering if she is a mirage: 'it was a noonday picture that passed there before him and yet also a reality' (*Gradiva*, p. 58).

In this section, Jensen is narrating a combination of times, of the distant past, of dreams and memories, and a present that appears to be encrypted, hiding something. The secrets become accessible, we learn, when Hanold 'felt from the secret inner vibrations that Pompeii had begun to live about him in the noonday hour of spirits and so Gradiva lived again, too, and had gone into the house which she had occupied before the fateful August day of the year 79' (*Gradiva*, p. 60). He searches the house (Casa di Meleagro) for signs of Gradiva, but cannot find her: 'she had already dissolved again into nothing' (*Gradiva*, p. 63). He experiences a complex sense of time in which historical life appears to emerge from archaeology and then disappears. The subject of his desire appears to live in this cryptic realm, as if he has been transported from a delusion (including his infatuation with Gradiva) to a more fabulous mirage, based on his perception of this cryptic, historical life of Gradiva in contemporary Pompeii.

In the story Jensen creates a multiple stratification of narrative times, including how a dream appears to Hanold to come to life in a historical crypt. Historical time appears as something that can be resurrected; it is not spectral, for Gradiva is corporeal. Hanold tests Gradiva's materiality when he aims at a common housefly that has settled on her hand. The narrative itself, more than spectral, proposes a new relationship between historical time and lived time, developing the relationship between Hanold's lived time, his perceiving, dreaming, analyzing, remembering, and other temporalities existing around him – ruins, tourists, found objects, as well as the woman he calls Gradiva, continuing 'her visible existence in the noonday spirit hour and sat there before him, as, in the dream, he had seen her on the steps of the Temple of Apollo' (*Gradiva*,

p. 65). When she speaks, this is ‘really remarkable from the mouth of a Pompeian woman who had died two centuries before’ (*Gradiva*, pp. 67-68). Hanold is drawn into the confusion of temporality, the narrative hinting at the presence of the posthumous, Gradiva being ‘Only fleetingly visible for a while, she finally seemed to have sunk into the earth’ (*Gradiva*, p. 69).

Freud’s analysis of *Gradiva* develops an understanding of the role of posthumous temporality in Jensen’s fictional approach to historical time. He reads the story as a narrative of delusion, while showing how incorporation of a historical character into narrative changes our understandings of how historical time might be narrated posthumously. As with Freud’s version of Moses, Jensen’s narrative uses archaeology to produce a new narrative of historical memory, showing how the archive might come alive. The past appears to open out to the future; viewed posthumously it is subject to restructuring, while revealing Hanold’s repressed love for Zoë (Gradiva’s true identity) which Freud interprets via the influence of dreams and delusions.

Jensen’s incorporation of memories and dreams of the past acknowledges the role of posthumous temporality, in which historical time appears to come alive. In his commentary on the novel, Freud notes ‘the class of dreams that have not been dreamt at all – dreams created by imaginative writers and ascribed to invented characters in the course of a story.’⁵ These dreams are not only different from real life dreams because they have been made up, but also in terms of the fictive nature of their relationship both with fictionalised historical time and history.

The dream described by Jensen acts upon the lived time of Hanold such that it brings the archive alive. The threat or infection of the past is not localized or internalised as a symptom in Hanold, but is part of the structure of the narrative, the past appearing to be dramatized within a present day narrative. Freud presents the story as a revelation of a dream entering into real life, revealing Hanold’s hidden desire while showing how the dream relates to the subsequent narrative.

Freud’s analysis uses an archaeological method to consider how the past may be brought back to life. Derrida considers Freud’s interpretation of *Gradiva*, considering his psychoanalytical approaches to the archive, including the ambiguous nature of its haunting of the archive, and how virtual traces hint at an origin accessible via

⁵ Freud, *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud*, vol. ix, *Jensen’s ‘Gradiva’ and Other Works (1906-1908)*, trans. by James Strachey (London: Vintage, 2001), p. 7.

archaeology. He also articulates the hiddenness of language concealed within historical time, contrasting this with Freud's comments on how historical time might appear to come to life via archaeology, for

at the moment Freud sees himself obliged to let the phantoms speak for the duration of the archaeological digs but finishes by exorcising them in the moment he at last says, the work having been terminated (or supposed to have been), "Stones talk!" He believes he has exorcised them in the instant he lets them talk, providing that these specters talk, he believes, in the figurative. Like stones, nothing but that...⁶

The past is brought to life, but Freud observes the narration of delusional effects in *Gradiva*, as if by proceeding backwards we might uncover the origin, like the investigation into Moses that might reveal his historical character. The novel presents episodes that demonstrate how historical time may posthumously inhabit the present and be experienced as a reconstruction that invades the present. Hanold's delusions form a connection with historical time, with the past appearing to come to life, but Jensen introduces a new understanding of historical time. This concerns not just what has happened, but how this is incorporated within or excluded from narrative. Posthumous temporality within fiction includes decryptions of historical time, but also incorporates historical time. Jensen's chief temporal interest is not the search for origins, including both archaeology and the role of dreams; rather, it is how dreams and repressed desires resurface, changing Hanold's experience of time. *Gradiva/Zoë*, who Hanold regards as embodying historical time, is an agent of historical time, making Hanold's fictional experience of it possible. She appears to want the story to continue, while incorporating historical time. I will show later in this chapter how Galip acts as an agent of both temporal continuity and re-emergence in Pamuk's *The Black Book*.

3. Delusion, dreams and encryptions of historical memory

Freud's analysis of *Gradiva* follows a path of dream interpretation, while showing how traces of the past are incorporated into writing. Derrida writes in 'Freud and the Scene of Writing' that Freud's notion of writing is based on a system of inscriptions that leave imprints of memories that have stratifications, made possible by repression. Derrida insists that 'there is as well a time of writing, and this time of writing is nothing other

⁶ Derrida, *Archive*, pp. 94-95, quoting Freud, *Standard Edition*, vol. iii, *Early Psychoanalytic Publications* (1893-1899), trans. by James Strachey (London: Vintage, 2001), p. 192.

than the very structure of that which we are now describing'⁷ [his analysis of Freud's analogy of the mystic writing pad]. Derrida perceives that the scene of writing includes the times of writing, of what is both incorporated and articulated.

Freud's analysis reveals the narrative's temporal strata, showing how different events of memory can be connected in fiction, as well as in consciousness. He recognises Hanold's desire for another time, not just desiring the Pompeian bas-relief and Gradiva. His desire includes the historical time of the bas-relief, as if it possesses or has encrypted a hidden lived or imagined historical time. In the novel Jensen reveals hidden temporalities relating to both dreams and posthumousness, presenting alternative ways in which historical time can be experienced or narrated. Delusion is connected to the force of re-emergent historical time, drawing Hanold towards his repressed desire, Freud writing that, 'The journey, which was undertaken in defiance of the latent dream-thoughts, was nevertheless following the path to Pompeii that was pointed out by the manifest content of the dream. Thus at every fresh struggle between eroticism and resistance we find the delusion triumphant.'⁸

Hanold's delusion offers an alternative path to that which has been repressed, 'awakening erotic longing for the girl whom he loved' (*Gradiva*, p. 67). The delusion returns the repressed time in a different form, producing a new narrative setting and temporal structure, while Gradiva/Zoë appears to conform to the expectations of Hanold's delusion. Derrida's archival search for hidden bodies within the fictive historical crypt of *Gradiva* takes Freud's analysis further, analysing the novel as an example of incorporation of the fictive archive into historical memory. This differs from Freud's understanding of repressed traces when reconsidering Moses' life within history, for in *Gradiva* Zoë acts out the imagined past figure of Gradiva, as an agent of Hanold's delusion that might reveal his repressed desire.

In *Gradiva*, Hanold is haunted by virtual traces of historical time, in his dreams, everyday life, and Pompeii. Derrida addresses Freud's interest in the relationship between Hanold and Zoë, and the truth that it conceals. He writes: 'Analogous to that "historical truth" which Freud distinguishes, notably in Moses, from the "material truth," this truth is repressed or suppressed. But it resists and returns, as such, as the spectral truth of delusion or of hauntedness.'⁹ He says further of this truth that 'It

⁷ Derrida. 'Freud and the Scene of Writing', in *Writing and Difference*, trans. by Alan Bass (London: Routledge, 2001), p. 282.

⁸ Freud, vol. ix, p. 67.

⁹ Derrida, *Archive*, p. 87.

returns, it belongs, it comes down to spectral truth. Delusion of insanity, hauntedness is not only haunted by this or that ghost, Gradiva for example, but by the spectre of the truth which has been thus repressed' (*Archive*, p. 87). Jensen's story acts as a crypt for this truth to come to life, the posthumous temporality appearing in the present – in dreams, and in Hanold's everyday life.

Hanold is drawn in to this new version of historical time within fiction, in which he 'begins to *know*... what he did not then know, namely his "intimate drive" or "impulse"' (*Archive*, p. 98). Hanold has moved towards an understanding of the hidden systems of historical time and memory, what Derrida refers to as 'this deciphering of the interior desire to decipher which drove him on to Pompeii, all of this comes back to him in an act of memory... He recalls that he came to see if he could find her traces, the traces of Gradiva's footsteps' (*Archive*, p. 98).

Derrida's *Archive Fever* considers how historical time is recaptured in narrative, using Freud's, Jensen's and Yerushalmi's texts to show how the past is retold, but at the same time how historical time is represented and reimagined. This re-ordering and disruption of historical time offers itself to new fictional approaches, including engaging with memory and its significance through fictional characters. Concerning the search for meaning in historical time, Derrida writes: 'Hanold suffers from archive fever. He has exhausted the science of archaeology. He had, the novel says, become a master in the art of deciphering the most indecipherable, the most enigmatic graffiti... But he had had enough of his science and of his abilities' (*Archive*, p. 98). The 'archive fever' reveals itself in his dissatisfaction with a codified historical time based on archaeological interpretation. He is in pursuit of a different kind of time, one that the fiction might reveal. Derrida says how 'in the moment Pompeii comes back to life, when the dead awake... Hanold understands everything' (*Archive*, p. 98), as if historical time has been decrypted.

In Jensen's fiction, the reader engages in a dream of historical memory, in which the past is brought back to life in what Derrida calls (*Archive*, p. 99),

the condition of singularity... of the impression and the imprint, of the pressure and its trace in the unique *instant* where they are not yet distinguished the one from the other, forming in an instant a single body of Gradiva's step, of her gait, of her pace... and of the ground that carries them. The trace no longer distinguishes itself from its substrate.

The reader encounters time encrypted in the narrative, which includes the combined trace and substrate. Temporality is deceptive in this 'condition of singularity', demanding the analysis of this conjunction. *Gradiva* shows how historical time can be

combined with fictional memory to create an integrative palimpsest in which traces of the past and the substrate appear indistinguishable. Freud's interpretation tries to understand how these different layers of time come together, seeing in Hanold's delusion a desire for the lived past to come alive, for historical time to be incorporated into the present and given a posthumous life. *Gradiva* shows how fiction may reincorporate historical time to bring it to life, reflecting how repressions, delusions and dreams are part of the structure of historical time within fiction. Analysis of this effect of posthumous temporality, including conjunctions of traces and the substrate is necessary to understand how narrative brings together different temporal imprints.

4. Disappearances, crises and discoveries of historical time in *The Black Book*

The narrative temporalities of Pamuk's *The Black Book* are more complex than those of *Gradiva*, in part due to the enigmatic, unresolved tripartite relationship between the narrator, Galip, and Celâl. In the novel, Galip goes in search of his wife, Rûya, who has disappeared, along with Celâl, a newspaper columnist whose pieces alternate with the narrative of Galip's search among the archaeologies of encrypted time within Istanbul.

Analyzing the temporalities of Pamuk's narrative, we can consider how time is conjoined within narrative, including times of the characters, the material spaces of the scenes, and the narrator's memory. Pamuk presents details and narratives of memory encrypted within narrative; as with *Rodinsky's Room*, places within the narrative are structured by and stocked with moments of time as much as objects. Time inhabits places, and narratives are part of this encrypted inhabitation. Galip's discovery of hidden spaces leads to new understandings of historical time, repressed time becoming visible as in *Gradiva*, the novel revealing desire concealed in crypts like a latent archaeology awaiting new understandings of historical time to be brought back to life.

Galip tries to imagine this historical time in his searches for Rûya and Celâl and the signs of *Gradiva*-like posthumous intensity or delusion are to be found throughout the city, as if Galip is in a dream house. Rûya's name signifies 'dream' in Turkish, and we are aware of unconscious presence in the novel's formation of our impressions of the city, as Galip follows paths in search of hidden mysteries. It is as if only after disappearance or death that these signs of the buried past become visible to him. Repressions of historical memory make Galip aware of the hiddenness of the past and how his desire for what is hidden may be the key to unlocking them. His recognition of

posthumous temporality and of memories of the past buried in the present also reveals his desire for Rüya and the signs that she leaves.

To unlock this posthumous temporality, Galip takes on another's (Celâl's) time in order to interrupt the archive, superseding Celâl's role in it. Galip, knowing that Rüya was in search of the first Turkish detective novel, offers his search and reconstruction of the mystery of her disappearance as a gift to her. Galip appears to be enacting the detective fiction itself, the process helping him hold Rüya's memory in his mind while seeking to understand her disappearance. His intense search for Rüya leads him to hidden worlds of Istanbul buried like virtual memories within the city. In these discoveries, Galip accepts Rüya and Celâl's absence, yet his narrative will describe their death. His tracing of his desire for Rüya is also her burial; his taking on of Celâl's identity and the losing of his own marks both a concern for the historical time of what happened and his desire to keep this historical time alive, as if suspended in a posthumous temporality.

Galip's understanding of historical time develops from their disappearance, as if formed from their displaced presences. His investigation into the mysteries hidden in time and how posthumous time may reveal the past in new ways becomes his new lived time. Reading, we participate in his apparent discoveries; in the posthumous recollection of buried time, we are incorporated within the time of the search, witnessing the structure of the delusions and revelations, as if our presence gives it life too. *The Black Book* narrates the lost time and repressed histories as that which explains the death of Rüya and Celâl; however, it is also as if the lost time being recovered and narrated produces the fatal threat against them.

Rüya and Celâl's disappearance creates a rupture in which Galip's delusion is created, leading to his transformation into Celâl and his belief in the discovery of hidden significations and presences of the city, including historical time's mysteries. Galip believes these mysteries can be solved, through memory, reconstruction and decryption. The narrator remarks of Galip that:

For if it was true that the world was awash with secrets, it was also true that everything he could see on the table in front of him – the coffee cup, the ashtray, the letter opener, and even his own hand as it rested like a drowsy crab alongside the letter opener – were not just signs pointing to another world; they themselves belonged to it. Rüya was in this other world. Galip stood on its threshold.¹⁰

¹⁰ Pamuk, *Black*, p. 298.

This description presents a sense of posthumous temporality, the narrative revealing signs that appear out of place or time, the scene of death and disappearance. They disrupt the narrative, as posthumous eruptions of historical time. Galip learns how virtual presences of the archive might be brought to life in the present, as if by reimagining these he will understand historical time and what has happened to Rüya and Celâl.

The narrative presents historical time as recoverable, bringing it back into memory, rather than memories signifying an absence, as in *Rodinsky's Room*. Within the narrative's posthumous temporality, the story describes objects and other semblances in the absence of Rüya and Celâl. Galip interprets perceived virtual traces, incorporating these within a version of historical time, though the contents of Celâl's apartment appeared to change, 'No longer did they welcome him; they were danger signs, pointing to a world that kept its secrets buried deep' (*Black*, p. 253).

Pamuk's novel, like *Gradiva*, shows how delusions and reimaginings of historical time inform narrative constructions of the past and memory. Galip tries to uncover memory and discovers ruptures in meanings hidden in historical time, through which he tries to unlock buried memories, assembling new understandings of historical time. Like the mediated desire of both Hanold and *Gradiva*/Zoë, Galip's search for hidden desire is fundamental to the novel's approach to historical time. Unlike *Gradiva* however, the narrative turns Galip's concern for repressed and encrypted desire into a pursuit of historical meaning as if it is possessed by a mystery. Hanold's rediscovery of erotic feeling is related to the opening out of memory in *Gradiva*.

At the beginning of the novel, there is no immediate sign of the posthumous or encryption. We do not appear to be in a crime scene and there is no immediate clue indicating what might have happened. The narrative makes the past appear present, bearing only innocent marks of nostalgia. The first memory we are offered in the first chapter ('The First Time Galip Saw Rüya') appears to be a simple reminiscence, retelling memories as they surface in an easy present form, although memory's metaphorical powers are beginning to assert themselves: Galip 'longed to stroll among the willows, acacias and sun-drenched climbing roses of the walled garden where Rüya had taken refuge' (*Black*, p. 3).

In these early passages we begin to explore Pamuk's use of temporality and signification within the complex archaeology of time of Galip's search. His desire for Rüya is communicated as being for moving through the 'walled garden', yet we know that it is Rüya whom he desires. Galip embraces the past because of what he believes

that it conceals (desire and the memory of desire) and allows space for, cryptically. He is aware of how desire is concealed, how the ‘sun-drenched country roses’ may live within (and try to climb) the ‘walled garden.’ In his reminiscences, memory is neither distant historical or clear first-hand memory. The past tense is disturbed by Galip’s own imagining within it: ‘*Memory*, Celâl had once written in a column, *is a garden*. Rûya’s gardens, Rûya’s gardens... Galip thought’ (*Black*, p. 3). The conflated memory, a jealousy, invades his memory of the garden of desire.

Threats and ruptures are hidden in these memories; Galip was ‘indecently afraid of the faces he might find there... It was not the already identified apparitions he most dreaded but the insinuating male shadows he could never have anticipated’ (*Black*, p. 3). His memories activate new presences of the past as he moves between nervous recollection and more optimistic representations of the past, for ‘perhaps Rûya’s memories were not so cruelly crowded; perhaps she was at this very moment basking in the one sunny corner in the dark garden of her memories, setting out with Galip in a rowboat’ (*Black*, p. 4).

In his speculations, Galip dwells on virtual aspects of the archive, aware that somebody else’s recollection of the past is a completely different garden. As he finds ways into the past through another’s eyes, he becomes aware of the subjective experience of temporality, changing his perception of historical memory. Historical time appears multiple, including ruptures between what is being concealed and what may be revealed. In his return to historical memories, we learn of Galip’s early introduction to linguistic signs and what they might conceal or reveal. Galip learnt from his grandmother ‘the greatest mystery of all – how the letters joined up to make words’ (*Black*, p. 5), and how he longed ‘for a magic potion to pour over the picture of this sprightly alphabet horse, to give it the strength to jump off the page’ (*Black*, p. 5). While this memory surfaces, there is an accompanying memory of erasure, or of concealing the infant apprenticeship to signs, for ‘later on, when they held him back in the first year of primary school and he had to learn to read and write all over again under the supervision of the very same alphabet horse, he would dismiss this wish as nonsense’ (*Black*, p. 5). This re-learning of language is a lesson in how signification gets hidden, overwritten and encrypted, creating a sense of rupture in meaning that forms part of Galip’s developing understanding of the written word.

Writing’s power and hidden symbolism appears in other forms in the novel. When Galip’s grandmother and grandfather had ‘both finished reading Celâl’s column. [Celâl

is Rüya's half-brother] "If only they'd let him sign his real name," Grandfather would say, "maybe he'd come to his senses" (*Black*, p. 7). This sense of Celâl's hidden or disguised self is a sign of the power of what is encrypted. It creates a space of accidental or unrepressed articulation, which demands interpretation. Galip's grandmother asks: "Is it because he writes so badly that they won't give him permission to write under his own name?" "If nothing else," Grandfather would say... "It's because they haven't let him sign his columns that so few people know how much he's disgraced us" (*Black*, p. 7). The connection between pseudonymity and secrets of language develops through the novel, including how Galip later tries to recapture hidden knowledge through his adoption of Celâl's persona and his writing. Pseudonymity permits alternative approaches to historical time, with characters appearing to occupy different times simultaneously. Galip's venture through his own garden of memories within Istanbul is built on these complex layers of time, of signs hidden and encrypted. In his attention to hidden signs, we recall Pamuk's writing of his first love in his own memoir: 'Because this is a memoir, I must hide her name, and if in naming her I offer a clue in the style of the Divan poets, I must also hint that this clue, like the rest of this story, might also be misleading'.¹¹ The desire is revealed and hidden; following the rules of this genre we are given an encrypted version of historical time, while revealing disclosure of desire. We don't know if this is a historical account, the reader being made aware that there are fictional narrative strata not clearly differentiated from those which are historical. These fictions are integral to Pamuk's narrative of historical time, making possible the presentation of narratives of hidden desire.

The novel narrates historical time as something that cannot be completed, recover what has been lost or has disappeared. The posthumous perspective changes our relation to historical time, introducing hidden and repressed narratives of desire. Through their uncovering, the novel's narrative time is ruptured, interrupted, distorted and disordered. The eruption of historical time generates new understandings of historical memory, including how buried signs conceal desire, death and lost meaning.

¹¹ Pamuk, *Istanbul, Memories of a City*, trans. by Maureen Freely (London: Faber and Faber, 2006), p. 293.

5. Fictional narrative and the incorporation of lost signs of historical time

The Black Book's fictionality raises questions about how novels can approach historical time, particularly in relation to absences and disappearances. Galip's attempts to understand the archaeology of historical memories is part of a wider search for historical origins and original meanings of signs. This involves decoding what happened in the past, as if understanding Turkey's transition to modernity in the early 20th century might offer clues to other mysteries. Galip perceives that clashes of systems of meanings created ruptures which he must understand in order to solve the mystery of Celâl's and Rüya's disappearance.

In Galip's search for historical knowledge, absence forms a mystery in the structural order of historical time, in which the present is continually drawn to the past via signs. The absence of meaning, or the mystery, unites the world around Galip. Pamuk writes that Galip 'became more and more certain that he would soon be diving into this ocean's secrets. Because if signs were everywhere, if they resided in everything, then the mystery was also everywhere and residing in everything'.¹² This world encompasses him, for 'The longer he read, the more clearly he saw that the objects surrounding him were – like the pearls, roses, wine goblets, nightingales, golden hair, nights, flames, and lovers' faces in the poems he was reading – both signs of themselves and of the mystery he was slowly entering' (*Black*, p. 300). These signs included memories of Rüya: 'The curtain in the weak light of the lamp, the chairs in which he could read so many memories of Rüya, the shadows on the wall, and the fearsome telephone receiver were all so heavy with memories and stories' (*Black*, p. 300).

Rüya and Celâl's disappearance makes Galip realize that he must understand the nature of what of historical memory has been lost and how historical crises bury meanings, hence his need to salvage and search for signs hidden in everyday life, from mannequins to pre-Atatürk Turkish language.¹³ Galip also uses Celâl's writings to unlock the secrets of historical time that Celâl had encrypted in his writing. He believes there are hidden clues about Rüya and Celâl's disappearance amongst these; by reading Celâl's columns, Galip trusts that he will discover the secret of their disappearance. Pamuk writes (*Black*, p. 211):

To extract the hidden "secret" meaning, all he had to do was hold on to that conviction as he read the column. As his eyes traveled from word to word, he told himself that, while his first

¹² Pamuk, *Black*, p. 300.

¹³ In 1928, Mustafa Kemal Atatürk, founder and first President of modern Turkey, introduced a Latin alphabet to the Turkish language, replacing the Ottoman Turkish alphabet.

object was to locate Celâl and Rûya's hiding place (and also make sense of it), these lines would also reveal to him all the secrets of the city, all the secrets of life itself.

Galip believes these signs are deeper symptoms or clues to an understanding of the past and the present. His search unifies the times of the past and the narrative present, his investigation revealing how these times may be brought together and told as one story. The signs he discovers are remains of other times, but they are a confused archaeological presence, as if masking what they really represent. In his search, Galip feels '...happy, on the verge of a revelation – the secret of life, the meaning of the world, the shimmering just beyond his grasp – but when he tried to put this secret into words, all he could see was the face of the woman who was sitting in the corner watching him' (*Black*, p. 211).

The sense of cryptic meanings and presences is found in Galip's interpretation of the world around him: 'He'd look at the black phone, an exact replica of every telephone he'd seen in those foreign language textbooks; marveling at its overt purpose – to link a caller with other voices – but he'd sense a second, greater, hidden purpose' (*Black*, p. 217). His purpose is 'to enter the secret world of second meanings' (*Black*, p. 217), encrypted meanings that continue into the present, posthumously.

The narrator describes how 'In Rûya's detective novels, when the puzzle was solved and the murky second world revealed itself, it would burn bright for a few seconds, only to recede into the shadows of the first world for lack of interest' (*Black*, p. 217). Galip connects the posthumous time of the murder with this hidden language of the 'second world', his pursuit of the mystery of historical time a search for buried or hidden presence. The narrator describes Galip's task: 'How to enter the secret world of second meanings, how to break the code? He was standing on the threshold – joyful and expectant – but he had no idea how to cross it' (*Black*, p. 217). He could hope that one day he might decipher this new world, finding hidden signs in words and in faces, and know what these might mean. The world around him is given this potential hidden significance, as if a posthumous temporality is incorporated within the present. The narrator describes how (*Black*, p. 218),

It was possible to look into the faces of his fellow citizens and see in them the city's long history – its misfortunes, its lost magnificence, its melancholy and pain – but these were not carefully arranged clues pointing to a secret world; they came from a shared defeat, a shared history, a shared shame.

Pamuk emphasizes 'shared' here because the clues do not belong to a private 'secret

world' – the pain is shared, together with knowledge. Galip identifies with the pain of the city's history, recognizing he is part of a shared system of signs, an encrypted archaeology of historical time. His search for individual and collective memories, for personal memories of Rüyâ and those of general Turkish cultural history are conflated.

In *The Black Book*, the narrator brings to life historical memories to attempt to reveal historical time within Istanbul. Galip's search for the meaning of historical time changes as signs of the past are given a new sense of order through the story of the disappearance of Rüyâ and Celâl and their deaths. Fictional time and historical time combine to create new senses of how the past is represented and understood.

From the novel's first chapter, there are mysteries of historical time and memory, indicated by evidence discovered by Galip. His gradual taking over of Celâl's life during the novel continues the sense of disrupted meanings after Celâl and Rüyâ's disappearance and then after their deaths. Galip's ongoing desire to be Celâl creates new disruptions, opening ways for posthumous memory to be incorporated within the narrative. Celâl's murder marks the moment in which Galip believes he can describe what has happened. The narrator writes after the discovery of the murder of Celâl: 'Please, sir, Galip longed to say to the inspector, I'm writing Turkey's first ever detective novel, and look, here's our first clue' (*Black*, p. 440). This 'first clue' follows a continuous series of apparently meaningful signs, suggesting the deeper significance of the clue as the key revelation that might lead to the reconstruction of historical time. This involves Galip decoding the world of mysterious signs that he has found.

Like Poe's 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue', the death scene near the end of *The Black Book* is a double murder. The circumstances of the deaths mean that memories that have appeared earlier in the novel appear to take on new meanings. Unlike Poe's story, there are multiple murder suspects when Rüyâ and Celâl's bodies are found. The novel is more than a detective story, however. The sites of their deaths are key to the novel, but not as a typical murder scene where clues may be gathered, for the scene is another illustration of encryption. Death is another form of absence, in which meanings must be reconstructed. Galip's search confronts this absence in terms of the themes of repression and hidden knowledge indicating ruptures in historical time.

Written from this perspective of absence, the narrative doesn't try to resolve the mystery as Dupin aims to. Instead, historical time's mystery is displayed, the narrator conveying how memory is hidden and might be rediscovered. Survivals of historical time appear

as illusions and spectres at the scene of death or disappearance. The temporal experience of Pamuk's novel is not simply disruptive, but shows how disappeared time and the time of the dead of historical time may be incorporated within the narrative present. Developing his ideas on narrative, Ricoeur writes: 'If, following Genette, we may call the relation between the time of narration and the narrated time of the narrative itself a "game with time," this game has as its stakes the temporal experience (*Zeiterlebnis*) intended by the narrative.'¹⁴ *The Black Book* creates the sense of the mystery of historical time by encrypting the time of narration, complicated by the multiple presence of narrators, within the time of the narrative.

The intended temporal experience of Pamuk's novel is a form of mysterious historical time, which is achieved by conjoining different kinds of pastness into his narrative, the narrative being simultaneously in the moment and other historical times. *The Black Book* develops the relationship between the past and the present, presenting history's mystery via signs related to historical time. In the novel's representation of the past, the original, the double and posthumous versions of past time are difficult to distinguish. Ricoeur writes that 'contemporary experiments in the area of narrative techniques are... aimed at shattering the very experience of time' (*Time*, vol. ii, p. 80), but there is a constitutive element present here too. *The Black Book* holds different times together, virtual historical times existing alongside narrated revisions and revelations of historical time.

The narrative structure, alternating Galip's story with newspaper columns, draws the reader into the fictionalisation of narrated historical time. The narrative of Galip's search indicates presences of disappearance and anticipations of death. His taking on of Celâl's persona is as if he has accepted or anticipates Celâl's death. Galip believes the newspaper columns written by Celâl hold the key to the mystery of both Celâl's and Rüya's disappearance, but also to a more general hidden order behind historical memory and systems of meaning that can be decoded. He uses the columns to navigate the loss of the past, and so the narrative alternates between disappearance and possible recuperations of what has been lost.

The alternating elements of the narrative are linked by a sense of posthumous temporality, the past reappearing via the text and Galip's searches of Istanbul, in which meanings hidden in the past come alive and form part of the narrative of the present. This is developed in different ways, including Galip's imitation of Celâl, and his taking over of Celâl's life. The posthumous temporality incorporated by the narrator includes

¹⁴ Ricoeur, *Time*, vol. ii, p. 80.

how the narrative continues after the death of Rüyâ and Celâl. Another way in which this posthumous temporality is present is in the possibility that Celâl, who dies in the final sections of the novel, is in part the narrative voice too. The author appears to be writing as Galip pretending to be Celâl, yet these encrypted voices of Galip and Celâl are more than a ghosted simulacra, as if Celâl exists after the novel's having been written and Galip might continue writing as Celâl, elements of the past continuing to come back to life, like the mementos he treasures, his stories 'trailing my memories behind them.'¹⁵

6. Posthumous temporality, archaeology and reconstructions of historical time

The Black Book shows how the narrator and characters develop temporality within narrative, including experiences of ruptures of historical time, as we find in Galip's search. Narrated time in the novel is divided, yet brought together in the narrator's present, accommodating temporal ruptures and complexities. In the previous chapter I considered how ruptures of historical time in narrative stimulate re-interpretations of historical memory, this informing Freud's *Moses and Monotheism*. When tradition appears to conceal or to be structured on a distortion of the past, literature has a potential to develop new senses of historical time to compensate for or supplement what has been broken, hidden or repressed. In *Rodinsky's Room*, absence is supplemented by narratives of posthumous temporality and there are similar supplementations and reorchestrations of historical time in *The Black Book*.

Pamuk's supplementation of historical time is achieved through the creation of hidden temporality incorporated within the narrative, embedded in material crypts that the novel exposes and encounters. Working from Freud's approach to archaeology in *Moses and Monotheism*, we can develop ideas of recovered hidden time in narrative further. The archaeology of time evident in *Moses and Monotheism* reflects Freud's psychoanalytic approaches to virtual elements of the past via which hidden bodies may be made visible. This forms Freud's focus on the virtual, which Derrida considers in *Archive Fever*. But Freud's text also shows how historical time can be obscured – by repressions, distortions and absences and how historical time comprises these elements. The historical time of Moses presented in *Moses and Monotheism* is more than an attempted archaeological reconstruction. Freud's interpretation, given inadequacies of

¹⁵ Pamuk, *Black*, p. 460.

material and textual evidence, acknowledges absences and rupture in historical time and implies the need for fictional reconstruction based on what evidence there may be.

Freud's argument indicates that readings of historical time should attend to virtual traces, distortions and repressions. Narrative may lead us to consider not just hidden, lost or dead bodies, but how hidden time is experienced and presented within the text. How in narrative, for example, places hold historical time, incorporating memories and hidden systems of the past. Pamuk writes in his later novel *The Museum of Innocence* that 'Real museums are places where Time is transformed into Space',¹⁶ a description that inverts the narrative process in his novels, in which archives are transposed back into time. *The Black Book's* narrative displays how historical time can be encrypted by fiction, the novel overlaying, interleaving or supplementing historical memory. The narrative approaches the hiddenness of archives and crypts, as well as their ubiquity and unresolved temporal status. The novel's posthumous elements are highlighted through Galip's investigations of Istanbul, including hidden rooms, deep underground crypts and secret writing.

Where in *Rodinsky's Room* Sinclair and Lichtenstein are in search of the lost body of Rodinsky, finding ways to conjure his presence into existence, Pamuk is more concerned with how memories might lead to the discovery of Rüyâ and Celâl, and how memories erupt into the present, disordering senses of historical time. The posthumous invades and interrupts the present, making visible the underworld of memory that has been repressed, as if waiting to be discovered by Galip.

Galip enters into these crypts of past times, acknowledging posthumous temporality and that visible historical time may combine different times of the past. His inhabitation of the narrative transforms the significance of historical time. Pamuk writes of Galip in 'The Ghost House' chapter: 'He felt less like a detective in forced pursuit of his missing wife than a man who has just gained entry to the first museum ever to exhibit his primary passion in life and is strolling from room to marvelous room in openmouthed awe'.¹⁷ Pamuk's reconstruction of historical time, incorporating virtual elements of the archive, is both an act and a memory of desire, the posthumous temporality of this memory overwriting the sense of absence. Galip acts as a detective in search of the significance of disappearances, absences, erasures, alterations and other evidential phenomena. He searches within the site of disappearance, discovering that

¹⁶ Pamuk, *Museum*, p. 700.

¹⁷ Pamuk, *Black*, p. 240.

posthumous elements of the past are not simulacra, but part of a scene of death and historical rupture within which he is himself significant.

The posthumous temporality of *The Black Book* encompasses the narrator and characters as well as the time of action. Galip believes he can decode the mystery and appears to generate new narrative temporalities in his confrontation with death and disappearance. Taking over the life and identity of Celâl in order to live a different historical time, he becomes absorbed by the posthumous, inhabiting the past, as if the narrative is sinking into the crypts of historical time which he appeared to be surveying. Galip's transition to Celâl's personality embodies this absorption. The novel's use of inhabitable historical memory creates a complex archaeology of narrative time.

A psychoanalytic approach is helpful to consider how an archaeological model of narrative time might be applied to the past; Freud used archaeology as a model for reading processes of time and for uncovering symptoms. For example, in his early writings on hysteria he described how an explorer might (vol. iii, p. 192),

content himself with inspecting what lies exposed to view, with questioning the inhabitants – perhaps semi-barbaric people – who live in the vicinity, about what tradition tells them of the history and meaning of these archaeological remains, and with noting down what they tell him – and he may then proceed on his journey. But he may act differently.

This difference is to look beyond visible signs and to dig beneath, using applied techniques of archaeology to find buried items of significance, so that 'when they have been deciphered and translated, yield undreamed-of information about the events of the remote past, to commemorate which the monuments were built' (vol. iii, p. 192). Freud's exclamation, 'Saxa loquuntur!' ('Stones talk!') (vol. iii, p. 192) is not a reflection on the automatic nature of revelation; it refers to the analytic coaxing that makes the inanimate come alive, and to speak. Derrida refers to this as the archaeologist having 'succeeded in making the archive no longer serve any function. It *comes to efface itself*, it becomes transparent or inessential so as to let the origin present itself in person.'¹⁸

This effacement of the archive partially re-presents the past, for historical time is always mediated, and the role of the interpreter, narrator or author is always to some extent present. The revealing of buried historical times in Pamuk's novel requires secret knowledge by Galip. While historical time appears disordered in his search, it conceals

¹⁸ Derrida, *Archive*, p. 93.

significance. Traces and signs of the past are confused and conflated, with times turned upside down. Pamuk writes: ‘...it was one of Celâl’s trademarks to mix objects dating back centuries with those from his own past; the muddy slopes of his future Bosphorous were littered with Byzantine coins and modern-day bottle caps, both bearing the name Olympos.’¹⁹ The narrative incorporates historical time into the present in this disruptive way, encrypting elements of historical time as if the novel aspires to the condition of archive. Pamuk has stated that

Novels... form a rich and powerful archive – of common feelings, our perceptions of ordinary things, our gestures, utterances and attitudes. Various sounds, words, colloquialisms, smells, images, tastes, objects, and colors are remembered only because novelists observe them and carefully make note of them in their writings.²⁰

The textual archaeology of *The Black Book* includes how Pamuk uses archival remnants as if they are active in the fictional present, while also concealing elements of historical time. These elements are part of the narrative’s temporal complexity, the narrator and characters contributing to the active production and discovery of this archaeology.

7. The archive, posthumous temporality and the search for historical origins

Galip explores the archive as if he himself brings it into being, the search for Rüya and Celâl giving it a sense of form and meaning. During his search for origins the narrator articulates Galip’s sense of posthumous presence within the city, drawing on historical time to develop the story.

Galip’s attempts to find Rüya and Celâl drive him to return to the past, including historical time that has been defaced or displaced, believing it might provide clues. His search structures his sense of the archive of historical time, the journey gaining allegorical meaning beyond the search for his wife. She represents ideas about historical memory, including meanings that must be reconstructed and desires that must be rediscovered. Galip is drawn to what existed before Rüya’s disappearance, for original meanings or principles that organize historical memory. Some of these crypts disturb Galip’s sense of personal memory, including places which appear to encrypt historical

¹⁹ Pamuk, *Black*, p. 21.

²⁰ Pamuk, ‘Museums and Novels’, in *The Naive and the Sentimental Novelist*, trans. by Nazim Dikbaş (London: Faber and Faber, 2011), p. 130.

time. Early in the novel, Galip returns to an apartment that he'd once known, it being Celâl and Rûya's family home (as half siblings):

The room was exactly as it had been a quarter century earlier, when Celâl the young unmarried journalist had lived here. Everything - the furniture, the curtains, the placement of the lamps the colors, the shadows, the smells - exactly replicated the room of twenty-five years ago. If there was anything new, it was a simulation of something old...²¹

The room is a museum or crypt that indicates an origin, but a simulated kind, though one that Galip finds is something more than a museum; it is an archive re-activated in a new sense, somehow preserving everything in the present as if time had not occurred in the inbetween time. Pamuk writes of the apartment's contents (*Black*, p. 237):

They radiated the enchantment of newness only because they were things Galip would have expected to have aged, fallen apart, vanished, gone the way of his own memories, yet here they were, just where he'd last seen and forgotten them... as if they had decided... to escape that fate by taking refuge in a new world of their own creation.

Pamuk creates the appearance of historical time encrypting itself in the present, as the objects in the apartment create this 'new world'. He incorporates simulated memory within the archive as if the objects represent themselves, the archive active as 'a new world of their own creation', a supplementary world spun off from the original. The archive takes on a new life, becoming more than a delusion or dream, as Galip becomes submerged in the past. The historical crypts within the narrative have their own posthumous temporality, their material elements still exerting a force, disturbing Galip's sense of historical time.

Galip discovers that historical time is subject to impressions, re-impressions and re-signification, including how different temporalities are brought together, a complexity produced through the narrator's re-presencing, retellings and imprints. Galip's searches connect to potential sources of past presence held within cryptic spaces, as if trying to revive or create posthumous presences of historical time. Through his travels and his adoption of Celâl's persona, the archives and crypts of the city offer posthumous presences, historical memories appearing in the lived, narrated present. This differs from Hanold's delusion in *Gradiva*, in which his perception of the historical past is a condition for the possibility of its reanimation, but as if in disguise, Zoë appearing in the guise of Gradiva.

Pamuk's concern is for active historical time hidden within Istanbul and how

²¹ Pamuk, *Black*, p. 237.

that erupts into the present. He dramatizes historical memory, incorporating its significance within narrative, returning to signs that represent meanings which have lost their obvious connection to the present. These historical signs, including letters of the Turkish language in its prior form as written in an Ottoman Turkish alphabet (a version of the Perso-Arabic alphabet), are brought to life in Pamuk's novel. Their new literary presence is as if they are being translated, emergent in faces of characters seen by Galip. The posthumous power of the past, including how memories emerge into the present, is signalled early in the novel when the narrator notes that 'part of the story would only become clear to Galip after he'd discovered that Celâl had turned his own life into a private museum-cum-library' (*Black*, p. 34). A little later it is revealed that Galip himself has turned a chest of drawers 'into a museum of his own life' (*Black*, p. 48) on the advice of Celâl. This archival, cryptic motif is developed further as Galip appears to adopt Celâl's memories following his disappearance, giving them a new life.

The narrative incorporates crypts of historical memory, developing different senses of posthumous presence to those in *Rodinsky's Room*, describing how Galip discovers historical meaning and how the past relates to the present through his inhabiting and exploring of the archive. The fictional narrative intensifies Galip's possession by historical time as he is drawn to histories of the city's hidden spaces as if to an origin, the source that will explain how things are, as if a virtual index of what is happening in the present. The novel's narrative and Galip's search traces a path of analysis, aware of what has been lost, and its varied dispersal. 'Psychoanalysis', Derrida writes, 'in its archive fever, always attempts to return to the live origin of that which the archive loses while keeping it in a multiplicity of places.'²²

Galip goes in search of these multiple places as well as the origin itself, which the ghost house (Rüya's family apartment) represents. Derrida's approach to the archive and crypt offers ways of understanding posthumous presence in fiction and how historical memory may be narrated within a fictional posthumous temporality. Galip's recognition of what is hidden brings the text to life as narrative spaces offer the possibility of the incorporation of historical memory into the present.

The drama of *The Black Book* is created by the eruption of historical time into the present. Galip experiences time as if posthumously, sensing memory's aliveness and how material objects can be animated by memory. As the archivist in search of the origin, Galip captures this hidden, original time that the ghost house appears to replicate,

²² Derrida, *Archive*, p. 92.

through Celâl's intervention. The artifice of the posthumousness is only barely visible because of the replication, as if history's original significance is disguised. Pamuk writes:

Though it was hard to tell from the towels and the bedsheets just how meticulously Celâl had gone about replicating the décor of his childhood home, it was clear that he had repeated the sitting-room's ghost-house motif throughout the apartment. So the walls of Rüya's childhood bedroom were the same childish blue, and in the same room was the skeletal replica of the bed where Celâl's mother had once laid out her sewing materials with the dress patterns.²³

In Galip's confrontation with this origin – the encrypted familial space of Celâl and Rüya – the archive is fictionalised and yet made historical. It is as if the ghost house is an exterior creation of interior memories so these can be rediscovered, a primal memory palace mimicking historical time. Galip's discovery of the origins, archival remains and presences changes the time of the archive, the archive becoming part of a posthumous temporality, as if brought to life.

The presence of this posthumous temporality creates a mystery of historical time's presence in narrative, as if the crypt is speaking, invading the narrative. There is a decryption of the past, the animation of the archive indicating the mystery of the past's posthumous appearance within the present. Galip's search for origins and activation of the past, finding encrypted meanings, relates to what Freud considers the miracle of finding the origin that will speak for itself. This is productive effacement, the 'near ecstatic instant Freud dreams of, when the very success of the [archaeological] dig must sign the effacement of the archivist: *the origin then speaks by itself*. The *arkē* appears in the nude, without archive. It presents itself and comments on itself by itself.'²⁴

The mystery of historical time is in part its ability to appear and erupt within the present, as if revealing primal memories. Galip's discovery of simulated historical origins suggests the impossibility of this nakedness of the archive, though its simulacra or imprinted remains may be found. In Galip's confrontation with the exposed simulated archive, he takes on the role that the archive permits, as a detective of hidden meanings. After Rüya's and Celâl's disappearance, Galip is a posthumous organizer of interpretations; as archivist his presence refuses complete effacement, for he believes he is intrinsic to the archive and the memory garden of Rüya. Galip's transformation into Celâl (who brought some of the archive into existence), the disappeared body

²³ Pamuk, *Black*, p. 241.

²⁴ Derrida, *Archive*, pp. 92-93.

within the archive, suggests a desire to inhabit the archive but as if invisibly, effaced within the archive. In the persona of Celâl, he may discover the secrets of this hidden world, having effaced his own self.

8. Origins and narrative incorporations of posthumous temporality

While Galip searches for origins, historical memory appears to be more complex than he had anticipated. He uncovers survivals of past times, including a collection of mannequins. These stand for a kind of erased origin of modern Turkish culture, the old style mannequins preserved as if outside historical time, as a critique of present time, countering the desire for stylised European mannequins. The narrator writes:

Turks no longer wanted to be Turks, they wanted to be something else altogether. This was why they'd gone along with the "dress revolution," shaved their beards, reformed their language and their alphabet. Another, less garrulous, shopkeeper explained that his customers didn't buy dresses but dreams. What brought them into his store was the dream of becoming "the others" who'd worn that dress.²⁵

The collection is part of an alternative history, the crypt of mannequins a museum of repressed or forgotten historical time of a pre-modern desire, which Celâl had written about and Galip goes to discover. The crypt indicates how the archive conceals the desire to be something else; Galip's discovery of this posthumous temporality is a revelation of a hidden time of desire. One of Celâl's newspaper columns tells the story of Bedii Usta, a mannequin maker, who vows to make mannequins particular to a Turkish type of body and social behaviour that he believes to be alien to the new imported and mimicked Western mannequins. Celâl writes (*Black*, p. 61):

Bedii Usta did try to make mannequins that accommodated this dream. However, he was only too aware he could never compete with the imported European mannequins with their strange and ever changing poses and their toothpaste smiles. So before long, he went back to realizing his own dreams, his real dreams, in his own dark atelier. He spent the last fifteen years of his life giving these terrible homespun images the semblance of flesh and blood, producing more than a hundred and fifty new mannequins, each one a work of art.

This cryptic basement holds the dreams of another time, an origin before modern Turkey. The bodies hold repressed desires, which Galip tries to recover in his narratives,

²⁵ Pamuk, *Black*, p. 61.

the mannequins holding secrets of the interior life of the city. In his column, Celâl describes how, ‘Bedii Usta’s son, who came to see me at the newspaper and then took me to see his father’s basement atelier for myself, told me, as we inspected the mannequins one by one, that “the special thing that makes us what we are” was buried inside these strange and dusty creatures’ (*Black*, p. 61).

Galip’s search for origins using Celâl’s writing leads him to this crypt of mannequins and their posthumous temporality. The crypt’s hidden significance forms part of the complex archaeology of historical time within the fictional narrative, including buried layers of signs and desires. Galip’s problem is decrypting the hidden meanings, drawing the narrative (and the narrator) towards the originary desire that precedes the hidden meanings of the signs.

The archive that Galip is exploring refers to earlier states of being or ideas of self, memories, perceptions and desires brought to life through the narrative. The narrative refers back to buried desire, including Galip’s love for Rüya. The theme of the reawakening and rediscovery of desire is found in Chapter 15, ‘Love Stories on a Snowy Evening’, one of Celâl’s columns. This relates how a writer whose wife has left him ‘set himself a strict regime, forcing himself to remember each and every one of the dreams he’d once had’ (*Black*, p. 164).

Later, after his wife had returned to him, his obsessions with dreams and his imaginary, dreaming double self had taken over his life, and so he went out to explore the city, and realized, like Galip, that ‘everything he ever dreamed about “our city” was actually real; this fact alone told him the world was a book’ (*Black*, p. 165). The story of dwelling in dreams and their referents reworks Pamuk’s concern for origins, buried desires and historical time, including archaeologies of memory.

Derrida comments on Freud’s archaeological approaches to the past, noting that he ‘was incessantly tempted to redirect the original interest he had for the psychic archive toward archaeology.’²⁶ He continues: ‘Each time he wants to teach the topology of archives, that is to say, of what ought to exclude or forbid the return to the origin, this lover of stone figurines proposes archaeological parables’ (*Archive*, p. 92). Freud is concerned with origins but also how these are hidden and part of a more complex historical narrative. *The Black Book* is concerned with historical time’s elusiveness and mystery. The historical time replicated by Celâl, his creation of the apartment, and his imitations and borrowings from the writer Rumi represent part of Galip’s sense of this

²⁶ Derrida, *Archive*, p. 92.

mystery. With Celâl's disappearance, the archive is reconstructed by Galip in the shadow of Celâl's knowledge of historical time and in this process Celâl is erased. This is a double erasure, for Galip, taking on Celâl's identity, is also effaced, as if burying his own desire.

Effacement within the archive occurs where there are buried forms of representation or hidden signs (where the origin is able to 'present itself in person' (*Archive*, p. 93). In Pamuk's novel, where Galip overwrites Celâl, narrative buries as well as generates origins and new meanings. The effacement described by Freud is a form of repression of subsequent time, as well as the production of new time. Derrida notes the double movement of both erasure and production (*Archive*, p. 94):

On the one hand, the archive is made possible by the death, aggression and destruction drive, that is to say also by originary finitude and expropriation. But beyond finitude as limit, there is... this properly in-finite movement of radical destruction without which no archive desire or fever would happen... anarchiving destruction belongs to the process of archivization and produces the very thing it reduces, on occasion to ashes, and beyond.

Derrida argues here for understanding of the archive to include virtual spaces of absence, for where there is erasure traces of the absence remain in the archive. Galip is archiving in a process of creating as he is erasing, taking on Celâl's time while writing in his place, displacing him. The novel's narrative is both erasing and counter erasure, as if Galip's discovery of crypts can salvage erased time, capturing the remains or traces of historical time that are being erased by modernity.

Pamuk's novel engages with the archive and historical time through Galip's search and taking over of Celâl's life. While Freud aims for the origin (the archaeological remains and their virtual presences), not the prosthetic (archive), which Derrida refers to as the 'secondary and accessory exteriority' (*Archive*, p. 92) in Freud's thinking, we may think more about the prosthetic value of what is not effaced, what of the material archive remains.

Fictional archives offer presences of historical time and forms of posthumous existence within the archive. Pamuk's narrator welcomes the reader into this archival space, the reader being another form of posthumous encryption within narrative, another apparent survival. As with Pamuk's novel *The Museum of Innocence*, which has its

parallel, eponymous museum²⁷ in Istanbul created by Pamuk himself, through reading you can inhabit the literary crypt, as if in touch with the fictional exhibits belonging to his characters, while becoming aware of other significant presences.

The invitation to the reader to enter the crypt is intrinsic to narrative: the novel is not a locked room, but one to be entered and inhabited. Once entered the reader becomes part of the archive and the narrative's temporality. It must be lived in too, the reader shadowing Galip's search. When the telephone rings in the ghost house and Galip answers it, he first takes on Celâl's voice, as if accidentally, and the caller exclaims 'So you've finally come back!'.²⁸ The reader, like Galip, is occupying the narrative, assuming a role of trying to understand the signs within the discovered world, and to understand what is present, what is posthumous, and how the text might be offering a new presence of historical time within fiction.

9. New life, encryption and the posthumous temporality of the text

In Pamuk's later novel *The New Life*, the first-person narrator is also absorbed into a new world. Referring, like Barthes' incomplete project mentioned in *Mourning Diary*, to Dante's *Vita Nuova*, the novel relates a secret world that opens up when the narrator falls in love with Janan and he begins to read a book he saw her reading. The narrator writes, 'I told her I'd read the book after seeing it in her hand. I had my own world before reading the book, I said, but after reading the book, I now had another world.'²⁹ The book describes the discovery of this other world, drawing the reader into it.

The Black Book also invites the reader to inhabit the narrative, to follow Galip in pursuit of Rüya and Celâl, to read the columns of Celâl, whose life is gradually taken over by Galip, who himself writes the final columns appearing under Celâl's name. The novel is a cryptic space which the reader and writer inhabit, as if to animate it. Structured to be discovered, walked through, each narrative space of memory creates a network of lived and historical time, encrypted within the novel. Each space offers possible understandings of incorporations of the past, just as Sinclair and Lichtenstein offer different readings of the crypt in *Rodinsky's Room*.

The novel presents sites of posthumous temporality, navigating disjointed

²⁷ The Museum of Innocence opened in 2012. See <http://en.masumiyetmuzesi.org> [last accessed 19/2/18].

²⁸ Pamuk, *Black*, p. 235.

²⁹ Pamuk, *The New Life*, trans. by Güneli Gün (London: Faber and Faber, 1998), p. 19.

memories, scenes and textual transferences, as well as actual events. Galip's search unifies these competing temporalities, including the time of Celâl's columns, incorporating this writing into the narrative present, while offering a doorway into a more distant past, including the prehistory of the Bosphorus. The posthumous sense of time appears both separate and present, a territory that Galip discovers as if it is hidden, not normally experienced as present, comprising anachronous layers of time.

Temporal dispersal within the archive, with proliferations of different times and stratification (including temporal separation and integration) is part of the drama of both *The Black Book* and *Gradiva*. Both authors direct the narratives of broken time towards a resolution. The narrator in *Gradiva* does not explain the temporal delusions until the final section, where Hanold's repressed desire becomes clear. Zoë is object, subject and the enabling of the desire that comes to life again. Once the different times converge, with Hanold recognising Gradiva as Zoë, the posthumous has been incorporated into the present. The resolved desire indicates the role of memory, delusion and dreams in linking repressed feelings and the present.

Gradiva incorporates different simulacra of the past, while making the reader aware of how these are encrypted within Hanold's perception and, via his actions, the novel's narrative. This presence of the posthumous in the narrative develops our sense of fictionalised historical time. Zoë, Hanold and Galip make new experiences of historical time visible, while the process of revealing characters' delusions also shows how these might become real, part of a posthumous temporality that the characters' lives have been drawn into which then change the narrative.

In *Gradiva*, this is Hanold's love for a woman who died almost two millennia previously. Hanold becomes aware of this process, and Freud comments that, 'It was only when he caught sight of Gradiva that he suddenly remembered the dream and became conscious at the same time of the delusional reason for his puzzling journey.'³⁰ Freud then asks (vol. ix, p. 68):

How could this forgetting of the dream, this barrier of repression between the dream and his mental state during the journey, be explained, except by supposing that the journey was undertaken not at the direct inspiration of the dream but as a revolt against it, as an emanation of a mental power that refused to know anything of the secret meaning of the dream?

³⁰ Freud, vol. ix, p. 68.

The incorporation and pursuit of history is a sign of Hanold's unconscious repression, Freud appears to be insisting. The fictional narrative's use of posthumous temporality incorporates historical time while at the same time emphasising how fiction is developing a new representation of historical memory, both concealing and revealing the desire that Hanold had felt. The delusion, as Freud shows in his analysis of the story, includes how historical time can enter the conscious and unconscious life of an individual, changing that person's sense of historical time. By the end of Jensen's story, Hanold is made aware of his delusion by Zoë, and how he has imagined that the woman he has met and talked to took the identity of *Gradiva*. In this cryptic space his desire for her is both reawakened and acknowledged.

Zoë's feelings for Hanold are confirmed when the narrator describes how 'she had been convinced more than ever of the complete recovery of his reason.'³¹ Hanold's realisation in *Gradiva* is of the active, hidden role of historical time in the present. This first reveals itself as a delusion, but becomes an awareness of how desire is veiled and unveiled within time. He is living as if posthumously – drawn to the time of 79 AD, just as he believes *Gradiva* herself is living in that time. This posthumous temporality is a delusion, but the past appears to take a form in which this desire may be incorporated into the present. Hanold is confronting what has otherwise been repressed.

The complex conjunction of temporalities in Hanold's dream contributes to the development of his delusion. For Hanold, what is happening must be either all past or all present; he does not perceive the narrative reality, the posthumous temporality recognised as present, not spectral. The story produces its own fictional version of historical time, incorporating historical memory into the present, creating a rupture in temporality that is resolved at the end, erasing the sense of the appearance of historical time. The crypt which Hanold believed to hold historical time is revealed to be an illusion; only through this correction is harmony re-established.

In the final section of *The Black Book*, the presence of posthumous temporality continues to be troubling and there is no immediate resolution. Galip, believing that he has entered an alternative time by becoming Celâl, takes on new perceptions of time, including the presence of a posthumous temporality. This ruptures the sense of the narrative present's relation to the past. Historical time, in the form of Celâl's life, appears to be a delusion being lived by Galip.

Following my consideration of de Certeau's perspective on ruptures in

³¹ Jensen, *Gradiva*, p. 135.

historical time in the previous chapter, we can observe that ruptures of historical time and appearances of posthumousness in fiction present openings for reinterpretations of the past. Through fictionalised historical memory within the novel, historical time is reimaged, the archive rearticulated and the new narratives of the past are discovered. These processes of transformation of historical memory are visible in *Gradiva* and *The Black Book*, indicated by the appearance of Gradiva and the disappearance of Rüyâ and Celâl, and Galip's attempt to be Celâl, bringing the past into the present in the shadow of Celâl's disappearance and death.

10. Fictional impressions and transformations of historical time

The return to the imagined origin, as Galip discovers, is also the beginning of another impression, just as Derrida provides another 'Freudian impression' (or impression of Freud) in his return to the archive. Derrida rearticulates Freud, as if incorporating him within his own archives, the ruptured, reordered terrain in which writing at once erases and creates a new mark. Derrida describes a space of writing which exists between Freud and the impression of Freud, and the effect of the impression of Freud on the archive of Freud itself. This demonstrates a reflexive, disrupted temporality, Derrida's ideas concerning 'the impression left, in my opinion, by the *Freudian signature* on its own archive, on the concept of the archive and of archivization, that it is to say also, inversely and as an indirect consequence, on historiography.'³² He notes that this also includes 'the history of the concept of the archive, but perhaps also... the history of the formation of a *concept in general*' (*Archive*, p. 5), for concepts possess virtual presences.

The rupture in historical time that we find in Pamuk's and Jensen's novels is not simply between times past and present, but between original and subsequent impressions – and how a concept of the archive, and of temporality, can be used that includes the relationship between these. The rupture is a place of both erasure and surviving traces, the posthumous perspective operating as a point where reorganising ideas of historical temporality is possible. On the nature of the archive, Derrida continues (*Archive*, p. 5):

We are saying for the time being the *Freudian signature* so as not to have to decide yet between Sigmund Freud, the proper name, on the one hand, and on the other, the invention of

³² Derrida, *Archive*, p. 5.

psychoanalysis: project of knowledge, of institution, community, family, domiciliation, consignment, “house” or “museum,” in the present state of its archivization. What is in question is situated precisely between the two.

De Certeau comments that ‘Historiography... is based on a clean break between the past and the present’,³³ while ‘Psychoanalysis recognises the past in the present’ (*Heterologies*, p. 4). Freud’s notion of the return – of the repressed, of the phantom, of memory – is radical in this temporal respect. The Freudian signature survives – and appears again as a posthumous presence. The past that survives like this is disruptive, psychoanalysis not only challenging the standard narration of historical time but demanding that it be understood as intrinsically self-rupturing, the archive remaining active.

Pamuk’s use of posthumous temporality in the search for historical time is as if death is implicit, but not present, historical time having been ruptured through Rüya and Celâl’s disappearance. Whereas Poe places the detective at the abandoned scene of the crime and Sinclair and Lichtenstein occupy the site of Rodinsky’s absence as a scene of writing and re-establishing of memory, Pamuk finds new ways to approach posthumous temporality. Galip knows the disappeared characters, Rüya and Celâl, and he knows some of their narrative obsessions, including Rüya’s interest in detective fiction. When Galip appears to become Celâl, he ceases his role as searcher within the archive, becoming a detective, deepening his inhabitation of the crypt, further encrypted. In *Gradiva* the posthumous figure of Gradiva appears to come alive, but is the contemporary woman Zoë mistaken by Hanold for Gradiva. Hanold’s encounters with Gradiva are as if an ecstasy, the crypt appearing out of historical time. In contrast, in *The Black Book*, Galip appears to recede into the crypt by becoming Celâl, becoming whom he is searching for, as if becoming entombed within time, while in this process activating the archive.

Galip’s perspective on the ruptures of historical time is as if he is visiting from the future, posthumously, like Poe’s Dupin, after the mystery has happened, in order to reassemble it. Galip’s writing as Celâl within the archive has a sense of delusion for he is entering into the time of the past via a posthumous temporality which he appears to have given a life of its own. Before the final chapters, the novel appears to offer a version of history without death, only disappearance, lost meanings and lives that can

³³ de Certeau, *Heterologies: Discourse on the Other*, trans. by Brian Massumi (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2010), p. 4.

be recovered. Until the final scenes, death is not materialised in the posthumous temporality: historical time is the appearance of memories afloat in their own time, seen from a future perspective.

The archives of historical time which Galip has explored take on new significances upon Rüya and Celâl's deaths. Their dead bodies are not simulacra of historical time. The deaths demand Galip's more intense attention to what has happened. Having explored ruptures of historical time, including through his becoming Celâl, on Celâl's murder Galip takes on a new sense of absence. The archive incorporates his absence, as if he continues as Celâl, and in so doing he appears to be taken over by the archive as its automatic presence. He appears condemned by Celâl's absence to live a life of posthumous temporality. The narrative takes over his life like the archive of a museum gradually takes over the spectral occupant. History is rearticulated through the cryptic space of writing as if he no longer exists as himself. In grief, he is incorporated; in trying to remember, he is erased.

Gradiva and *The Black Book* both have posthumous protagonists, the characters (Zoë and Galip) appearing to become someone who can be understood as if having been created posthumously. As with *Gradiva*, Pamuk's narrative raises questions about the role of historical time within narrative. Celâl and Rüya's deaths mark the erasure of historical time, but also its supplementation, as Galip creates virtual presences of Celâl in the narrative. After the murders, Galip's doubling of Celâl can be read as possessing Celâl's new virtual absence, his archival impressions, his signature. Confronting Celâl's loss, he discovers his own presence as Celâl, a posthumous prosthetic of absence, a new presence, and another encrypted sign representing the mystery of historical time.

11. Historical time and the interruptions of doubles within narrative

The Black Book's return to and mimetic relation with historical time is not simply one in which, following Genette's interpretation of Marcel Proust's *Remembrance of Things Past*, 'when an event that at the time of its occurrence has already been provided with a meaning, has this first interpretation replaced afterward by another.'³⁴ The meaning that Pamuk provides involves signs of the past invading the present, as if these signs are all clues to a historical time that is awaiting reconstruction or recognition. Temporality in Pamuk's novel has the dimension of a present lived as if it was in the past, the present

³⁴ Genette, *Narrative*, p. 58.

possessed by the past.

The ghost house described in Chapter 20 is presented to appear as if was never changed, while incorporating the past, as if posthumously, after the death of the characters who have disappeared, Rüyâ and Celâl. After their murders, the extent of the posthumous temporality becomes apparent: not only have we witnessed the murder scene, the site of death which has been anticipated, but also sites in which time appears to have been played with, including the ghost house, as if death was already present. The novel has been written around the deaths of Rüyâ and Celâl, as if it has been known that they will be killed. Where Barthes' describes his sense of writing around the death of his mother, Pamuk appears to write around the deaths of Rüyâ and Celâl as if they are presumed dead. Whom the author is remains mysterious, keeping open the possibility of an amalgam or palimpsest of authors, including Celâl, Galip and another. Rüyâ and Celâl's deaths expose the possibility and mystery of multiple authorship, as if the author could no longer remain completely anonymous.

With the identity of the author mysterious, it is as if the author's signature has been overwritten. The signs of death have also been hidden, the crime scene appearing to have been delayed within the narrative to allow for accumulation of meaning. Before then there are mysterious senses of lost meaning and hidden memories, the entrails, reliquaries and fragments of historical time, as if acknowledging death but still awaiting it. The absences and signs of loss anticipate the deaths of Celâl and Rüyâ, also compelling Galip to attempt to compensate for them. The posthumous temporality of Pamuk's novel includes the merging of past traces with the present time, but also Galip's desire for Celâl's historical time, as if he has died.

Galip's pursuit of historical time, continuing after Celâl's death, includes his doubling of Celâl, taking on his identity and being. In the next chapter I will look further at the incorporation of posthumous temporality in relation to the archive within fiction and how it informs understandings of historical time developed in Jensen's and Pamuk's novels. I will consider how absences within Pamuk's novel and Hanold's repressed memory in *Gradiva* contribute to the role of the double, particularly in relation to posthumous temporality and historical time.

Chapter 3

Posthumousness in fictional and historical time: Doubling, ruptures and resolutions in Wilhelm Jensen's *Gradiva* and Orhan Pamuk's *The Black Book*

1. Doubling and the fictional pursuit of historical time

This second chapter on Jensen's *Gradiva* and Pamuk's *The Black Book* will consider how fictional uses of posthumous temporality develop the relationship between historical time and fictional time, including through the use of the double. Posthumous temporality can involve uses of doubling via spectres and body doubles, which often appear within cryptic spaces. Sometimes these spectres are arbitrarily visible, and at other times they appear to come as if intact from the past, alive within the archive or crypt. Doubling of characters presents a phantasmal present, unsettling historical time and questioning the authenticity of presence with alternative versions of temporality and the past.

Pamuk's and Jensen's use of the double shows how fictional historical time incorporates posthumous presences as a form of extra-temporality. Otto Rank's discussion of the double developed the idea of fiction's contest between materialist and psychic versions of the self, and how psychic versions might supersede the materialistic by virtue of the imagined posthumous temporality that the soul might have. He noted, 'The thought of death is rendered supportable by assuring oneself of a second life, after this one, as a double.'¹ What is contested, from the perspective of the posthumous, consists of what we might consider to be historical: the life of the psyche and that which survives, or that which relates to the materialist self in lived time.

Novels appear to incorporate both within posthumous fictions of historical time. Rank's work of 1925, inspired in part by his role as a psychoanalyst and as an early colleague of Freud, looks at how doubles take on other aspects of a character's psyche, from Friedrich Schiller's *The Ghost Seer* to Dostoyevsky's *The Double*. Freud also notes in 'The Uncanny' that 'disturbances of the ego that Hoffman exploits in his writings are easy to judge in accordance with the pattern set by the motif of the double.

¹ Otto Rank, *The Double: A Psychoanalytic Study*, trans. by Harry Tucker Jr. (Chapel Hill: The University of Carolina Press, 1971), p. 85.

They involve a harking back to single phases in the evolution of the sense of self, a regression to times when the ego had not clearly set itself off against the world outside and from others.² The survival of the double as a device within fiction plays with ongoing conflicts of the self, including historical memories of the self relating to the repressed and unknown time. Doubleness is part of our experience of reading narrated time, for we experience both the time of reading and the times of the narrative; doubleness is part of a reader's openness to temporal complexities of narrative and how fiction involves how fictional and historical time work together within narrative.

Considering the role of the double takes us back to our earlier considerations of the untimely and the uncanny. The uncanniness of the double relates to uncertainties of reconstructing and rethinking the past that incorporate repressed elements of the self. Freud's treatment of doubleness in 'The Uncanny'³ focuses on the self's possible experiences of the double in relation to earlier repressed phases of the self. The untimely, which Currie referred to as 'interruptions in the continuity of time' (*Unexpected*, p. 78), includes returns of the repressed in the form of unexpected ruptures; doubling in narrative is one of these ruptures, with competing versions of the self in conflict. Jensen's and Pamuk's fictions offer unexpected returns of the repressed, with the double appearing as an effect of complex experiences of historical time. Experience of historical time itself includes doubling, reflecting what Currie describes, writing on the future anterior and the messianic as 'the strange combination, on one hand, of anticipation and retrospect, and the unforeseeable arrival, on the other' (*Unexpected*, p. 95).

Fictional incorporations of doubles reflect attempts to unify various narrative ideas of temporality, including the posthumous. Fictional approaches to the double in *Gradiva* and *The Black Book* incorporate posthumous temporality, with imagined historical time encrypted within narrated time. This produces senses of the uncanny, the uncovering of the crypt revealing the double that complicates historical time. These uncanny senses include posthumousness and 'spectral materialism', which Santner describes as involving 'among other things, a capacity to register the persistence of past suffering that has in some sense been absorbed into the substance of lived space, into

² Ibid., p. 143. Referring the to the German writer E.T.A. Hoffman (1776-1822), author of the 'The Sandman' and other stories.

³ Freud writes that "Its uncanny quality can surely derive only from the fact that the double is a creation that belongs to a primitive phase in our mental development, a phase that we have surmounted, in which it admittedly had a more benign significance" ('The Uncanny', in *The Uncanny*, trans. by David McLintock (London: Penguin Books, 2003), p. 143).

the “setting” of human history.⁴ Incorporation of posthumous temporality within fictional narrative redefines our sense of historical time, a rupture that appears to produce narrative that overcomes or tries to resolve the rupture, as we find in *Gradiva* and *The Black Book*.

2. Posthumous temporality, the double and approaches to historical time

As I analyse *Gradiva* and *The Black Book* further, I will consider how the posthumous nature of the relationships of both Zoë/Gradiva and Galip/Celâl create new interpretations of historical time. This includes Jensen’s and Pamuk’s use of analepsis and their engagement with the doubling of time, which both novels develop as a way of incorporating versions of historical time within fiction.

Freud’s approach to *Gradiva* indicates ways in which psychoanalysis can help us understand the various relations between historical time and fictional time within a novel. His analysis is drawn to the delusional and phantasmal aspect of the story, rather than, at least in overt emphasis (from a literary but also a psychoanalytical perspective), how historical time is being used by Jensen as part of the development of the narrative. Historical time is a key part of self consciousness and the self’s temporal structure; what it signifies is in conflict in both Jensen’s and Pamuk’s novels, and is intrinsic to their narrative development, including how their protagonists engage with their past.

The idea of lived time and historical time considered by Ricoeur in his *Time and Narrative* series describes a heterogeneous range of how lived and historical time is incorporated within the novel. Historical time is part of Freud’s interpretation of *Gradiva*, as in his interpretation of dreams, which he considered not as revelations of the future, but as revelations and symptoms of history. Michael Roth writes that ‘Freud’s work is first and foremost a theory of history aimed at establishing self-consciousness in the analysand.’⁵ He later writes: ‘Although psycho-analysis as a theory of history in no way presupposes continuity in development (on the contrary, it underlines traumatic breaks in development), it does attempt to make meaning out of memory’ (*History*, p. 59). As a theory of history, it is also a means of temporal analysis within narrative.

⁴ Santner, *Creaturely*, p. 57.

⁵ Michael Roth, *Psycho-Analysis as History: Negation and Freedom in Freud* (Ithaca: Cornell University, 1995), pp. 33-34.

While developing this idea of psychoanalysis as a theory of history, Roth further writes on psychoanalysis ‘that it can search for the meanings of a particular sign (symptom, dream, action) by finding the dynamic elements of that sign’s past which have generated its appearance. The questions that arise out of that meaning are extra psycho-analytic. If psychoanalysis were to answer these questions, it would leave historical interpretation behind in favor of prophecy’ (*History*, p. 71). Roth emphasises in his conclusion that “‘history’... includes in a fundamental way the personal past, individual memory’ (*History*, p. 192). His analysis shows how individual memory and the unconscious is both part of history and a theory of history. I will now again consider fictional approaches to history, following Derrida’s argument in *Archive Fever* that archival engagement involves rethinking how history is imagined and re-written, reflected in his analyses of *Gradiva* and Freud’s *Moses and Monotheism*.

While a mystery is sometimes the hidden narrative of the story, leading to an explanation for what happened, sometimes the hidden element is the relationship between various contiguous times within a narrative. For example, reconstructed historical time (Dupin’s speciality) may combine with fictional representations and disclosures of historical time, creating in Poe’s ‘The Murders in the Rue Morgue’ an illusion of revelation of historical time through fictional narrative. Poe’s approach to the double murder solves a mystery not of death but of historical time, using fiction to assert a form of recovered and reconstructed historical time.

Fictions such as *Gradiva* and *The Black Book* incorporate a sense of posthumous time have an additional complexity compared to non-fiction approaches to the recovery of historical time, such as Sinclair and Lichtenstein’s *Rodinsky’s Room*. These novels incorporate a sense of historical time that is constructed within the fiction, as if simulating an historical archive, including its absences. Ricoeur writes: ‘If it is true that one of the functions of fiction bound up with history is to free, retrospectively, certain possibilities that were not actualized in the historical past, it is owing to its quasi-historical character that fiction itself is able, after the fact, to perform its liberating function.’⁶

This ‘liberating function’ is an effect of narrative on time, including how novels incorporate posthumous temporality, fiction detecting ‘possibilities buried in the actual past’ (*Time*, p. 192). Fiction can change our ideas of historical time; a device that achieves this, related to posthumous temporality, is the doubling of characters – as ghosts, hidden selves or as actual corporeal characters. The fictional use of doubling, as

⁶ Ricoeur, vol. iii, p. 191.

Poe relates in terms of Dupin's character as discussed at the beginning of Chapter 1, is an aspect of posthumousness concerning historical time.

3. Doubling, mimesis and the relation between historical time and fictional time

Pamuk having himself dwelt on melancholia in his memoir of his life in Istanbul, it is not surprising that much of what has been written about his fiction has dwelt on this subject. Sibel Erol⁷ writes about how melancholic time dominates his writing, referring to the Turkish work for melancholy, *hüzün*, and how Pamuk emphasises this element of Turkish history to give his writing its own presence within it. But there are other ways of approaching his sense of historical time, beyond melancholia, including through the role of the double and its ambiguous fictional status.

In *The Black Book*, domestic and other spaces are habitations for memories, senses of loss, and sites of material artefacts which do not always immediately disclose their meaning. Some spaces are recreated in the narrative as if simulations of memory, keeping historical time alive. Galip's discovery of posthumous temporality within cryptic spaces changes his relation to historical time, a relation that becomes more complex when he adopts Celâl's identity. He becomes a more active (archival and protagonistic) part of the temporal puzzle, including the narrative's disorder of memory and historical time.

Pamuk's fiction uses doubled and posthumous time, generating mystery through incorporations of doubles of historic times, identities and appearances. Historical time is confused with fictional simulacra, among a delirium of mimeses and imaginary representations. This confusion of realism and fabulism is found in the image presented in Chapter 33, 'Mysterious Paintings', in which in a competition, an artist secretly installs a mirror to reflect the creation of his competitor, and

for years it was the amazing doubleness of the lobby's views that entranced the guests... after contemplating each wall at length, they would wander back and forth between them for hours as they struggled to give a name to the intense and mysterious pleasure that the twin views afforded them.⁸

⁷ Sibel Erol, 'The Chronotope of Istanbul in Orhan Pamuk's Memoir *Istanbul*', *International Journal of Middle Eastern Studies*, vol. 43, issue 4 (2011), pp. 655-676.

⁸ Pamuk, *Black*, p. 398.

The mirror effect is a metaphor for Pamuk's use of multiple times, and the confusion of 'the enigmas in their dreams with the images in the mirror' (*Black*, p. 400). There are versions of realism, Pamuk conveys here, that are more fabulous than a dream or the most beautifully composed image. The complex temporalities of Pamuk's narrative, incorporating posthumousness, produce alternative ideas of historical time, reflecting complexities of psychological time of narrative.

Doubling within fictionalised historical time disturbs the archival structure of historical time, revealing narrative effects of temporal structures common to historical time and fictional versions of historical time. De Certeau notes the dynamic of how writing takes the place 'of the history lost to it',⁹ fiction and non-fiction displacing what is represented. He writes that the historian 'effaces error from the "fables" of the past. The territory that he occupies is acquired through a diagnosis of the false... From this viewpoint, "fiction" is that which the historiographer constitutes as erroneous; thereby, he delimits his proper territory' (*Heterologies*, pp. 200-201). In spite of this role of effacement, the historian's domain becomes larger, more complex as fiction's interpretations and expressions of historical time develops. Every negation of fictional versions of historical time is incorporated within historical systems of establishing meaning in narratives of historical time. Fiction becomes part of history's development and the system of memory that generates narrative identified as history. Pamuk's novel works on the archive of historical time by engaging with its possible negations, anticipating the critique of it as a delusion, while asserting a belief in the fictional workings of the archive.

Approaching historical time, the historian may threaten to negate or refuse the incorporation of the other, sometimes in the guise of the double, due to its close relation to the false other. However, the novelist may use the double as a way into historical time, for it reflects the ruptures found within historical time. The double is part of this rupture, whereby writing and what it displaces must be reconciled. Through the double, an opening is made into the archive that changes how we might conceive of it, as something that changes, an evolving structure and form which is effaced, restructured and reimagined.

Doubling is developed in fiction in relation to posthumous temporality, particularly how the novel incorporates historical time. Fiction explores what might be extant or hidden in existing treatments of historical time. As Ricoeur states, 'The quasi-past of fiction...

⁹ de Certeau, *Heterologies*, p. 29.

becomes the detector of possibilities buried in the actual past. “What might have been” – the possible in Aristotle’s terms – includes both the potentialities of the real past and the “unreal” possibilities of pure fiction.’¹⁰ These two potentialities are brought together in posthumous temporality, and this multiplication of past times relates back to Todorov’s observation on detective fiction regarding ‘the story of the crime and the story of the investigation.’¹¹ The presence of doubled time in narrative and complex conjunctions of temporalities develop the relationship between fictional and historical time. Fiction incorporates both potentialities of the real past and unreal possibilities, including alternative senses of historical time. Developing ideas on the relationship between historical time and fictional time, Ricoeur continues:

The deep affinity between the verisimilitude of pure fiction and the unrealized possibilities of the historical past explains perhaps, in turn, why fiction’s freedom in relation to the constraints of history – constraints epitomized by documentary proof – does not constitute... the final word about the freedom of fiction.¹²

In this analysis, Ricoeur implicitly notes fiction’s reimagining of historical time, outside of traditional ‘constraints of history.’ Todorov writes how this interest is not just past-oriented, for the ‘reader is interested not only by what has happened but also by what will happen next; he wonders as much about the future as about the past;’¹³ this interest in the future generates the sense of mystery. I will now explore these possibilities of reimagining historical time and fiction’s approach to historical time, including via the use of doubling of characters in *Gradiva* and *The Black Book*.

4. Posthumous temporality and the pursuit of historical time within fiction

Both *Gradiva* and *The Black Book* show how the incorporation of posthumous temporality within the novel develops fiction’s engagement with historical time. Posthumous temporality is part of how we construct and understand historical tradition and reinterpretation, imagining life from the point of view of the dead, animating dead matter and constructing narratives relating to the historical. Fiction reawakens narrative traces of consciousness, demonstrating how posthumous temporality incorporates narratives of historical time, generating possibilities of doubling.

¹⁰ Ricoeur, *Time*, vol. iii, pp. 191-192.

¹¹ Todorov, ‘Typology’, p. 139.

¹² Ricoeur, *Time*, vol. iii, p. 192.

¹³ Todorov, ‘Typology’, p. 143.

The incorporation of virtual elements of the historical within fiction creates forms of doubling, as historical time is fictionalised. Mimesis of historical time is intrinsic to Jensen's *Gradiva* and Freud observes that the novel's incorporation of the past into lived time has complex elements. He refers to the 'double origin'¹⁴ in his analysis, referring to the historical past of Pompeii and of Hanold's childhood memories. The novel shows how these early origins are integrated via their 'twofold determination of symptoms' (vol. ix, p. 85). Zoë, taking the part of Gradiva, as if doubled, integrates these symptoms consciously, as Freud notes (vol. ix, p. 85) with his reference to her words: 'I have long grown used to being dead' (*Gradiva*, p. 86) and 'The fact of someone having to die so as to come alive; but no doubt that must be so for archaeologists.' *Gradiva*, p. 131) and 'I feel as though we had shared a meal like this once before, two thousand years ago; can't you remember?' (*Gradiva*, p. 111).

Gradiva's performance appears to perfectly integrate her lived time with historical time. The integration of fictionalised historical time with fictional time is foregrounded as part of the drama of the novel and Freud describes how in the novel the 'substitution of the historical past for childhood and the effort to awaken the memory of the latter are quite unmistakeable' (vol. ix, p. 85). Historical origins appear to be doubled, the novel referring to both archaeological and personal historical pasts, but the fictional narrative shows how these times can be integrated. In Jensen's fictional negotiation with the past, the narrative mode is not one of mourning (relating to 'the loss of a beloved person or an abstraction taking the place of the person'¹⁵) or melancholy ('the loss of an object that is withdrawn from consciousness', ('Mourning', p. 205) with a continuing obsession with that object). Rather, it is the recognition of the virtuality of memory that Freud develops in *Moses and Monotheism*, including the posthumous recognition and redefinition of historical time.

The virtual presence of the historical within fictional narrative belongs to a sense of historical time that is neither completely historical (for Freud, Moses is pre-historic, entering into history after a return of the repressed) nor pure fiction. The incorporation of fictionalised historical memory and posthumous temporality into narratives of the past changes our idea of how historical time relates to the present. When the incorporation and integration of historical time occurs in *Gradiva*, where Hanold sees

¹⁴ Freud, vol. ix, p. 85.

¹⁵ Freud, 'Mourning and Melancholia', in *On Murder, Mourning and Melancholia*, trans. by Shaun Whiteside (London: Penguin Books, 2005), p. 205.

Zoë in Pompeii, Freud considers this to be a delusion; Hanold's delusion is based on an openness to understanding historical time, rather than repressing it. Towards the end of his interpretation of *Gradiva*, Freud states that 'Every psycho-analytic treatment is an attempt at liberating repressed love which has found a meager outlet in the compromise of a symptom' (vol. ix, p. 90). This symptom is localised within Hanold's attempt to understand the posthumous presence of historical time.

Gradiva represents a discovery of how time may be re-presented and doubled – and posthumous temporality acknowledged – reopening Hanold's past feelings that have their own new presence. The story is an unmasking of his own lived historical memory and of how his love is bound up with his experience and memory of historical time. Hanold's recognition and incorporation of posthumous temporality indicates how time can be considered retrospectively, beyond delusion. Zoë appears to have an intuitive understanding of this and acts accordingly, as if following Hanold's logic. Of the bas-relief of *Gradiva*, Freud writes that Hanold 'found something "of to-day" about it, as if he thought the artist had had a glimpse in the street and captured it "from the life"' (vol. ix, p. 11). Freud then proceeds to describe how Hanold the archaeologist reconstructed the life of *Gradiva*, so that 'Little by little he brought the whole of his archaeological learning into the service of these and other phantasies relating to the original who had been the model for the relief' (vol. ix, p. 11).

As if possessed by spectres of historical time, Hanold attempts to locate the anachrony of the image of *Gradiva*, observing women in contemporary Rome to see how their walking style appeared to differ from that shown in the bas-relief. It is as if he is trying to prove the anachrony and the rupture in historical time. Freud writes: 'As an outcome of these careful studies he [Hanold] was forced to the conclusion that *Gradiva's* gait was not discoverable in reality; and this filled him with regret and vexation' (vol. ix, p. 12). However, Hanold's obsessive search for the posthumous existence of *Gradiva* and her historical time continues, reflecting both his desire to return to historical time in personal and more general historical senses. Jensen allows Hanold's search to extend beyond a straightforward delusion. Hanold's dream of ancient Pompeii on the day of the eruption of Vesuvius introduces a new historical time within the narrative. In the dream, Hanold witnessed the city's destruction and he sees the woman from the bas-relief whom he identifies as *Gradiva*. Jensen writes (p. 17):

He [Hanold] recognized her at first glance; the stone model of her was splendidly striking in every detail, even to her gait... So with buoyant composure and the calm unmindfulness of her

surroundings peculiar to her, she walked across the flagstones of the Forum to the Temple of Apollo. She seemed not to notice the impending fate of the city.

Jensen continues later: ‘From Vesuvius the red glare flared over her countenance, which, with closed eyes, was exactly that of a beautiful statue’ (p.18). The dream makes the past present here, operating as a posthumous temporality. The wish fulfilment of the archaeologist is twofold: the recovery of historical time and the embrace of erotic desire. But Norbert’s two desires have a shared aspect: while his professional archaeological ambition drives him towards understanding the past and to enter it, his experience of that time has a heightened presence because of his repressed desire. His desire to experience historical time appears to be to counter the repression of a lost time that is later identified in unveiling the real identity of Gradiva and his feelings for her during an earlier time. The posthumous temporality of Gradiva’s appearance conceals the desire buried within Hanold’s own historical time.

Freud’s analysis of Hanold’s delusion informs a reading of fiction as a mediation and reimagination of historical time. Other fictions have engaged with archaeology as a site of repressed and revealed desire, including Théophile Gautier’s story ‘The Tourist’ (first published in 1852), which also deals with the subject of an obsession with reliquary of Pompeii. One character, Octavian, is drawn to the fossilized breasts of a woman, for whom he was ‘seized with a wild, retrospective passion.’¹⁶ As if anticipating Hanold’s sentiments in *Gradiva*, Octavian ‘was thinking how much he regretted that he had not been at Pompeii on the day Vesuvius erupted, so that he could have saved the lady with the golden rings and earned her undying love’ (‘Tourist’, p. 123).

The scene of posthumous temporality, in which the past appears to come to life, can be read as the revelation of hidden desire; in both ‘The Tourist’ and *Gradiva*, we have a desire that is discovered and given a new life. Freud’s analysis of *Gradiva* tries to consider how this desire might be incorporated into a reading of historical time via the return of the repressed, and how this might change our sense of historical time. This approach is connected to his later work *Moses and Monotheism* in terms of how the repressed may be reconsidered, changing our understanding of historical time. The fictional text responds to lacunae in historical time, supplementing them. Freud’s reading of *Gradiva* describes how delusion operates through incorporations of historical

¹⁶ Théophile Gautier, ‘The Tourist’, in *My Fantoms*, trans. by Richard Holmes (New York Review Books, 2008), p. 122.

time, offering a model for reinterpreting fictional time. His reading shows how ruptures operate in terms of how delusion can act as a form of anti-repression, making the emergence of repressed elements of historical time possible.

The delusion encrypts the desire for a reinterpretation of historical time within fiction. In the space of the repressed, the delusion marks a rupture in the past where fiction might develop new narrative possibilities, including the use of posthumous temporalities, in which the past appears to come alive. This interpretation of historical time involves the past being continually rewritten via both ruptures and counter-repressions, enabling a different relationship between fiction and historical time, working towards redefining historical time. De Certeau writes: ‘Repressions are expressed through writing, but writing responds through a labor (an elucidation) aimed against death... Such is the situation of the text. It does not escape the trial that it analyses.’¹⁷ This can be said of *Gradiva*, particularly how it sets the scene for understanding Hanold’s delusion (including the doubling of Zoë and Gradiva) within fictional narrative. In this context, Jensen’s articulation of historical time appears to conceal the repression, the palimpsest of writing overlaying that which brought the posthumous presence into being. The overcoming of the temporal rupture is achieved in the transformation of Hanold’s delusion of Gradiva, leading to the expression of repressed desire and his new recognition of lost historical memory. Hanold’s delusion of the doubling of Zoë being Gradiva leads to his repressed desire being recognised and incorporated within their renewed relationship.

5. *The Black Book* and the doublings of self and historical time

Pamuk’s *The Black Book* shows doubles of the self related to how narrative is doubled, including doublings of historical time and the appearance of posthumous temporality. In the novel, Galip discovers Celâl’s recycling of ideas and writing styles in his columns on the 13th-century Persian poet Rumi. Galip is suspicious, both of Rumi, and of other historical characters and objects, wondering what other afterlives they may have. Reading Celâl’s writing and research notes, Galip discovers

All his life, Rumi had been searching for his “other,” the double who might move him and light up his heart, the mirror who might reflect his face and his very soul. So whatever they’d done or said in that cell, they were best seen as the words and deeds of a multitude masquerading as a

¹⁷ de Certeau, *Writing*, p. 328.

single person, or of one person masquerading as a multitude... Rumi needed to be able to draw from a storehouse of alternative identities, just as poets over the ages have availed themselves of disguises for much the same reason – to enjoy a few moments' peace.¹⁸

But this 'storehouse' is also a means by which the writer engages with historical time, a motif of the novel and Celâl's columns. When Celâl writes further on this subject, his writing about his own life blends with Rumi's (*Black*, p. 257):

Celâl spoke of Rumi as if he were the man himself; somewhere between the lines, he had retreated into the shadows without anyone's noticing and exchanged his identity for Rumi's. When Galip returned to other, earlier columns and found that Celâl had used the same sentences, paragraphs, and even the same mournful voice in the columns he'd written about his own life as he did in his "historical" columns about Rumi, he became all the more certain that the two men were one and the same.

The doubling of the texts extends to a perceived confusion of the personalities of Rumi and Celâl, as if this doubling indicates a total integration, two people divided by centuries existing as if contemporaneously. The doubling of historical time and Celâl's use of Rumi's writing to create his own autobiographical narrative indicates a disturbance in historical time. Celâl's inclusion of repressed fragments of history in the columns and Rumi's posthumous presence within Celâl's life reveals how the novel is encrypting historical time.

Celâl's appropriation of historical memory is troubling to Galip as he searches through Celâl's archive, especially when he discovers it being incorporated into his writing, including his rewriting of Rumi. The narrator writes that Celâl had 'even gone so far as to continue this strange game in his private journal, the rough drafts of unpublished columns, his "historic conversations," the essays he'd written on another Mevlevi poet (Sheikh Galip, the author of *Beauty and Love*), his dream interpretations, and countless columns' (*Black*, p. 257).

Galip suspects there is not just doubling but something more threatening and uncanny, including the integration of the two characters as one. The dangers of doubling and incorporation is developed in the novel's later stages, both in Galip's writing on Celâl's reuse of Rumi's work and how Galip is drawn into the delirium of doubling, so that if 'Galip had by then begun to wonder if the room and its many objects, the desk and its piles of paper, had any basis in reality whatsoever, it was not because he knew now that many stories he'd long attributed to Celâl were actually the work of someone

¹⁸ Pamuk, *Black*, pp. 255-256.

else. What unnerved him were the other possibilities this suggested' (*Black*, p. 259). Galip suspects doubling might be more widespread for 'it now occurred to him that there might be yet another room in some other part of the city that had been furnished and arranged to look exactly as it had twenty-five years ago' (*Black*, p. 259). He wonders if his own 'luckless double' (*Black*, p. 259) might be working there, in a situation mirroring his own, a parallel archival universe. Doubling extends to include Galip's imagining of another (shadow or double) historical time of his own life, as if historical time has these alternative, subsequent, previous or parallel versions.

Historical time in Pamuk's novel is threatened and reimagined, the narrative intentionally confusing historical time, suspending or disintegrating the reader's sense of time, questioning what might be historical truth. André Green addresses the idea of historical truth in *Time in Psychoanalysis*, asking whether a 'recognisable core of truth'¹⁹ remains intact through a time's acquisition of meaning, or whether it may be regarded 'as "shattered" time' (*Psychoanalysis*, p. 32). In the development of meaning, historical time is not erased, but can appear fragmented. Green refers to how 'the moment time is experienced and the moment it is designated never coincide,' arguing for how time is made up from fragments that are kept together by the appearance of the 'evidence of its own endless continuation' (*Psychoanalysis*, p. 64).

Historical time's integrity can appear to depend on continuity and reconciliation in the face of disintegration, conflict and rupture. While the novel as a form resists being incorporated into historical time, its ambiguous status regarding historical time is also a sign of repressed history's unresolved ruptures. Fictional narrative's incorporation of elements of the past that do not conform to accepted historical memory provides a form of temporal disruption, perhaps in anticipation of reconciliation. Galip's uncovering of crypts is an attempt to discover hidden continuities in historical time that might otherwise be regarded as fictional; through his search these sites are newly encrypted within Istanbul's and his own historical narrative.

6. Reconciling desire, doubling, historical time and posthumous temporality

The role of the double in relation to historical time is intrinsic to Pamuk's narrative, his interpretation and use of historical time reflecting Ricoeur's and Currie's approach to

¹⁹ André Green, *Time in Psychoanalysis: Some Contradictory Aspects*, trans. by Andrew Weller (London: Free Association Books, 2002), p. 32.

how fiction can conjoin temporalities and reconfigure historical time. In Pamuk's novel, the posthumous use of historical memory within fictional narrative develops our understanding of historical time as something joined together with other temporalities, including lived time and posthumous time.

These temporal conjunctions and uses of doubling include alternation. As in *Rodinsky's Room*, the narrative of *The Black Book* is structured by alternation, in this case between Celâl's pseudonymous columns and the more traditional narration of Galip's search. The alternating structure is mutually both encrypting and decrypting. While the narration between each column appears to decrypt, it also encrypts new details and unexplained versions of the past, while also revealing Galip's desire to become Celâl. This desire develops the relationship between the alternating narratives, as they threaten to be encrypted within the other. They represent versions of historical time in a dynamic relation. The reader is invited to bring these different historical times together, in so doing becoming involved in creating a new sense of historical time in which competing ideas of historical time and memory are integrated.

Pamuk's alternation of historical time and fictionalised historical time shows the power of fictionalised historical time's reconfiguration of historical memory. Galip's own investigations bring the alternate elements of narrative together, unifying historical time and the novel's fictional history. Pamuk's doubling of memories and selves develops in relation to death and what is absent, his use of posthumous temporality supplementing the absence of Celâl and Rüya and their eventual deaths.

Doubling involves the incorporation of posthumous temporality in Jensen's *Gradiva*, as Zoë and Gradiva appear to Hanold as doubles. *Gradiva* develops the possible unity of three historical times, of Hanold's repressed memory, Pompeii's destruction and the present in which historical memory is triggered. The reader shares in the drama of the posthumous appearance or apparition of the historical times. Of Gradiva, Freud asks: 'Is she a hallucination of our hero, led astray by his delusions? Is she a "real" ghost? or a living person?'²⁰ She can be all three: within fiction it is possible to be both illusory and a real person, though her status affects the novel's development. Freud engages with how fiction might be creating or manipulating historical time, writing (vol. ix, p. 17):

The author, who has called his story a 'phantasy', has found no occasion so far for informing us whether he intends to leave us in our world, decried for being prosaic and governed by the laws

²⁰ Freud, vol. ix, p. 17.

of science, or whether he wishes to transport us into another imaginary world, in which spirits and ghosts are given reality.

Freud himself dismisses this latter suggestion, following the author's descriptions, for in the story: 'A large lizard was lying motionless, stretched out in the sunshine, but fled at the approach of Gradiva's foot and darted away across the lava paving-stones. So it was no hallucination, but something outside our dreamer's mind' (vol. ix, p. 17). Freud pursues the story not just in terms of delusion, but how the reality of the present appears in the narrative. Reading his analysis is to be involved again in the psychological and temporal drama of the novel, including its use of historical memory. Jensen's use of historical time is critical to the narrative development, particularly the role of the return of the repressed. The nature of Hanold's delusion is how historical time is encrypted within the fictional narrative of historical presence; in this way, delusion, and perceptions of doubling, becomes part of historical time.

7. The emergence of the double in relation to historical time

Galip's engagement with Celâl's past and archive is an attempt to reconstruct historical time. His adoption of Celâl's persona changes the presence of historical time; as he appears to become Celâl, what he has been attempting – and perhaps his secret desire – has been to recuperate lost historical time. This is not to change historical memory, but to inhabit it, enact it, perhaps to be encrypted by it. Alongside his pursuit of Celâl's historical time there is a collateral desire to conceal or repress his own self.

The novel's narrative of disappearance creates the space for Galip to enter Celâl's life. Galip's taking over of Celâl's life becomes progressively more intense, creating new senses and experiences of narrative time. Doubling is also a form of narrative erasure or displacement in which historical time is overwritten. Galip's sense of the world being doubled, of a posthumous temporality, reflects his awareness of being part of historical time without knowing how to make sense of it except by trying to reimagine or retrieve it. His absorption of the historical time of Celâl threatens his sense of order as he discovers the dangers of taking on a different identity, with the confusions this entails. These dangers are a source of narrative tension, the reader awaiting the next eruption of the past.

Galip's taking on or taking over the historical time of Celâl is similar to what happens in the third section of Auster's *The New York Trilogy*, which I will consider

later in this chapter, but in a way that is more than imitative, as if this is a more fundamental transformation, echoing Celâl's imitation of the writing of Rumi. The discontinuity of Celâl's disappearance is not resolved by Galip's delusion that he has become Celâl. Instead, it creates a narrative of disruption and discontinuity. Galip knows he is part of a mystery, but appears to believe that his transformation represents a solution to the mystery, as if through imitating Celâl he is resolving Celâl's disappearance, the cryptic posthumous temporality resolving what has been lost. In attempting to resolve the disappearance, his imitation and doubling of Celâl creates new ruptures: the columns that Galip writes have an unexpected effect, opening up a repressed history, which I consider further below.

Galip's becoming Celâl shows him taking on a prosthetic life of the archive, a form of what Derrida called 'live memory',²¹ describing Freud's approach to the role of memory in writing. Galip displays a sense of archive fever; when Derrida refers to how Freud 'invariably maintains a primacy of live memory and of anamnesis in their originary temporalization' (*Archive*, p. 92), he is referring to an obsessive return to the origin. Derrida doubts the origin may be retrieved, and notes the 'incessant tension here between the archive and archaeology' (*Archive*, p. 92). Galip's journey dramatizes this conflict, in his desire to understand and experience memory, and the delusion that this produces, as if he has become possessed by the archaeological presence of Celâl. When he starts to write like, or as, Celâl, he is aware of the threat this new development contains: 'He felt doomed, marked, exposed – as guilty as a child who's just done something wrong, or become someone else, or stumbled onto someone else's secret – for this was the end of the road, and there was no turning back, no escape from the catastrophe he saw ahead.'²²

This sense of oncoming tragedy directly relates to Galip's doubling, or metamorphosis: 'From now on, I really am someone else! Galip told himself, and though there was something childish in this thought, he knew he had embarked on a journey from which there would be no return' (*Black*, p. 320). Galip's transformation is compulsive; he senses that he has, in taking on Celâl's identity and being, become a force he cannot control, a mysterious narrative disruption. Galip is not only taking on his identity, but also submitting to the force of an autonomous, eruptive narrative in which events have their own power.

²¹ Derrida, *Archive*, p. 92.

²² Pamuk, *Black*, p. 320.

Galip's sense of his own powerlessness when he takes over Celâl's writing persona includes the awareness of the power of words and signs around him, such as the words that he could now read in his own face. Galip assumes these must have been there all along but wasn't aware of them, now witnessing a virtual presence of language: 'It seemed to him that his face was a sheet of paper covered with writing, an inscription riddled with secret signs for other faces, other eyes; odd as this sensation was, he did not dwell on it for long, because now he could hardly believe he'd never noticed them before' (*Black*, p. 322). This spectral image indicates Galip's possession by signs, these virtual presences that have become visible to him, and which he tries to reject: 'Not to read these letters would be more difficult than reading them. But Galip tried to do just that – hoping to liberate himself of this loathsome mask' (*Black*, p. 322). His loss of self is apparent, for he 'tried to breathe new life into his old scepticism, to convince himself that it was childish nonsense even to entertain the notion that you could read letters in faces' (*Black*, p. 322).

Galip is possessed and we learn that the moment of his seeing this hidden language is 'when the terror overtook him. But it had all happened so quickly – first the letters had appeared and then, almost in the same instant, the words those letters signified' (*Black*, p. 323). It was 'as if a sorrowful history happily discarded by everyone around him had been left for him to bear alone' (*Black*, p. 324). Galip is overcome by a certain idea of historical time – not tragic history, but the torments of histories of forgotten times and buried meanings.

Doubled as Celâl, the historical time Galip is experiencing possesses a threat, the past erupting into his life and the narrative he is part of. He doesn't know if he is witnessing the collapse or creation of meaning. Looking at the well outside an apartment window, he 'was seized by the urge to throw himself into its bottomless depths too – to plunge into the dark hole that Celâl had been constructing so patiently, and for so many years, from the wells and fears and mysteries of old poetry – but all he could do was stare into the abyss like a drunk' (*Black*, p. 324).

This void is not a quiet abyss. It is a space in which new meanings are generated and new memories discovered, Galip having entered 'the fully furnished trap that Celâl had been so lovingly preparing for him all these years' (*Black*, p. 325). What happens next is a further development of Galip's relationship with writing and signs, as if he is in an automotive state, discovering language anew (*Black*, p. 325):

He washed his face, made himself another cup of strong coffee, transferred Celâl's old

Remington to his now clear and tidy desk, and sat down. In the drawer was a ream of the paper Celâl had been using for many years; taking out a clean sheet, he rolled it into the typewriter and immediately began to write.

Galip let ‘himself be directed by the flow of his thoughts – in Celâl’s words, never forcing them’ (*Black*, p. 326). In his transformation, Celâl’s historical time animates his mind and his body, as he becomes someone else. The narrative dramatizes the production of historical time within fiction through Galip’s adoption of Celâl’s being.

8. The double, live memories and revelations of historical time

The Black Book dramatizes the process of incorporation of posthumous temporality within fiction through the columns written by Galip, writing as if Celâl, taking on the voice of the other as if having adopted Celâl’s historical time: ‘I gazed into the mirror and read my face. The mirror was a silent sea, my face a pale sheet of paper, written over in a sea-green ink... My face was the Rosetta Stone I had deciphered in my dream... My face was a mirror made of skin which the reader beheld himself’ (*Black*, pp. 335-336).

The birth of Galip as a writer represents an opening of a repression held within him, including his desire to be Celâl. Celâl is entering him as if through language, etched on to or flowing through his body. The emergence of the writing proposes an idea of writing as a form of production of historical time, including Galip being a conduit for Celâl’s writing as ‘live memory’²³ in Derrida’s phrase.

Pamuk’s description of Galip’s writing reflects tensions between prosthetic and mimetic powers of language and its life within crypts of the self. In becoming Celâl, Galip believes he is gaining access to mysteries of historical time, including what might have happened to Celâl and Rûya since their disappearance. However, the consequences of his transformation are not what he anticipated, becoming the site of the emergence and activation of repressed historical memory. He is a machine of writing, as if Celâl’s psyche is simply running ‘by itself’,²⁴ posthumously, what Derrida describes as a ‘mechanism without its own energy’ (*Writing*, p. 285). Galip’s writing symbolises the death of his previous self, and the automation of Celâl’s historical time, bringing forth what has been repressed.

²³ Derrida, *Archive*, p. 92.

²⁴ Derrida, ‘Freud’, *Writing*, p. 285.

Having completed three columns in Celâl's name, the next morning Pamuk writes that 'He felt like a detective who had just found the key to a mystery, who would now be using the same key to open new doors.'²⁵ Galip's taking on of the historical time of Celâl affirms his belief in his ability to reconstruct and enter the past. Celâl's columns, which were previously doubted by readers in terms of their historical veracity, are now fictions written by another.

Galip's writing produces and incorporates historical time, as if posthumously. He realises that his writing opens up the past when he sees signs becoming visible, as if they are the markings of another time, 'the Rosetta Stone I had deciphered in my dream' (*Black*, p. 327). Derrida, writing on Freud's 'A Note upon the "Mystic Writing Pad"' (1925), captures the role of consciousness and the virtual in writing performed in Pamuk's fiction, writing that: 'Writing supplements perception before perception even appears to itself [is conscious of itself]. "Memory" or writing is the opening of that process of appearance itself. The "perceived" may be read only in the past, beneath perception and after it.'²⁶

Following Derrida's interpretation, we understand that writing comes before perception, as if it is producing a sense of historical time before it is known. Fiction participates in this same process of supplementing perception, as if anticipating it. He notes the movement between appearance and disappearance of writing: 'The becoming-visible alternates with the disappearance of what is written would be the flickering up (*Aufleuchten*) and passing-away (*Vergehen*) of consciousness in the process of perception' ('Freud', pp. 282-283). Derrida's description touches on the complexity of temporality of writing, in its supplementation of absence.

Derrida uses this idea of writing to develop his understanding of temporality, writing: 'Temporality as spacing will be not only the horizontal discontinuity of a chain of signs, but also will be writing as the interruption and restoration of contact between the various depths of psychical levels' ('Freud', p. 283), referring to 'the remarkably heterogeneous temporal fabric of psychical work itself' ('Freud', p. 283). In his appraisal of Freud's text, he explicitly embraces temporality's importance to writing, stating that 'Time is the economy of a system of writing' ('Freud', p. 284).

Within this idea of writing, presence is one part of the temporal stratification, working alongside erasure. 'Traces', Derrida remarks, 'thus produce the space of their

²⁵ Pamuk, *Black*, p. 327.

²⁶ Derrida, 'Freud', p. 282.

inscription only by acceding to the period of their erasure. From the beginning, in the “presence” of their first impression, they are constituted by the double force of repression and erasure, legibility and illegibility’ (‘Freud’, p. 284). In *The Black Book*, Galip’s transformation as a writer begins with erasure, as if he is repressing his own self and the narrative plays with this erasure; his transformation into Celâl appears to reverse the erasure, as the posthumous become present via Galip’s doubling of Celâl.

Writing connects temporalities and scenes of writing in both *Gradiva* and *The Black Book*, including the sense of the posthumous return of elements from the past as well as erasure. Derrida writes: ‘Writing is unthinkable without repression. The condition for writing is that there be neither permanent contact nor an absolute break between strata: the vigilance and failure of censorship’ (‘Freud’, p. 285). Readings of posthumousness in narrative depend on understanding the roles of repression, erasure and what is hidden within the text, including connections between temporal strata. The return of the past has complex consequences and Galip anticipates these in his terror of the uncontrollable, dramatic nature of the doubling, historical memory appearing to erupt uncontrollably, threatening a ‘permanent contact’ between strata.

The Black Book presents the space of Celâl’s disappearance as a void in which incorporations and new senses of historical time can be discovered, even if only momentarily. The fiction uses this void, decrypting the past but then encrypting it within a new layer of narrative time. Galip cannot remove his own sense of being within the site of historical time, his presence interrupting from outside the original temporality. He produces more time, for as Derrida notes, ‘The archivist produces more archive.’²⁷ The rupture of historical time by the archivist is also the place of the past’s reconstruction. For Hanold, *Gradiva*’s disappearance is the ground for her memory being reconstructed and her apparent posthumous appearance; so is Rüyâ and Celâl’s disappearance, as if the void demands a new historical time to be created, a new historical presence, just as Freud tried to create a new historical account of Moses’ life.

9. Posthumous temporality, doubling and the search for definitive historical time

Galip’s search for Rüyâ and Celâl presents conflicting ideas of historical time within fictional narrative, including through the use of doubling. Galip is in search of historical time while reimagining historical time as a form of possession, a force outside of himself

²⁷ Derrida, *Archive*, p. 68.

to be discovered as if he can possess it. His search for lost or displaced presence leads to encounters with eruptions and distortions of historical time, with questions of how it might be incorporated into the present. His pursuit of Celâl is complicated by Celâl's own interest in multiple selves, for Celâl is haunted by the reality of doubling.

Celâl relates being visited one afternoon by a barber in Chapter 16 ('I Must Be Myself'). The barber asks him two questions: "Do you have trouble being yourself?" and "Is there a way a man can only be himself?"²⁸ These questions touch on how historical time and subjective time may diverge or converge; Celâl is troubled about what his true historical self might be and whether it is accessible or not. He comments as he looked at himself, recalling: 'I immediately knew that this person sitting in the chair looking at his reflection in the mirror was someone else' (*Black*, p. 183).

Galip's sense of his own transformation reflects his determination to capture Celâl's historical time. His subsequent emulation of Celâl's writing and his public appearance at an event as Celâl is a further attempt to inhabit Celâl's life, creating an illusion of historical time to try to show that Celâl still exists. Galip explores how the historical time of Celâl can be reconstructed and generated, almost imperceptibly, as merely an 'extension of the known world' (*Black*, p. 404). His adoption of a persona, who in his writing operated as a double (of Rumi) adds to the sense of the posthumous construction and experience of temporality. The appearance of doubling is both accidental (when Galip goes into the apartment, the 'ghost house', the phone rings, and he is taken to be the occupant of the apartment, Celâl) and also intentional, desiring to be Celâl. The repeated doubling suggests a fictional reality out of control, developing Galip's delusional activity towards delirium. Posthumous temporality and alternative historical times invade his life, while he also has a sense of loss of meaning as historical time is erased, repressed or confused.

When the narrator observes Galip's noticing similarities between Celâl's description of the apartment and Rumi's, this was 'when he discovered why it was that, as he read Celâl's columns, the objects surrounding him kept changing – why all these tables, curtains, lamps, ashtrays, chairs, and even that pair of scissors on the radiator has been drained of the meaning and goodwill that had once bound them together' (*Black*, p. 257). Celâl's use of Rumi's life suggests a complex relationship of doubling, as historical time is repeated too, in the second time as if meaning is encrypted or erased.

Celâl's life has its own historical time as well as its relation to the historical time of Rumi. This double origin is adopted by Galip when he appears to become Celâl,

²⁸ Pamuk, *Black*, p. 179.

as if to reassert lost meanings of historical time. Galip's taking over of Celâl's life develops a sense of posthumous temporality being present within the narrative. The doubling's presence dramatizes the difference between an external historical time that can be narrated, and an internal time in which Galip exists, participates and incorporates historical time within his being. Galip's attempt to control the illusion of his taking over of Celâl's identity is like Zoë's response to Hanold's apparent delusion. He seeks to take control of the appearance of posthumous temporality, adopting it to make sense of the historical rupture of the present. However, whereas Zoë is able to reassert the primacy of historical memory within the 'Pompeian fantasy', Galip is more troubled. His fantasy of Celâl's life cannot be fully reconciled with what is happening and time continues as a rupture.

Neither Galip nor Zoë are prepared to accept the perception of historical time as an illusion and seek to synthesise the past, using the erupting of historical time into the present to their own ends. The fiction is given historical veracity through this incorporation, but the ambiguity of the illusion remains important, as Freud refers to Hanold's thoughts: 'What... might be the bodily nature of Zoë-Gradiva? Would one feel anything if one touched her hand? A strange urge drove him to a determination to put this experiment to the test.'²⁹ Hanold's witnessing of Zoë brings his perception of past time into the present, while Galip seeks to bring Celâl's historical reflections into a new understanding of the present and of historical time.

Galip recognises Celâl's use of both Rumi's writing and Celâl's life to describe Rumi's life. He discovered that Celâl had 'lifted several sentences word for word from his [Celâl's] own column about the apartment's pit... without any way altering the column's style.'³⁰ This recognition awakens Galip to a sense of the otherness of historical time, beyond the repressed time of the self that Hanold recognised in *Gradiva*. The historical time that Galip discovers is harder to reconcile than that found by Zoë.

The Black Book's doubling, with Galip taking on the identity and being of Celâl, ends differently to *Gradiva* in relation to historical time and posthumous temporality. Galip's taking on of Celâl's life has an additional aspect, the posthumous temporality of both Celâl and Rumi appearing to create a disruptive return of the repressed when Galip brings up old themes in the newspaper columns that he writes in Celâl's name.

As mentioned, Galip's adoption of Celâl's identity has some parallels with

²⁹ Freud, vol. ix, p. 23.

³⁰ Pamuk, *Black*, p. 257.

Auster's unnamed narrator in 'The Locked Room' in *The New York Trilogy*, who has taken on the identity of his friend Simon Fanshawe who disappears and is assumed dead. This follows the story of the first section ('City of Glass') of the novel, the narrator noting how Quinn, following the death of his wife and son 'had managed to outlive himself, as if he were somehow living a posthumous life.'³¹

Auster's novel shows how posthumous temporality and the adoption of the time of the other (a disappeared character) opens up new forms of narrative time through doubling, both in the sense of lived and historical time and of other selves. In the novel's third section, Fanshawe is found to be alive in the closing scenes. Having been tracked down by the narrator, but still hiding behind his apartment door, Fanshawe gives the narrator a final book, referred to as 'a red notebook' (*New York*, p. 311) to explain what has happened. When he reads it, the narrator comments (*New York*, pp. 313-314):

I read steadily for almost an hour, flipping back and forth among the pages, trying to get a sense of what Fanshawe had written. If I say nothing about what I found there, it is because I understood very little. All the words were familiar to me, and yet they seemed to have been put together strangely, as though their final purpose was to cancel each other out. Each sentence erased the sentence before it, each paragraph made the next paragraph impossible.

Following these figurative erasures, the narrator's response is not to archive this work, as part of the autobiography that he is writing of the person whose life he has taken over. He continues the act of erasure, perhaps as if this double should not exist, as if the original is an historical error; fictional time takes over from the historical time of Fanshawe: 'One by one, I tore the pages from the notebook, crumpled them in my hand, and dropped them in a trash bin on the platform. I came to the last page just as the train was pulling out' (*New York*, p. 314).

The narrative is resolved through this act of destruction, Fanshawe having just signalled that he will be taking his own life. Fanshawe's writing is rejected by the narrator, who continues to assume his original's own life, having been living with Fanshawe's wife, clandestinely writing and publishing under Fanshawe's name, even writing his autobiography. The novel ends with this rejection of authenticity, in favour of the posthumous temporality that the narrator has created. The original Fanshawe doesn't contest this, having indicated his intention to kill himself. The resolution offers a troubling sense of how historical time may be incorporated within the fictional, the narrator seeking in Fanshawe's death the certainty of what his life may have meant, but

³¹ Auster, *New York*, p. 5.

instead finding what Stephen Bernstein refers to as a ‘sublime closure’, ‘with sublime darkness subsuming all.’³²

Narrative doubling might demand closure through acknowledgment or death, but the form offers opportunities to resist closing. In Saramago’s *The Double*, Tertuliano Máximo Afonso kills the person purported to be his double.³³ Dostoyevsky’s *The Double* ends with the original character (Golyadkin) who is doubled being locked up for his psychological problems; for him, time has been shattered, reflecting Green’s comments on ‘how the time of death is installed within the time of life.’³⁴ Authorial attempts to resolve confusions at the end of narratives, as in the resolution of the doubling of Zoë and Gradiva in *Gradiva*, does not mean the end to temporal complexity, but indicates a completed incorporation of historical time within fictional time, including the time of death and posthumous temporality. Pamuk’s book itself appears to close with the solution to doubling with the announcement of the deaths of Celâl and Rüya, while the narrative appears to be unlike what it might seem, including apparently incorporating the voice of Celâl after his death.

10. Doubling, endings, death and the openness of historical time to the spectral

In *The Black Book*, historical time appears to be acting on the present in unexpected ways, as Galip’s writing awakens unexpected feelings. One of Currie’s sub-definitions of prolepsis refers to how ‘the present might be structured by an anticipation of the retrospect of the time of writing.’³⁵ The present is also structured in recognition of how it may be considered in terms of different layers of time, including posthumousness. Galip’s sense of the posthumous hints at an ending, while also returning to openings of historical time. Through Galip’s adoption of the historical time of the other (Celâl), Pamuk shows how historical time can become folded into the present.

This folding of time involves anachronies, as memories of Celâl resurface, creating a posthumous presence within narrative. Galip takes on the memories of Celâl, changing the narrative’s perspective on historical memory, as if erasing it while producing it, including the posthumous temporality. Celâl’s archive is remade and

³² Stephen Bernstein, ‘Auster’s Sublime Closure’, in *Beyond the Red Notebook: Essays on Paul Auster*, ed. by Dennis Barone (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press), p. 105.

³³ This ending is notably foregone in the film version of the novel, entitled *Enemy* (2013), in which the double is killed in an accidental car crash, together with the main protagonist’s wife.

³⁴ Green, *Time*, p. 163.

³⁵ Currie, *About*, p. 40.

rewritten via the new historical time that Galip has created, bringing doubled and hidden times together, as if fused by the autonomous energies of the past and writing.

The new newspaper articles by Galip don't resolve the disappearance of Celâl, but creates a new rupture as if prompting a return of the repressed. By writing of love, he awakens a jealousy of one of Celâl's readers, whose wife is infatuated with him, and believes a column talking of love is about her. Galip receives a death threat by phone from her husband, though he says this is because of his deceptions: 'I'm going to kill you because you deceived us all, deceived the entire nation with your bold lies, scandalous dreams, paranoid obsessions, insinuating refinements, elegant turns of phrase, and endearing antics – for years and years, you fooled even me.'³⁶

The man's revolt and death threats are in part against the fictional use of historical time, relating to Celâl's use of Rumi's texts as well as his wife's obsession with Celâl. Galip's phone call with the man displays the eruption of historical time, of both the man's rage against Celâl and his wife's rediscovered desire for him. The two feelings appear to have coalesced, as if desire for love and truth might find themselves allied in such a situation, revenge uniting them. The man and wife want to meet Celâl to discuss these matters. As if still proving his existence as Celâl, Galip seeks to meet them, though they are not there at the agreed location. Close to the arranged time, Celâl is found dead near the scene, with Rüya found not far away, also dead, in a nearby shop.

From a narrative perspective, it appears to have become a detective mystery, but by incorporating eruptive historical and erotic elements it is more complex. Galip knows historical time has been interfered with through doubling, and that he has been instrumental in this. The murders are not a closure for Galip, for they reopen his questions about the past, the scene of death creating more possible understandings of historical time. Meanings may be reordered and historical time reconstructed in new ways.

Both Todorov and Currie referred to the double time of detective fiction, but there is an additional time here of the narrator. It is as if they too are part of the mysteries of historical time, more than passive witnesses of time. The posthumous temporality of the aftermath of this murder is not like the time reconstructed by Poe's Dupin in which historical time is reimagined. Galip does not seek to reconstruct historical time as something that is completely past, but develops its open, posthumous aspect, believing that his understanding of historical time will be transformed in the process of investigation.

³⁶ Pamuk, *Black*, p. 382.

The fiction incorporates historical time, but with events left unresolved, historical time is transformed into a mystery. The closing of the narrative of *The Black Book* resists the simple closure of a detective story, the deaths of Celâl and Rüya leading to a re-evaluation of the text including what signs are meaningful, misleading or insignificant. At the end of the novel, the barber is indicated as the murderer, having been, he thought, ridiculed in the columns and therefore having motives for vengeance. The barber ‘first denied the crime, and then confessed to it, only to deny it again, and then to confess to it once more.’ He is tried, sentenced and hanged, his ‘ruined, tired face... devoid of letters and empty of meaning’ (*Black*, p. 456). Another barber having previously asked ‘Is there a way a man can only be himself?’ (*Black*, p. 179), it is as if this one has been condemned to be himself, in pursuit of Celâl whose life had been taken over by Galip.

The doubling has created a rupture in historical time, while Celâl’s use of fictionality in relation to historical time appears to have opened the threatening force of imagination, which the barber seeks to repress or eliminate, leading to Celâl’s death. Through Galip’s attempts to discover and solve mysteries of historical time, a new rupture has been created. The murders repeat the rupture of fictional and historical time, the narrative also having been ruptured in Galip’s taking over of Celâl’s writing.

After the double murder, the author’s identity is unresolved in the narrative; we are left with doubles, still narrating, still trying to reconstruct historical time in relation to a deeper historical meaning. As the author writes in the final scene, in an abrupt multiple exposure of the present (*Black*, p. 461):

Toward morning, beset by painful memories of Rüya, Galip rises from his desk and looks out over Istanbul’s dark streets. Beset by painful memories of Rüya, I rise from my desk and look down on the dark streets of Istanbul. Together we think of Rüya and look down onto the dark streets of Istanbul; together we go to bed to drift between sleep and wakefulness, and whenever I see some sign of Rüya on the blue-checked quilt, we are both plunged into misery and surprised back to life.

The narrators appear to come together, uniting Galip and Celâl in the final paragraph. The author appears to be a conjunction of Galip, Celâl, and an unnamed narrator; Celâl, posthumously, has been incorporated within Galip’s voice, which in turn is ventriloquized by the narrator. Celâl appeared to have foreshadowed the murder in Chapter 16, writing ‘It was at this moment that I saw the link between the barber who came to the paper to see me at the beginning of this story and the other barber who

caused me to remember him at the end' (*Black*, pp. 183-184), though we might also speculate that Galip has written or rewritten this. Posthumously, the author is able to reveal the nature of the truth of Celâl's life, but only by appearing to become Galip, and only by Galip becoming Celâl. Pamuk's fictional narrative appears to become part of historical memory, creating doubles to find ways to access the past. The novel continues to multiply fictional and historical time, reconciled only in their mutual mimeses.

With the death of Celâl, written as if by the double of him, Pamuk presents a form of reflexive, performative knowledge of history. The fiction finds that beyond history there are multiple times that can be known from different temporal perspectives, including posthumously. The doubling of Celâl allows the past to be reordered and engaged with from a posthumous position, which I will look at further now.

11. The past's emergence through fictional engagement with historical time

The doubling of historical time is intrinsic to the narrative of *Gradiva*. Louis Rose writes about Hanold, referring to how 'the archaeologist fully simulated the inward re-emergence of the past which his observation of Gradiva's image had initiated by sojourning among the surviving remnants of antiquity in Italy.'³⁷ Rose indicates how Freud was drawn to how in Jensen's story the 'attempt at mental or visual reconstruction led to a dramatic enactment of fragments from the past' (*Survival*, p. 96). Rose notes how for Aby Warburg, an early-20th-century art historian, 'the rebirth of the past occurred also as an artistic and historical process' (*Survival*, p. 96). Roth's observation that psychoanalysis is also a theory of history connects with the pursuit of new understandings of historical time in the early 20th-century, including Warburg's awareness of how historical time is brought to life within art and literature.³⁸

This process of the rebirth of the past is enacted by Jensen in *Gradiva*, putting delusions and historical constructs together in order to generate significance in relation to the past. Freud is concerned by potential confusion between the authorial process and standard mental processes, as he acknowledges at the end of his writing on *Gradiva*, commenting of his analysis: 'But we must stop there, or we may really forget that Hanold and Zoë/Gradiva are only creatures of their author's mind.'³⁹ Authorial presence

³⁷ Louis Rose, *The Survival of Images: Art Historians, Psychoanalysts and the Ancients* (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 2001), p. 96.

³⁸ Aby Warburg's *The Renewal of Pagan Antiquity* (1932) highlighted the ongoing influence and presence of the motifs of antiquity in both Renaissance and contemporary art and culture.

³⁹ Freud, vol. ix, p. 93.

is not a reason for abandoning this analysis, for they may recognise how fiction co-exists with and seeks to imitate and reconfigure historical time. In *Gradiva*, Hanold and Gradiva are creatures of their author's mind, but the delusional aspect of Hanold's relationship to his memory or reconfrontation with Zoë is part of the narrative structure of historical memory, a fictional opening on to archaeological and historical time. It is not a negation of historical time. Freud's attraction to *Gradiva* is its dramatization of characters' engagement with the nature of repressed time, including the structure of the incorporation of historical time in memory. Repression in the novel signals where historical time needs to be reconsidered; it is through an approach to Hanold's sense of posthumous temporality that this might be achieved.

Embracing the possibilities of fictional incorporations of (fictional and non-fictional) historical time, Jensen and Pamuk show how fictional narrative can use virtual presences to resurrect historical memory, including Galip's memory of Rüya and Hanold and Zoë's memories of each other. Both *The Black Book* and *Gradiva* show how fictional retrievals of the past are mediated through fragments and reliquaries, presenting them such that historical time appears to come to life. The narrative aspects of the past – memories, dreams, perceptions of surviving traces – show how delusion is at work via the role of incorporation of fragments of historical time, part of how memory recovers past time.

Through the bas-relief and Hanold's revived sense of the past, *Gradiva* brings what has been repressed to life within the fiction. The narrated present of Hanold conveys his decision to confront historical time beyond archaeology whilst uncovering a repressed desire for Zoë. The complex incorporation of historical time is conveyed through the different versions of Zoë and Gradiva, Zoë making multiple appearances as the early Gradiva, the dreamed Gradiva, the Gradiva of the bas-relief, the Gradiva who appears in Pompeii, the one who unveils herself as Zoë to Hanold, and the one who will live in the future with Hanold.

Each version of Zoë and Gradiva has a different relation to historical time, the narrative being in part an attempt to integrate them within a coherent narrative of historical time within the fiction. The narrative shows how different ideas of time are drawn into the narrative present; the multiple incorporations of the past indicates the complexity of Hanold's delusion and the nature of the rupture in memory and desire that he seeks to resolve.

12. Posthumous temporality and autonomous narratives within crypts of historical time

The final chapters of *The Black Book* dramatize posthumous temporality asserting itself over historical time, the narrator stating that the stories are ‘writing themselves’,⁴⁰ as if there is an invisible hand. The novelist is creating and defacing, wanting to appear absent while also generating; this is shown when the narrator writes as if dead or at least unconscious: ‘as I wander like a sleepwalker through its [the story’s] hidden world. For the pages that follow – the black pages that follow – are the memoirs of a sleepwalker, nothing more and nothing less’ (*Black*, p. 443).

The narrator’s assurances here disguise the formal design and intention of the novel, in which apparent order is concealing or acting as the means by which the virtual or repressed elements of history might appear. The somnambulism is a sign of this writing as if writing the unconscious, the dream and the deliria, as if the text is all unconscious, virtual presences threatening to overwrite the temporality of the present. The narrator has a form of temporal omnipresence, if not omniscience, able to move between the worlds of the living and the dead. This anticipates the dead narrator in Pamuk’s novel *My Name is Red*, displaying the power of posthumous temporality in narratives of historical memory.

Galip tries to make sense of the present and historical time via a sense of posthumous temporality, which his adoption of Celâl’s persona gives him access to. The narrator’s orchestration of, or submission to, an unconscious time suggests an extra-temporality at work, the narrative operating as if from the outside of fictional time. Green states that ‘the timelessness of the unconscious... signifies... the timelessness of Eros’, suggesting that this extra-temporality is a drive that lies within historical time, ‘laid down in earliest infancy at the heart of the psyche.’⁴¹

The mystery of the historical time that the narrative engages with involves this elusive time, which is part of the novel’s mimesis of historical time, ‘not to invent new stories but to set down the tales we have been telling each other for many centuries, to gather them together in the black book whose last scene I am now ready to write.’ (*Black*, p. 461). In the final section, the narrator appears to try to control the autonomous force of historical time; the novel frames historical time as a mythical discourse of an

⁴⁰ Pamuk, *Black*, p. 442.

⁴¹ Green, *Time*, p. 151.

autonomous drive. The posthumous temporality of the novel includes a cryptic automatism, of things coming to life (furniture, objects, exhibits), a counter to forces of repression and disappearance.

Galip's imitation of Celâl concludes with the fiction's incorporation within a mysterious time of writing, external to the events of the novel. The narrator addresses the reader as if the real historical Galip has been narrating the novel all along, producing the narrative by incorporating time from the past and from the posthumous perspective. The ending reflects the transformation of Galip into Celâl, then the death of Celâl, the text taking on its own form, independent from a single voice. Celâl, an absent author within the novel's text, is resurrected in Galip's adoption of his identity. The novel's closure is a narrative performance, continuing the ventriloquy that Galip appears to do in relation to Celâl. Galip's automatically writing as Celâl presents this new independent form of narration, its possibilities incorporated by the novel's narrator.

The narrative, having incorporated posthumous temporality via historical crypts, is reframed at the end, the automatism implying the author's fading, as if it has been written after death or approaching death. The posthumous temporality of the novel is an aspect of this narrative automatism – of things coming back to life, including the text writing itself – while also offering a sense of the past posthumously having a new life that can't be controlled, a dramatized rupture of historical time.

The narrator asserts that they have tried to order the past, aware of the confusions of fictional approaches to historical time, writing: 'Reader, dear reader, throughout the writing of this book I have tried – if not always successfully – to keep its narrator separate from its hero, its columns from the pages that advance its story, as I am sure you will have noticed.'⁴² The narrator's confession of the difficulty of the novel's complex formal structure and articulation in the final chapter is also a sign of how the presence of posthumous temporality interrupts the temporality of historical memory and the narrative present.

The narrator of *The Black Book* tries to conduct these forces of historical time, allowing eruptions of the past, while also attempting to assert control over historical memory. Historical time is presented by the narrator as powerful, developing the sense of the automatism of narrative. In search of an authentic historical time, Galip is overtaken by the raw nature of historic hatred and erotic love that his searches and actions have

⁴² Pamuk, *Black*, p. 442.

uncovered. The novel's ending indicates how historical time has transformed since the beginning, changing from a passive analepsis to memories and voices coming alive, erupting into the present via the narrator. The autonomous voice of the narrator at the end reflects this, the text's voice speaking of itself as if liberated, while possessed by the past.

When towards the end of the novel, *The Black Book* appears as a book within the novel, like the 'red notebook' in Auster's *The New York Trilogy*, the book is presented as the meaning of its own writing, a solution to the mystery of the novel in which it is mentioned. Pamuk's and Auster's novels' closures hint at the mysteries of the presence of posthumous temporality within narrative, an idea of writing after and within writing. The form of encryption in *The Black Book*, placing the book within the book, reaching outside of itself, outside of the time of the novel, is as if the fictional time has been intruded upon by history and the narrator is inhabiting historical time. The tensions between fictional time and historical time are not resolved, being part of the continuing drama in the novel, the use of posthumous temporality emphasising the role of rupture within historical time. Virtual representencing of historical time within fictional time carries on, in a perpetual future anterior which appears to continue, as if without end, reaching into the future and back into the past, reflecting Nietzsche's projected role of history as 'a mode of affirmation of the present and future in which the value of the past can be addressed'.⁴³

13. Posthumous temporality and resolutions of cryptic presences of historical time within *The Black Book*

Galip uncovers a sense of the unfolding of time and how posthumous temporality appears within the narrative, the novel bringing the reader into the narrative crypt of Celâl's past via Galip's mediation. In Galip's returns to historical time via Celâl's archive we are drawn into these interiors of crypts which offer solutions to mysteries of historical time, while disrupting the narrative time of the novel. Historical time is presented as both indeterminate mystery and elusive virtuality, as if the novel is hiding origins and meanings, which Galip has to find.

The fictional times of *Gradiva* and *The Black Book* are responses to eruptions and presences of historical time. At the end of Jensen's novel, *Gradiva* (Zoë) embraces

⁴³ Grosz, *Nick*, p. 115.

Hanold, overcoming the repression of love, while *The Black Book*'s ending marks Galip as a character taken over by historical time, fictional time having been overwhelmed by the historical. The narrator comments that: 'No longer did he [Galip] believe he had been searching the city for Celâl and Rûya but that he was a pawn in a game that Celâl (and perhaps Rûya) had devised for him' (*Black*, p. 265). Galip believes he has been drawn into the narrative complexities of time, for 'Celâl, after all, was obsessed with the little tricks, ambiguities, and fictions that allowed him to manipulate others from a distance; so it was not beyond the realm of possibility that his investigations in this room had pointed not to his own liberation but to Celâl's' (*Black*, p. 265).

Galip submits to being part of the mysteries within the world of signs that he desires to understand. His search is in part for historical time in the place of death and disappearance of Rûya and Celâl. The mystery of historical time in the book is how it is hidden, created, appears present, and how Galip confronts it when he finds himself part of it in his search for cryptic presences within the city. The crypts within the novel produce new meanings and the potential for the multiplication of time for Galip, for if (*Black*, p. 259),

Celâl's columns could suggest new meanings with every new reading, it followed that his own life could take on a new meaning every time he thought about it, and as he contemplated this endless freight train of meanings mercilessly multiplying itself into infinity, he feared he might lose himself inside it forever.

The crypt's repeated presence in the novel shows a recognition of posthumous temporality, each scene being part of a greater, hidden mystery. It is as if the author is operating in this posthumous temporality, writing as if against death, the psyche running 'by itself',⁴⁴ like the machine imagined by Derrida in his writing on Freud. *The Black Book* represents posthumous temporality as a dangerous survival of historical memory, a delirium threatening to erupt into the present, producing mysteries without resolutions, the time after death being separate from historical time and yet able to form it. The scene of Rûya and Celâl's death appears as a scene from another world to which the disappearances and deaths belong to, as if outside history. Their double murder moves the narrative not towards a resolution but as a return to the mystery of historical time, the detective narrative taken over by the unresolved past.

⁴⁴ Derrida, 'Freud', *Writing*, p. 285.

Cryptic structures within fictional time offer more than a housing of secret narratives and signs; the hidden historical time is kept alive, as if waiting to be released into the narrative. Castricano argues that ‘the structuring principle of cryptomimesis is analogous to the fantasy of incorporation. It is meant to house something other and to keep it “safe.”’⁴⁵ This narrative encryption is apparent in *The Black Book*; one of the novel’s final images is of Celâl’s murdered body, covered in newspaper pages. It is the newspaper for which he wrote his column; his body is covered by text, the narrative returning to the theme of hidden signs and signs appearing on the body, the historical time of the newspaper appearing on his dead body. Rather than self-encryption, we understand that this column’s writing is not his, it is Galip writing as Celâl, as if Galip’s writing is entombing Celâl, preserving his memory, kept alive for future narration.

Celâl’s dead body is presented as encrypted within the posthumous writing of Galip. This image also presents us with a model of temporality of writing which suggests a posthumous exfoliation, as if the writing has emanated from his body. The following day, an obituary of Celâl is published in the newspaper, and his column also appears, again written by Galip. In this posthumous temporality of Celâl, in the space of his disappearance and death, Galip creates a fictional historical time that appears to erase or displace Celâl’s life, creating a rupture in which Galip’s fictionalised historical time of Celâl finds a life, while by surviving he also ceases to exist as himself, erasing his own time.

Galip’s writing as Celâl is another form of cryptic presence. Castricano comments on ‘the work of mourning – or cryptomimesis... a certain writing that draws us into the history as well as the production of the ghost. Writing, in this case, is learning to let the (plurivocal) spirit speak, a task which is the Gothic equivalent of pursuing a phantom through labyrinthine vaults’ (*Cryptomimesis*, p. 120). The use of crypts in *The Black Book* includes this sense of cryptomimesis, returning to historical time to recreate, redefine and renarrate it. The crypt allows inhabitation of historical time, not just as a place to view history’s ghosts, but to give voice to the past through writing.

Writing on Derrida and the formation of crypts, Castricano refers to ‘the production of an inside, be it of a text, a subject or an institution like “literature”’ (*Cryptomimesis*, p. 124). The cryptomimesis she describes offers an understanding of how fictional time incorporates historical time. The ‘production of the inside’ reflects the possibility of fiction to create internal spaces which allow for the narration of historical time, including, following Ricoeur, the ‘possibilities buried in the actual

⁴⁵ Castricano, *Cryptomimesis*, p. 122.

past.⁴⁶ Derrida shows, through his engagement with Freud's *Moses and Monotheism*, how the crypt can form part of a new fictional realisation of the past, reconsidering historical time. The cryptic presence of historical time in fiction creates a narrative tension between historical time and fictional narrative, this contributing to the drama of both Pamuk's and Jensen's books, in which the protagonists discover hidden crypts of historical time.

14. Posthumous temporality and reimagining historical time

When the dead bodies of Celâl and Rüya are discovered, the narrative present takes over Galip's sense of historical time. The narrative demands to be written in the present tense to explain the deaths within historical time, the dead bodies signifying the moment when historical time becomes actively present. Galip is drawn back again towards the past, describing how

Deep in the recesses of my mind, a shadow would come to life; I would watch it cross the garden of memory to pass through a gate that led to a second garden, and then a third, and a fourth; and as I watched this familiar sight I would feel my own self passing, too, from garden to garden, gate to gate, until I had become someone who could share life with that shadow, even know happiness with that shadow.⁴⁷

Galip is returning to the garden of memory with which he began in the first chapter of the novel, as if resolving historical time, incorporating a posthumous temporality of his own self within that memory. The imagined past that Galip has created appears to insert itself as a presence in historical time. He desires to encounter historical time through the development of doubleness and within the crypts of historical time. The eruption of historical narrative in the novel is as if history inscribes over itself. This performed becoming of historical time is a revelation of the past that is as complete as Hanold's in *Gradiva*. The multiplying or revealing of the palimpsest or doubled nature of the narrator in the concluding paragraph, referred to previously in this chapter, suggests the complex nature of historical time within the novel, in which there is no singular or resolved life. Again, re-reading the closing paragraph, we recall that (*Black*, p. 461):

Toward morning, beset by painful memories of Rüya, Galip rises from his desk and looks out over Istanbul's dark streets. Beset by painful memories of Rüya, I rise from my desk and look

⁴⁶ Ricoeur, *Time*, vol. iii, pp. 191-192.

⁴⁷ Pamuk, *Black*, p. 457.

down on the dark streets of Istanbul. Together we think of Rüya and look out onto the dark streets of Istanbul...

The narrator is not only apparently doubled here; the narrative incorporates a spectral sense of posthumous temporality within the present, as if Celâl may be narrating this, as if he is imagining Galip. The doubling represents this rupture in historical time, the analeptic perspective operating as if integrating an alternative temporality within narrative which the reader then has to decrypt. The doubling indicates a subversive form of mimesis.

The narrative crypts in both *Gradiva* and *The Black Book* hold senses of hidden time waiting to be discovered and unlocked. This is not only in terms of the crypts discovered by Dupin in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue' or the crypt of Rodinsky's room described and developed by Sinclair and Lichtenstein, but also the cryptic generation of time, shown by *Rodinsky's Room*, *Gradiva* and *The Black Book*, in which the crypt appears to produce more elements of historical time that require or achieve incorporation through narrative. Where an investigator such as Dupin offers the closure to the scene of speculation on historical time, other narratives present more generative senses of historical time. Posthumous temporality is a sign not only of historical time's rupture, but also its openness to future interpretation and reintegration within narrative.

In the Freud Museum in London, housed within Freud's final home, Freud's copy of the *Gradiva* bas-relief still exists on a wall of the study. The bas-relief reminds the visitor of the historical narrative within the fiction of Jensen that Freud himself was drawn to. The object posthumously participates with both historical time and fictionalizations of historical time. As we encounter narrative doubling, within fictions and versions of historical time, this expands our sense of narrative temporality and what historical time might consist of.

Ricoeur writes that, 'the interweaving of history and fiction in the refiguration of time rests, in the final analysis, upon this reciprocal overlapping, the quasi-historical moment of fiction changing places with the quasi-fictive moment of history.'⁴⁸ While Pamuk achieves this reciprocity in his novels, his reimagining of the historical time of fiction took on a more public sense when he created a museum in Istanbul that supplemented his novel *The Museum of Innocence*. The museum supplements historical time and the fictional time of the novel, reinforcing a sense of a fictional historical life

⁴⁸ Ricoeur, *Time*, vol. iii, p. 192.

that can be relived as if within the crypt, while outside standard historical time. Pamuk's museum displays his pursuit of historical time, ranging from the posthumous temporalities of his fiction to the supplementary materialism of the museum, which Pamuk collected for during the writing process of *The Museum of Innocence*.

Historical time is not regained in *The Black Book* but Pamuk's use of time produces new fictional possibilities of historical time, in how it is doubled, encrypted and incorporated. Fiction also introduces new elements to historical time, using qualities of writing explored by Freud and Derrida, making writing appear as live memory, as if automated, and as if the past can be mediated into the present, whether as delusion or representation. The novel shows how posthumous temporality can create the sense of a hidden historical time, making a place for it to develop and take on a posthumous life.

In Pamuk's and Jensen's novels, the narrators appear to display a mastery of historical time, developed in confrontation with delusion. Both novels transform the archive of historical memory into a new vision of historical time's encryption within fiction, bringing to light how historical time is incorporated as crypts within the archive and how posthumous temporality is integrated in the narration of historical time, giving memory meaning. Reading in terms of posthumousness in these narratives opens up our sense of the crypt within historical memory. How the past is made to exist in the present introduces a hidden, doubled kind of historical time within narrative, complicating the relationship between fictional and historical time.

Posthumous temporality allows this doubling and shadowing of historical time, creating a new alignment and interplay of fictional and historical time. Sinclair and Lichtenstein's Rodinsky and Freud's Moses both show the potential dramatic presence of historical time hidden within the crypt. The fictional crypt is more than a site of storage; the crypt of historical memory is alive, but must be written to be alive, as if animated with new interpretations. The novel develops senses of the strangeness of historical time, Pamuk's *The Black Book* suggesting another time of writing which includes historical time reimagined. Fiction incorporates posthumous temporality and new interpretations of historical time, pursuing a reordering of historical time, seeking how fictional time might coincide and combine with historical time, including via encryption and incorporation.

Fictionalisation and restructuring of historical time becomes part of the archive, the protagonists obsessively interpreting and interrogating the archive, creating a rupture as if violating historical time, pursuing bodies or texts that have been repressed.

The doubling in *Gradiva* and *The Black Book* are signs of attempts to respond to ruptures in historical time, but in the characters' search for resolution, they further highlight the encrypted nature of historical time in narrative. Readings of historical time within fiction reflect how the past is constructed in relation to the posthumous, including senses of encryptedness, but also hidden desire. This includes the desire to confront repressed desire, opening out the crypts and ruptures of historical time, Zoë giving back Hanold 'from outside the repressed memories which he could not set free from inside'.⁴⁹ Doubling within narrative involves the opening up of repressed elements of historical time.

I will consider fiction's incorporation of historical time further in my readings of writing by Pessoa and Saramago, exploring the role of historical time in relation to posthumous temporalities. This developed interpretation of historical time will help our understanding of how narratives incorporate and develop posthumous temporality, including elements of doubling and primal memory.

⁴⁹ Freud, vol. ix, p. 88.

Chapter 4

Posthumous temporality and crypts of historical time: The presence of posthumous scenes in Fernando Pessoa's *The Book of Disquiet* and José Saramago's *The Year of the Death of Ricardo Reis*

1. Posthumous temporality and biographical writing

My readings of *Gradiva* and *The Black Book* have shown how narrative uses of posthumous temporality create presences of historical time within fiction, including cryptic incorporations of the past. Both novels use analeptic perspectives, incorporating posthumous presences of historical time. Pessoa writes in the present as if it is primarily experienced in an analeptic mode, reflexively experiencing the present as if it is being considered from a future position of having been completed already. Saramago develops this perspective further in *The Year of the Death of Ricardo Reis*, setting the story after the death of one of the main characters, Pessoa. This book can be interpreted in terms of posthumous temporality, but also by understanding it in relation to Pessoa's *The Book of Disquiet*. Saramago echoes Pessoa's style, but transposes it into a realist narrative.

Saramago's novel imagines the return, upon hearing of Pessoa's death, of one of Pessoa's heteronyms (Ricardo Reis) to Lisbon, where he meets the phantasmal figure of Pessoa. In so doing, Saramago participates in Pessoa's ideas about temporality, including senses of posthumous time that are anticipated and incorporated. Pessoa's approach to time goes beyond simple presence, and appears elusive. He writes, 'I don't know what time is. I don't know what its real measure is, presuming it has one. I know that the clock's measure is false, as it divides time spatially, from the outside. I know that our emotions' way of measuring is just as false, dividing not time but our sensation of it.'¹ His critique opposes time to attempts at logical understanding, while he asserts that even the unconscious has got time wrong: 'The way our dreams measure it is erroneous, for in dreams we only brush against time, now leisurely, now hurriedly, and what we live in them is fast or slow, depending on something in their flowing that I can't grasp' (*Disquiet*, p. 292).

Pessoa's autobiographical narratives are a pursuit of historicity, the present

¹ Fernando Pessoa, *The Book of Disquiet*, trans. by Richard Zenith (London: Penguin, 2002), p. 292.

becoming a mode of the posthumous, an anticipated future anterior. His work incorporates posthumous temporality within the text, including an idea of the crypt in which an imagined posthumous time is incorporated into the present. He describes a sense of the self as if it is a posthumous memory, posthumous temporality invading the present moment. Saramago ventriloquizes Pessoa, giving him these words: ‘It is before death and not after that we enter nothingness, for from nothingness we came, emerging, and when dead we shall disperse, without consciousness yet still existing.’²

Pessoa presents an alternative narration of present time in *The Book of Disquiet*, as if inviting a rupture from the future. While his writing flashes forward proleptically, incorporating a posthumous perspective on his present time, Saramago develops the analeptic perspective further through a different use of posthumousness. As referred to previously, describing detective novels, Currie describes ‘the conjunction of the forwards motion of narration to the backwards motion of explanation.’³ Saramago locates this forward motion in a posthumous temporality after Pessoa’s death, the backwards motion attempting to explain Pessoa’s sense of historical time via the extra-temporality of his phantasmal existence.

Pessoa’s incorporation of posthumous time is also a future projection, as if encrypting time or creating historical time before an event has happened. His sense of the posthumous anticipates how he may be incorporated within history and a posthumous mythology, encrypting the present from the point of view of the future. My readings present ways of understanding the palimpsest of temporality within narrative, incorporating multiple layers of time. In Pessoa’s and Saramago’s biographical narratives, posthumous temporality exists in terms of a new presence of death, anticipated or incorporated. Their works overlap in their approaches to temporality and the posthumous; together they illuminate the nature of posthumous temporality as a presence in fiction and life writing.

I will explore how these texts use historical time, developing ideas about cryptic temporalities in terms of what I call the ‘posthumous scene.’ Saramago uses Pessoa and his heteronym, Ricardo Reis, to develop forms of posthumous temporality. Pessoa himself conveyed senses of self presence related to posthumous temporality, marked by the present’s extinction or exhaustion. This sense of time includes a new idea of the temporal self within the narrative imagination. Saramago is drawn towards the body of

² Saramago, *Year*, p. 63.

³ Currie, *About*, p. 144.

Pessoa, reimagining him living time that is historical yet out of history, a posthumous temporality that offers a dream of death while also being defined by death.

Pessoa and Saramago's texts appear to act on each other. While Pessoa's writing encrypts future readers of his life, including Saramago, drawing them into the crypt of his written life, Saramago encrypts and develops a certain historical reading of Pessoa. Beginning with Pessoa, I will show how posthumousness defined his sense of presence, like one of Nietzsche's 'posthumous people' appearing as if outside of time, untimely in the sense of negating a basic presence. The void this creates allows Saramago to present a fictional historical supplement to his life, engaging with Pessoa's sense of posthumousness.

2. Encryptions of posthumous temporality and primal memory in *The Book of Disquiet*

Pessoa repeatedly inscribes his imagined death within the text, preserving his own realization of death, incorporating death's presence and a sense of a posthumous temporality. He declares: 'We are death. What we call life is the slumber of our real life, the death of what we really are. The dead are born, they don't die. The worlds are switched around in our eyes. We're dead when we think we're living; we start living when we die.'⁴ Pessoa's sense of posthumousness is a form of prolepsis, as if flashing forward to a posthumous perspective, but articulated within the present. The narrative possesses a posthumous temporality in terms of an anticipation of death and experience of finitude within life, as if the spectral has become incorporated within his life.

Pessoa's fictional autobiography *The Book of Disquiet*, published after his death, was written as a heteronym, Bernardo Soares, one of a number of names or characters used by Pessoa in his published and unpublished works. The heteronyms were alternative personae that varied dramatically in style and philosophy and may be interpreted as conflicting survivals and manifestations of his hidden self that he activates, encrypting them within his writing. Writing on Pessoa, Zbigniew Kotowicz quotes his letter to a young poet, Adolfo Casais Monteiro, describing the birth of one of his heteronyms: 'what followed was an apparition of somebody in me, to whom I immediately gave the name Alberto Caeiro. Forgive me the absurdity of the phrase: my

⁴ Pessoa, *Disquiet*, p. 158.

master had appeared in me.’⁵ Kotowicz states that Pessoa ‘was using this letter to shape his posthumous mythology’ (*Voices*, p. 41).

In *The Book of Disquiet*, Pessoa’s heteronymic persona Bernardo Soares is aware of his own death, encrypting his future spectral self within narrative. The cryptic space is not an invisible partition, but is made structurally visible, as he writes:

The four walls of my squalid room are at once a cell and wilderness, a bed and a coffin. My happiest moments are those when I think nothing, want nothing and dream nothing, being lost in a torpor like some accidental plant, like mere moss growing on life’s surface. I savour without bitterness this absurd awareness of being nothing, this foretaste of death and extinction.⁶

Pessoa’s text is encrypting the heteronym that he created, presenting an experience of death as he imagines it. The posthumous temporality here has a greater presence in narrative than a sense of the flashback or a reflection on historical time, forming a hypertrophied version of analepsis, as if the heteronym exists in a posthumous temporality. One of Pessoa’s English translators, Richard Zenith, describes the book as “the world’s strangest photograph, made out of words, the only material capable of capturing the recesses of the soul it exposes”⁷ and “a kind of primitive, verbal CAT scan of one man’s anguished soul” (Introduction, p. ix). Pessoa’s writing traces an imagined posthumous narrative of the self, as if discovering a hidden sense of death.

The text’s structural and psychological detail is more complex than Zenith’s clinical metaphor might suggest, Pessoa embedding a posthumous perspective within the narrative fragments that prohibits a simple present tense. Pessoa argues through Soares’ narrative that ‘Everything in our activities that we hold to be superior participates in death and is death. What are ideals but an admission that life is worthless? What is art but the negation of life? A statue is a dead body, chiselled to capture death in incorruptible matter’ (*Disquiet*, p. 158). The incorporation of posthumous temporality in his narrative mimics the presence of death in life.

Pessoa’s embrace of death is echoed by Saramago’s use of posthumous temporality within his novel. Pessoa’s posthumous scenes might be considered in

⁵ Zbigniew Kotowicz, *Fernando Pessoa: Voices of a Nomadic Soul* (London: Menard Press, 1996), pp. 40-41. Letter of 13 January 1935. Pessoa’s use of heteronyms is considered by Max Saunders in *Self Impression: Life-Writing, Autobiografiction, and the Forms of Modern Literature* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010), see pp. 303-308. Kevin Jackson in *Invisible Forms: A Guide to Literary Curiosities* (New York: St Martin’s Press, 2000) quotes Pessoa stating that a heteronym is an ‘author writing outside his own personality’ (article, *Presença*, 1928).

⁶ Pessoa, *Disquiet*, p. 379.

⁷ Richard Zenith, Introduction, in Pessoa, *Disquiet*, p. xxv.

relation to the concept of the primal scene reinterpreted by Ned Lukacher after Freud, particularly Freud's analysis of the Wolf Man. Lukacher refers to how elusive the primal scene is both as a concept and also in practice. There are often various possible primal scenes; the Wolf Man case points to myriad possible origins of his trauma, including an incestuous relationship and other sexual-related childhood events. The posthumous scene is a correlative of the primal scene described by Lukacher, not in terms of relating to early witnessing of sexual activity that 'subsequently plays a traumatic role',⁸ but the primal scene in the sense of what he describes as 'the figure of an always divided interpretive strategy that points toward the Real in the very act of establishing its inaccessibility; it becomes the name for the dispossessive function of language that constitutes the undisclosed essence of language' (*Primal*, p. 24).

The posthumous scene is a correlative of this, marking the inaccessibility of historical time while presenting itself as an opening to the undisclosed essence of historical time, or language about the event, incorporated into narrated time. Pessoa incorporates versions of imagined historical time that are yet to occur, deferred by the life that they are waiting to supersede. The posthumous scene enacts this historical time in the space of the present by giving death presence, time's passing being a form of death, Pessoa writing: 'Oh, the dead past that survives in me and that has never been anywhere but in me!' (*Disquiet*, p. 89), then continuing later that it's an 'actual past that I mourn, a real-life corpse that I stare at, lying there solemnly in its coffin' (*Disquiet*, p. 89).

Both Pessoa's and Saramago's texts possess multiple senses of the posthumous, including how death may be present within life and an idea of historical time that invades lived time, awakening narrative crypts. Lukacher's analysis in *Primal Scenes* draws on Abraham and Torok's version of the crypt and my earlier considerations of crypts are developed further here with both the primal and the posthumous in mind. Lukacher refers to the role of incorporation and the formation of what he calls a 'secondary unconscious' (*Primal*, p. 89). His reference to the primal is full of the sense, taken from Abraham and Torok, of death that takes over the subject and refers to Martin Heidegger's phrase, the 'primal incorporation of the oblivion of Being' (quoted in *Primal*, p. 89).

Lukacher's analysis of the primal scene in the light of Abraham and Torok's work offers an insight into how the primal and the posthumous are related, the

⁸ Ned Lukacher, *Primal Scenes: Literature, Philosophy, Psychoanalysis* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1988), p. 24.

posthumous perspective often revisiting what the primal signifies within a biography. Lukacher picks up on their use of the phrase ‘phantasmatic theatre’⁹ to describe the primal scene, as if it occurs in relation to a sense of posthumousness. The conflation or overlapping of the primal and the posthumous occurs in Pessoa’s work, as he writes of ‘The longing I feel when I think of the past I’ve lived in real time, when I weep over the corpse of my childhood life.’¹⁰ Saramago considers aspects of the primal in his posthumous narrative as I will explore further later, his novel on Pessoa and Pessoa’s heteronym Ricardo Reis alluding to senses of the primal, including the experience of the womb. Saramago writes of Pessoa and Reis when they meet:

They look at each other with affection, obviously happy to be reunited after years of separation, and it is Fernando Pessoa who speaks first, I believe you came to visit me, I wasn’t there, but they told me when I got back. Ricardo Reis replied, I was sure I’d find you there, never imagining you could leave that place.¹¹

The scene is a return to primal memory for Reis, but it is more significant than that. Pessoa explains to Reis (*Year*, p. 64):

I have about eight months in which to wander around as I please. Why eight months, Ricardo Reis asked, and Fernando Pessoa explained, The usual period is nine months, the same length of time we spend in our mother’s womb, I believe it’s a question of symmetry, before we are born no one can see us yet they think about us every day, after we are dead they cannot see us any longer and every day they go on forgetting us a little more, and apart from exceptional cases it takes nine months to achieve total oblivion.

Saramago approaches oblivion through the primal, as if following Lukacher and Heidegger. Pessoa and Reis’s encounter is as if in the womb, and yet this is also a posthumous scene, after death. Pessoa is only visible to Reis, but feels threatened by the possibility of his becoming visible to others, becoming more than spectral.

In *The Book of Disquiet*, Pessoa’s perspective reveals historical time taking on the position of the dead, from childhood to imaginary scenes. These scenes are primal in the sense that they hold an elusive, originary meaning that may be concealed or removed from his sense of being. He writes of how:

⁹ Ibid., p. 157.

¹⁰ Pessoa, *Disquiet*, p. 89.

¹¹ José Saramago, *The Year of the Death of Ricardo Reis*, trans. by Giovanni Pontiero (London: Harvill, 1998), p. 64.

Certain paintings without great artistic merit and certain prints on walls I saw every day became realities in me. My sensation in these cases was different – sadder and more poignant. It grieved me that I couldn't be there too, whether or not the scenes were real. That I couldn't at least be an inconspicuous figure drawn in at the foot of those moonlit woods I saw on a small print in a room where I once slept – and this was after my childhood was quite finished!¹²

Pessoa's alienation from these images concerns being cut off from something primal. He wants to live again in those crypts of childhood but cannot; his writing implies a disorientation in relation to historical time, the present appearing to be irredeemably removed from the past. This sense is found in Barthes' memoir *Camera Lucida*, in which he writes of photographs from his family's past, 'With regard to many of these photographs, it was History which separated me from them. Is History not simply that time when we were not born? I could read my non existence in the clothes my mother had worn before I can remember her.'¹³ In his return to early memories and times before his birth, Barthes finds evidence of his own non-existence. Looking back, as if posthumously, the past reflects his non-existence and also his sense of being outside history, as 'the very contrary of History, I am what belies it, destroys it for the sake of my own history' (*Camera*, p. 65). By moving outside of history, he finds his own sense of historical time ('my own history') buried within extra-temporality.

3. The posthumous scene and the nurturing and eruptions of historical time

In *The Book of Disquiet*, Pessoa looks beyond the life of the present as if there is an external sense of historical time that he can appeal to, a time linked to death. Pessoa's concern for death is related to Benjamin's observation on how the storyteller uses death to demonstrate a narrative's sense of being historical when he writes: 'Death is the sanction of everything that the storyteller can tell. He has borrowed his authority from death.'¹⁴ Benjamin describes the 'eschatological orientation' of the chronicler and their 'profane outlook' ('Storyteller', p. 95). *The Book of Disquiet* is an eschatological form, its meditations on death reflecting a yearning for meaning while inviting the reader to share in a sense of the historical in which death disturbs, reorders and empties time. Pessoa's narrative incorporation of death creates posthumous scenes as if they are in the present. Without seeking to emulate medieval tales that Benjamin describes as having

¹² Pessoa, *Disquiet*, p. 89.

¹³ Barthes, *Camera*, p. 64.

¹⁴ Benjamin, 'The Storyteller', p. 93.

a ‘divine plan of salvation’ (‘Storyteller’, p. 95), Pessoa’s episodic biographical stories seek a form of reconciliation with death, working out how he may seek to incorporate the time after death to form his own sense of historical time.

Benjamin notes the struggle for historical time via natural history within the stories of the Russian writer Nikolai Leskov (1831-1895), a struggle for the historical from a perspective of knowing death. Benjamin’s concern for the posthumous is not the search for an afterlife; there is no future-oriented sentimentalism in his pursuit of historical time in relation to death. Tambling’s reading of Benjamin in *Being Posthumous* focuses on the afterlife of historical memory. Interpreting Benjamin’s historical perspective, he writes that ‘the present gives everything to the past, turning a past fact into something historical. At the same time, the past gives everything to the present.’¹⁵ The idea of rupture considered by Benjamin and others including de Certeau demands the reconciliation of historical time and posthumous perspectives, producing a new envisioning of historical time.

Posthumously, the nature of the past is further revealed and animated in relation to death. Benjamin is in search of the historical, and of how the posthumous is part of that, his concern being not for an extra-temporal ‘angel of history’, but one which might define collective experiences of historical time. The novel does this he argues, quoting Georg Lukács on how the novel’s unifying of ‘inwardness and outside world’ ‘becomes the divinatory-intuitive grasping of the unattained and therefore inexpressible meaning of life.’¹⁶

When Benjamin writes that ‘What draws the reader to the novel is the hope of warming his shivering life with a death he reads about’ (‘Storyteller’, p. 100), he is not describing the novel as an amusement or simple consolation, but as a means of engaging with the historical in relation to death in order to incorporate it within an understanding of lived time. Posthumous temporality provides this possibility, concerning what Pessoa calls ‘this absurd awareness of being nothing, this foretaste of death and extinction.’¹⁷ The posthumous scene signals a desire to be part of historical time, in which the historical is repossessed or incorporated within narrative.

Pessoa’s writing is often in pursuit of the historical, whether through memories or traditions, demonstrated in his imitation of the Portuguese poet Luís de Camões’ *The*

¹⁵ Jeremy Tambling, *Becoming Posthumous: Life and Death in Literary and Cultural Studies* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2001), p. 128.

¹⁶ Benjamin, ‘The Storyteller’, p. 98, quoting Lukács’ *Theory of the Novel* (1915).

¹⁷ Pessoa, *Disquiet*, p. 379.

Lusiads in the poetry of another of his heteronyms, Alvaro de Campos. His autobiography demands an understanding of how historical time may be reconstructed within a life by the person living it. His poetry uses personal mythology, dramatizing his self in confrontation with historical time and the time of death, as if trying to possess it, in a form of epic poetical engagement with history. Benjamin wrote that “Any examination of a given epic form is concerned with the relationship of this form to historiography. In fact, one may go even further and raise the question whether historiography does not constitute the common ground of all forms of epic.”¹⁸ Pessoa’s writing shows the complexity of the relationship between epic, historiography, and autobiography, as the posthumous temporality that he develops attempts to imbue moments with a sense of pastness.

Pessoa’s imagined time of death develops his reflections on temporality, access to historical time being sought through the perspective of death, a posthumous point where a new order of the past can be achieved. Rather than giving an account of the primal in terms of origins, Pessoa’s writing relates to posthumousness, a future time in which meanings of the past will be revealed. Novelists who incorporate posthumous temporality in fiction also participate in how meanings of the past can be disclosed from a future perspective. The posthumous scene reveals a desire for or anxiety concerning historical time, presenting the past from a different perspective, constructing it via analepsis from the imagined, proleptic position of the posthumous. This also makes possible a new relationship with absent or hidden origins.

The primal scene described by Lukacher presents the erasure of the origin, with a corresponding demand for a supplementation of this erasure. He argues that his proposed redefinition of the ‘primal scene’ is ‘a step toward solving the crisis of interpretation that emerges when the question of the origin becomes at once unavoidable and unanswerable, when the origin must be remembered but memory fails utterly, when all the evidence points toward an origin that nevertheless remains unverifiable.’¹⁹ His version of the primal scene is a place where a new writing or reinterpretation is possible. He writes, ‘The primal scene is the figure of an interpretive dilemma; it is a constellation of forgotten intertextual events offered in lieu of a demonstrable, unquestionable origin’ (*Primal*, pp. 24-25).

Lukacher’s development of this concept is helpful for how we approach posthumous

¹⁸ Benjamin, ‘The Storyteller’, pp. 94-95.

¹⁹ Lukacher, *Primal*, p. 24.

temporality. His version of the primal scene is a constellation of imagined and historical events, a narrative in lieu of a ‘demonstrable, unquestionable’ account of historical time. The posthumous scene constructed within historical time allows the reincorporation and reinterpretation of primal memory, projecting a future time in which scenes of the past become better known in relation to death. Pessoa’s and Saramago’s texts’ encryptions of historical time reveal how this narrative perspective can work, including their concern for presences and orderings of historical time after death, rather than for elusive origins.

In *The Book of Disquiet*, Pessoa narrates a time of attempted repossession of the life from the point of death through complex uses of temporality that includes a perspective on the primal. Lukacher writes that the ‘primal scene is an effort to answer the unanswerable call of the Real, a call that emerges from the undisclosed essence of language itself’ (*Primal*, p. 25). The posthumous approach to this call is also related to hidden and spectral aspects of language, which Pessoa attempts to disclose. Regarding words, he writes, ‘They speak, they tell, but it’s not of themselves that they speak or tell; they’re words, as I’ve said, that don’t disclose their meaning, but they allow glimpses.’²⁰ He develops his idea of semantic uncertainty further through visual imagery: ‘In my twilight vision I only vaguely distinguish what these sudden glass panes on the surfaces of things let show from the interior that they veil and reveal. I understand without knowledge, like a blind man when someone tells him about colours’ (*Disquiet*, p. 264). These veils are like the curtains of primal memory, in which something is known to have been hidden and temporarily revealed. The complex nature of language merges with the elusiveness of memory.

Historical memory can sometimes take the form of meanings opening up, while still being veiled. Benjamin describes being in hidden places in his childhood home, ‘enveloped in the world of matter. It became monstrously distinct for me, loomed speechlessly near.’²¹ This hiding place is described as if part of a primal scene, a world in which there are secrets: ‘the house was an arsenal of masks’ (*Berlin*, p. 100). Alongside these descriptions of primal memories we may consider Edward Thomas’ descriptions of reaching beyond veils, articulating a posthumous and crypt-like sense of the past:

²⁰ Pessoa, *Disquiet*, p. 264.

²¹ Benjamin, *Berlin*, p. 99.

When I penetrate backward into my childhood I come perhaps sooner than many people to impassable night. A sweet darkness enfolds with a faint blessing my life up to the age of about four. The task of attempting stubbornly to bring up that darkness is one I have never proposed to myself, but I have many times gone up to the edge of it, peering, listening, stretching out my hands, and I have heard the voice of one singing as I sat or lay in her arms; and I have become again aware very dimly of being enclosed in rooms that were shadowy, whether by comparison with outer sunlight I know not. The songs, first of my mother, then of her younger sister, I can hear not only afar off behind the veil but on this side of it also.²²

In this passage we encounter edges, enclosures, veiled divisions, the modular architecture of recollected memories. Memories here are crypt-like, circumscribing an intimate space that is both escaped (lived ecstatically in recollection) and sensed inwardly at the same time. Written in 1913 when Thomas was about 35, just four years before his death, it relates a world enclosed within a world, signalling a previous closure, writing as if posthumously. Such writing evokes significances that have either been superseded or simply left behind.

While Pessoa's, Benjamin's and Thomas's scenes all have correlative primal memories, the posthumous scene within fiction has not happened – it is imaginary. The posthumous scene reaches into historical time, creating a new time developed in relation to reimagined origins and memories, as we will see further in Saramago's *The Year of the Death of Ricardo Reis*. In this reaching back into time there is a sense of fictional narrative aspiring to historical time, as if the phantom curtain is being drawn back to reveal these scenes.

Saramago's fiction is not written as a chronicle, but as an engagement with historical time from a fictional posthumous perspective. Death provides the veil which is returned through by Saramago, just as we saw Pamuk and Jensen employ veils of the posthumous in their respective novels. Saramago's posthumous scenes conjoin erased, overwritten and re-incorporated temporalities – not reconstructions of the origin, but retelling fictional historical memories from the perspective of the future. In this analeptic position the origin, primal memory or historical time of Pessoa might be revealed anew.

²² Edward Thomas, *The Childhood of Edward Thomas: A Fragment of Autobiography* (London: Faber and Faber, 1983), p. 13.

4. Biography, death, historical time and the multiple self

The posthumous temporality described by Pessoa reveals suggests both a disconnection from the present and an appetite for an alternative temporality. He is not in search of a separate afterlife but a heterogeneous time integrating past, present and posthumous times. Pessoa anticipates what historical understandings after death might do to understandings of a life, including this posthumous perspective within historical time. Benjamin writes that, ‘Historical “understanding” (*Verstehen*) is to be viewed primarily as an afterlife (*Nachleben*) of that which has been understood; and so what came to be recognized about works through the analysis of their “afterlife,” their “fame,” should be considered the foundation of history itself.’²³ Biographies, fictional or non-fictional, can include this sense of the afterlife, acknowledging the tension between lived time and historical time seen from a posthumous perspective.

Anticipation of death is a way of understanding how life may be reconceived. In *A Fortunate Man*, a biographical memoir of a living doctor in rural England in the 1960s, and with interpretative echoes of Benjamin, John Berger writes: ‘It sounds absurd to say that a man’s life is utterly transformed by his death, but I mean for those who knew him, or even knew of him. The simplest confirmation of this is what happens when an artist dies.’²⁴ Berger captures this through how an artwork might change: ‘The painting you saw last week when you assume the painter was alive is not the same painting... you see this week when you know that he is dead. From now on everybody will see the painting you see this week. The painting of last week has died with him’ (*Fortunate*, p. 159).

Death changes the internal cryptic forms and meanings of a life’s narrative, and the immediate relationship between a narrative and historical time, considered posthumously. Berger continues (*Fortunate*, pp. 159-160):

Whilst the artist is alive, we see the painting, although it is clearly finished, as part of a work in progress ... We can apply epithets to it such as: promising, disappointing, unexpected. When the artist is dead, the painting becomes part of a definitive body of work ... The subject for discussion is no longer his unknown intentions, his possible confusions, his hopes, his ability to be persuaded, his capacity for change: the subject now is what use we have for the work left us. Because he is dead, we become the protagonists ... we have to make up our minds.

²³ Benjamin, ‘N [Re the Theory of Knowledge, Theory of Progress]’, in *Benjamin: Philosophy, Aesthetics, History*, ed. by Gary Smith (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1989), p. 47.

²⁴ John Berger, *A Fortunate Man* (London: Granta Books, 1989), p. 159.

Pessoa imagines this future perspective, drawing the posthumous scene into his writing, anticipating how his life's crypts, masks and hidden meanings might be perceived after death. His incorporations of posthumous temporality within narratives draws on the posthumous perspective both presumptively, sometimes preposterously. Berger concludes his book by speculating on how recognition of death might affect the act of biographical writing (*Fortunate*, p. 160):

And so if Sassall [the doctor] were dead, I would have written an essay which risked far less speculation. Partly because I would have wanted to write a more precise memoir of him, to preserve his likeness. But also because when writing about him I would not have been aware – as I am now and have been every moment of writing – of the process of his life continuing – unfixated, mysterious, only half conscious of its own ends.

Pessoa's writing includes this process of life continuing, but integrates an intensified anticipation of posthumousness. The posthumous scene attempts to fix meanings of historical time being described by him, as if repressing conflict hidden within the present moment. Berger continues of Sassall: 'If he were dead, I would conclude this essay as death concluded his life. Without sentimentality, and without religious intimations, I would have wanted him to rest, at least on these final pages, in peace' (*Fortunate*, p. 160). In this anticipation of the transition after death, Berger is negotiating with the authority of death, aware of its presences within an ongoing life story, and of the narrative crypts that he creates for his subject. He is aware of how his writing would change if his subject were to die, believing that death will create a resolved, stable order. And yet, as we have considered, the historical may also be represented as being in ongoing upheaval or formed by ruptures.

Against the closure that death represents, there are mysteries that evade the biographer's narrative, or force it to take a different form. There are alternative understandings of how the death of a biographical subject may affect the writing and cryptic forms of a life. After death, voices, images, texts and memories haunt the living, including those phantoms often created by the writer themselves, as found in Pessoa's writing. There are unconscious elements that remain obscure and encrypted, threatening to erupt or be discovered. In the face of these, the biographer or novelist may resist closure, acknowledging the mysteries and uncertainties of historical time. In her essay 'How to End it All', Hermione Lee describes how she closed her biography of Virginia Woolf:

My view ... was that Virginia Woolf's suicide should not be made to fit a theory; and that all the

information and all the interpretations should be written, or rewritten, as accurately as possible. But what I didn't want to do, or didn't feel I could do, was to write an account of her death which gave the impression that there was nothing mysterious and nothing obscure about that act. I could describe, as far as I knew it, how she ended it all, but I couldn't entirely – and nor can anyone – say why.²⁵

Lee's reticence here is not just a care for historical truth, which is hidden, but reflects a belief that a narrative of Woolf's death should not conceal or distract from what may be mysterious and unknown in her life. More positively, Lee is using the moment of her death to remind the reader of the multiplicity and unknowability of biographical narratives. Towards the end of her biography of Woolf, Lee writes: 'Posthumously, it feels as if she has generously, abundantly opened herself up to such retellings [of life stories], as if in an echo of her joking phrase to John Lehmann: "You are hereby invited to be the guest of Virginia Woolf's ghost."' ²⁶

Woolf's awareness of the posthumous existence of herself anticipates how life writing may tell hidden stories. Lee's approach leaves as encrypted that which resists singular interpretation. For Woolf, a narrator of characters of complex interior selves, it is appropriate that a biographer feels unable to fix her to a singular life, even after death. Interior crypts are intrinsic to the form of Woolf's novels, creating multiple, competing and often disturbing presences of the past. These cryptic presences hint at multiplicities, at many alternative fictions or histories.

Readings of posthumousness within Pessoa's writing involve engaging with how he develops different temporalities, reflecting the finitude of life but also the opening up of life within historical time in relation to death. His cryptic approaches disturb representations of historical memory, disrupting narrative temporality. While sensing absence, Pessoa finds a new sense of temporal presence, how what is erased by time becomes a new presence, for 'Whoever lives like me doesn't die: he terminates, wilts, dries up. The place where he was remains without him being there; the street where he walked remains without him being seen on it; the house where he lived is inhabited by not-him.'²⁷ He continues: 'That's all, and we call it nothing; but not even this tragedy of negation can be staged to applause, for we don't know for sure if it's nothing' (*Disquiet*, p. 44). Pessoa incorporates the sense of finitude within life, while seeing how

²⁵ Hermione Lee, 'How to End it All', in *Body Parts: Essays on Life-Writing* (London: Pimlico, 2008), p. 218.

²⁶ Lee, *Virginia Woolf* (London: Chatto & Windus, 1996), p. 769.

²⁷ Pessoa, *Disquiet*, p. 44.

life accomplishes plenitude in relation to death. He reflects the post-Messianic sense that history isn't the fulfilment of humanity or the divine, but the posthumous frame or iteration of the past's meaning.

The posthumous perspective enables a new understanding of the nature of historical time, and how time might be understood in terms of Pessoa's life, moving 'among shadows that represent beings and places where there are actually beings' (*Disquiet*, p. 191). He writes (*Disquiet*, p. 192):

In both body and spirit I feel sorely weary of things, all things, of simply being here, of... finding myself in this present state. I almost catch myself wanting to scream because of a feeling that I'm sinking in an ocean... whose immensity has nothing to do with the infinity of space or the eternity of time, nor with anything that can be measured and named... I feel like a mere void, the illusion of a soul, the locus of a being, a conscious darkness where a strange insect... vainly seeks at least the warm memory of a light.

This 'warm memory of a light' sits precariously in the void that Pessoa paints so despairingly. Via the scene of negation, he develops a sense of temporal plenitude; aware of death, the present moment overcomes him. Lucia Boldrini develops an understanding of the time of heterobiographical disclosure, moving from primal memory to a posthumous understanding. She describes how 'The regression to the original moment of plenitude and self-sufficiency when language and self-consciousness were not yet present, however, can only be realized through death, when language is lost and conscious self-speculation can no longer take place'.²⁸ This regression is referred to by Boldrini as if it is an accomplishment, like Pessoa's, a movement towards death, or a time of death which promises self-revelation.

In place of the search for the historical origin or primal scene, we have the posthumous scene, the imagined or real site of death, where the past becomes visible. Boldrini writes further that, 'The paradox is that, while desiring to transcend its own divisions, the autobiographical subject also desires to experience this renewed state of plenitude *consciously*' (*Autobiographies*, p. 23). Contrasting the absent and the surviving within historical time, Pessoa's approach suggests an alternative version of Benjamin's 'Angel of History', a soul caught in historical time trying to capture its cosmic context, outside of traditional metaphysics. In *Posthistoire*, Lutz Niethammer quotes a text by Heiner Müller where he reconsiders Benjamin's image of the 'Angel of History', writing,

²⁸ Lucia Boldrini, *Autobiographies of Others: Historical Subjects and Literary Fiction* (London: Routledge, 2012), p. 23.

The past is washed up behind him and debris rains down on his wings and shoulders, with the sound of funeral drums. Meanwhile the future piles up before him, presses his eyes in their sockets, bursts his eyeballs like a stone, turns his words round into a mouth gag, chokes him with his own breath. For a while longer the beating of his wings can still be seen, the rocks can be heard crashing down behind him, his futile movements become louder and more violent, from time to time, if slower.²⁹

This passage intensifies Benjamin's vision of historical time, the angel of history a victim of the violence of the historical process. Niethammer notices that in Müller's text, 'the beating of his wings can still be seen', as if the angel is the anticipated spectre of the end of this historical process. In Benjamin's formula and Müller's interpretation, there is a figuration of an idea of post-history, but this projected ending is a fictional representation formed within the historical process, itself now subsumed within history. Writing and historical reflection become part of history, as Benjamin's consideration of the mollusk indicated.³⁰ Posthumous fictions such as that by Saramago are attempts to accommodate or acknowledge history within the historical process, defying both the destruction of historical time and the forgetfulness that announces that history has ended. These fictions offer a historical time that includes re-imagination and reconstruction. Pessoa's own imagining of death engages with historical time as a form of pre-emptive incorporation, hoping this might offer the present a heightened sense of existence.

5. Death's space, historical time and masks within life writing

Pessoa's *The Book of Disquiet*, published after his death, offers a posthumous biographical revelation, as if knowing his papers would be made public. The space of death created within his writing allows for resurrections of heteronymed voices within it. *The Book of Disquiet* can be read as an illusion of death from the point of view of the living, housing encrypted selves of Pessoa. As a form of life writing, it anticipates or performs a posthumous life or presence, revealing something hidden in life that might only be known posthumously, as if mourning while conscious of the knowledge that his grasp of loss has given him.

²⁹ Heiner Müller, 'Glücksgott' (1958), quoted in Lutz Niethammer, *Posthistoire: Has History Come to an End?*, trans. by Patrick Camiller (London: Verso, 1992), p. 125.

³⁰ Benjamin, 2006, p. 98. I refer to this mollusk analogy in my Introduction (p. 24).

Lukacher writes, in relation to Paul Valéry, Marcel Proust and Stéphane Mallarmé that ‘half-mourning describes the fate of thinking where one is in part outside metaphysics but still under its spell... The veil of half-mourning is a kind of mask, and no less than the tragic mask of the ancient stage, it has a “magical function” linked to the ancestral rituals of death.’³¹ This function is a keeping-alive of the dead, while maintaining contact with death. Pessoa’s life writing presents a posthumous scene before death, as if possessed by death, historical time invading the present.

Maurice Blanchot gave the term ‘death’s space’ to a cryptic space which offers a site of resistance to or endurance of death, an afterlife. There life is kept alive, together with the possibility of revelation or accomplishment. Pessoa’s sense of death’s encrypting of life recalls Blanchot’s analysis of Franz Kafka:

Kafka’s heroes carry out their actions in death’s space, and that it is to the indefinite time of ‘dying’ that they belong. They are experiencing, feeling this strangeness out, and Kafka, in them, is also standing a test. But it seems to him that he won’t be able to bring it to a ‘happy conclusion’, draw from it a story and a work unless, in a certain way, he is in tune beforehand with the extreme moment of this trial – unless he is death’s equal.³²

‘Death’s space’ is the site where the author encounters death, encrypting it within their life. The author forms these crypts, death encrypted within the text. Blanchot shows how this is embodied in Kafka’s story ‘In the Penal Colony’, in which a crude writing machine’s harrow lowers on to a man’s body, barely touching his skin; it ‘appears to do its work with uniform regularity. As it quivers, its points pierce the skin of the body, which is itself quivering from the vibration of the Bed.’³³ Blanchot’s ‘indefinite time of “dying”’ includes the synchronous movement of the bed, like an elemental experience of the world, as well as the contigial experience of the piercing, a surgical, continuous rupture within consciousness that is integral to articulation within the body. Writing marks and mimics both an active and passive experience of dying.

Blanchot shows other ways in which death may be incorporated within writing, as he writes, with possible autobiographical resonances, as a young man facing a Nazi execution squad in the Second World War:

³¹ Lukacher, *Primal*, p. 90.

³² Maurice Blanchot, *The Space of Literature*, trans. by Ann Smock (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1982), p. 92.

³³ Franz Kafka, ‘In the Penal Colony’, in *Franz Kafka: The Complete Stories*, trans. by Willa and Edwin Muir (New York: Schocken Books, 1971), p. 147.

There remained, however, at the moment when the shooting was no longer but to come, the feeling of lightness that I would not know how to translate: freed from life? The infinite opening up? ... As if the death outside of him could only henceforth collide with the death in him. 'I am alive. No, you are dead.' ...All that remains is the feeling of lightness that is death itself or, to put it more precisely, the instant of my death henceforth always in abeyance.³⁴

His confrontation with the imminent possibility of death leaves as its legacy the continual state of being on the threshold of death, while keeping it 'always in abeyance.'

With death in abeyance, Pessoa's writing too is as if in a crypt, kept alive. He writes of objectifying his own body as if dead, 'I want to be a work of art, at least in my soul. That's why I've sculpted myself in quiet isolation and placed myself in a hothouse, cut off from fresh air and direct light – where the absurd flower of my artificiality can blossom in secluded beauty' (*Disquiet*, p. 106).

Death is a synonym of artifice for Pessoa, whose writing acts as a death mask, in an imitation or anticipation of death. The death mask within his writing is deceptive, however. Remove a mask, and we don't find the face of the dead. Instead, another face appears, belonging to another heteronym or another remembered self. The mask is acting not only as a prosthetic face, changing appearance, but it also represents the presences of other, hidden times. The heteronym, sometimes regarded, following Pessoa, as an author's imaginary persona, may also be considered in terms of multiple possible posthumous lives, haunting the author during their life. Writing as Ricardo Reis, Pessoa wrote this poem, evoking the divided nature of the self and memory, reminding us of the illusory image of a death mask:

Recalling who I was, I see somebody else.

In memory the past becomes the present.

Who I was is somebody I love,

Yet only in a dream.

The longing that torments me now

Is not from me nor by the past invoked,

But his who lives in me

Behind blind eyes.

³⁴ Blanchot, *The Instant of My Death*, trans. by Elizabeth Rottenberg (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2000), pp. 7-11.

Nothing knows me but the moment.
My own memory is nothing, and I feel

That who I am and who I was
Are two contrasting dreams.³⁵

These lines present us with both the sense of the self-encryption ('who lives in me') and the attempt at decryption ('who I am and who I was/Are two contrasting dreams'). The mask is part of the self, both its memory and its presence, a sign of an alternative temporality. This temporality is confused by interruptions of memory and the appearance of a posthumous self. The self that Pessoa writes about is composed of two dreams that erase and supplement each other. Pessoa's heteronyms are more than masks, or personae; they are as if voices of the selves that are dead or buried within the self. They speak of memories left behind, lost in the world, as he writes in the poem 'Whatever stops is death, and is our death':

In everything I saw, part of me remained.
With all I saw that moves I too move.
Nor does memory distinguish
What I saw from what I was.³⁶

Pessoa writes as if the world archives these impressions and the writer expresses them, as a sign or foretelling of the self's extinction. The heteronyms present these impressions as if from sensations and perceptions of the external world, rather than from their inner self. His autobiography gathers heterogeneous temporalities, the imagined sense of death unifying his life, as if posthumously.

Jean-Luc Nancy, discussing the European fascination with the death mask in the 1920s, writes on their complexity, of the dead looking as if presented alive, confronting death, as if their dying can be made explicable: 'The final effect of the death mask is to mask the imagination *itself*, even as it uncovers it as dead beneath the mask ... a secret that one unveils only by veiling it anew.'³⁷ He continues later: 'Beneath the mask, and from

³⁵ Fernando Pessoa, 'Recalling who I was, I see someone else', in *Poems of Fernando Pessoa*, trans. by Edwin Honig and Susan M. Brown (San Francisco: City Lights Books, 1998), p. 137.

³⁶ Pessoa, 'Whatever stops is death, and is our death', *Poems*, p. 136.

³⁷ Jean-Luc Nancy, *The Ground of the Image*, trans. by Jeff Fort (New York: Fordham University Press, 2005), p. 97; Nancy, pp. 91-92, refers to the publication in Berlin in 1926 of *Das ewige Antlitz* ('Undying Faces') by Ernst Benckard, a collection of photos of death masks of well-known figures including Ludwig van Beethoven.

the bottom of the dead gaze flowing back through the entire body... the imagination not beneath its mask but as the living-dead body of the mask itself, entering the scene in order to withdraw from it' (*Ground*, p. 98). Death's space here is a place of affect, the dead appearing sentient, in the present.

The death mask operates as an encryption masquerading as a portrait of a life 'entering the scene in order to withdraw from it.' This presents the task of how to interpret or decrypt historical memory, demanding the reader to look beyond visible appearances, to what might be found behind the mask. The mask points not to another face, but another time. Referring to the 'Greek *prosōpon* and the Latin *persona*', Lukacher refers to how masks

signify the inseparable connection between the theatrical and the chthonian... between taking on the voice of the other and mourning. In assuming the voice of the dead, the masked actor performs an act of half-mourning, reminding the audience not only that the voice that speaks is already dead but also that it lives on behind the mask. With each utterance the voice announces that it is neither properly dead nor alive but somewhere between the two.³⁸

This analysis applies to Pessoa's use of heteronyms, including how he articulates the presence of death and posthumous temporality within *The Book of Disquiet*. His writing describes how posthumousness is embedded in everyday life, his sense of death and lost presence being part of his self knowledge. He writes: 'There are figures from the past and living images from books that are more real to us than the incarnate indifferences that talk to us over shop counters, or happen to glance at us in the trams, or brush against us in the dead happenstance of the streets' (*Disquiet*, p. 267).

Pessoa writes as if to know oneself is as if oneself was dead, consciousness rendered as an artefact to be described, not just to be animated. This sense of self suggests how life enters the world as historical memory, as Pessoa writes as Ricardo Reis:

Whatever stops is death, and is our death
If it stops for us. That very shrub now
Withering, takes with it
Part of my present life.³⁹

Pessoa takes us into a temporality of impressions and residual effects, presence being the dissipation of sensation into the world, escaping into things; the presence of the self

³⁸ Lukacher, *Primal*, p. 90.

³⁹ Pessoa, 'Whatever stops is death, and is our death', *Poems*, p. 136.

is a recognition of this mingling and intertwining of times: ‘We are who we’re not, and life is quick and sad. The sound of the waves at night is a sound of the night, and how many have heard it in their own soul, like the perpetual hope that dissolves in the darkness with a faint splash of distant foam! (*Disquiet*, pp. 92-93). These lines describe presence as a wave of times emerging and dissolving, a sensation both external and internal, as temporalities are brought together in this dynamic movement: ‘And all this, in my walk to the seashore, was a secret told me by the night and the abyss. How many we are!... What seas crash in us, in the night when we exist, along the beaches we feel ourselves to be, inundated by emotion!’ (*Disquiet*, p. 93).

Pessoa’s incorporation of external realities shows how his voice takes on forms beyond his own sense of time; memories belong to the exterior world that he signifies here in terms of the nocturnal, referring to ‘all the memories we took for emotions; and the entire ocean, noisy and cool, rolling in from the depths of the vast night to ripple over the beach, during my nocturnal walk to the seashore’ (*Disquiet*, p. 93). In this way, his self mingles with the other, including death; Pessoa reimagines historical memory, simulating it as if it was alive, presented within a posthumous scene, giving voice to what has been or will be lost.

Pessoa’s pursuit of the historical via what is encrypted or buried is portrayed as a drama of masks, as he writes (*Disquiet*, p. 356),

... the mask I’d been staring at as it talked on a street corner with an unmasked man on this last night of Carnival finally held out its hand and laughingly said goodbye. The natural-faced man turned left down the street at whose corner he’d been standing. The mask – an uninteresting one – walked straight ahead, disappearing among shadows and occasional lights in a definitive farewell, extraneous to what I was thinking...

The mask conceals the interior and unconscious, yet betrays its own presence. Pessoa makes interiors visible in his autobiographical narrative, where death is incorporated but made part of lived time, made performative. The performance engages with historical time as something that appears completed and yet in his writing it is ongoing, posthumously. Pessoa creates this strange drama in which life and death fold into each other, historical time transformed by a sense of posthumous temporality.

The reader is drawn in by these dramatized processes into the world of the narrator, into death’s space. The presence of death in fictional narrative or life writing may reinforce the reader’s sense of survival; while being in contact, cryptically, with the historical time of the dead, the reader senses how writing incorporates the past.

However, the present's incorporation of the knowledge of the dead is a performative future anterior, Pessoa's writing an imagined death mask, a posthumous temporality imagined before death.

6. Prosopopoeia, posthumous scenes and the pursuit of encrypted historical time

Lukacher develops his commentary on prosopopoeia in relation to de Man's essay 'Shelley Disfigured', quoting de Man's reference to the 'endless prosopopoeia by which the dead are made to have a face and a voice which tells the allegory of their demise and allows us to apostrophize them in our turn.'⁴⁰ Here Lukacher connects the posthumous and the primal through language, writing that 'prosopopoeia stages what has always been the primal scene of analytic understanding: namely, the return of the dead and the haunting recollection of forgotten voices and incorporated selves. Prosopopoeia stages the fundamental relation of the subject to voice' (*Primal*, p. 92).

Pessoa's engagement with posthumous temporality brings together masked voices and hidden temporalities. In his writing, primal memories operate in relation to posthumousness, early voices and sensations being made historical, as if after death. While we cannot see beneath Pessoa's mask, he shows how early memories might be brought back in relation to posthumousness, which keeps the memory of them alive. His writing possesses a temporal presence, while he negates this at the same time, imagining life in the light of death in which things forever await completion if only through remembrance: 'I'm the ruins of buildings that were never more than ruins, whose builder, halfway through, got tired of thinking about what he was building.'⁴¹ Pessoa gives presence to death and ruin, romanticizing and eulogizing that which appears to have a sense of disappearing, having been lost or hidden away. His descriptions of his own writing are illuminated with this sense of encryption: 'When I write, I pay myself a solemn visit. I have special chambers, remembered by someone else in the interstices of my imagining, where I take delight in analysing what I don't feel, and I examine myself like a picture in a dark corner' (*Disquiet*, p. 286).

Pessoa situates himself between a posthumous perspective and primal memories, his life written as if from a point of having died while seeking origins of his sense of historical time. He is visiting himself as if from the outside, 'remembered by

⁴⁰ de Man, 'Shelley Disfigured', p. 122.

⁴¹ Pessoa, *Disquiet*, pp. 61-62.

someone else' but as if imagined by himself, a self portrait appearing like a photo not wholly developed. He writes: 'I'm a perpetual unfolding of images, connected or disconnected but always pretending to be external, situated among people in the daylight, if I'm awake, or among phantoms in the non-light that illumines dreams, if I'm asleep' (*Disquiet*, p. 287). His writing encrypts and decrypts his life, incorporating death and showing the generative qualities of death's space, reimagining and multiplying narratives, resurrecting past voices and figures while creating new phantom-like posthumous lives.

While Pessoa's autobiography crosses over with thanatography, including a sense of the posthumous, it also animates historical memory. He isn't only concerned with death, but with the wider sense of cryptic forms within lives and how the past may be reimagined. His fictional autobiography, including lived and imaginary elements, recalls de Man's questioning of Philippe Lejeune⁴² about autobiography as a representational, empirical form. De Man describes 'how the study of autobiography is caught in this double motion, the necessity to escape from the topology of the subject and the equally inevitable reinscription of this necessity within a specular model of cognition.'⁴³ Study of Pessoa's life writing demands reconsideration of how we consider autobiography, encompassing his use of heteronyms and embrace of death and posthumousness. He remains elusive, unmirrored, yet he offers ways to understand how his masks and different identities form a palimpsest of selves.

Pessoa's fictional autobiography engages with historical time, through the vehicle of a self that is haunted, troubled and alienated. His writing animates the crypts of his historical memory, bringing the temporality of hidden forms to life, revealing a present time in which spectral presences create scenes of posthumous temporality, as if he is repossessing historical time. Commenting on Benjamin's writing, Gerhard Richter states: 'The subject's gaze is directed toward the ephemeral ghost that haunts it. It keeps pace with it and even passes through walls, those monuments to changelessness and solidity.'⁴⁴ Pessoa gives voice to these ephemeral ghosts, giving them developed roles to play in his writing.

⁴² Philippe Lejeune is author of *The Autobiographical Pact* (1975) and numerous other works on autobiography.

⁴³ de Man, 'Autobiography', p. 72.

⁴⁴ Gerhard Richter, 'Introduction: Benjamin's Ghosts', in *Benjamin's Ghosts: Interventions in Contemporary Literature and Cultural Theory*, ed. by Gerhard Richter (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2002), p. 5.

Autobiography, fictional or non-fictional, creates a privileged space where traces of other selves might be revealed and kept alive. Robert Smith writes that: ‘Autobiography is both the narrowing of the space between the subject and object, discourse and theme, but also the opening of a new space, a scene of writing which is more potent than its so-called agents or institutors.’⁴⁵ This ‘new space’ engages with lived time via a posthumous perspective in which historical time is reimagined and primal memories can be worked through. In this space, writers, ‘envisaging their own position of control, are nonetheless granted that position by virtue of an inaccessible but original simulacrum which dominates them, where “death by writing also inaugurates life”’.⁴⁶

The authority and presence of death in writing begins during the writer’s life, as Benjamin writes in ‘The Storyteller’: ‘Death is the sanction of everything that the storyteller can tell. He has borrowed his authority from death.’⁴⁷ The authority referred to is the knowledge of historical time gained in relation to death. Pessoa reimagines the presence of death and historical time in life writing, showing how narrative can incorporate posthumousness, restructuring the historical time of the subject. This restructuring is found in more traditional approaches to biography too. Benjamin writes: ‘A man ... who died at thirty-five will appear to *remembrance* at every point in his life as a man who dies at the age of thirty-five ... the ‘meaning’ of his life is revealed only in his death’ (‘Storyteller’, pp. 99-100). This knowledge of death changes the definition of a life, and a reader’s relationship to a narrative of the past.

The reader is drawn by the sense of death, of a narrative’s posthumousness, and also to the historical time of a life via the text’s recuperation of sensations and memories of the dead character. These presences of death are part of life writing, including biographies written after the death of the subject. Benjamin notes how the reader of a novel is consumed by characters’ experience of death – ‘if need be their figurative death – the end of the novel – but preferably their actual one’ (‘Storyteller’, p. 100).

Incorporations and encryptions of death within narrative develop our understandings of historical time and how meaning is created posthumously, including in fictional narrative, such as Saramago’s novel on Pessoa. Smith writes that ‘the other’s

⁴⁵ Robert Smith, *Derrida and Autobiography* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), pp. 136.

⁴⁶ Smith, *Derrida*, pp. 136-137, quoting Derrida, *Of Grammatology*, trans. by Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1976), p. 143.

⁴⁷ Benjamin, ‘The Storyteller’, p. 93.

mortality establishes the minimal condition for my life and autobiography,⁴⁸ and it is this recognition of and engagement with death that informs narrative understandings of historical time beyond a traditional record or chronicle.

Benjamin's understanding of historical time is set within a framework of destruction, disruption and disenchantment. History is incomplete, never ending, but more than a process of becoming. The formation of historical time is one of remembering, reconstructing, and re-presencing. His critique of history subverts historical materialism, focusing on processes of disintegration and eruption. The 'Angel of History' looks back at the destructive force of history, seeking a sense of historical time that reconciles the catastrophe with its potential and what survives, writing that 'The angel would like to stay, awaken the dead, and make whole what has been smashed.'⁴⁹

Benjamin's observations in 'The Storyteller' show how the writer can be engaged with both a concept of history and time, including understanding or reconceiving of historical time, incorporating elements that might otherwise be hidden within lived time. Agamben writes that 'Every conception of history is invariably accompanied by a certain experience of time',⁵⁰ and Benjamin's interpretation of history relies on his recognition and incorporation of death within an understanding of narrative temporality. Pessoa's versions of time suggest a conception of history that possesses the present through his anticipation and experience of death, but also through his acknowledgement of primal memory and the unconscious.

Lukacher engages with Benjamin's ideas, noting his focus 'unrelentingly on the role of language in the effort of retrieving the originary, the primordial, and the pre-historical.'⁵¹ Lukacher's reinterpretation of the primal scene includes his understanding of the historical place of the unconscious, showing how primal memories persist within language and experiences of lived time. He demonstrates this in his analysis of the repeated presentation of primal memory within Charles Dickens' novels, particularly *David Copperfield* (1850)⁵² and of Freud's interest in Dickens' presentation of childhood memory (*Primal*, pp. 330-336).

Narrative concern for primal memories highlighted by Lukacher is a strong

⁴⁸ Smith, *Derrida*, p. 139.

⁴⁹ Benjamin, 'Theses', p. 249.

⁵⁰ Agamben, *Infancy*, p. 99.

⁵¹ Lukacher, *Primal*, p. 277.

⁵² *Ibid.*, pp. 290-330.

theme in Saramago's *The Year of the Death of Ricardo Reis*. Saramago creates a posthumous biography for Pessoa, while also giving life to one of Pessoa's heteronymic doubles, Ricardo Reis. Saramago's incorporation of these two characters continues Pessoa's development of the posthumous scene and how it might inform how the self relates to historical time. Saramago reimagines Pessoa's sense of his multiple self and the role of the mask, appearing to unmask Pessoa, making him live posthumously within a historical time in which Pessoa's vision of death within life is turned inside out.

7. Posthumous temporality and cryptic historical time within Saramago's *The Year of the Death of Ricardo Reis*

Pessoa's writing was part of an evolving tradition of how the voice of the dead might be incorporated within narrative, which had developed in both fiction and life writing. In the late 19th century, the posthumous novel and new forms of life writing emerged that explored death's space and re-imagined dead selves buried in the past, of both the living, in autobiographical writing, and of the novel or biography in the narration of the dead. Such writing includes the Brazilian writer Joaquim Maria Machado de Assis' *Epitaph of a Small Winner* (originally published in 1881; also known as *The Posthumous Memoirs of Brás Cubas*).

This novel describes a new profane, cryptic space of the dead in fiction, of death in suspension, as imagined in posthumous narratives. Machado de Assis writes: 'I am a deceased writer not in the sense of one who has written and is now deceased, but in the sense of one who has died and is now writing, a writer for whom the grave was really a new cradle.'⁵³ In this line, one senses whole new cryptic worlds opening up to fiction. The crypt appears to be decrypted, while the reader is encrypted, drawn into death's fictional space.

Other narratives of posthumous lives develop this same effect, for example Pamuk's *My Name is Red*, a novel caught between encryption and decryption: 'I am nothing but a corpse now, a body at the bottom of a well. Though I drew my last breath long ago and my heart has stopped beating, no one, apart from that vile murderer, knows what happened to me.'⁵⁴ The narrative is being presented as a crypt, the narrator

⁵³ Joaquim Maria Machado de Assis, *Epitaph of a Small Winner*, trans. by William L. Grossman (London: Bloomsbury, 1997), p. 5.

⁵⁴ Pamuk, *My Name is Red*, trans. by Erdag M. Goknar (London: Faber and Faber, 2001), p. 3.

decrypting the past, including buried historical selves, revivifying archives of memory and reimagining possible futures and lost voices of dead figures, while also encrypting them within a new imaginary narrative of historical memory.

Pessoa's writing has resonances with many other modern writers, including W. B. Yeats, Walt Whitman and Wallace Stevens, as explored in the essay collection *Fernando Pessoa's Modernity Without Frontiers: Influences, Dialogues, Responses* (2013).⁵⁵ This ongoing resonance is manifested in the new life given to him by Saramago in *The Year of the Death of Ricardo Reis*. In this novel, Pessoa is imagined alive as dead, incorporating posthumous temporalities that defy normal burial or encryption. The novel imagines the return of one of Pessoa's heteronyms (Ricardo Reis) to Lisbon, where he meets the phantasmal figure of Pessoa who has been brought back to life. The fiction appears to encrypt historical memory within narrative, using the space of Pessoa's death to return to his life. The two main characters meet in Lisbon, their posthumous extension allowing the reader access to Pessoa at the border of life and death, and to Reis, who, still physically manifest, has returned home from Brazil upon hearing of Pessoa's death. The novel uses death's space and shows how historical time might be imagined within it. The fictional Reis says to the fictional Pessoa that, 'the more I think about it, I believe I came back here only because you died, it's as if I alone can fill the void you left behind.'⁵⁶ Pessoa's death creates this space to which Saramago is drawn to, as if he is following, or adopting the position of Reis.

Writing on Saramago's novel, David Frier notes that Reis has an 'unwillingness to let go of the past,'⁵⁷ as if the novel should not be oriented towards the historical, which appears to be the narrative focus. Pessoa's death is used by Saramago to revisit history, using the afterlife as a point of understanding conflicting senses of historical time. The time of Saramago's narrative mediates between the posthumous point of view, primal elements of Pessoa's life and a reimagined historical time, set within 1930s Portugal. The novel's posthumous scene returns to an origin (Reis to Lisbon and his creator Pessoa), and also to the void in the aftermath of Pessoa's death. In this void, Saramago brings together elements of the historical life that Pessoa wrote in *The Book of Disquiet*.

⁵⁵ *Fernando Pessoa's Modernity Without Frontiers: Influences, Dialogues, Responses*, ed. by Mariana Gray de Castro (Suffolk: Boydell & Brewer, 2013).

⁵⁶ Saramago, *Year*, p. 65.

⁵⁷ David Frier, *The Novels of José Saramago: Echoes From the Past, Pathways Into the Future* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2007), p. 186.

Pessoa's conversation is as if taken from *The Book of Disquiet*, for example, near the end of the novel, Pessoa comments to Reis: 'What is interesting is not that a dead man should dream he is alive, after all he has known life, he has something to dream about, but rather that a man who is alive should dream that he is dead, because he has never known death' (*Year*, p. 239).

In both the *The Book of Disquiet* and Saramago's novel, Pessoa lives both of these anomalous situations, while also becoming a fictionalised dead man being imagined as alive while encountering his alternative persona after death. The novel approaches Pessoa as someone who has been encrypted, both alive and dead, Saramago's Pessoa saying that 'No living person can substitute for a dead one. None of us is truly alive or truly dead.' (*Year*, p. 65).

Saramago's use of posthumousness articulates through Reis an idea of death's space around Pessoa which offers a place of narration, a void or cryptic site for reimagining historical time. Ideas of encryption within narrative are explored by Castricano, who writes on cryptomimesis within writing, describing how, 'drawing upon such figures as the crypt, the phantom, and the living-dead, cryptomimesis utilizes and foregrounds the dynamics of haunting and mourning to produce an autobiographical deconstructive writing through the trope of the "live burial."' ⁵⁸ Through the creation of posthumous lives in fiction, Saramago finds access to these crypts via imaginative reconstructions, in part to decrypt them, or at least giving the appearance of doing so, while also creating new crypts of historical memory.

Saramago imagines a dead person (Pessoa) being dreamt of as if he is alive, but on the verge of death. The posthumous scene of the novel dramatises conflicting analeptic and proleptic movements of time, Saramago imagining an afterlife so that he can return to Pessoa's life. His imaginary, posthumous portrait of Pessoa operates in similar ways to Ozick's *The Messiah of Stockholm* (which focuses on a posthumous life of Schulz), Grossman's *See: Under Love* (also imagining a posthumous life of Schulz) and Bruno Appiah's *The Angel of History* (imagining the final days of Walter Benjamin before his suicide on the France/Spain border). These fictions have comparable narrative structures, set in imagined historical times, enabling the reader to approach death via crypts of historical memory, biographical narratives and posthumous perspectives. The novels develop death's presence within narrative, demonstrating and incorporating ideas of cryptic and historical time.

⁵⁸ Castricano, *Cryptomimesis*, p. 8.

Death's presence in autobiographical writing is found throughout Pessoa's work, as if he is encrypting ideas of selves that are more than a shadow, imaginary, alternative or twin self. Saramago's novel incorporates versions of these historical selves and spectres within it, encrypting them within an imagined historical time, so that his fiction may then appear to decrypt them. Saramago offers a quasi-naturalistic version of the phantasmal Pessoa, developing a new presence of the posthumous in literature. Pessoa is encrypted via the text that also animates him, bringing him back to life in relation to historical time. In its pursuit of history, the novel decrypts and reorders recovered meanings, re-imagining historical time. While Nietzsche claims a rarefied status for 'the posthumous people', Derrida describes the related existence of phantoms within the text as characterizing all literature, remarking: '... perhaps in every text there is a dead man or woman to be sought, the singular figure of death to which a text is destined.'⁵⁹

Saramago's version of Pessoa is introduced with descriptions of his being, invisible but casting a shadow:

Fernando Pessoa rose from the sofa, paced a little, then paused in front of the bedroom mirror before returning to the sitting room. [Pessoa:] It gives me an odd feeling to look in the mirror and not see myself there, [Reis:] Don't you see yourself, [Pessoa:] No, I know that I am looking at myself, but I see nothing, [Reis:] Yet you cast a shadow, [Pessoa:] It's all I possess. He sat down again and crossed his legs.⁶⁰

This posthumous portrait of Pessoa presents a figurative re-ordering, disrupting historical memory and time. Saramago mimics historical time while reducing Pessoa to a phantom. He shows how fiction may create the void which Pessoa's heteronym invades, dramatizes and becomes possessed by. The posthumous scenes of the novel appear to revive the material self that was erased in Pessoa's autobiography, creating a new sense of Pessoa's historical time. The novel nurtures an embryonic Pessoa within the posthumous scene, the combination of the primordial and posthumous being like Beckett's 'Unnamable'. In the posthumous nine months, Saramago portrays Pessoa not only as the living dead, but as what might be reborn from what has been buried and encrypted.

⁵⁹ Derrida, *Specters of Marx: The State of the Debt, the Work of Mourning & the New International*, trans. by Peggy Kamuf (London: Routledge, 1994), p. 53.

⁶⁰ Pessoa, *Disquiet*, p. 65.

8. Crypts of historical time within fictional posthumous scenes

Saramago's dramatization of Pessoa divides his self into its basic elements, being and existing, which Saramago's Pessoa asserts 'are not the same thing.'⁶¹ Death is part of being, not existence and Saramago shows how being erupts within existence; through this eruption of historical time he returns to primordial memories, showing how historical time is silently being nurtured within us: 'Inside the body, too, there is a profound darkness, yet the blood reaches the heart, the brain is sightless yet can see... Clearly man is trapped in his own labyrinth' (*Year*, p. 78), he writes. Saramago's encryption of historical being within the novel shows how complex versions of historical time may be developed within fiction, including how he incorporates and represents aspects of Pessoa's historic self within the fictional narrative.

The search for crypts within narrative, described by Abraham and Torok, looks at how language conceals the past. Similarly, a novelist may decrypt and animate historical memory, uncovering time past including primal memories hidden within the unconscious, establishing a sense of historical time through a posthumous temporality. Decryption by the narrator leads to a new encryption, as Saramago's novel shows, for the novel creates a new crypt of the past, the body of Pessoa re-enshrined, re-encrypted, repeating the signature posthumous act within death's space.

We recall again Rodinsky's encryption within Lichtenstein and Sinclair's text and how they reimagine his life, as if keeping him alive, as Freud also tries to do with Moses. Abraham and Torok offer further ways of thinking about encryption, both as an active and a preservational process. Their preservational theory, in which the past is protected, as if to be refound, presents a concept of historical memory that the posthumous novel uses in its awakening of the past. They refer to

a memory... buried *without legal buried place*. The memory is of an idyll, experienced with a valued object and yet for some reason unspeakable. It is memory entombed in a fast and secure place, awaiting resurrection. Between the idyllic moment and its subsequent forgetting (we have called the latter "preservative repression"), there was the metapsychological traumatism of a loss, or more precisely, the "loss" that resulted from a traumatism.⁶²

Abraham and Torok describe here a form of buried historical time, in part illicit because a live burial is by its nature illegal, assuming that burial leads to death. Their burial is a

⁶¹ Saramago, *Year*, p. 75.

⁶² Abraham and Torok, *The Shell and the Kernel*, trans. by Nicholas Rand (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994), p. 141.

form of survival though; the crypt, classical, gothic or modern, while hidden or invisible, is not beyond life: it remains alive, within historical time, as if awaiting decryption. We may seek this life in biographical writing about the dead, or posthumous writing in which the dead are imagined alive, like Saramago's recuperation of Pessoa.

As I referred to in Chapter 1 in relation to *Rodinsky's Room*, Derrida wrote that: 'The inhabitant of a crypt is always a living dead, a dead entity we are perfectly willing to keep alive, but *as* dead, one we are willing to keep, as long as we keep it, within us, intact in any way save as living.'⁶³ Saramago's version of Pessoa is as this 'living dead', incorporating and incorporated by historical time. Saramago's narrator appears to enter the archive, a new cryptic presence who decrypts, offering a new imagining of historical time and its development. The crypt is alive, holding a hidden historical time that is told from within the posthumous scene.

After death, multiple shapes of a writer's life can be reformed and redrawn, sometimes after the dissemination of unpublished works, as well as writing on the author published after their death. These works offer both new encryptions and possible keys to the writers and their work. Consider Pessoa's writing posthumously published but also other corpus- and life-altering works such as Kafka's *Diaries* and Virginia Woolf's *Between the Acts*, and also Ted Hughes' *Birthday Letters*, published in the author's final months. These dramatically reordered their author's known biographies, hinting at the secret life held within crypts of historical time.

Saramago's version of Pessoa forces us to consider aspects of his life that Pessoa's writing repressed, including his relationship to historical time. The posthumous scenes within the novel attempt to reconcile hidden or conflicting forms of temporality, using fictional versions of Pessoa and Reis to explore these. Historical time is presented from the perspective of a fictional posthumous time. From the position 'on the edge of death', Boldrini argues, 'the "double I" can both speak and dramatize the desire of reconciliation.'⁶⁴ This reconciliation of self and world, of language and self-consciousness can be made to appear to occur in this posthumous scene. She later notes that, 'The "double I" of heterobiography allows the writer to bring into the open what autobiography always implies: that as speaking, consciously self-reflexive and self-narrating human beings, we are condemned to self-division' (*Autobiographies*, p. 47).

⁶³ Derrida, Foreword, *Wolf*, p. xxi.

⁶⁴ Boldrini, *Autobiographies*, p. 23.

Saramago's exploration of self-division encompasses more than the multiple personae, masks, and identities of Pessoa. His novel incorporates both the posthumous Pessoa and his heteronym Ricardo Reis in a way that brings various temporalities together through his imagining of historical time. Boldrini comments further on self-division that 'if autobiography appears to want to overcome that gap, heterobiography privileges and exploits it in order to engage the "I" in a dialogue that goes beyond the wish for reunion, to probe deeper into the ways that we construct the human subject' (*Autobiographies*, p. 47). The construction of the human subject includes its relation to historical time, and Boldrini considers temporal division and resolution in relation to Pessoa, writing on Antonio Tabucchi's fictional version of Pessoa in 'The Last Three Days of Fernando Pessoa', reflecting on how this fictional biography offers an opening of narrative into another version of his life.

Boldrini describes heterobiography as the 'wandering out of one's identity into another's; a kind of lucid madness, a working outside or beyond the furrows of reason' (*Autobiographies*, p. 12). In Tabucchi's story, Pessoa says to one of his heteronyms, Alberto Caeiro: '...I needed a guide and a coagulant – I don't know if I am making myself clear – otherwise my life would have shattered into pieces. Thanks to you I found cohesion.'⁶⁵ As Boldrini notes, Pessoa 'found cohesion in splitting himself into multiple personae.'⁶⁶ However, it is a complex cohesion, the posthumous narrative opening up conflicting elements of Pessoa's character.

Saramago's portrayal of the fictional Pessoa and Reis are presented in a stereoscopic style, as if using two simultaneous representations to create a truer image of the posthumous Pessoa within the fictional crypt. It is as if they mutually confirm each other's existence. Saramago writes of Reis finding Pessoa in his hotel room:

They look at each other with affection, obviously happy to be reunited after years of separation, and it is Fernando Pessoa who speaks first, I believe you came to visit me, I wasn't there, but they told me when I got back. Ricardo Reis replied, I was sure I'd find you there, never imagining you could leave that place. Fernando Pessoa said, For the time being it's allowed.⁶⁷

The scene reflects Boldrini's diagnosis of self division, and also portrays the role of doubling within an exploration of historical time, as I explored in the previous chapter.

⁶⁵ Antonio Tabucchi. 'The Last Three Days of Fernando Pessoa', in *Dreams of Dreams*, trans. by Nancy J. Peters (San Francisco: City Lights, 1992), p. 101.

⁶⁶ Boldrini, *Autobiographies*, p. 12.

⁶⁷ Saramago, *Year*, p. 64.

While there is a rediscovery of a lost origin in their meeting (in terms of Reis's origin within Pessoa), there is also a reconciliation between the primal and the posthumous. Reis, a double, and the dead Pessoa are more than departing spirits taking on an imagined historical form. Saramago makes a narrative crypt out of Pessoa's life in which historical time is investigated in relation to Pessoa's world.

The quasi-historical realism of Saramago's narrative of Pessoa and Reis contrasts with the Pessoa of *The Book of Disquiet* and the poet Reis, of whom we have only known of his poetry previously. In Lisbon, Reis stays in a hotel, where his presence has been alerted to state authorities for suspicious behaviour. It is a politically sensitive time in Portugal, especially with civil war in Spain, and Reis cannot explain his sudden presence in Lisbon. A government agent begins to follow Reis, watching him closely, leading to formal interrogation. In the hotel, Reis (*Year*, p. 166),

overhears as guests converse over dinner, or he reads in the newspapers. Hotbeds of dissent, the wave of propaganda launched by Communists, anarchists, and trade unionists, which is infiltrating the working classes and has even influenced members of the army and the navy. We can now understand [they say] why Ricardo Reis was summoned by the Police Department for State Security and Defense.

It is as if Reis, a double of Pessoa, has, after Pessoa's death, found a new historical time. Posthumously, he enters the historical crypt that Saramago constructs within his fiction, the posthumous scene in which the historical time of the epic threatens to take over, replacing the void created by Pessoa's death. The civil-war-fleeing Spanish bourgeoisie are finding refuge in the hotel, praising the qualities of António de Oliveira Salazar, the Portuguese dictator, stating that he is what Spain needs too. Reis has, in his personal quest for Pessoa, become caught up in a historical crisis and risks being drawn into a vortex of politically significant events.

Saramago's narration of the historical moment reframes the failed opposition to Salazar as a historical accident (of which Reis becomes a witness and participant), historical time being reimagined via this posthumous scene. The fictional narrative dramatises historical memory, inserting fictional time within historical time. In the return to history via the fictive, new meanings are imposed on and encrypted within (and read into) history. The posthumous scene imagines a historical time within a new framework of meaning; Pessoa's portrait is redrawn, and he is given a new sense of his own historical time, in which he appears spectrally, together with his heteronym.

9. Encrypted historical time and the sublime of posthumous temporality

Saramago's novel captures cryptic presences of the dead; his use of death's space has its own rules, codes of mortality and evidence of time passing. In his posthumous state, Pessoa is in a state of gradual disappearance: '...one whole side of the face loses its outline, which is only to be expected, because almost six months have passed since Fernando Pessoa's death. I see less and less of you these days, Ricardo Reis complained' (*Year*, p. 285). As Pessoa fades, so historical time appears to be taking over. Lukacher refers to Barthes' sense of fading:

"The Fading of Voices" is Barthes' version of this primal scene in the history of modern textuality... Barthes imagines the "fading of voices," the "fading" of the subject, as a disappearance behind the watery luminescence of the *moiré* effect. What appears to be a glittering revelation turns out to be a secret concealment.⁶⁸

Lukacher's interpretation suggests that Barthes' 'secret concealment' is to be found behind the text, but the hiddenness is more subtle for 'the *moiré* effect, like writing, is a textual effect, a weaving of voices that discloses and conceals at the same time' (*Primal*, p. 72). This effect is the appearance of contrasting patterns, whose mutual interference creates an animated visual effect, both revealing and concealing. Barthes' use of the English word 'fading' is translated as 'dissolve' in Richard Miller's 1974 translation of *S/Z*.⁶⁹ In this book analyzing Honoré de Balzac's short story 'Sarrasine', Barthes considers the surface complexity of language and voices emergent within the modern narrative text in which multiple subjects are made present through language. In the interweaving and folding of voices, presences become concealed through overleafing. Presencing and absencing of voices creates patterns of language which the reader must attune to, for 'In modern texts... the discourse, or better, the language, speaks: nothing more.'⁷⁰

Saramago plays with the fading and resounding dead voices of Reis and Pessoa in *A Year of the Death of Ricardo Reis*; with the gradual posthumous nine-month fading of Pessoa. As the novel progresses, Saramago develops the intensity of historical time, as if it might be causing Pessoa's fading or his disappearance behind the appearances of

⁶⁸ Lukacher, *Primal*, p. 72.

⁶⁹ Barthes, *S/Z: An Essay*, trans. by Richard Miller (New York: Hill and Wang, 1974), p. 41. Lukacher notes how Barthes' use of 'fading' derives from Jacques Lacan's reference to the fading of the voice or subject (*Primal*, p. 71).

⁷⁰ Barthes, *S/Z*, p. 41.

historical time. Pessoa is aware of his ambiguous status, and speculates that perhaps the government agent can see him, because ‘certain people among the living have eyes that can see the invisible.’⁷¹

The narrator, using the authority borrowed from death, seizes hold of the encrypted past, imagining the early years of fascist dictatorship in Portugal, with Reis being pursued by a government agent. Historical time’s emergence within the novel and the imprinting of Pessoa’s imagined posthumous life within it offers a new idea of historical totality as Reis and Pessoa possess the narrative present, historical time emerging through their encounter.

Saramago uses Pessoa’s posthumous scenes to encrypt his life further, his novel and Pessoa’s fictionalized autobiography offering the phantoms of his life a new existence, an afterlife, as historical time is reimagined and retold. Tambling, writing on Nietzsche’s idea of the retroactive force, comments on how this ‘creates the posthumous – where the ‘fact’ is changed into something historical, by which it gains the power of an image.’⁷² Through Saramago’s fiction we sense how a narrative may appear historical, giving new life to memory that might otherwise be hidden.

Tambling’s sense of ‘becoming posthumous’ is a recognition of how things appear to become historical after death, including how following a writer’s death, every text may appear to become a form of life writing, every literary trace a sign or fragment of the life that the text now survives. Texts become encrypted within the life, giving to a life what death (with its various accomplices) appears to have hidden. The posthumous scenes of Pessoa present hidden and the sublime spectres of lost historical time, resurrecting ghosts of literature and history. While Pessoa writes about the absence of self from time in *The Book of Disquiet*, Saramago provides cryptic spaces for spectres within historical life, normalizing the spectre within fictive simulations of history, as the imaginary Reis returns home to meet Pessoa’s ghost in Lisbon.

Saramago’s novel creates a posthumous temporality within the void of the dead Pessoa, developing the relationship between the encrypted life and the fictional memory of the life, producing a new reflection on historical time. The voices of the characters are dead and yet live, coming from outside the dead body, as if the scene is outside history while mimicking it. Reis represents the return of a primal element living within

⁷¹ Saramago, *Year*, p. 286.

⁷² Tambling, *Becoming*, p. 123. Nietzsche writes: ‘Every great human being exerts a retroactive force: for his sake all of history is put on the scale again, and a thousand secrets of the past crawl of their hiding places – into his sunshine’, *Science*, 2001, p. 53.

the posthumous temporality. As discussed earlier in my Introduction (p. 25), Ozick refers to the ‘posthumous sublime’⁷³ in relation to the writing of Sebald, reflecting a fictional approach to history that represents a new engagement with historical memory. As Saramago’s novel shows, in re-imagining historical memory, fiction may incorporate historical time in a process of both animation and new encryption.

10. Posthumous scenes, the unconscious and death’s space in Saramago’s fictional construction of historical time

Pessoa’s and Reis’ appearances reveal a break in historical time, as if this posthumous rupture is opening historical memory. Saramago’s attempt to rescue the historical subject of Pessoa from encryption creates a voice that has escaped death, erupting into narrative. The posthumous narrative imagines Pessoa’s escape from the crypt, an exteriorisation of hidden desire for historical time and presence, while also announcing the absence itself within the crypt. Derrida notes that the crypt commemorates ‘not the object itself, but its exclusion, the exclusion of a specific desire... A door is silently sealed off like a condemned passageway inside the Self’.⁷⁴ The posthumous novel marks the attempt to bring this desire for historical time.

Saramago creates the narrative crypt in order to bring that which has been encrypted back within history and historical consciousness. He gives Pessoa a sense of historical time, as if the result of analytic retrieval. Derrida’s comments on Abraham and Torok’s analytic path reflect on the narrative drama of this process, describing ‘the drama of the Wolf Man, but also the pulsing, rhythmic, step-by-step tale of the act of deciphering, decrypting, itself dramatic, the tale of a tale, of its progress, its obstacles, its delays, its interruptions, its discoveries all along a labyrinth; of its entrance hall, its corridors, its angles’ (Foreword, xxiii). Saramago constructs Pessoa’s world like a phantasmagoria of realist scenes offering the illusion of the historical moment and simultaneously Pessoa’s inner life, encrypting the inner forms of the world and the protagonists of the novel within a reimagined historical time.

Saramago uses public spaces of Lisbon, including streets, the cemetery, and the harbour to construct a fictional crypt in which Pessoa and Reis can exist posthumously. In death’s space we encounter crypts of historical time, walls, darkness and closed

⁷³ Ozick, ‘Posthumous’, pp. 26-41.

⁷⁴ Derrida, Foreword, *Wolf*, xviii.

spaces concealing desire. The fictionalised historical time is inhabited by the imagined crypts of the past. Crypts' spatial qualities are examined by Wigley, describing their 'elusive geometry of concealment.'⁷⁵ These structures of the hidden, like those found in Pamuk's *The Black Book*, are used by Saramago to present the revelation of historical time seen posthumously. Pessoa appears within this elusive 'geometry of concealment', historical time operating as time that has been hidden, out of which Pessoa's posthumous life can be imagined, as if the historical Pessoa and Reis were simply waiting to be discovered.

The novel's approach to posthumous temporality is, like mourning, to integrate the historical within the reimagined narratives of the past. The narrative skirts and circles the historical, like Reis weaving around the statues in Lisbon while believing he is being chased by a government agent: 'He followed the itinerary of the statues, Eça de Queirós, Chiado, D'Artagnan, poor Adamastor viewed from behind. Pretending that he was admiring the statues, he walked around each slowly, three times, feeling that he was playing cops and robbers.'⁷⁶ Saramago brings the statues back within an active historical time. In the posthumous scene Saramago dramatises the possible discovery of historical time, while appearing to recognise its defacement. He enters the lost temporality, casting historical shadows in the temporal void. Historical characters appear, transforming this moment of fiction – as if seen through a veil of time, capturing a world enclosed within a world, a secret primal memory out of which meanings are later created. Where for Edward Thomas the crypt of memory is a foundation of the adult's sensual and poetic world, it is also a veiled, private space to which he can escape, as Saramago explores too.

Saramago's novel stages a migration from Pessoa's imagination to a fictional historical time, including Reis and his world (including the character Lydia, Reis's lover in his poetry). Describing the nature of the content of his dreams, Pessoa notes that 'Things are the raw material of my dreams; that's why I apply a distractedly hyperattentive attention to certain details of the Outside.'⁷⁷ His search for the historical within unconscious life challenges traditional expectations of the autobiography, embracing unconscious time, re-animating and narrating memories so they have a new presence.

⁷⁵ Wigley, *Architecture*, p. 147.

⁷⁶ Saramago, *Year*, p. 352.

⁷⁷ Pessoa, *Disquiet*, p. 433.

The novel absorbs and gives space for some of the dreams that Pessoa wrote about. In *The Book of Disquiet*, dreams have a strong presence, Pessoa eulogising their presence as if an ideal: ‘Sometimes I muse about how wonderful it would be if I could string all my dreams together into one continuous life, a life consisting of entire days full of imaginary companions and created people, a false life which I could live and suffer and enjoy’ (*Disquiet*, p. 106). This is not an imaginary game, but an exercise which attempts to yield more historical reality: ‘The dreamer sees only what’s important. An object’s true reality is only a portion of what it is; the rest is the heavy tribute it pays to physical matter for the right to exist in space’ (*Disquiet*, p. 433). He continues: ‘A real sunset is imponderable and transitory. A dreamed sunset is fixed and eternal’ (*Disquiet*, p. 433).

Pessoa reconciles unconscious experience with historical time, arguing, ‘I haven’t really fled from life, in the sense of seeking a softer bed for my soul; I’ve merely changed lives, finding in my dreams the same objectivity that I found in life’ (*Disquiet*, p. 434), as if in a mutual mimesis. *The Book of Disquiet* is suffused with the maritime life of Lisbon, ships operating as a continual signifier of epic and imperial movement across the world, and of the objective material world, while for Pessoa also determinedly an object of the unconscious. He writes, ‘I dream real life. All ships are dreamed ships if we have the power to dream them’ (*Disquiet*, p. 275). In Pessoa’s text, dream and unconscious elements help form historical time. He writes, referring to his work for a shipping company: ‘I attentively record the entries that tell the useless history of an obscure firm, while at the same time and with equal attention my thoughts follow the route of a non-existent ship past landscapes of an unreal Orient. For me the two things are equally visible and equally distinct’ (*Disquiet*, p. 256). Pessoa indicates the merging of these two experiences: ‘the ruled pages on which I carefully write the commercial epic of Vasques & Co., and the deck where I carefully observe – beyond the ruled pattern of the floorboards’ tarred joints – the rows of lounge chairs and the stretched legs of passengers relaxing on the voyage’ (*Disquiet*, p. 256).

Saramago transforms this double inscription of the ship in historical time to a new posthumous scene, this time as another ship, a sign of hidden epic history. The ship (a battleship) in the novel is not the sign of a fantasy of empire but of empire’s implosion and the internal conflicts of war and new political ideologies. Historical time is reconsidered as the collision of dreams, ghosts, and matter, emerging from the posthumous scenes. The novel dramatizes conflicts between historical time and fictional time within the posthumous scenes, Saramago bringing historical time back into the

time of consciousness. He presents Pessoa as phantom and dreamer within the historical scene, that includes the rise of Portuguese fascism and the gathering sense of catastrophe. If Pessoa's living desire was to be buried within his own unconscious, Saramago's exhumation places him within a more complex historical time. Pessoa is no longer at a remove from historical time, as Saramago's posthumous fiction creates a new relationship between historical time and memory, engaging with historical memory. It isn't just concerned with afterlives, but with how a life becomes historical, how fiction produces a sense of historical time and how posthumous temporality can be reconciled with historical time.

11. Posthumous fiction, death, biography and defacements of historical memory

My posthumous readings of Pessoa and Saramago reflect an awareness of the past's hiddenness, but also of how historical time that can be revisited, discovered, or inhabited. Malcolm Bull argues that hiddenness 'presupposes not just incomplete knowledge but incompleting knowledge, knowledge that is less full than it might be, perhaps than it ought to be'.⁷⁸ These readings of Pessoa and Saramago hint at incompleteness in terms of both the obscurity and fragmentation that fiction is engaged with the challenge of overcoming, but also the hiddenness of historical time. Both narratives play with the hiddenness of consciousness and of lived experience, and so readings of them need to recognize a sense of hidden time.

Saramago approaches the hidden Pessoa, trying to find a way to dramatize the elusive or faded face of Pessoa. He brings Pessoa to life, giving face to him, yet in this enfacement, or figuration, there is a defacement. His body is revealed to Reis where before Pessoa was careful to conceal it. Saramago's naturalism defaces the life via the posthumous temporality, presenting a more naturalistic supplement to the interior record of Pessoa, elements not found in *The Book of Disquiet*.

Supplementing the life of Pessoa, engaging with his autobiographical and other biographical writing, Saramago isn't trying to overwrite Pessoa, but showing how Pessoa's self and heteronyms can be incorporated within a posthumous narrative. Saramago enters Pessoa's crypt, as if in search of biographical truth, the novel developing Pessoa as if he is a statue that has come to life. Saramago's portrait of him

⁷⁸ Malcolm Bull, *Seeing Things Hidden: Apocalypse, Vision and Totality* (London: Verso, 2000), p. 18.

is not of a historical person who had once lived, but of a historical person who has come back alive. We can compare Jensen's *Gradiva* here, in terms of the appearance of coming back to life and the delusion or embrace of historical time that it represents.

Amidst the convolutions of historical time and the unconscious, Saramago's posthumous Pessoa is disorientated. Historical time, defaced, supplemented, faded and transposed, is a place of uncertain landmarks. While trying to resist disappearance, Saramago's Pessoa is aware of what has been lost, saying to Reis that 'the only thing that saves me is the mental picture I still have of Camões, working from there, I can usually get my bearings' (*Year*, p. 309). It is as if he is navigating historical time, a time that is being reimaged and altered. The conversation with Reis continues, referring to the statue of Camões in Lisbon (*Year*, p. 309):

[Reis:] Let's hope they don't remove him, given this latest mania of removing things, you should see what's happening on the Avenida da Libertade, they have stripped it bare. [Pessoa:] I haven't been back there, I know nothing about it. [Reis:] They have moved or are about to remove the statue of Pinheiro Chagas, and that of a certain José Luís Monteiro, whom I've never heard of.

Pessoa later says: 'They will never erect a statue to commemorate me, only if they have no shame, I'm not one for statues' (*Year*, p. 309). (There is now a statue of Pessoa in this area, erected since the publication of Saramago's novel.) Responding to Pessoa, Reis says, 'Don't upset yourself, you might escape this curse, and if you don't, like Rigoletto, you can always hope that they will pull your statue down one day, as in the case of Pinheiro Chagas.'⁷⁹

Reis reflects doubts about monumental history, stating that 'words cannot be set in bronze and stone' (*Year*, p. 309). As referred to in my Introduction, de Man refers to the way in which history turns lives into monuments:

For what have we done with the dead Shelley, and with all the other dead bodies that appear in romantic literature ... is simply to bury them, to bury them in their own texts made into epitaphs and their own monumental graves. They have been made into statues for the benefit of future archaeologists.⁸⁰

⁷⁹ Saramago, *Year*, p. 310. João Pinheiro Chagas (1863-1925) was a journalist and politician. In 1911, for less than three months, he led the first constitutional government of the Portuguese First Republic.

⁸⁰ de Man, 'Shelley Disfigured', p. 121.

De Man returns to Shelley to try to give him a more developed historical time, arguing that there is something primal in Shelley that historical time must incorporate. De Man's proscribed role for deconstruction in relation to the past does not necessitate a movement away from historical memory, but rather a reconstruction of how it is incorporated, figuratively or otherwise, within narrative.

Saramago animates the past, as if reawakening a sense of historical time as it is considered posthumously. His turn towards history gives the posthumous scene a realism, but also marks the posthumous with elements of primal memory: the nine-month period of Pessoa's posthumous life, Reis's relationship with Lydia (the idealised lover of some of Reis's poetry) and the role of Reis within Pessoa's unconscious, as if a return of the repressed or hidden origin that returns to Portugal from Brazil. The posthumous scenes imagined by Saramago supplement and historicise primal elements of Pessoa's life.

Pessoa is reimaged by Saramago, transforming some of his unconscious elements into a mimesis of historical time. His figuration of Pessoa within a posthumous temporality attempts to supplement both the autobiographical and the fictive in the pursuit of an elusive historical time. Saramago's fiction attempts to unveil the biography of Pessoa: where Pessoa's autobiography defaces his own self, Saramago attempts to give the face back to Pessoa, to give him back his sight of the world around him. Pessoa confesses in *The Book of Disquiet* that, 'I've lost the vision of what I was seeing. My eyes see, but I am blind... What I see is no longer Reality, it's just Life' (*Disquiet*, p. 378).

Where Pessoa provides his imaginary, 'factless autobiography' (*Disquiet*, p. 9), Saramago supplements this with a narrative that describes his exterior life. De Man's observations on the historical disfigurement of Shelley reflect his views on defacement within life writing and weak attempts to construct historical time out of a life. He asserts that 'Autobiography veils a defacement of the mind of which it is itself the cause.'⁸¹ Fiction might supplement this defacement of historical time, though not without complication. De Man's essay has been greatly discussed, particularly in light of the posthumous revelations of his collaborative activities during the Nazi occupation of Belgium, his comments read by some as a distancing of himself from this. One can also read his essay as an acknowledgement of what is absent, encrypted or not given form, his writing veiling its own defacement.

The posthumous revelations about de Man's life do not negate his observation

⁸¹ de Man, 'Autobiography', p. 81.

concerning autobiography. His collaborationist and anti-Semitic writings were repressed by him, his migration to the United States marking a post-war reinvention, his new writing both an ‘escape from the tropology of the subject’ (‘Autobiography’, p. 72) and also an attempt to reinscribe his self through other figures, including Wordsworth, Shelley and Yeats, within what he calls a ‘specular model of cognition’ (‘Autobiography’, p. 72).

His work on autobiography reflects the double motion of both erasure and supplementation that I considered in Pamuk’s *The Black Book*. We do not know exactly what these ghosts within de Man are hiding, what absences they mask. In *Memoires for Paul de Man* Derrida articulates, in a troubled and sometimes troubling way, that the nature of de Man’s mask itself is unknowable. The defacement is clear, but we don’t know the precise relationship between the escaped subject (de Man’s flight to the United States) and the masked subject (his work in Belgium). The site of his life, its absences, its unresolved presences, invites a posthumous reimagining, to rediscover the historical time of his life.

Boldrini wrote, in relation to de Man and two heterobiographies that relate to his circumstances (John Banville’s *Shroud* and Malcolm Bradbury’s *Dr Criminale*) that, ‘No text can be read only biographically, but, equally, no attempt to dissolve, de-referentialize, de-historicize will succeed entirely, insofar as language has a way of constantly returning the subject to a form of grounding.’⁸² Posthumous readings of fictional narratives and life writing open up historical memory to the possibility of revelation or regrounding, and the exposure of defacements and voids.

Reconstructing historical time includes awareness of processes of decryption, incorporation and defacement, where each element may mask or change the existing face of memory. Posthumous readings reveal the traces of the past, defacements, encryptions and the historicity of defacement obscured by de Man’s essay. Shoshana Felman, with whom Boldrini engages in her exploration of these issues, writes on this historicity, as it is encrypted within de Man’s own work:

De Man’s entire writing effort is a silent trace of the reality of an event whose very historicity, borne out by the author’s own catastrophic experience, has occurred precisely as the event of the preclusion—the event of the impossibility—of its own witnessing; an event that could thus name

⁸² Boldrini, *Autobiographies*, p. 141.

the very namelessness, the very magnitude, the very materiality of what de Man will constantly refer to as the ever-threatening *impossibility of reading*.⁸³

The ‘ever threatening *impossibility*’ implies a future total encryption, which threatens to encrypt de Man himself, through silence. Felman approaches the defacement of historical memory via the crypt that conceals memory. The encrypted subject is decrypted through reading, as Boldrini explores in terms of Banville’s heterobiographical representation of de Man in *Shroud*. Banville’s posthumous fictional representation of de Man, Alex Vander, the narrator, is presented as if possessed by these encryptions and buried selves. The fiction appears to attempt to reveal de Man’s other self, which isn’t fictional but the alternative historical self within his life that posthumously becomes part of his biography.

Encountering the faces and defacements of the past is part of approaching the archives and crypts of history; as Boldrini’s interpretation iterates, silences and defacements becomes part of that history, relating to our understanding of it. Posthumous interpretations of de Man’s life includes its hidden or repressed historical time, as well as the techniques and approaches in his writing where he attempted to illuminate writers’ biographies. As with Saramago’s novel, Banville’s fictional use of a historical character uses the posthumous scene to show conflicts of the historical self in relation to temporality. His narrative reveals the life anew, how its secrets, stories and interior times may be understood historically. In Banville’s novel, Vander writes:

I had the sensation then, as so often, of shifting slightly aside from myself, as if I was going out of focus and separating into two. I wonder if other people feel as I do, seeming never to be wholly present wherever I happen to be, seeming not so much a person as a contingency, misplaced and adrift in time. My true source and destination are always elsewhere, although where exactly that elsewhere might be I do not know; perhaps it is in childhood, that age of authenticity the scenes of which I can summon up more and more vividly the farther away from them that I get.⁸⁴

Vander refers to childhood here as if it holds the key to historical time, explaining the nature of his sense of self-division, the movement towards posthumousness or death making these primal memories more vivid. Historical time takes on a greater clarity. This is a return of the repressed but also a narrative performance of historical time returning to consciousness. Banville’s fiction attempts to bring to life this sense of the

⁸³ Shoshana Felman, *Testimony: Crises of Witnessing in Literature, Psychoanalysis, and History*, co-authored with Dori Laub (London: Routledge, 1992), p. 140.

⁸⁴ John Banville, *Shroud* (London: Picador, 2003), pp. 68-69.

erased and retrieved self, but such posthumous fictional works themselves may encrypt and deface historical memory. Fictional figuration threatens to disfigure and deface in pursuit of biographical authenticity.

Defacement is integral to the form of autobiography; part of the narrative intrigue is whether we are seeing the true face or not. Pessoa, whose ‘factless autobiography, my lifeless history’⁸⁵ is an attempt at self-portraiture, foregrounds unconscious elements, producing a death mask that appears to disguise his life. Saramago’s new fictional mask for Pessoa presents a form of biography that also defaces his life. His resurrection of Pessoa attempts to understand his life in relation to historical time through the posthumous temporality of the novel. Where in *The Book of Disquiet* Pessoa’s life is portrayed in relation to death, in Saramago’s novel death becomes the grounding for a reimagining of historical time.

12. Posthumous scenes, defacement and the unconscious of historical time

The encrypted life of Pessoa and Reis in Saramago’s novel reflects the hiddenness of lived time, as well as showing how a novelist may bring a life back into relation with historical time. Saramago approaches this through animations of Pessoa’s life, uses of historical realism, attention to complex temporalities and the development of the posthumous perspective’s reach into primal memories.

While multiplying senses of temporality, reflecting various times of consciousness, fictionalised historical time is constrained by the book’s form. This formal constraint is part of writing’s defacement of life, de Man asserts overdeterminedly, asking rhetorically whether ‘whatever the writer *does* is in fact governed by the technical demands of self-portraiture and thus determined, in all its aspects, by the resources of his medium?’⁸⁶ Rather than fix the meaning of a life and its becoming historical, fiction’s use of the posthumous scene reactivates the life, deepening the sense of historical time. In Saramago’s case, his novel on Pessoa and his double, Ricardo Reis, follows on from Pessoa’s use of the heteronym, the posthumous scenes of the novel building on what came before them, both materially and spectrally.

Posthumous fiction supplements historical and biographical time, both defacing and reconstructing the life in the pursuit of historical time. Saramago brings to life and

⁸⁵ Pessoa, *Disquiet*, p. 9.

⁸⁶ de Man, ‘Autobiography’, p. 69.

decrypts both Pessoa and Reis, a multiple refiguration within the posthumous scene. As with Pamuk's *The Black Book*, this is in part a search for historical time. In Saramago's novel, Pessoa is given a new mask, living as a phantom within the imagined historical time. The narrative encrypts Saramago's desire to bring Pessoa into history, giving the novel what Kotowicz describes as a 'polemical edge.'⁸⁷ In the novel, Reis asks Pessoa, 'By the way, Fernando, did you ever come across a certain António Ferro, Secretary for National Propaganda. [Pessoa:] Yes, we were friends, I owe it to him that I was awarded a prize of five thousand reis for *Mensagem*, why do you ask.'⁸⁸ The undisclosed context here is that Pessoa and Ferro were both associated with the poetry journal *Orpheu*, and as a journalist Ferro went on to interview Mussolini, Hitler and Primo de Rivera, also working for Salazar's authoritarian regime in Portugal. Saramago's resurrection of history is also an interrogation of history.

The posthumous scene presents the possible return of the repressed, proposing a multiple, heterogenous version of historical time. The search for historical time, including the primal, as Lukacher shows, leads to a new sense of historical time that embraces the unconscious, the hidden and the encrypted. Returning to the unconscious of Pessoa, creating the nine womb-like months of his return to Lisbon, and describing the fictional figure of Reis, Saramago invigorates our understandings of the historical time of Pessoa.

In the posthumous scene the mystery of historical time is presented within the fictional setting, in which unconscious or hidden elements come to life. Repressed and primal memories may be transformed or given a new sense of place within such a life. De Certeau shows how primal memory is activated posthumously, considering how Freud goes back to the early life of Moses and his hidden origins. De Certeau describes how Freud's Moses is an attempt to complicate Freud's own biographical past and the origin of psychoanalysis; again this is a return to origins, redefining historical time from the point of view of the posthumous.

Pessoa's and Saramago's narratives include different encrypted versions of historical time. Saramago's novel of posthumous scenes of Pessoa seeks to construct historical time, reimagining Pessoa and Reis, the narrative reflecting the temporalities of Pessoa's writing. The novel transfigures Pessoa's life, imagining him within a phantom history. In Saramago's pursuit of Pessoa, the posthumous nature of historical

⁸⁷ Kotowicz, *Voices*, p. 93.

⁸⁸ Saramago, *Year*, pp. 286-287.

time is understood. Benjamin writes, ‘no fact that is a cause is for that very reason historical. It became historical posthumously.’⁸⁹ In this process of becoming historical, new meanings are developed, the afterlife represented by Saramago changing our understanding of Pessoa’s historical time. Gradually, to use the image of Pessoa, the ink of the ruled pages fades and the ‘ruled pattern of the floorboards’ tarred joints’ bleed into reanimations of memory. Historical time, posthumously, in this obscure mimesis, becomes visible.

In my final chapter I will consider how the posthumous scene is developed further in relation to primal memory and historical time, analysing the work of Schulz and novelists who have sought to reimagine elements of his life and work. In my engagement with Schulz, I consider further how historical time has ruptures and voids, which narratives of individual lives may offer doorways into and pathways through. Saramago’s revivification of Pessoa changes our sense of historical time in terms of Pessoa and his life. Felman notes on de Man that ‘we cannot escape from... how his later writing... is inextricably tied up with a historical event... that is still a crucial and immediate part of our present.’⁹⁰ Similarly, our posthumous understanding of Schulz shows us the ongoing nature of reinterpretations of historical time, and how fiction might develop our engagement with this via the use of posthumous temporality within narrative.

⁸⁹ Benjamin, ‘Theses’, p. 255.

⁹⁰ Felman, *Testimony*, p. 147.

Chapter 5

‘Spring dusk’¹: Posthumous and primal scenes in Bruno Schulz’s fictions and fictions that reimagine his work and life

1. Posthumousness and primal and mythic fragments within Schulz’s fiction

Saramago’s use of the posthumous scene in *The Year of the Death of Ricardo Reis* involves echoes and re-incorporations of primal elements of Pessoa’s life. I will pursue this theme of returns and incorporations further via texts relating to Schulz, a Polish writer killed during the Second World War in what was Nazi-occupied Poland. Schulz’s appearance in various guises in other writers’ fictions since his death suggest his life marks a rupture in history where complexities of historical time in fiction might be addressed.

While I will begin by considering Schulz’s fictions, these subsequent narratives indicate further how posthumous temporality in fiction might be understood in relation to historical time. Fiction relating to Schulz offers examples of continuity and disruption in terms of how, posthumously, historical time relating to his life is reconstructed and encrypted within narrative. Fiction that imagines Schulz in a posthumous temporality includes Grossman’s *See Under: Love* (which includes a shamanic, dream-like construction of Schulz in an underwater world), Ozick’s *The Messiah of Stockholm* (which relates an apocryphal tale of a surviving manuscript appearing in Sweden), Maxim Biller’s *Inside the Head of Bruno Schulz* and Philip Roth’s *The Prague Orgy*. There are other fictions that refer more obliquely to Schulz, including Aharon Appelfield’s *The Age of Wonders*, Nicole Krauss’s *The History of Love and Great House*, and Michael Chabon’s *The Final Solution*.

Fictions that dramatize imagined narratives of his life inform our understanding of how posthumous temporality in fiction relates to historical time. Novelists’ use of posthumous temporality to narrate other lives of Schulz highlight how the relationship between fictional and historical time is unresolved, while fiction can be part of understanding the nature of historical time. Each of the Schulz-related fictions that I refer to contribute to a diaspora of fragments as both tribute and memorial to him. These fictions take radical approaches to historical memory, imagining primal elements to

¹ This phrase is taken from Schulz’s story ‘Spring’, *Street*, p. 160.

develop new versions of Schulz's life. They incorporate melancholia and loss as intrinsic parts of historical time, rather than exclude them as historical remnants or ruins.

I will also consider Foer's *Tree of Codes*, which fragments Schulz's short stories, using them to create a new text out of the remaining fragments. Foer's narrative attempts to give Schulz a new posthumous existence, reframing and releasing the life fragmented or buried within Schulz's original text. This pursuit of hidden historical time is found in his previous two novels, particularly *Everything is Illuminated*.

Fictions on Schulz's life and imagined alternative life imply continuity while accommodating rupture. Schulz's death appears to create an opening within which new imaginings of his fictions and historical time can be imagined. The rupture indicates a form of historical time that is susceptible to being ruptured by narrative supplementation, including new fictions that refer back to his life and writing. This understanding of rupture reflects Felman's analysis of posthumous understandings of de Man and his writings during the Second World War. She writes that history is not 'as it is commonly understood to be, a mode of continuity that defines itself in opposition to the mode of fiction, but a mode of interruption in which the unpredictability and uncontrollability of fiction, acting itself out into reality, "becomes the disruption of the narrative's referential illusion."² The text incorporates the crises and untimelinesses of historical time.

Felman's comments also connect with de Certeau's notion of rupture in relation to history, which I considered in Chapters 1 and 2, especially relating to Freud's *Moses and Monotheism*. De Certeau comments that in Freud's analysis of tradition, 'Rupture does not intervene as a separation between regions (the past and the present, the individual and the collective, etc.), but as the very principle of their functioning.'³ De Certeau referred to how Freud's writing on Moses created an opening onto history; Felman considers the relationship between history and fiction in terms of disruption, history itself being a 'mode of interruption' while also offering 'a mode of unexpected continuity (the uncanny indestructible materiality) of signifiers and of their circulation' (*Testimony*, p. 148). This complex account of historical time does not allow for clear resolutions or permanent closures.

² Felman, *Testimony*, p. 148, quoting de Man, *Allegories of Reading: Figural Language in Rousseau, Nietzsche, Rilke and Proust* (New Haven: Connecticut, 1979), p. 292.

³ de Certeau, *Writing*, p. 313.

Emily Miller Budick imagines fiction's position in relation to the Holocaust and historical time differently, specifically regarding various narratives on Schulz and others as part of a hysterical approach, writers being 'haunted by the phantoms or ghosts of dead Jews, who cannot be properly mourned and who therefore cannot be properly buried.'⁴ Budick's comment on 'improper mourning' needs itself to be understood within a historical time that might gain from being understood in relation to trauma, where mourning takes on more forms than a clinical or ritualised reintegration of lost memory. 'The question for the writers of post-Holocaust Schulz-obsessed fiction is how to utter this [Munchian] scream within their fictions without obliterating the history of events or the history of love' (*Holocaust*, p. 167), she writes. She continues, referring to the protagonists of these books: 'They must learn to mourn. They must permit the dead to die' (*ibid.*).

I will attempt to show how these characters reflect a more complex work of mourning within fiction. Budick's prescriptive approach and resistance to the incorporation of fictional history into thinking on historical memory represents an incomplete comprehension, a taxonomic fragmentation of historical time into the rationalised and the hysterical. Fragmentation and rupture are part of historical time; the unresolved nature of memory is part of a reading of the posthumous, in which ruptures of historical time are the grounds of memory, not only possible symptoms.

Against the prescription of better mourning are more nuanced commentaries, for example Derrida's various approaches published in *The Work of Mourning* (2001). These allow for both a complexity of incorporations and the ongoing recognition of that which isn't simply incorporated, or is without future irresolution. Derrida writes in his essay on Louis Marin: 'mourning is interminable. Inconsolable. Irreconcilable. Right up until death – that is what whoever works at mourning knows.... working *at mourning* as one would speak of a painter working *at a painting*.'⁵

My exploration of the role of disintegration within fictional approaches to history will also include uses of fragments of historical memory in relation to historical time in Georges Perec's *W or the Memory of Childhood*. This will further illuminate our understanding of the use of posthumous temporality, including in the work of Schulz.

⁴ Emily Miller Budick, *The Subject of Holocaust Fiction* (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2015), p. 145.

⁵ Derrida, 'By Force of Mourning', in *The Work of Mourning*, trans. by Pascale-Anne Brault and Michael Naas (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2001), p. 143.

2. Schulz's adventures in posthumous temporality

Novels that relate to and include Schulz are not ones of traditional memorial or biographical narrative, but appear to awaken the primal life hidden or lost within historical time. They relate analogically to Schulz's own writing; his stories used fragments to build a mythology that introduced new ways of presenting memories, perceptions and temporality, using various approaches to posthumous temporality. His story 'Sanitorium Under the Sign of the Hourglass' confuses a temporality of mourning with a time of ongoing survival of the narrator's father.

This story creates a posthumous temporality within which the narrator discovers more of the hidden world in a locked time in which his father, though dead, remains alive, presenting time as if it has been suspended in the period around his death. The narrative offers a gateway onto historical time and the time of the narrator's childhood when his father was still alive. The narrator returns to this world as if for the first time, meeting his father, as if uncovering a primal memory, recognising the existence of his parents before his birth and understanding his existence in these familiar surroundings. When his father tells him to find his shop where he will be working, the narrator writes, finding himself disoriented in this world, a kind of simulacra of his known world and yet also unfamiliar:

I began to look for the optician's shop that my father had mentioned. He had spoken of it as something I knew, and he seemed to assume that I was familiar with local conditions. Didn't he remember that I had just come here for the first time? No doubt his mind was confused. Yet what could one expect of Father, who was only half-real, who lived a relative and conditional life, circumscribed by so many limitations! I cannot deny that much goodwill was needed to believe in his kind of existence.⁶

This world is known and yet not known, a return to a primordial time or origin that is uncanny, within time and yet outside of historical time, combining both the primal and the posthumous. The posthumous scene forms a crypt, which as Elizabeth J. Bellamy writes on Abraham and Torok's analysis, 'marks the trace (or retrace) of a ghost, or "ghost-effect," within the unconscious where trauma and memory converge and yet fail to produce anything more than a kind of uninterpretable knot of incompletely buried signifiers.'⁷ The trace of the ghost is a form of masking or repressing of primal memory.

⁶ Schulz, 'Sanitorium Under the Sign of the Hourglass', *Street*, p. 249.

⁷ Elizabeth Bellamy, *Affective Genealogies: Psychoanalysis, Postmodernism and the "Jewish Question" After Auschwitz* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1997), p. 21.

The posthumous scene continues when the narrator arrives at his father's shop. He finds his father working there, who tells him that a package has been delivered for him. What has arrived is not the pornographic book that he had requested from a bookshop (a letter informs him it was out of stock), but a 'folding telescope with great refractive power.'⁸ This appears to imitate a primordial space, as if an imagined womb: 'it rose under my fingers until it almost filled the room; a kind of enormous bellows, a labyrinth of black chambers, a long complex of camera obscuras, one within another' ('Sanitorium', p. 251). This telescope doesn't look into the sky; instead, the narrator sits inside it: 'Intrigued, I put my head deeper into the rear chamber of the apparatus I could now see in my field of vision the maid walking along the darkened corridor of the Sanitorium... I was sitting, as it were, in the rear chamber of the telescope as if in the back seat of a limousine' (ibid.).

Here Schulz again conjoins primal and posthumous temporalities, as if within the primal memory looking proleptically towards the future and located within the posthumous. The posthumous temporality he creates appears to be aware of and is even expecting the narrator's presence, with the arrival of the delivery. A form of historical time is developed in this scene, in which the past is recreated but as if having been simulated, haphazardly or at short notice – his father's shop's 'display window was not ready and was covered with a gray paper' ('Sanitorium', p. 250). Schulz's narrator's analeptic perspective, flashing back to a primordial memory, holds within it the proleptic too, viewing towards the future, as if within an observatory of time, a temporal panopticon. Schulz shows how posthumous temporality offers the possibility of time being regained but also dramatically reconfigured within narrative.

Jerzy Ficowski writes on the rootedness of Schulz's sense of historical and mythic time in his home town, describing how 'Walking with friends through the changed Drohobycz market square, Schulz pointed out the spot where his childhood home had stood at number 12 and, describing it as it had been, he reached into an even more distant past than his own childhood...'⁹ Schulz appeared to have the sense of his own absence, yet aware that this is where he emerged from: 'as if in that shadowy era he discovered his own prehistory, the root of his personal mythic origins' (p. 43).

⁸ Schulz, 'Sanitorium', p. 251.

⁹ Jerzy Ficowski, *Regions of the Great Heresy: Bruno Schulz, a Biographical Portrait*, trans. by Theodosia Robertson (New York: W. W. Norton, 2003), p. 43.

This scene indicates a way in which posthumous temporality is present for Schulz, evoking his biographical origins and a primordial history. This historical time is unresolved, hidden beneath remembered time; its appearance presents an intentional rupture through which Schulz might be understood further in terms of his use of myth and imagined primal elements. Writing on the relationship between fiction and history, de Certeau argues that

The novel is the psychologizing of myth; it interiorizes conflict among the gods. Rather than “an extenuation of myth,” it is born of its fragmentation and of its reduction into miniature. But it reiterates the “primal scene” on the individual space created by a point of no return within history. With Freud, as with Defoe or Kafka, myth returns in the psychological figure that has taken its place.’¹⁰

His analysis, referring to the fragmentation of myth, is relevant to both Schulz’s development of his mythology and subsequent extenuations and appropriations of his work and literary mythology by other writers. Schulz’s use of posthumous temporality opens up fragmented mythic times of the past buried within historical time. In ‘Sanitorium Under the Sign of the Hourglass’, the narrator inhabits the space of death as if it was a continuum of life, incorporating a historical time that is separate from lived time yet assimilated via fiction. The rupture in temporality appears to be overcome through this incorporation via the posthumous scene in which the narrator revisits and renarrates the past.

3. Schulz, temporality, mythic fragments and new fictional lives

Temporal disturbance and disorientation are signs of Schulz’s rupture of historical time, his fictions awakening and animating the past, while presenting time’s elusiveness. In ‘Cinnamon Shops’, he described how ‘time passed unnoticed. It ran by unevenly, as if making knots in the passage of hours, swallowing somewhere whole empty periods.’¹¹ Schulz brings to life presences of primal memory and consciousness in ways that are often appear anachronous and invasive. In his story ‘Mr Charles’, he writes of a bodily, primordial time, how ‘While Charles sat there in a thoughtless, vegetative stupor... there formed inside his perspiring body an unknown, unformulated future, like a terrible

¹⁰ de Certeau, *Writing*, p. 347, quoting Claude Lévi-Strauss, *The Origin of Table Manners*, trans. by John Weightmann and Doreen Weightmann (New York: Harper and Row, 1979), p. 131.

¹¹ Schulz, ‘Cinnamon Shops’, *Street*, p. 58.

growth, pushing forth in an unknown direction' ('Mr Charles', p. 50). This sense of a wild, alternative time is developed further, the narrator referring to how 'The rooms, empty and neglected, did not approve of him... He felt, entering that stillness, like an intruder in an underwater kingdom with a different, separate notion of time' ('Mr Charles', p. 51).

The story is a repository of fragmented mythic time that engages with the idea of posthumous temporality. Posthumous presences are indicated in other writing by Schulz. In 'The Age of Genius', he writes (p. 129):

Yet what is to be done with events that have no place of their own in time; events that have occurred too late, after the whole of time has been distributed, divided, and allotted; events that have been left in the cold, unregistered, hanging in the air, homeless, and errant?

Could it be that time is too narrow for all events? Could it happen that all the seats within time might have been sold? Worried, we run along the train of events, preparing ourselves for the journey.

Schulz diagnoses and dramatizes the relation between mythic and historical time here in terms of how historical time may posthumously become incorporated within mythic time. In doing so, he opens a temporal space that has attracted other writers, inhabiting, extenuating and developing this temporality afresh. They offer him more time, presenting new myths of his life including mythical posthumous recoveries. Schulz's death is a site for new mythical developments of historical time, with writers including Grossman and Ozick giving him a posthumous new time, as if a new life.

In these new narratives, it is as if the tragic historical figure of Schulz might be rescued or redeemed, using the ecstatic temporalities, outside traditional historical time, that he imagined in his own stories. The story about Schulz by Grossman in *See Under: Love* appears to liberate him from a hidden, constricted and encrypted sense of time, as if he is reborn. In this temporality, death is outside everyday understandings of existence; incomprehension of death extends to, as Bruno states,

"any thought bearing the bitter traces of decay and putrefaction, destruction and fear. No one will be able to understand such thoughts, just as in the old world you could never really understand a person coming back to life, or the backward flow of time. Because I am speaking to you about a totally different life, about the coming phase of human evolution."¹²

This mythical time is created by Grossman via his readings of Schulz's writings; it conjoins the renewal of the life that he lost and the time within his writing, as if through

¹² Grossman, *Love*, p. 179.

fictional reimaginings of time he might be liberated from time, while also being encrypted within new narratives. Grossman's novel combines primal and posthumous temporalities, connecting these elements through his new vision of Schulz.

Schulz's stories involve seeking life through death and finding liberation or escape through death's space, reflecting his sense of being encrypted within time and having to seek liberation. While his writing re-imagines temporality, in his life he was trapped by historical events. Working in the nursery crypt of his Nazi captor's house, he painted scenes of nursery rhymes, as Ficowski recalls, quoting the words of one of Schulz's former students, Emil Górski, who had worked on the details of the painted frescoes himself. Of the portraits, Górski remarks:

Their similarity to the emaciated and tortured faces that Schulz had captured in memory was extraordinary. Here these tormented people – transported through Schulz's imagination from the world of tragic reality – found for themselves in paintings brilliant richness and pride; as kings on thrones in sable furs, with golden crowns on their heads; on beautiful white horses as knights in armor, with swords in their hands and surrounded by knights; seated like powerful lords in golden carriages.¹³

The primal space of these paintings is not liberating for Schulz, for it encrypts his own oppression. He incorporates historical memories (the 'tormented people') to give them mythological meaning, as if there may be some redemption or escape from historical time through masked transformation. The portraits are a fantasy within constraints, a microcosm reflecting the mythic structure of his writing, incorporating a posthumous temporality of characters who have been tormented by history.

Schulz's stories, formed of imaginary and cryptic times, suggest how posthumous narratives work with the limits of cryptic spaces. Various stories, including 'Sanitorium Under the Sign of the Hourglass' and 'Father's Last Escape' have a sense of the posthumous that includes existence after death, this being incorporated within everyday time as a form of supplementation. Using fairytale tropes, he creates cryptic sites that extend realist narrative with imaginative and absurdist developments. His own mythic time is contained in these universes, as if requiring the shell of a more ordinary reality in order to exist.

The crypts of Schulz's writing include his childhood, unconscious and other primal elements which are turned into other forms through fragmentation and

¹³ Emil Górski, quoted by Ficowski, *Regions*, pp. 166-167.

transformation. He creates his family mythology, the father possessed by unconscious drives after his death, while the narrator also appears to be possessed by presences of the primal. In 'Father's Last Escape', the father dies, and his memory comes alive, as if invigorated by some primal essence, for after his death, 'Father never failed to appear in the dining room during mealtimes, although his participation in them was purely symbolic.'¹⁴

This presence is a spectral primal memory within the posthumous scene as if a memory that can't be forgotten or understood. The Father is an accidental protagonist, 'his abdomen slightly pulsating. What the meaning of these rhythmic pulsations was, we could not imagine. They seemed obscene and malicious, but at the same time expressed a rather gross and lustful satisfaction' ('Father's', p. 309). The posthumous existence of the Father takes on a new mythological form.

4. Schulz's fragments and animations of Father, Mother and other characters

The stories of Schulz's *The Street of Crocodiles* possess senses of the primal and the posthumous, including how these may be connected, as we have seen in 'Sanitorium Under the Sign of the Hourglass' which links the time of the father's death to a primordial time which the narrator (the son) doesn't completely recognise. Schulz also reveals connections between the primal and the posthumous found in fragments and simulacra of things referring to both life and yet appearing to disguise it, masking it, as in the story 'Tailors' Dummies'.

In my previous chapter I considered the role of statues and masks in posthumous temporality; 'Tailors' Dummies' develops the theme of the animation of things, including a lecture by the father on dummies, focusing on their primal power. He celebrates latent temporalities, as if matter is simply awaiting animation or release. Schulz writes, quoting the father: "There is no dead matter," he taught us, "lifelessness is only a disguise behind which hide unknown forms of life. The range of these forms is infinite and their shades and nuances limitless."¹⁵

The father also describes the hidden forces of sculpture, caging personality within matter: "Do you understand the power of form, of expression, of pretense, the arbitrary tyranny imposed on a helpless block, and ruling it like its own, tyrannical,

¹⁴ Schulz, 'Father's Last Escape', *Street*, p. 309.

¹⁵ Schulz, 'Tailors' Dummies', *Street*, p. 31.

despotic soul?” (‘Dummies’, p. 35). The ‘arbitrary tyranny’ of art is opposed by Schulz’s belief in forms and temporalities that break the constraints of traditional art. There is no ‘still life’ or frozen form. The father continues, ‘You give a head of canvas and oakum an expression of anger and leave it with it, with the convulsion, the tension enclosed once and for all, with the blind fury for which there is no outlet’ (ibid.). Through the father, Schulz is ventriloquizing an argument on animation, the voice of the father acting as if his own prosopopeia, in which he makes the dead speak.

If death is fragmentation, separating matter from life, then Schulz’s art stimulates the life hidden within fragments. His animation of fragments presents the possibility of posthumous reconstruction and incorporation. He discovers life within dead spaces, hidden within its deepest recesses. The father continues his lecture (‘Dummies’, p. 38):

in old apartments there are rooms which are sometimes forgotten. Uninvited for months on end, they wilt neglected between the old walls and it happens that they close in on themselves, become overgrown with bricks, and, lost once and for all to our memory, forfeit their only claim to existence. The doors, leading to them from some backstairs landing, have been overlooked by people living in the apartment for so long that they merge with the wall, grow into it, and all trace of them is obliterated in a complicated design of lines and cracks.

This scene describes the formation of a closed crypt. The father investigates this room, entering a “‘forgotten passage” (ibid.), discovering an “‘unexpected flowering” (ibid.), “‘an example of the strange make-believe of matter which had created a semblance of life” (‘Dummies’, p. 39). His lecture continues further on fragmentation: “‘Who knows,” he said, “‘how many suffering, crippled, fragmentary forms of life there are, such as the artificially created life of chests and tables quickly nailed together, crucified timbers, silent martyrs to cruel human inventiveness?” (ibid.).

The view of fragmentation here signifies the wearing away and defacement of the life of things through forced purposefulness. Schulz’s animistic writing, awakening matter and bringing things to life, is a response to the deadening of historical time. He shows how fragmented matter might bring enchantment to daily life, exposing its links to mythical time. Schulz reconnects everyday time to primal elements, as shown in how a memory is recreated in the story ‘Cinnamon Shops’, in which he describes a visit to a theatre with the father (p. 54):

when we had made our way through the crowd, there emerged before us an enormous pale blue curtain, like the sky of another firmament. Large painted pink masks with puffed-up cheeks floated in a huge expanse of canvas... the breath of the large canvas which made the masks

revive and grow, revealed the illusory character of that firmament, caused that vibration of reality which, in metaphysical moments, we experience as the glimmer of revelation.

This theatrical scene leads to a mystical walk by the narrator, during which he discovers a hidden room in his school, as he is led on a 'luminous journey on that brightest of winter nights' ('Cinnamon', p. 61). Schulz's path moves towards a hidden place, in a similar way to the title story 'The Street of Crocodiles.' A fragment of the past offers itself to the narrator to be reconstructed as a new world, displacing the everyday, because 'Reality is as thin as paper and betrays with all its cracks its imitative character' ('Cinnamon', p. 67). The father's map of these worlds 'dramatized and orchestrated in a bleak romantic chiaroscuro the complex architectural polyphony' ('Cinnamon', p. 63), the representations taking on the life of their subjects.

In his story 'Spring', Schulz describes another form of fragmentation, writing how at dusk 'Words are split into their components and dissolved, they return to their etymology, reenter their depths and distant obscure roots. This process is to be taken literally' ('Spring', p. 160). These fragmented, broken elements of language offer access to primal and imaginary forms within historical time, the past opening up through language. Schulz describes the reconnection to buried words and unconscious roots of thought, so that 'when we sleep, severed from the world, straying into deep introversion, on a return journey into ourselves, we can see clearly through our closed eyelids, because thoughts are kindled in us by internal tapers and smolder erratically' ('Spring', p. 161).

Having established a sense of outer and inner worlds merging, he continues: 'This is how total regressions occur, retreats into self, journeys to the roots. This is how we branch into anamnesis and are shaken by underground subcutaneous shivers... in the depth we disintegrate again into black murmurs, confused purring, a multitude of unfinished stories' ('Spring', p. 161). Schulz here shows how language is part of the rejuvenation of the past, and how the primal reignited within narrative is part of the 'total regressions' and 'journeys to the roots'.

Schulz's connection to primal memory operates through fragments and ruins, language developing as if part of the natural history of these reawakened fragments, words being ('literally') a form of organic life taking over a ruin. His allusion to natural history via the ruin and the fragment in relation to literature connects with Benjamin's thesis in his essay 'The Storyteller.' Benjamin observes (p. 96),

Leskov tells us that the epoch in which man could believe himself to be in harmony with nature has expired... The storyteller keeps faith with it, and his eyes do not stray from that dial in front of which there moves the procession of creatures of which, depending on circumstances, Death is either the leader or the last wretched straggler.

In Leskov's stories, 'Death' stands for a relation to natural history; in Schulz's writing, posthumous temporality is suggestive of a rupture in which words take hold having returned 'to their etymology' ('Spring', p. 160). His stories emerge from words' encounters with 'distant obscure roots' (ibid.). Through posthumousness, Schulz gains access to both death and a hidden time of a virile nature, forming a new idea of historical time, presented as something discovered by the narrator as if it was always there.

Schulz's revelation of historical time, as we found in Saramago's use of Pessoa's life, incorporates the dead within narrative, dramatizing a return to primal roots. Ozick describes Schulz's engagement with the past as the invention of a 'religion of animism... where everything comes alive with an unpredictable and spiteful spirit-force, where even living tissue contains ghosts',¹⁶ possessing the 'brute splendors of rite, gesture, phantasmagoric transfiguration, sacrifice, elevation, degradation, mortification, repugnance, terror, cult' ('Phantasmagoria', p. 227). Schulz's use of posthumous temporality engages with primal elements in revelatory and sometimes malevolent manifestations, while his analeptic connection of the posthumous with the primal highlights history's interruptive and reconfiguring powers. His version of the past is more than a personal mythology, being a more open mythic site where other writers might discover or invent eruptions of alternative imagined histories, including versions of how his work might have developed had he not been murdered.

The posthumous temporality of fictions that include and refer to Schulz release extant energy and revive worlds within his writing in ways that reach beyond his world of Drohobycz. It is as if the fragments of his historical time are in search of a new home, his stories offering connections between primal, historical and posthumous times, his characters moving between these different worlds. In literature, fragments of historical time can be understood beyond their sense of pastness; Sophie Thomas explains that a fragment is often seen to have a future sense, with a new life including possible completion or development. She writes: 'Considered as fragments... ruins can also seem curiously timeless: detached from their original contexts they are also in some

¹⁶ Ozick, 'The Phantasmagoria of Bruno Schulz', in *Art & Ardor* (New York: E. P. Dutton, 1984), p. 227.

sense isolated from the present and achieve or project a sense of wholeness through this apparent self-containment.’¹⁷ Thomas asserts a sense of futurity when she continues, ‘By contrast, the fragment is more fluid... by relating to the present or to the future, it appears less historically specific... a fragment can refer back to a whole that has passed away... But it also has a uniquely forward-looking aspect’ (*Romanticism*, p. 43). She refers to the fragment as ‘a figure for coming into being, as the perfect expression of their [German Romantic writers’] view of Romantic poetry as, on the one hand, all-encompassing, but on the other, always in a state of becoming and never to be achieved’ (*ibid.*). The fragment allows a new future to be imagined, posthumously.

Schulz’s posthumous lives of the father shows how fragments might exist in new forms, such as a surviving character having a new mythic life. In ‘Fatherland’, Schulz retells a life seen as if posthumously, the narrator stating ‘I found myself abroad at last, in that realm of my youthful dreams I once ardently yearned for. Fulfilment came too late, though, and... I made my return not as a conqueror but as one of life’s derelicts.’¹⁸ Schulz returns to incomplete fragments of his childhood, family mythology creating the possibility of reentering the past and reimagining this time as if myth, enabling new meaning to be found within it. Schulz’s death, as if following the fate of the father in his stories, creates an absence that appears to open his life to be reimagined by others.

Fragments of time in his stories offer opportunities for attempts at completion and revision, inviting new fictional worlds as shown in Grossman’s and Ozick’s remaking of his worlds. Their return is as if to primal memory, resurrecting Schulz’s life via fragments of historical time that offer opportunities for new narrative forms. Their fiction engages with historical time as if to try to complete it or at least to supplement it. The posthumous temporality developed by Schulz, using fragmented selves, acts as a model for writers as they reimagine historical time via fiction. His stories present an indeterminate historical time, inviting writers to construct more narratives; posthumous readings of his stories suggest new totalities, versions of historical time and interpretations of fictional uses of temporality.

¹⁷ Sophie Thomas, *Romanticism and Visuality: Fragments, History, Spectacle* (New York: Routledge, 2008), p. 43. Thomas considers the evolution of the idea of the ruin, pp. 40-67.

¹⁸ Schulz, ‘Fatherland’, *Street*, p. 330.

5. Posthumous fictional supplementations of Schulz's fictions

Grossman's and Ozick's mimetic approach to the fragmentation of historical time in Schulz's writing is an attempt to offer him a new historical time that reflects his own vision, using his writing as a model. Their imagining of the past is in the context of disappearance (of some of his work, including writings) and his murder. The second section of Grossman's *See Under: Love* describes a writer obsessed with Schulz, and is set within a framework of writing about tragedy in the 20th century, taking a fictional approach to historical time.

Grossman's portrayal of Schulz includes his ventriloquization through the narrator Momik, who copies text from Schulz's stories into his notebook, and then, 'Whenever I finished copying some passage, my pen would jiggle around a few more times and litter the page with a line or two of my own – though how shall I put it – in Bruno's voice.'¹⁹ Momik's narration offers a return to Schulz's life, the narrator describing his possession by Schulz as if it were real, going back to and reimagining his life and transforming it, using primal elements of his life to reimagine historical time.

As Momik appears to resurrect Schulz, as if he is a posthumous heteronymic mask, the narrative extenuates mythic elements of his life and writing, interpreting historical time from a perspective in which death is negated, while creating a new story. Momik describes the imagined extra-temporality of Schulz, reborn and escaped, avoiding the death of his original historical time (*Love*, p. 100):

Bruno had not been murdered in the Drohobycz Ghetto in 1942. He had escaped. When I say "escaped," I don't mean it in the usual sense of the word but, in the special sense Bruno might have given a word like "pensioner," signifying *someone who crosses the prescribed and generally accepted borders and brings himself to the magnetic field of a different dimension of existence, traveling light...*

Grossman's supplementation of Schulz through Momik's narrative and his apparent possession by Schulz shows how historical memory can be animated posthumously while also displacing historical time. In the 'Bruno' section, the posthumous perspective leads to a primal memory, under water, Schulz emerging there via the hand of Momik. Momik describes Schulz in this posthumous temporality in which he appears to go back to his birth or a primal memory (*Love*, pp. 171-172):

¹⁹ Grossman, *Love*, p. 100.

...in the midst of all the glowing and dimming, Bruno was galloping backward and forward in “time” as well: one moment he was a mature man burning with tremendous force, and the next moment, an alert and lively child straining to contain his fullness in the hoops of his frail body, and later – but what’s this? – he is regressing further still, to the plumpness of babyhood.

Time here is confused, the supplementation of historical memory through the incorporation of posthumous temporality creating a historical time that is disruptive, open to new ruptures and memories. Grossman’s reimagining of the historical time of Schulz, including historical reinterpretation and phantasmagoria – draws on Schulz’s ideas of historical time, as if this is taking over this section of the novel. Grossman’s narrative supplements Schulz’s life by imagining an alternative history, his fiction offering a different approach to mourning Schulz.

The posthumous sublime of Grossman’s portrayal of Schulz reimagines the surviving historical figure in new mythic terms, responding to what has been lost. It is as if the void demands the new author to create a posthumous supplement. Grossman dramatizes Momik’s need to supplement what has been lost; writing of the White Room in the Yad Vashem Holocaust History Museum in Jerusalem, Momik relates that Ayala ‘told me that first night that the White Room was the ““real testing-ground for anyone who wants to write about the Holocaust. Like the riddling Sphinx. And you go there to present yourself willingly before the Sphinx, understand?”’ (*Love*, p. 123). The Sphinx here alludes to the role of the Sphinx in Sophocles’ Oedipal tragedy, as well as the Sphinx’s traditional ability to cross between the worlds of the living and the dead.

The White Room appears to Ayala as a liminal space, possessing a mythic temporality that exists in relation to a historical time that is normally inaccessible. It is like the womb-like and mythic interior chambers that Schulz reveals in his stories, where an adventure or new narrative begins, as in ‘The Night of the Great Season’, in which his Father’s shop is described: ‘The walls of the shop disappeared under the powerful formations of that cosmogony of cloth, under its mountain ranges that rose in imposing massifs... The interior of the shop formed itself into the panorama of an autumn landscape.’²⁰ In these transitional, mythic spaces, the past comes alive, birds arriving in Schulz’s landscape as if returning to their ‘ancient motherland after numerous generations, on the last day before the extinction of the tribe’ (‘The Night of

²⁰ Schulz, ‘The Night of the Great Season’, *Street*, p. 89.

the Great Season', p. 92). Schulz's mythification in his stories builds on historical and apocalyptic tales, offering imaginary times that Grossman and others are drawn to.

Grossman's fictional Schulz is a response to the loss of the historic Schulz; however, the more that Momik realises Schulz, the more fictional the fantasy of Schulz appears. The posthumous time created by Momik gives Schulz a new body, a new life, imagines him as a salmon, the underwater narrative suggesting an exploration of the unconscious. Momik's fiction of Schulz includes a sense of primal memory – both a return to the origin and also to the erased or hidden unconscious. His version of Schulz supplements what has been lost. Grossman writes, as Momik (*Love*, pp. 180-181):

"I saw that Bruno was in convulsions, throughout which he was shrinking more and more, not in size, perhaps, but in essence, his existence becoming more airy, more abstract..."

For an instant he materialized again: half his face, the cleft of his mouth, one eye, and a throbbing gill. With a terrible smile he said, "In our new world, Shloma, even death will belong to man, and when a person wishes to die, he will only have to whisper his body code to his soul."

Power over death is part of the posthumous perspective that Grossman creates, his supplementation of Schulz's life relating to both primal and posthumous elements. Mimesis is part of this power, his narrative echoing Schulz's writing, the past being extenuated in a mythic form. The text provides an alternative vision of Schulz's lost history, much of his work having been lost and his having been killed. Grossman seeks to liberate Schulz through his fiction as if from historical time, by creating a new mythical time. The resulting narrative does not release either Momik or Schulz from historical time, for a new sense of the past possesses Momik.

Momik's posthumous reimagination of the primal origin and of historical time shows how absence and mourning can be incorporated within fictional narratives, opening a space for new narratives of historical memory. This idea of historical time, incorporating rupture, requires ongoing supplementation, as if in perpetual pursuit of completion. Grossman's supplementation of Schulz's historical time is incomplete, and might be read in relation to Derrida's interpretation of Rousseau's approach to the concept of the supplement. This involves the supplement as more than just in relation to a missing origin, but to the role of absence more generally within writing, language and historical time.

Understanding supplementation of historical time via the use of posthumous narration is key to readings of Ozick's novel *The Messiah of Stockholm*, about a journalist in Sweden who has convinced himself that he is the son of Schulz and who is passed a missing manuscript that he believes to have been written by Schulz. Like

Grossman's version of Schulz, Ozick's phantasmagorical representation of Schulz operates as a fantasy in pursuit of the real, in the form of the missing manuscript of Schulz's 'The Messiah'. This apocryphal manuscript also stands for, in Ozick's own terms, the 'posthumous sublime'²¹ existing as if outside of time, a memory reactivated. Just as Momik imagines himself to be the son of Schulz, Lars in *The Messiah of Stockholm* also does, as if continuing or creating another branch of Schulz's family mythology.

The novel's fictional discovery of the lost or apocryphal text of 'The Messiah' is an opening for a new history, but when Ozick reveals the inauthentic status of the manuscript this creates a new void, as if demanding further supplementation. Later in the novel, Ozick creates her own supplement of this absence, Schulz's writing revived in a frenzied, poetic passage describing the birth of a mythical bird-like creature,

fabricated of various commonplace inanimate materials, none of them costly or in any way precious – cotton, cardboard, glue, thread, and not a wisp of hay anywhere. Its locomotion was dimly frightening but also hobbled and limited: it had several hundred winglike sails that tossed themselves either clockwise or counterclockwise, like the arms of a windmill [. . .] The Messiah had given birth to a bird, and the moment the bird flew living out of the relentlessly wheeling contrivance that had been the Messiah, the thing – or organism – collapsed with the noise of vast crashings and crushings.²²

Ozick's mimetic vision of 'The Messiah' is a posthumous supplementation of Schulz, but her recuperation of the text is a traumatized vision, both the Messiah and its avian offspring apparently unable to sustain life. Ozick's imitation and supplementation of Schulz reconstructs the lost text, but her supplement itself represents a ruin in terms of its broken relation to the unknown original. Her representation of an imagined, resurrected literary figure follows a modern tradition of the recuperation of the archaic image, a return to the primal cultural figure, including Freud's return to Oedipus, which is also echoed in the work of some of his detractors, including Jean Cocteau in his dramatic versions of the Oedipus myth.²³

²¹ Ozick 'Posthumous', pp. 26-41.

²² Ozick, *The Messiah of Stockholm* (New York: Vintage Books, 1988), pp. 110-111.

²³ Jean Cocteau wrote one play using the Oedipus myth, *La machine infernale* (1961) and a libretto for Igor Stravinsky's operatic version of Sophocles' *Oedipus Rex*. The theme of the resurrection of myth in modern drama and thought are considered in Almut-Barbara Renger's *Oedipus and the Sphinx: The Threshold Myth from Sophocles through Freud to Cocteau*, trans. by Duncan Alexander Smart and David Rice, with John T. Hamilton (University of Chicago Press, 2013).

Ozick's mythical bird-like creature is like the creature imagined by Schulz in his representation of the Father in 'Visitation': 'In his crouching pose, with misty eyes and a sly smile on his lips, he remained for long periods without moving, except to flap his arms like wings and crow like a cock whenever anybody entered the room.'²⁴ Borderline biblical, likened to an Old Testament prophet, the Father, 'behind a windmill of arms, a screen of desperate wriggings of which there towered his voice, grown unfamiliar and hard, I understood the divine anger of saintly men' ('Visitation', p. 14). Ozick and Schulz's portraits offer these Sphinx-like creations within a posthumous temporality, not as figures of mourning but as historical resurrections and decryptions.

Posthumous temporality within fiction represents not just the interruption of historical time, but its reinvention and reimagining, in which fragments are developed as supplements that then engage with new forms of historical time. Phantasmal presences of historical time are incorporated within fictions, presenting posthumous mimeses of of Schulz's writing, including primal aspects.

The fictional versions of Schulz, occupying posthumous temporalities, connect with spectral appearances within the archive explored by Derrida. His concern for spectres, crypts and other ghostly and hidden forms in his later critical works relates to absence within historical time that develops in his earlier writings on supplementarity and origins in *Of Grammatology* and *Speech and Phenomena*. From the perspective of the supplement, the spectre within biographical and fictional writing is a posthumous development of the crypt within narrative, of spaces and temporalities representing a 'memory... given over to the specter.'²⁵

Grossman's and Ozick's supplementation of Schulz's life is a response to Schulz's death and the void in historical time that it created. Both writers attempt to give his life a new sense of historical time, inspired by his use of posthumous and mythic narratives. This attempt is also visible in Foer's *Tree of Codes*; while fragmentary, this is also a supplement to Schulz's writing, sharing approaches to the fictionalisation of the posthumously imagined lives of other writers such as Pessoa and Benjamin, as well as Schulz.

²⁴ Schulz, 'Visitation', *Street*, pp. 16-17.

²⁵ Derrida, *Archive*, p. 100.

6. Posthumous supplementation, fragmentation and historical time

Schulz, murdered in Drohobycz, left behind a void in historical memory; in its place, heroic stories of posthumous survival are imagined and retold, engaging with what he wrote and what he might have written. Against the void, the fictionalized figure of Schulz gains historical presence in fiction, however inauthentic or fantastical the historical claims of these texts. Foer's *Tree of Codes* gives Schulz's text of *The Street of Crocodiles* a new setting. It is a form of memorial to Schulz, a fragmented supplement to his absence. The fragmentation is reflected in the title, having itself been reduced from the translation of Schulz's title *The Street of Crocodiles*. On each page, only a small number of printed words physically remain, creating a new single story out of many. Most of the book's words have been excised, the pages punched through and perforated via software-calibrated machinery.

Through the book, Foer created a memorial of fragments, the surviving words and letters forming a literary remainder, a new story, with selections of words from Schulz's texts (in English translation) incarnating memory while disincarnating it via the perforation. The book preserves some expressions while whole sections and words are elided from the original. The new narrative demands to be read in terms of how it operates in relation to absence, the fragments offering hints of Schulz's enchantment against the threat of the void. Foer's transformation of Schulz is neither apocalyptic nor redemptive, but a continuation of form that makes new worlds out of surviving fragments of lost time.

In his afterword, Foer explains: 'For years I had wanted to create a die-cut book by erasure, a book whose meaning was exhumed from another book... I was in search of a text whose erasure would somehow be a continuation of its creation.'²⁶ Foer's reduction of Schulz's text plays with the words encrypted and buried within the original stories as if he is uncovering them, selected as if to highlight their existence within the crypt, their poetic energy remaining after fragmentation. It is a radical fictional approach to reimagining historical memory, fragmenting time, creating voids, Foer's fragmentation of Schulz's text being both supplement and fragment. By taking away letters and words, the text is in dialogue with the original text, Foer's work continuing Schulz's writing while taking a wider account of its place within historical memory and Schulz's personal mythology.

²⁶ Jonathan Safran Foer, *Tree of Codes* (London: Visual Editions, 2010), p. 138.

Like the fictions of Grossman and Ozick, Foer's text remembers Schulz's work, his stories being reimagined and supplemented through absences and fragmentation. The supplementation of Schulz's work by Foer through excision creates a posthumous temporality in which Schulz's original text is evoked and recreated, as if narrating what is hidden within it. Foer is writing as part of a chain of supplementation, a concept Derrida develops in *Of Grammatology*. Derrida considers texts to be supplements that are in a dynamic relation to their absent origin and hidden presences. The engagement of writing with crypts within texts involves absence and presence in a continual exchange. He writes:

It is always necessary to add a supplement of presence to the presence that is concealed... The present is originary, that is to say the determination of origin always has the form of presence. Birth is the birth (of) presence. Before it there is no presence; and from the moment that presence, holding or announcing itself to itself, breaches its plenitude and starts the chain of its history, death's work has begun.²⁷

This description reflects how posthumous fictional narrative may connect with the primal, engaging with historical time, embodying what Derrida describes as 'an irrepressible desire to return to the origin.'²⁸ Posthumous supplements take on various guises, both metaphorical and material, supplementing the archive by responding to and incorporating historical elements, fictional and material, within fictional narrative.

In his 2008 foreword to a translation of Schulz's *The Street of Crocodiles*, Foer refers to the posthumous discovery of some of Schulz's artistic work, a matter described by Ficowski in his biography of Schulz.²⁹ In February 2001, Benjamin Geissler, a German documentary filmmaker, discovered the fairytale murals that Schulz had created, under compulsion, for the Gestapo officer Felix Landau in Drohobycz. Following this, restoration by Ukrainian conservation workers began, who informed Yad Vashem, the Israeli Holocaust museum, of the work. In May 2001, Yad Vashem representatives went to Drohobycz to examine the mural and later removed five large fragments, taking them to Jerusalem. To some, including Geissler, this was an act of cultural sabotage, while those working on behalf of Yad Vashem believed they were saving the murals from neo-Nazi desecration, bringing the works within the protection of the Israeli state.³⁰

²⁷ Derrida, *Of Grammatology*, 1976, p. 309.

²⁸ Derrida, *Archive*, p. 91.

²⁹ See Ficowski, 'The Last Fairytale of Bruno Schulz', *Regions*, pp. 163-172.

³⁰ This episode is told in detail by Jaimy Gordon, 'The Strange Afterlife of Bruno Schulz', *Michigan Quarterly Review*, vol. xliii, issue 1 (Winter 2004) [online, last accessed 19/2/18].

One of Schulz's mural paintings now held at Yad Vashem shows a carriage driver, whose face, Ficowski notes (p. 171), suggests a self-portrait, an example of his posthumous fragmentary survival. The mural represents the posthumous presence of fragments of Schulz's work. The fragmented paintings have existed in various settings, from the cryptic space of the original house, to the gallery of Yad Vashem³¹ and films created by Geissler, including the *The Picture Chamber of Bruno Schulz* (2012),³² a multimedia installation.

The mural's history indicates the complex relationship of cultural fragments to the past that is still active within the historical imagination. In his foreword to Schulz's *The Street of Crocodiles*, Foer writes: 'The whole story could have been told like this: in Jerusalem there is a wall, under whose surface is an unfinished fairy tale, painted sixty years before and a continent away by the Jewish writer Bruno Schulz, for the pleasure of his captor's child.'³³ This story itself fragments the story of Schulz's paintings, in a similar way to his fragmentation of Schulz's stories, historical presence erased and supplemented in synchronous movements.

7. Incorporations of posthumous temporality and fragmented primal memory within historical time

While Schulz's biographer Ficowski searches for his missing novel *The Messiah*³⁴ and other lost creations, Foer's *Tree of Codes* offers a posthumous literary exchange with Schulz's life and work, sculpting textual fragments to create a new dialogue between the present and lost time, recognising voids of historical memory. His fragmentation and reconfiguration of *The Street of Crocodiles* breathes new life into and reinterprets Schulz's modernist poetics and imaginary worlds. While heightened and fantastic relations to time exist in the original work of Schulz, Foer's fragmentation uses varieties of elision, compression and condensation to transform the text into a world that distorts Schulz's text, with 'the wrong staircase, unfamiliar balconies, unexpected doors strange empty courtyards. Full of vast faded mirrors, our apartment sank deeper

³¹ See www1.yadvashem.org/yv/en/education/newsletter/16/new_yv1.pdf [last accessed 25/01/2017].

³² *The Picture Chamber of Bruno Schulz* (2012) opened on 15 September 2012 in Freiburg, Germany. See www.lvivcenter.org/en/chronicle/news/?newsid=867 [last accessed 25/01/2017].

³³ Foer, Foreword, Schulz, *Street*, p. viii.

³⁴ See Ficowski, 'Awaiting *Messiah* – a Postscript', *Regions*, pp. 155–62.

owing to my mother, endlessly everywhere discarded.’³⁵ But these fragments are also recognisable as Schulz’s, the original text resisting complete erasure or enmasking.

Foer imagines and reveals latent figures, the surviving fragments suggesting a world not only fragmented but disordered, with new physical laws and metaphysical codes, in which ‘The silence talked, the bright silence argued, time filled the room, the bright silence rising from the clock. Submerged in the green and blind with age, we rediscovered life’ (*Tree*, pp. 14–15). Foer uses distorted and fragmented figures within the surviving text, a supplement that intentionally erases and disfigures Schulz’s work. Foer presents these curated fragments, which like recovered dreams stand in relation to a past that is now unconscious or hidden. The fragments are disclosed, but in a defaced and disguised condition.

Foer’s fragmentation of Schulz’s text dramatizes the relation between memory and the lost time of the author and his writing. Foer’s excision of Schulz’s work verges on the abyss, as *The Street of Crocodiles* collapses into *Tree of Codes* (*Tree*, pp. 106–8):

Perhaps the city had ceased to exist? Perhaps the spaces suggested by the wind did not exist? Only an invention of loneliness confused and unconnected. We sat together, listening to the attic in the wind; how it inhaled, stretching out the rafters, grew and resounded. And then we forgot what it was all about. It seemed he might disintegrate.

These implosive emptinesses in the text echo the material voids of Foer’s book, each page missing most of its words. Foer’s fragmentation and excision of Schulz’s work is an intentional decryption of the lost worlds of Schulz, a means towards exhuming and reanimating the hidden forms of his work, treating them as fragments that may be brought to life. Foer’s text is a supplement that both displaces and emulates a lost origin, though the original text (*The Street of Crocodiles*) itself survives. Foer’s text is not an apocryphal fragment. The reader has to bridge the lost historical time that haunts the spaces and excisions within Foer’s text, reflecting Christopher Woodward’s observation that ‘A ruin is a dialogue between an incomplete reality and the imagination of the spectator.’³⁶ Foer indicates that through fragmentation, historical time may be reimagined.

While fragments are often oriented more towards either origins or endings, his work suggests a different idea of totality within historical time, a totality constructed

³⁵ Foer, *Tree*, pp. 22–23.

³⁶ Christopher Woodward, *In Ruins* (London, Vintage, 2002), p. 139.

posthumously, achieving completeness in connection to both the primal origin (Schulz's text) and a posthumous interpretation that develops and emphasises Schulz's sense of mythology.

Foer's creation of a narrative supplement from Schulz's work is part of an attempted reintegration of a posthumous mythic time with historical time, working at a site of rupture. In modern fiction and memoir, the attempt to remember, capture or decrypt a remote, difficult to retrieve, hidden past is sometimes a response to the perception of memory's own fragmentation, encryption and hiddenness. Via mimesis and other forms of engagement with the past, fiction often remains connected to a desire to save historical memory from disintegration, even if this reintegration might depend on imaginary constructions, as we have seen in Grossman and Ozick's novels.

Foer's fragmentation of Schulz's text in pursuit of primal or originary presences points to a new imaginary totality or form that exceeds the original. His text is part of a chain of supplementation, of absences followed by presences and further absences; *Tree of Codes* is posthumously engaging with Schulz's text within a broader historical totality, inviting new understandings of historical time. Fragments within Foer's narrative offer a connection to a missing origin, but as supplements they also offer the possibility of new presences which may form around the fragment.

8. Disintegration and other forms of posthumous survival in Foer's *Tree of Codes*

In fragmenting Schulz's text, Foer alters but also amplifies its temporalities and untimely presences, including spectral remains of characters, such as the posthumous presence of the father in the final section. In Schulz's story 'Father's Last Escape', he writes, 'my father was definitely dead. He had been dying a number of times, always with some reservations that forced us to revise our attitude toward the fact of his death' ('Father's', p. 307). We discover that in Schulz's text father's death itself was fragmented, the narrator noting that 'By dividing his death into instalments, Father had familiarized us with his demise' (ibid.). Foer continues this supplementary temporality, in which death is fragmentary.

The various incarnations of the dead father in Schulz's text forms a posthumous scene; his death by 'instalments' allows for a sense of his imagined future life within memory and his absence after death, in an incremental mourning. The narrator notes of the father how 'His features were already dispersed throughout the room in which he had lived, and were sprouting in it, creating at some points strange knots of likeness

that were most expressive' ('Father's', p. 307). Schulz describes the gradual taking over of the crypt with the absence of the Father, as if his primal memory is sublimated as archival survivals, reduced to deviant, cryptic furnishing. Schulz describes how 'The wallpaper began in certain places to initiate his habitual nervous tic; the flower designs arranged themselves into the doleful elements of his smile, symmetrical as the fossilized imprint of a trilobite' ('Father's', pp. 307-308). The room is alive, as if animated by the Father who takes on various forms: 'For a time, we gave a wide berth to his fur coat lined with polecat skins. The fur coat breathed... Putting one's ear against it, one could hear the melodious purring unison of the animals' sleep' ('Father's', p. 308).

Having metamorphosed into a crab in the next section, then been cooked for his family's meal, the narrator asks, 'Why didn't he give up, why didn't he admit that he was beaten when there was every reason to do so and when even Fate could go no further in utterly confounding him?' ('Father's', p. 311). Schulz's 'extension of the story beyond permissible limits' (ibid.) emphasises both the nature of posthumous temporality but also this time's relation to the primal, as if the Father is imitating primal essences of life that carry on within this posthumous sublime. The story displays an 'endless prosopopeia',³⁷ masks of death incorporated within life, while connecting this with the survival of a primordial memory.

Foer's text uses elements of Schulz's narrative structures, his fragmentation of the text remaking the crypt-like interiors and discovering hidden forms within Schulz's world. Foer breathes within Schulz's text, his narrative presence inhabiting the spaces made within the original stories, writing: 'at each turn I found myself in an even wider, more sumptuous interior. I faced all that magnificence with awe, with a beating heart. I saw on the far side of living. The constellations were lit by the city... I wanted a night that would not end.'³⁸ Schulz's world is inverted, with interiors enlarging and the universe up-lit by the city.

Foer creates a new posthumous presence within Schulz's work through his use of intentional fragmentation. The voids are a continuation and supplementation of Schulz's work and his historical memory. Within the void the mother and father appear, Foer writing, again reducing Schulz: 'When writing these tales about my father, I surrender to the secret hope that they will merge into the rustle of pages and become

³⁷ de Man, 'Shelley Disfigured', p. 122.

³⁸ Foer, *Tree*, pp. 82–86.

absorbed there' (p. 110). The stories appear destined to disappear, retreating, in Ficowski's words 'into seeming non-existence in order to exist',³⁹ trying to be invisible in order to survive. Foer later writes: 'We agreed without regret to a gradual shedding of character. Reduced to the indispensable minimum, I drove small nails into the wall of existence.'⁴⁰

Disintegration is a form of survival here. However, the mother and father also take on strong spectral presences, the heightened, mythic spectrality of Foer's text decrypting some of Schulz's figures: 'sometimes during the night we were awakened by nightmares, shadows fled sideways along the floor and up the walls – crossing the borders of almost. Hideously enlarged shadows attached to my father. He would spend whole days in bed, surrounded by Mother. He became almost insane with mother' (*Tree*, pp. 23-25). Foer continues: 'he was absorbed, lost, in an enormous shadow. From time to time he raised his eyes as if to come up for air, and looked around helplessly, and ran to the corner of the room' (*Tree*, pp. 25-26). These are fantastic figures that have been decrypted, but disfigured, mutated or reduced to fragments, surviving like faded or distorted icons in the text, their physical or metaphysical nature uncertain.

Foer describes the mother as having 'a face from which life was walking, a pale network of lines on an old map of distant lands wandering over memories which would suddenly blow away' (*Tree*, pp. 19-20). His image captures a sense of the exposure of the personal interior, the delicate superstructure of memory leaving the 'old map of distant lands' in its place, building on the previous transformation of personal history into myth by Schulz. In an essay published in 1935, Schulz describes how in his writing, 'I have attempted to uncover my own private mythology, my own "stories," my own mythic family tree.'⁴¹ He continues, emphasising his intent, 'Just as the ancients traced their ancestry from mythical unions with gods, so I undertook to establish for myself some mythical generation of forebears, a fictitious family from which I trace my true descent' (*Letters*, p. 114).

Foer's emphasis on the survival and posthumous temporality of the father and the mother extenuates Schulz's mythology, giving them a new spectral life as fragments within the stories' ruins. They are survivals of the primordial world reimagined by

³⁹ Ficowski, 'Mimesis', in *Waiting for the Dog to Sleep* (Prague; Twisted Spoon Press, 2006), p. 77. This collection of stories by Ficowski reinterprets Schulz's world in the post Second World War period.

⁴⁰ Foer, *Tree*, pp. 127–128. We are reminded here of Schulz's story 'Sanatorium Under the Sign of the Hourglass' in which the dead are sent to a Sanatorium where time is slowed down.

⁴¹ Schulz, 'An Essay for S. I. Witkiewicz', in *Letters and Drawings of Bruno Schulz*, ed. by Jerzy Ficowski (New York: Fromm, 1990), p. 114.

Schulz, operating as posthumous signs of the world that has been lost and excised. Foer's decryption of Schulz's writing, reworking figures that are fractured, disguised or reduced, draws us to a further reading of Derrida's *Archive Fever* in relation to Jensen's *Gradiva*.

9. Posthumous fragmentation, supplementation and defacement within the voids of historical memory

Foer's *Tree of Codes* operates as if posthumously recreating primal senses within Schulz's writing. Voids offers the opportunity for new appearances, for delusions of the past and the origin being 'present itself in person'.⁴² Just as Hanold believes in the posthumous life of historical memory and the survival of Gradiva, so Foer presents the figures of mother and father as if they are still alive. Derrida refers to Freud's interpretation of the delusions of Hanold, writing of the spectres that Freud 'believes he [Hanold] has exorcised them in the instant he lets them talk, providing that these specters talk, he believes, in the figurative.' This double movement, of the emergence of historical time while also its being encrypted, signals the active relation between the posthumous and the primal, the opening of the past and its being newly encrypted.

Hanold's delusion is a form of recovery of lost time, his fictional primal memory existing as a presence in the void that becomes the key to understanding earlier memories, including the identity of Gradiva. Grossman's and Ozick's fictions, as well as those by Schulz and Foer, seek to reveal primal origins within historical time, bringing these to life within a posthumous temporality. We may recall again Freud's words 'Saxa loquuntur!'⁴³ ('Stones talk!') and consider Schulz's figure of the father calling out in 'Tailors' Dummies': 'Have you heard at night the terrible howling of these wax figures, shut in their fair booths; the pitiful chorus of those forms of wood or porcelain, banging their fists against the walls of their prisons?' (p. 36).

In Derrida's reframing of the archive, following Freud, historical time is reimagined and renarrated, as Momik does in *See Under: Love* and Lars attempts to in *The Messiah of Stockholm*. Foer's story, using Schulz's text, creates posthumous forms out of fragmented memory, reimagining historical time and framing primal memories. In these narratives Schulz is both hidden and revealed, whole and yet fractured,

⁴² Derrida, *Archive*, p. 93.

⁴³ Freud, vol. iii, p. 192.

decrypted and yet encrypted, his mythic elements revealed yet defaced, masked, fragmented.

This appearance of Schulz's text in Foer's is not a basic mimesis, but a complex reconfiguration of the past. Foer's *Tree of Codes* develops Schulz's model of posthumous temporality and fragmentation. Through excision, Foer amplifies and condenses Schulz's effects, sometimes distorting them, creating new dramatic elisions and metaphysical leaps. Schulz posthumous approach to time haunts Foer's textual fragments. Each fragment represents disfigured time, but also creates a new time formed by the fragments. Foer responds to the crypt of Schulz's writing by appearing to decrypt it, as if fragmentation will offer revelation, reanimating figures of Schulz's text while excising the text.

Tree of Codes offers form and animation to fragments, producing new bodies by acting on the bodies within Schulz's texts. Hinting at the ongoing presence of Schulz's text, the characters crossing from Schulz's to Foer's work carry senses of fragmentation and deformation, for example in this evocation of the father, who would, 'walk along like a gardener of nothingness, outside of the surface of life. He seemed to scatter into fragments, an enormous featureless dignity, an older material' (*Tree*, pp. 37-40). These surviving, palimpsest bodies hint at encryption, but also reveal how bodies exist within texts, possessing their own time within narrative time. This bodily sense of posthumous temporality is integral to its production of narrative time in relation to the past. *Tree of Codes* holds traces of lost figures from Schulz's writing, the surviving fragmentary text existing in shadow relation to his stories. Foer decrypts the figurative forms and fragments of memory to offer the possibility of illumination and the literary recovery of the disintegrated past.

Foer's return to Schulz is an attempt to find his phantom body, as if going back to his text will create another supplementary version of Schulz drawn against the void of lost historical memory. His text masks Schulz, while appearing to unmask him, finding what lies behind the mask, following Lukacher's comments on prosopopeia on how the masked actor reminds the audience 'that the voice that speaks is already dead but also that it lives on behind the mask. With each utterance the voice announces that it is neither properly dead nor alive but somewhere between the two.'⁴⁴ Foer's masks are disfigurements that presents a new figuration, fragmentations of historical bodies in a posthumous temporality giving Schulz's characters new life. They are

⁴⁴ Lukacher, *Primal*, p. 90.

resurrected through fragmentation, revealing forms buried within the text, primal essences exposed and liberated. Schulz's text is a mask to be removed, to find out what may be hidden underneath.

Foer includes various references to masks in his text; these are not of the dead but remnants of characters within Schulz's text. They are painted and barely concealing, Foer announcing how, 'Everyone wore his mask. Children greeted each other with masks painted on their faces' (*Tree*, p. 1). These masks do not hide the face, being incorporated into them, more prosthetic than disguise: 'I went in silence through the crowd of painted masks, swelling with pathos, with the tremor of moments of revelation. The masks whispered voicelessly, and I knew the curtain would open to reveal experience and honesty' (*Tree*, pp. 76-77).

Foer's masks take on a new life of the faces beneath; where the mask is too terrifying, it is hidden: 'No human could bear such a tragic mask. He would run to a corner of the room and shake. He no longer possessed resistance... He hid in corners' (*Tree*, p. 100). These masks are also subject to fragmentation and disintegration: 'The plague of dusk spread from one object to another. People fled but the disease caught up with them and spread in a dark rash. Their faces disappeared. They continued, now featureless, shedding as they walked one mask after another. Everything disintegrated into that silent infinite' (*Tree*, pp. 113-114). This disintegration marks the ongoing presence of the posthumous, while still permitting resurrection, Foer's version of the father coming back to life in the final section of *Tree of Codes*. He writes: 'My father was the only one who knew a secret escape. His eyes closed. His gaze moved. Father saw no comet, leaving the comet behind. Left to itself, it withered away amid indifference. Richer by one more disappointment, life returned to its normal course. My father alone was awake, wandering silently through the rooms' (*Tree*, pp. 132-134). Foer's descriptions of the father are like the traces of an old, now distant, cosmic event.

As the father is reimagined in Grossman's and Ozick's novels, Foer also gives the father a new role, perhaps as if Schulz himself, a posthumous creature metamorphosed within the archive. The father reappears as a Sphinx-like creature within the liminal space of posthumous temporality. Foer's masking of Schulz as the father is part of the reimagined phantasmagoria of historical time, a posthumous supplement set against the voids of historical memory. In his foreword to *The Street of Crocodiles*, Foer refers to Schulz's story 'The Book', which 'some scholars suspect was

also part of *The Messiah*⁴⁵ (the manuscript of which was lost); the story's narrator 'recalls a volume – a lost volume – whose pages, when rubbed, reveal plumes of color.'⁴⁶ Schulz's story presents the uncovering of a primal memory, 'O that shedding of the film, O that invasion of brightness, that blissful spring, O Father' ('The Book', p. 115) referring to how 'a shiver ran through the columns of text, freeing from among the letters flocks of swallows and larks' ('The Book', p. 116). Foer's own shedding of words and verbal fragments uncovers and reveals hidden forms within Schulz's text, redacting the original text as if sculpting material from which the finished piece will emerge. fragmented from narrative time.

Foer's text restages Schulz's aesthetic energy and formal dynamism, finding new roots within his life and writing, treating Schulz's text as a primal form to be given new life, fragments animated against the void. Just as artists such as Kazimir Malevich present the void not as an intangible, metaphysical absolute, but that against and from which a composition appears to gain its form and presence, Foer's narrative presents fragmented appearances of self amid disappearing and distorting memory. The fragments he creates through excision are part of the articulation of memory, just as a void within an image or portrait can be intrinsic to a painting's composition.

10. Fragmentary form, historical memory and voids of historical time

Foer's text is a site, like a ruin, of the historical or literary consciousness where the text originally came into being, and so his work is a form of defacement, fragmentation and uncovering of the original, while incorporating new figures. In the previous chapter I considered defacement in relation to writing by Pessoa and de Man. Foer's fragmentation of Schulz' characters defaces historical memory by recreating characters in new settings, in the context of a void. The fragments remaining in Foer's text imply a memory of historical time, suggesting invisible forces of memory, of distortions, revisions and amplifications. This is another form of posthumous temporality, in which figures from the past are presented against a void. Susan Rubin Suleiman, in *Crises of Memory and the Second World War* (2006), analyses Perec's *W or the Memory of Childhood* in terms of biographical memory in relation to voids of not knowing and the unspoken. Textual fragments in Foer's text can be read in relation to this idea of lost

⁴⁵ Foer, Foreword, *Street*, p. viii.

⁴⁶ Schulz, 'The Book', *Street*, p. 115.

time, not to reconstruct lost time, but to affirm it by making the fragment stand in relation to it. The fragment is a sign of the past, and of the past's potential activation within the future, taken up by memory and the imagination.

The idea of fragmented subjects within representations of historical time has a precedent in some traditional Christian art, such as the iconic representation of Jesus and other religious figures created by Andrei Rublev in the 15th century, including within the Cathedral of the Annunciation in Moscow, created together with Prokhor of Gorodets and the Greek artist Theophanes.⁴⁷ In this art form, icons are dislocated from their moment of the subject's history, yet demand to be recognized as historical; it is an historical fragment, but a curated selection of the past rather than a ruin, this selection giving shape to the remaining content. The film director Andrei Tarkovsky connected the selectional nature of sculpting with the editing of temporal events to describe film-making:

What is the essence of the director's work? We could define it as sculpting in time. Just as a sculptor takes a lump of marble, and inwardly conscious of the features of his finished piece, removes everything that is not part of it – so the film-maker, from a 'lump of time' made up of an enormous, solid cluster of living facts, cuts off and discards whatever he does not need, leaving only what is to be an element of the finished film.⁴⁸

Tarkovsky's sense of 'sculpting in time' is also a consideration of lost time, and how what remains exists in relation to this. The iconic fragment has been used within other art forms, from the work of Schulz's contemporary Malevich, who reimagines the painted icon in relation to the void, to recent architectural forms marked by excision visible in European cities, such as those designed by Daniel Libeskind (Berlin's Jewish Museum), Peter Eisenman (the Berlin Holocaust Memorial) and Rachel Whiteread (the Vienna Holocaust Memorial).

The perceived fidelity of fragments to the past is illustrated in Whiteread's life-scale moulding of a library that forms the Holocaust Memorial in Vienna's Judenplatz, holding both the memory of the destroyed Jewish books and lives as well as the Nazi acts of cultural destruction. The fidelity is not just in the construction of fragments relating to the past, this metonymic gesture, but in the figuration of the void, the loss of memory against which the fragments survive. These fractures, excisions and intentional

⁴⁷ I refer to Andrei Rublev's work here especially because his life was the subject of the Soviet filmmaker Andrei Tarkovsky's film *Andrei Rublev* (1966).

⁴⁸ Andrei Tarkovsky, *Sculpting in Time*, trans. by Kitty Hunter-Blair (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1998), pp. 63–64.

absences commemorate lost life, time and memory. Foer's fictional uses of historical fragments that I have been exploring can be understood further in relation to these forms of ruptured historical time.

Foer's fragmentation of Schulz's work inflicts a temporal disruption and reframing, the remaining words creating a new textual and visual narrative form via cutting out, like a stop-motion animation.⁴⁹ The new frame sequence, with breaks between, suggests posthumous interruptions by external presences. Foer writes, following Schulz, as if commenting on broken forms of time: 'August has passed, and yet summer continues by force to grow days. They sprout secretly between the chapters of the year, covertly included between its pages the crumbling book of the calendar continues to increase between the boards.'⁵⁰ With time distorted and reworked, Foer's use of fragments engages with Schulz's characters via posthumousness, giving them new life. His modifications of the time of Schulz's text recalls Sebald's treatment of the recorded visual memory of Austerlitz's mother that I referred to in the Introduction. Austerlitz makes a slow-motion copy of the film that he thinks includes images of his mother, commenting that,

once the scant document was extended to four times its original length, it did reveal previously hidden objects and people, creating by default as it were, a different sort of film altogether... The men and women employed in the workshops now looked as if they were toiling in their sleep, so long did it take them to draw needle and thread through the air as they stitched, so heavily did their eyelids sink, so slowly did their lips move as they looked wearily up at the camera.⁵¹

Sebald's slowing down of time in *Austerlitz* is a form of unmasking, finding what is hidden in time, beneath the image or surface, under the mask. Narrative time is not something that is simply shaped, recalled or reconstructed, being part of a more complex form of fragments, layers and interpellations. Creating something new out of historical time, Foer's playful decryption of Schulz's work in *Tree of Codes* reveals how even the apocalypse is fragmented and reimagined, arriving 'In midsentence as it were, without a period or exclamation mark' (*Tree*, p. 130).

⁴⁹ Other works derived from Schulz's work include the Brothers Quay's stop-motion animation film 'Street of Crocodiles', 1986.

⁵⁰ Schulz, 'The Comet', *Street*, pp. 109-110.

⁵¹ Sebald, *Austerlitz*, pp. 345-348. The text is broken by a double page image, by implication representing a still from the film.

Foer's sculpted text reveals figures within lost historical time. Where memory fades, disappears, it is also open to reappearance. In the previous chapter we considered Saramago's reconstructive use of Pessoa's fragmentations of time within the posthumous temporality of his novel. Foer's palimpsest of bodies within narrative draws on Schulz's work, and like Grossman and Ozick he disfigures and reconfigures Schulz, while connecting with how posthumous temporalities in his narratives incorporate primal elements. The connection of the primal and posthumous in *Tree of Codes* includes how Foer's posthumous text implies the primal text of Schulz, the fragmented text an index of what came before. The incised words are visible by their absence (having been cut out), these negated forms being part of Foer's text. The textual fragments offer hope of a new imagined totality, using Schulz's elements, while set amidst the void of excised text.

Foer's focus on narrative fragmentation recalls Perec's use of fragments as part of narratives of memory. Suleiman highlights the role of the void of historical memory of Perec, as if in *W or the Memory of Childhood* he is trying to construct a self that might be seen in relation to this void. She quotes Perec's passage on his memory of parachuting: 'I suddenly saw, in the very instant of jumping, one way of deciphering the text of this memory; I was plunged into nothingness; all the threads were broken; I fell, on my own, without any support. The parachute opened.'⁵² Perec's text occupies at once voids, primal memories and the posthumous scene, as *Gradiva*/Zoë does in *Gradiva*, from Hanold's perspective.

Perec's absence of primal and childhood memory and other voids in historical time invites supplementation, whether by mask, mimesis, or invention, but the fictional supplementation possesses a danger of displacing traces of the original presence. Reinterpreting Rousseau's idea of the dangerous supplement, commented on by Derrida in *Of Grammatology*, we recall that Rousseau comments on the supplement's danger due to its remove from the vitality of the original. The danger of the fictional supplement is not this distance, but its proximity to the original that threatens displacement of historical time. Foer's supplement is dangerous because it defaces Schulz, disturbing his texts, while engaging with its primal elements. Schulz's remaining words are fragments and survivals of his voice that appear like revelations, posthumously.

⁵² Perec, *W or the Memory of Childhood*, trans. by David Bellos (London: Collins Harvill, 1989), p. 55.

The fragmented voice of Schulz is like a secret disclosed within Foer's text. Lukacher comments on how language creates presences of the voice, writing that "'The Fading of Voices' is Barthes' version of this primal scene in the history of modern textuality."⁵³ He continues that 'the "Fading" of the subject, as a disappearance behind the watery luminescence of the *moiré* effect. What appears to be a glittering revelation turns out to be a secret concealment' (*Primal*, p. 72). Lukacher is responding to Barthes' sense of how the voice is more than language, which like a picture or photograph cannot be reduced to its basic structural elements. The 'secret concealment' of language that Lukacher refers to invites supplementation within the text to reveal what is hidden. This work of language against the concealment and the void is an act of presencing. He writes 'Anamnesis enables memory to make voice present to the self in the absence of the voice... for Barthes, what voice presences is an absence. But it is not a complete absence... What it brings to presence is static, the ever more distant sound of the drift of voice toward forgetfulness and oblivion' (*Primal*, p. 73).

The revoicing of an author in fiction, as found in Foer's, Ozick's and Grossman's books, presents their voice in relation to this absence, as if the historical self is seen and heard through what Lukacher refers to as a 'veil of half-mourning' (*Primal*, p. 90) following what de Man wrote on Shelley, referring to the 'endless prosopopoeia by which the dead are made to have a face and a voice which tells the allegory of their demise and allows us to apostrophize them in our turn.'⁵⁴ The posthumous perspective introduces a new void, of the fading and disappearance of memory, the reduction to masks, shadows, spectres and fragmentary representations. The void of primal memory creates the scene for the posthumous imagining of historical time.

The danger of the supplement, defacing the original, reminds the reader that historical time is constructed in this site of fading, the gradual abyss of lost time. Felman writes, reflecting on the potential for rethinking historical time in relation to this absence, and what may deliberately be hidden within historical memory, that 'de Man's work does not cancel out forgetfulness, but it gives our own historical forgetting the power to address us, to remind us that we have forgotten, once again, the horror, and the threat, and the murder, and the radical impossibility of witnessing, of the original.'⁵⁵

⁵³ Lukacher, *Primal*, p. 72.

⁵⁴ de Man, 'Shelley Disfigured', p. 122.

⁵⁵ Felman, *Testimony*, p. 164.

The dislocated original and voids of lost memory haunt these narratives engaging with Schulz's historical time via fiction. The original also haunts Derrida's writing on de Man, as he tries to articulate how de Man's past might be incorporated within the memory of him, writing that 'one has to interpret discontinuity as a conscious or unconscious ruse meant to hide a persistence or a subsistence, the stubborn repetition of an originary project.'⁵⁶ In the space of discontinuity, there is also the opportunity for reconstruction, for new posthumous presences created against the temporal void, against death and losses of memory, visible as reconstructed fragments of historical time.

11. Supplements of primal memory and recuperations of historical time

To develop my reading of narrative presences of posthumous temporality through Schulz's fiction, I will now further consider Perec's writing, which resonates with the themes of posthumousness and fragmentation. Perec's *Portrait of a Man*, first published posthumously in France in 2012, is narrated by an art forger, Gaspard Winckler. Winckler is caught between creating an authentic portrait, his own self-realisation and revitalisation and the destruction of the unreal image, a fake portrait, as if a false painted mask to be destroyed. This appears to lead to his murder of Madera, who commissioned the portrait he is painting. Winckler describes this portrait while painting it: 'Under the spotlights the Condottiere rose from his ashes: a face decomposed and disfigured, a man demolished, an absurd lunatic who had long ceased to be a conqueror. The clear gaze and luminous scar had given way to the harsh anxiety of illegitimate leadership.'⁵⁷ The portrait is caught between life and death, as if the artist must choose which one to represent, which might be the authentic representation and which is false.

The narrator asks of himself: 'What were you after? What did you want? To extract your past image from past ages? On the back of twelve years' cumulative experience in painterly technique you wanted to pull off the authentic creation of a masterpiece' (*Portrait*, p. 109). It is as if Winckler is trying to place his own image in the past to create a new historical memory, posthumously. He later goes on to describe his murder as another intervention in historical time, as 'A first autonomous action, the

⁵⁶ Derrida, *Memoires for Paul de Man*, trans. by Cecile Lindsay, Jonathan Culler, Eduardo Cadava and Peggy Kamuf (New York: Columbia University Press, 1989 revised edition), p. 232.

⁵⁷ Perec, *Portrait of a Man*, trans. by David Bellos (London: MacLehose Press, 2014), p. 109.

first act of freedom, the first evidence of a conscious mind' (*Portrait*, p. 157). It is a primal scene of creation, both in the attempt to create this historical memory – the forged portrait in his own style – as well as creating his own style at the same time, this 'first autonomous action', as if a fatal signature. Winckler is attempting to be released from the artificial appearance of the authentic, the artistic fake, in favour of a primal individuality.

Perec's novel dramatizes how an artist might discover this authentic historical time, a concern for authenticity that reappears in later novels, particularly *W or the Memory of Childhood*. The first published mention of *Portrait of a Man* is in this book, when the narrator refers to his own facial scar which is similar to that of the subject in Antonello da Messina's painting 'Il Condottiere', about whom Perec says he has written a book, 'the central figure in the first more or less complete novel I managed to write',⁵⁸ notably adding that 'at first it was called "Gaspard pas mort", then "Le Condottiere"' (*W*, pp. 108-109). Winckler also appears in *Life, A User's Manual*, first published in French in 1978. *Portrait of a Man* was discovered by Perec's biographer and English translator David Bellos after Perec's death. This early, buried root, is like a primal memory buried in Perec's past.

In *W*, Perec takes a new perspective on his past, reconstructing historical time using elements of fragmented memory and a childhood story that he retells. *W* presents two alternating narratives that evoke and reconstruct Perec's memory of his early years in the period of the Second World War and its aftermath. Perec's parents were Polish Jews who emigrated to France in the 1920s; both died during the war – his mother in Auschwitz in 1943 and his father in 1940, killed by German troops outside Paris, having enlisted as a foreign combatant. Perec was adopted by his paternal aunt and uncle in 1942. Many of his childhood memories were lost or buried, he states, but his novel attempts to create new connections with the past, as if within a posthumous temporality, acknowledging voids of memory while offering paths returning to historical time.

Writing in relation to his family memory, Perec finds ways of dramatizing and incorporating elements of the void. Referring to his absence of memory, Suleiman asks of Perec: 'How does one write an autobiography when one has "no childhood memories," as Perec states hyperbolically in the opening of the very first memory chapter of the book? One solution is to prop up memory with fiction; another is to make

⁵⁸ Perec, *W*, p. 108.

the absence of memory itself the subject of the book.⁵⁹ Perec returns to his childhood, attempting to create narratives out of imagined and real fragments of the past. Lukacher writes that ‘The construction of the primal scene is the only way to remember something of which there is no memory.’⁶⁰ The scene of memory’s evacuation or exclusion can become the site where historical time might begin to be reimagined.

Perec’s mention of having no childhood memories marks a kind of death; in this void, memories are recovered, invented and brought together. At the beginning of the book Perec writes how ‘there are two texts which simply alternate; you might almost believe they had nothing in common’,⁶¹ but, he says, they are ‘inextricably bound up with each other, as though neither could exist on its own, as though it were only their coming together, the distant light they cast on each other, that could make apparent what is never quite said in the other, but said only in their fragile overlapping.’⁶² It is here that the cryptic form of these alternating narratives is revealed: ‘One of these texts is entirely imaginary...The other text is an autobiography’.⁶³ Perec offers fictional and historical narratives in mutual supplementation, though he does not explicitly say which is fictional and which is historical; the childhood story ‘W’ has its own claim to historicity.

While the story appears to supplement Perec’s memory, it is also a stimulus for his childhood memories, presenting another example of a chain of supplements. Perec perceives that absence of memory demands supplementation, mimicking and recreating memories from fictional fragments that open the past. Bellos comments that Perec’s autobiographical writing has been written in a quasi-fictional mode in order to mimic autobiography, remarking that ‘almost every assertion in the memory chapters of *W* or *The Memory of Childhood* asks to be questioned, and the answer in most cases is that the memory, whether first consigned to the sealed envelope of Lieux or lying in Perec’s drawer of official documents, has been altered, reworked, decorated, or, more plainly, falsified.’⁶⁴

Bellos argues that Perec introduced errors that were intentional simulacra of false memories, also incorporating memory gaps that seem to demand further explanation

⁵⁹ Susan Rubin Suleiman, *Crises of Memory and the Second World War* (Cambridge, Ma.: Harvard University Press, 2006), p. 187.

⁶⁰ Lukacher, *Primal*, p. 96.

⁶¹ Perec, *W*, preface.

⁶² *Ibid.*

⁶³ *Ibid.*

⁶⁴ David Bellos, *Georges Perec: A Life in Words* (London: Collins Harvill, 1993), p. 548.

and supplementation. The alternation between memoir and story presents a disruption of fiction and memory. As Perec writes (*W*, p. 68):

there are memories – fleeting, persistent, trivial, burdensome – but there is nothing that binds them together. They are like unjoined-up writing, made of separate letters unable to forge themselves into word, which was my writing up to the age of seventeen or eighteen, or like the disassociated, dislocated drawings whose scattered elements almost never managed to connect up.

Perec's text shows how fragments can operate as both supplements and remains of the origin or primal memory that offer the opportunity for supplementation. Fragmentation is implied in supplementation, the fragment existing in relation to the void that demands supplementation and a new narrative. Perec's *W* opens history's narratives to posthumous re-inscription and imagining, the reconstruction of his childhood story standing in place of the history that might explain the deaths of his parents and the Holocaust. The story implies an alternative and fantastical rationale for the development of concentration camps, as if they were a perversion of an ideal that became too administratively complex and oblique (Perec writing '*The Law must be known by all, but the Law cannot be known*' (*W*, p. 117)), as if unintended consequences rather than having been pursued as an ideal in themselves.

Suleiman notes the schism in the alternation in Perec's narratives, where after Chapter 12 the childhood story follows itself in successive chapters. From this point, 'the *W* narrative shifts radically, for the first person narrator disappears and we have a series of impersonal descriptions of the island society that becomes more and more horrific.'⁶⁵ The break in alternation is a rupture, and there is some merging of the narratives as 'metonymic details... migrate from one series to the other' though the connection 'remains unknowable' (*Crises*, p. 191). Perec's novel reimagines buried historical time and uncovers memories; while pursuing primal memories via the separate story 'W', his other narrative describes how his (*W*, p. 68)

disassociated, dislocated drawings whose scattered elements almost never managed to connect up and with which, at the time of 'W', roughly, that is, between my eleventh and fifteenth year, I filled whole exercise books: human figures unrelated to the ground which was supposed to support them, ships with sails that did not touch masts and masts which did not fit into the hulls,

⁶⁵ Suleiman, *Crises*, p. 189.

machines of war, engines of death, flying machines and implausible mechanical vehicles with disconnected nozzles, discontinuous cordage, disengaged wheels rotating in the void.

These figures of fragmentation and dislocation project fantasies suspended in the void, animating memories of childhood. Perec's writing echoes Schulz's fragmentary, vivid forms and primordial memories. In Schulz's story 'The Age of Genius', the narrator describes how as a child he:

sat among the piles of paper, blinded by the glare, my eyes full of explosions, rockets, and colors, and I drew wildly, feverishly across the paper, over the printed or figure-covered pages. My colored pencils rushed in inspiration across columns of illegible text in masterly squiggles, in breakneck zigzags that knotted themselves suddenly into anagrams of vision, into enigmas of bright revelation, and then dissolved into empty, shiny flashes of lightning, following imaginary tracks.⁶⁶

These analogical passages show the writers developing primal scenes of writing; they possess an autonomous drive while also being fantastical, suspended in the void. Perec's 'dissociated, dislocated drawings' suggest that dislocation can create absence which demands supplementation, reconstruction, or suspension; we return to his description of parachuting, how 'I suddenly saw, in the very instant of jumping, one way of deciphering the text of this memory; I was plunged into nothingness; all the threads were broken; I fell, on my own, without any support. The parachute opened.'⁶⁷

Suleiman comments on Perec's use of suspension as 'spanning the realms of life and of rhetoric and carrying in a single word two totally contradictory meanings: rupture, anchor.'⁶⁸ She writes that suspension 'implies suspense, an interruption or deferral used to create heightened expectation and surprise. Suspension is thus a paradoxical figure, at once an omission and the promise of more to come' (*Crises*, p. 189). This suspension allows for supplementation, recreating what has been lost in the context of not having memories.⁶⁹ In Suleiman's analysis of memories of Holocaust survivors, she notes the literary engagement with Second World War history in works by authors ranging from Art Spiegelman to Patrick Modiano. For these writers, where there is fragmentation of

⁶⁶ Schulz, 'The Age of Genius', *Street*, pp. 131–32.

⁶⁷ Perec. *W*, p. 55

⁶⁸ Suleiman, *Crises*, p. 194.

⁶⁹ Suleiman refers to Perec's comments, printed in the untitled preface of the English translation: 'In this break, in this split suspending the story on an unidentifiable expectation, can be found the point of departure for the whole of this book: the points of suspension on which the broken threads of childhood and the web of writing are caught.'

biographical and historical memory there is the opportunity for origination and formal innovation.

Suleiman's analysis is relevant to authors' use and supplementation of Schulz's life. She refers to how the experience of the 1.5 generation – 'child survivors of the Holocaust, too young to have had an adult understanding of what was happening to them, and sometimes too young to have any memory of it at all, but old enough to have been there during the Nazi persecution of the Jews'⁷⁰ – is reflected in later fictional treatments of historical memory, such as the work of Perec and we may also include Foer (born 1977), whose ambitions for the novel's representation of history and traumatic cultural memory are conditioned by an acute sense of what has been lost. Marianne Hirsch writes of how, 'The structure of postmemory clarifies how the multiple ruptures and radical breaks introduced by trauma and catastrophe inflict intra-, inter-, and transgenerational inheritance.'⁷¹

Foer's use of fragments of Schulz's stories collected in *The Street of Crocodiles* reactivates the past, intentionally moving between memory and postmemory, but anchored by historical time, represented by Schulz's original text. He presents Schulz's words as if animating their hidden spectres, his fragmentation indicating a phantasmal sense of the palimpsest. Perec's work demonstrates other narrative ways in which historical memory is presented as fragment and supplement against the void of lost and erased memories, as if posthumously.

12. Supplementation, appearances of primal memory and voids of historical time

Perec's supplements of memory include cryptic approaches to historical memory. He comments on the development of his writing that (*W*, p. 42),

It is not – as for years I claimed it was – the effect of an unending oscillation between an as-yet undiscovered language of sincerity and the subterfuges of a writing concerned exclusively with shoring up its own defences: it is bound up with the matter of writing and the written matter, with the task of writing as well as with the task of remembering.

His comments on the 'matter of writing and the written matter' portray his development as a writer as more than a search for his own voice; it is the discovery of a writing that

⁷⁰ Suleiman, *Crises*, p. 179.

⁷¹ Marianne Hirsch, *The Generation of Postmemory: Writing and Visual Culture After the Holocaust* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2012), p. 33.

might bridge the time of remembering and historical time, including via fragmentation and supplementation.

The role of supplementarity, fragments and fictional historical crypts within Perec's fiction is related to this analysis of his self's relating to the world through writing. Each historical memory or narrative in *W* is an ongoing retelling or reconstruction of the past, fragments operating as supplements buried within his narratives, incorporating the imagined past. In the novel, Perec's memory of his parents has all but been completely lost. The primal memories, including the story that he salvages, rewrite the past as if from memory; the screen memory mimics primal memory, retrieved and retold in a posthumous mode. The 'W' story is a posthumous screen of the parents' memory; through it, Perec develops his own new historical memory, this supplement keeping the original alive as an absence. His revival of Winckler in 'W' is an attempt to go over historical time again, returning to this repressed figure who must be reimagined and projected against the void. Perec's return to Winckler is as if his past stands for some authentic or hidden self who has to be refound in his search for the truth about his memory after its disappearance.

Perec's recognition of the void in his memory indicates historical time's need for supplementation, including via fiction. His recollection of 'W' is an attempt to supplement, but appears as if a fantasy of memory reconstruction. Other memory fragments show his use of fiction to consider historical time; he recalls the first three books from his childhood, though there was 'however something about those first three books: they were all in effect incomplete, they presupposed other absent and unfindable books' (*W*, p. 143). His reference to 'absent and unfindable books' is an example of memory that must be supplemented so it might be incorporated into his childhood narrative. Various chapters within *W* open with an assertion of the negative, alternating absence and supplement. For example, Perec notes that: 'I do not remember exactly when or in what circumstances I left Collège Turenne. I think it was after the Germans had got to Villard and shortly before their major offensive against the Vercors' (*W*, p. 128). Later he writes, 'The Liberation came; I have no visual memory of it or of any of its chapters or even of the waves of enthusiasm that accompanied and followed it and in which it is more than likely that I took part' (*W*, p. 134). This chain operates in a sequence whereby voids are created and are then followed by a supplement. The 'major offensive' and the 'Liberation' are emphatic traces of memory that supplement this sense of loss, as Perec constructs his childhood narrative.

While Schulz developed the use of posthumous temporality within narrative, the father existing beyond death within an extenuation of historical time, Perec creates a sense of memory suspended within historical time. He is aware of the void, including his parents' absence, against which he is narrating memory, as if primal memories have been erased from his past. The first appearance of Winckler in *Portrait of a Man* raises the question of the origin and identity of this character, as if he too might be a figure suspended against voids of memory. The novel links Winckler's murder of the commissioner and his traumatic birth as an authentic artist. Perec's childhood story reinforces Winckler's lack of autonomy, as if it is only by a transgressive act that he will be born as a subject. This birth of Winckler's new self indicates an approach to the primal via death's space, as if enacting a primal trauma.⁷²

Perec's *W* presents the absence and defacement of historical memory and its need to be reconstructed, as if posthumously. His autobiographical novel operates as a supplement in relation to erased or lost history, marking this absence, in the sense of writing historical time in Maurice Blanchot's words, in 'an anticipated relation with death.'⁷³ The void offers a sense of memory's historical totality, in totality's absence. The loss of historical memory acknowledged, textual fragments are used by Perec as elements within the construction of a new imagining of history and historical time. While memory fragments are developed in pursuit of desired completeness, recovering lost time, Perec is aware of the absence of memory and when his fragmented memory supplements lost time, it is as if he decrypts meanings within historical time. Writing after the loss of memory and his parents opens up a sense of historical time that is, like one of his early drawings, alive but having 'disengaged wheels rotating in the void' (*W*, p. 68). He writes later (*W*, pp. 104-105):

Another time, I think it was when we were haymaking together with masses of other children, someone came running to me to tell me my aunt was there. I ran towards a dark-dressed silhouette moving towards us across the field, coming from the school. I stopped a few yards from her: I did not know the lady standing in front of me and saying hallo with a smile. It was my aunt Berthe.

Berthe appears like a figure out of a Malevich painting, such as 'Peasant Woman' (1925), Perec's aunt's silhouette image must be decrypted; each detail and fragment of

⁷² Otto Rank's *The Trauma of Birth* (New York: Robert Brunner, 1952) links primal trauma with later life experiences, including forms of ambition, accomplishment and sublimation.

⁷³ Blanchot, 'The Work and Death's Space', in *The Space of Literature*, trans. by Ann Smock (Nebraska: University of Nebraska Press, 1982), p. 93.

memory appears as this vision of life against nothingness. Perec's literary fragments demand the decryption of their connection to a missing origin and the possibility of a new presence, which may form around the fragment. These fragments point to a new imaginary totality or form that exceeds the original, opening up and reimagining historical memory. The sense of the void remains. The image of Perec's aunt also recalls again Barthes' Winter Garden photo, repeatedly referred to but not reproduced in *Camera Lucida*. The absence seems intended, as if his critique of presence gains force from this absence after the loss of his mother.

Perec's incorporation of fragmented figures of memory in *W* cast light on Foer's fragmentation of Schulz, including his characterisations of the father. Schulz presented characters as if in a void or imagined historical time, portraying the father as an old testament prophet in "The Night of the Great Season": 'my father walked among the folds and valleys of a fantastic Canaan. He strode about, his hands spread prophetically to touch the clouds, and shaped the land with strokes of inspiration' ('Night', p. 89). These descriptions demand an understanding of his family mythology. The liminal, Sphinx-like figures exist within a posthumous temporality, and are found in other Schulz-related fictions.

Ozick portrays another father, an imagined version of Schulz in *The Messiah of Stockholm*: 'On account of his father, Lars shrank himself. He felt he resembled his father: all the tales were about men shrinking more and more into the phantasmagoria of the mind.'⁷⁴ His sense of resembling his imagined father is not empowering, and Budick notes that like Momik in Grossman's novel, Lars 'discovers himself unable to parent the future.'⁷⁵ She further quotes Ozick's novel, noting how Lars acquires 'the face of a foetus; it was as if he was waiting for his dead father to find him, and was determined to remain recognizable.'⁷⁶ The primal here is given a connection to the posthumous, appearing in the context of Schulz's absence. Budick reflects how Grossman's Bruno section is involved with 'a return to the womb-like sea, which is the Schulz-accented maternal presence that might give birth to a new creative and procreative son – namely, the author Momik – not to mention the writer whose text this is: Grossman.'⁷⁷ By developing a fictional approach to temporality that bridges the

⁷⁴ Ozick, *Messiah*, p. 5.

⁷⁵ Budick, *Holocaust*, p. 154.

⁷⁶ Ozick, *Messiah*, p. 6.

⁷⁷ Budick, *Holocaust*, p. 154.

primal with this posthumous scene, Grossman imagines complete oblivion, while finding a new place for revived memory, its presence supplementing the void.

Grossman's and Ozick's posthumous reinventions of Schulz offer access to mythic forms within historical memory, presenting historical time via a posthumous temporality in which primal elements and origins appear visible. Both writers operate in absences created by Schulz, creating narratives that disrupt formations of historical time.

As with Foer's *Tree of Codes* and other writers' narratives in relation to Schulz, Perec's *W* exemplifies an extenuation of life, as if developing historical time posthumously. As with Grossman's approach to Schulz, Perec moves between different temporalities of the past, producing new narratives of historical time. Winckler also moves between different versions of historical time, including the primal and the posthumous. McHale refers to how in postmodern fiction 'entities can pass back and forth across the semipermeable membrane between two texts, as well as between the real world and the world of fiction.'⁷⁸

This is more than access, for in these migrations, 'Entities can change their ontological status in the course of history, in effect migrating from one ontological realm or level to another. For instance, real world entities and happenings can undergo "mythification," moving from the profane realm to the realm of the sacred' (*Postmodernist*, p. 36). The posthumous consideration of historical time in fiction finds new life, new forms and hidden time. Perec's alternation of texts emphasises how history is interrupted by and interrupts narrative. What McHale refers to as 'mythification' is also a form of reconsidering historical time. This mythification is developed, like a form of euhemerism, in which historical figures take on mythological characteristics.

The primal in both Perec and Schulz is more than a return to an origin; when related to the posthumous, it forms a radical return to historical time via spectral primal figures, including Winckler and the father. Perec's fiction presents the mystery of historical time in relation to absence, reconstructing historical memory via fiction. His Winckler we discover was created by Perec's childhood self, while reappearing as a character in search of his authentic self. For Perec, as with Schulz, the return to the past presents a form of posthumous reading of historical time. The story 'W' that Perec originally wrote as a child of thirteen, then lost, attains new meaning in relation to his

⁷⁸ Brian McHale, *Postmodernist Fiction* (New York: Methuen, 1987), p. 36.

loss of childhood memories. By presenting the rewritten story against the void, the absent totality, the narrative fragments have a sublime quality. Perec's 'W' is incomplete; the void against which it is set stages Winckler as if within the context of primal memory, while in *Portrait of a Man* he occupies the posthumous temporality via the murder scene, while believing in his own rebirth.

13. Historical time, fragmentation, and framing Foer's posthumous histories

My readings of posthumous temporality in Schulz, Foer and Perec have explored palimpsests of historical time, including fragmentation and supplementation. These fictions are not fantasies of historical time, but productive engagements with it. Budick describes Foer's *Tree of Codes* as 'conjuring and ghost worship at its very best' (*Holocaust*, p. 153), noting how Schulz's spirit 'animated Foer's text, which becomes in its own right a superbly ghostly, ghastly, and haunting text' (*Holocaust*, p. 154). She does not acknowledge in Foer's text his self-conscious framing of Schulz, considering that the text is driven by incessant mourning, not an engagement with historical time.

Budick writes on Sebald's *Austerlitz* that 'the most difficult aspect of *Austerlitz* for the non-impartial reader of the text (like myself) is that it may finally be impossible to decide whether the text is complicit in the distortions of its narrator or is self-consciously framing them' (*Holocaust*, p. 227). Her indecision indicates the complexity of the fictional intervention in historical time, in which the framing of the archive may appear unconscious. Foer's reworking of crypts and use of posthumous temporality is part of a purposeful intervention in historical memory. His fragmentation of Schulz in *Tree of Codes* can be seen in relation to Perec's *W*, but also to his own earlier fictional work. His first two novels explore history via its ruins, from obliterated memory in his first novel *Everything is Illuminated* to traumatized memory in *Extremely Loud and Incredibly Close*.

The role of fragmentary memory within fictional historical narratives was central to Foer's work early on, evident in his personal family research in Ukraine,⁷⁹ which led to the writing of *Everything is Illuminated*. In this novel, *The Book of Recurrent Dreams* features as a partially destroyed text that the fictional author tries to recover. This imagined supplementary, fragmented book relates Trachimbrod history via folk tales

⁷⁹ Foer's mother, born in Poland in an area now part of Ukraine, was the child of Holocaust survivors.

that present the fantasy and phantasmal life around a community and family, a posthumous perspective on a history seen through dreams. Using fragments, Foer incorporates the past into personal and collective memories as if creating posthumous supplements, around which new imagined totalities may be formed. Foer's fictional memoir moves between the discoveries of a first person travelogue narrative and the fragmented recollections of an older history.

Seen from the perspective of *Tree of Codes*, Foer's first novel reflects his awareness of encrypted forms within narrative, spectral and shadowy presences of historical memory that sometimes continue in the form of fragments. Foer's reintegration of memory fragments within fictional narrative creates an order of historical time that his real life historical research was unable to achieve by itself. In *Everything is Illuminated*, crypts are opened, boxes reveal clues and secrets are discovered; memory is presented as fragmented and encrypted. In the aftermath of the destruction of social and cultural memory after the Nazi fire bombing of the village of Trachimbrod, Foer describes how 'Memory was supposed to fill the time, but it made time a hole to be filled. Each second was two hundred yards, to be walked, crawled. You couldn't see the next hour, it was so far in the distance. Tomorrow was over the horizon, and would take an entire day to reach.'⁸⁰

In the site of this rupture and distortion of historical time, crypts in the novel are approached through boxes and fragmented texts which appear to mimic encrypted and fragmented forms of the past. There are coverings, veils, boundaries and walls, with shadows and other crypt-like effects: 'Yankel goes through the house with black sheets. He drapes the standing clock in a black cloth and wraps his silver pocket watch in a swatch of black linen... He covers the window of his bedroom with a black cloth. He wraps the calendar in black paper, as if it were a gift' (*Illuminated*, p. 86). Yankel's veils are placed as if to be discovered after death. There is also a wall that is used to separate Brod and the Kolker, enforced to prevent his abuse of Brod. They overcome this crypt-like state, conceiving a child in spite of the separation, via a hole in the wall.

The sense of continued encryptedness is echoed in the boxes of Augustine, an old lady who saved Jonathan's grandfather's life. These are labelled 'DARKNESS', 'REMAINS', 'DEATH OF THE FIRSTBORN', 'FILLINGS' (*Illuminated*, pp. 147-149) and indicate encrypted presences inside them that preserve essences as well as objects. Posthumousness haunts the encryption and decryption described by the novel,

⁸⁰ Foer, *Everything is Illuminated* (London: Penguin Books, 2003), p. 260.

as objects of the living are put in the ground for safe keeping for future rediscovery: “‘Here is Rivka’s wedding ring,” Augustine said, and put it on her finger. “She hid it in a jar that she put in the ground... Many people did this. The ground is still filled with rings, and money, and pictures, and Jewish things. I was only able to find a few of them, but they fill the earth”’ (*Illuminated*, p. 152). This scene reminds us of Lichtenstein’s discovery of buried items in the Warsaw ghetto that I referred to in Chapter 1.

Foer’s narrative evokes the gradual discovery of historical memory and cryptic presences, the fictional memoir collecting objects of the past, mimicking Augustine, who returned to live in Trachimbrod: “‘She secured all of the things that she had hidden, and she brought them to her house. It was her punishment.” “For what?” “For surviving,” she said’ (*Illuminated*, p. 189). Her struggle for memory reflects the narrator’s burden of putting narratives of historical time back together. The crypt is a space of Augustine’s suffering, while reconciling herself with fragments of the past and the process of discovering the crypt’s contents.

Foer tries to understand the nature of these historical crypts. Like Perec, he confronts voids of memory via supplementation, each new fragment leading further into the hidden archive, presenting crypts and their decryptions. Foer’s narratives pursue the historical crypts as if he had discovered them in his real searches in Ukraine; the novel reinterprets the pre-history of Foer’s life, re-animating the past with new fictional approaches to historical memory. Within these fictional scenes, history is disclosed, decrypted via the surviving fragments of recorded history. The narrative moves towards further disclosures of history, as Jonathan (the character in the book) discovers the history of Augustine and how she helped to save his grandfather.

Augustine is portrayed as a Sphinx-like character, as shape-shifting as Schulz’s and Foer’s father characters. Like the Sphinx in Sophocles’ *Oedipus Rex*, Augustine holds a secret, which Jonathan is trying to discover. He does this through asking her to identify subjects of photographs which he has, as if decrypting historical time. The decryption underway, Augustine herself is a spectral, encrypted presence, as if occupying a posthumous temporality: “‘It is almost impossible to witness her,” Grandfather uttered, and even though he is blind, I must confess that it was becoming almost impossible to witness her. It was so dark that sometimes I had to skew my eyes to view her white dress. It was like she was a ghost, moving in and out of our eyes”’ (*Illuminated*, p. 183).

Augustine appears to inhabit the centre of the crypt, holding other cryptic topographies together. She is the key in the search through Jonathan's photographs of ancestors. Having revealed secret histories of Trachimbrod via the *The Book of Recurrent Dreams*, and the illumination of Foer's personal history via Augustine, the book moves towards historical revelation as if towards a primordial memory. The narrative refers to the Nazi invasion of Poland that turned Trachimbrod into a segregated Stetl for Jewish people. When Trachimbrod is accidentally bombed, the rocket explosions coincide with the kicks of Jonathan's father's foetus within the womb, confusing the primal scene and death's space: 'Just as my grandfather's first orgasm was not intended for Zosha, the bombs that inspired it were not meant for Trachimbrod' (*Illuminated*, p. 158). These moments form a primal scene for the modern history of Trachimbrod, the eruptive, destructive announcement of a new future, a traumatised birth.

In this context, Foer's narrative reconstructs primal memories, holding fragments of historical time together. Like Sebald's fictional history *Austerlitz*, Foer's narratives offer forms of the past within a narrative frame in which there is a central truth or revelation awaiting discovery. For Austerlitz this is the discovery of his original identity, culminating in his journey to Prague and Theresienstadt, Sebald's decrypting of Austerlitz's history leads to his seeing his mother in a film, discovered after her death. The posthumous temporality of the narrative presents the incorporation of the primal memory, as if, analeptically, this open rupture in historical time reveals cryptic structures of the past.

14. Phantasmagoria of primal memory, analepsis, historical time and the crypt

I will now return to how Schulz and Foer frame historical time within their narratives, and how fictional approaches to historical time create new senses of the past's narrative presence. Foer's *Tree of Codes* describes the mythical being of the father, like a Sphinx, a posthumous creature inhabiting historical time as if a surrogate or mythical figure of Schulz. Foer's story incorporates primal elements, maintaining Schulz's mythical time, while reinterpreting the posthumous temporality of Schulz's work. At the end, the Father lives on: 'My Father alone was awake, wandering silently through the rooms' (*Tree*, p. 134). Foer's fictional mythology here reveals another aspect of Schulz, whose Sphinxian secret is not historical time itself but access to it, just as Pessoa appears to have posthumous access to this in Saramago's novel.

Posthumous temporality uses analepsis, enabling the production of fiction at the site of ruptures of historical time, opening up the archive in which historical time is rediscovered. By using Schulz's writing, Foer incorporates Schulz's ideas of posthumousness, found in the surviving figures of the father and mother in *Tree of Codes*. Schulz attempts to create a phantasmagorical mythology, the past haunting his fictional narratives. His stories demonstrate a desire to reconstruct the past and create new senses of historical time. Using posthumous temporality, narrators construct imaginary times that lead to new incorporations of the past, invoked as if from the position of death. Foer's return to and reconstruction of Schulz's writing is not to frame or bury his life, but to keep the crypt alive, giving it new life, so his historical time may continue to be remembered, reconsidered, and presented to a future in which it can be reimagined and reconstructed.

Posthumous fiction that imagines lives of historical characters creates openings into history, the posthumous temporality found by Foer in Schulz's writing being one which others writers have also used, as if inhabiting this historical time. The use of posthumous temporality within fiction creates a frame for reconsidering primal and mythological times that redefine historical time. The fictional use of Schulz as a way to develop mythological temporality is a way of considering, via the posthumous, how fiction might relate to historical time and how it might be incorporated, not as an afterlife, but as a new understanding of lived time.

Reading narrative in terms of posthumousness involves understanding how fragments exist in the context of a historical void, supplementing it without displacing it, while indicating the need for further supplementation. Writing on Perec, Suleiman comments: 'There is certainly a suggestion... that writing is a form of substitution for loss, both reparative and form of commemoration; but such affirmations are accompanied, sometimes in the same sentence, by the contrary sense that writing can never replace, cover over, or otherwise compensate for the void left by the death of his parents' (*Crises*, p. 194). The substitution or supplement brings the void to light, but as she continues, 'At most, writing is a trace, the sign of something that once was but that has disappeared: an assertion of the writer's life, yes, but also a reminder of death, of an unjust and definitive absence' (*Crises*, p. 194).

This sense of absence is found in other memoirs; in his writing after de Man's death, Derrida highlights the void within his biography, refusing to consider his early, posthumously republished writings to be the last word on how his life should be interpreted. Where non-fiction may mark the absence, fiction seizes on the rupture, as

if creating a mythological time in which memory can be reconstructed. Schulz's life presents this opening on to history to which the novelist goes to, as if historical time is alive within the crypt. Grossman and Ozick's return to Schulz attempts to offer a new sense of historical time that includes new and rediscovered mythological tropes.

The posthumous fictions about Schulz encourage engagement with history and to reimagine historical time. The genocide in Europe during the Second World War is part of the historical void out of which rememberings and reconsiderations of historical time might emerge. The use of posthumous temporality presents the opportunity to restage historical time in relation to the void. In this place of rupture, new senses of historical time and memory may be developed.

As with Perec's novel, the analeptic perspective includes origins and primal memories; posthumous temporality questions what is lost in narrative and memory, not to fix or replace historical time, but to engage with it. The life lived and the life as it is reimagined after death are brought together, represented as a new imagining of historical memory. Foer's and Perec's texts show how a text might achieve a unity beyond fragmentation. Via posthumous temporality, memories can be brought together in a literary unity. These fragments may be considered in terms of Romantic ruins, not just those which might have been complete in the past, but ones that might find a greater unity or complete vision in the future.

The writers' self-conscious processes of remembering, mourning and of melancholia develop their fictional engagement within historical time. Narratives staged within the crypt and the archive develop not just a new sense of historical time, but of how this may create a new collective narrative remembering, reconfigured in relation to what remains unknown and lost. In this remembering, the historical protagonist (such as Schulz) is narrated against the background knowledge of their absence and death. This is not a simple mourning of absence or erasure, for while the use of posthumous temporality in these fictions reflects aspects of mourning and melancholia, they are not restricted to these modes of remembering. Fictional concerns for absence and reimagined historical narratives do not represent 'failed incorporation'; narratives of historical time recognise both presences of void and the ongoing presence of primal elements in memory. The posthumous perspective incorporates voids as an essential context of reconstructing narratives of historical time.

The novels on Schulz develop forms of resistance against fixed historical time and memory, producing new configurations of historical time. Other fictions that

include reference to Schulz – Danilo Kiš's *Hourglass*, Krauss's *The History of Love* and *Great House*, and Roth's *The Prague Orgy*, though more marginal in terms of characterisation than both Ozick's and Grossman's novels, indicate the extent of the role of fiction's imagined and reimagined engagement with historical time. In the development of posthumous temporality within fiction, what is being enacted, as Derrida writes reflecting on Jean-François Lyotard's writing in *Le Différend*, is a statement of the 'we' that exists beyond death: 'Does it not survive as survival itself, through a subtle and infinitesimal excess of thinking? Does it not rather think the speculative, even before thinking in a speculative mode? A beautiful risk to run, once again, at the instant of death.'⁸¹

Derrida quotes Lyotard, who refers to 'The we composed at least of I who write and you who read', which he describes as the 'affirmation of nothingness.'⁸² The absence affirms what has been lost, for it offers a space of supplementation and re-presenting; the use of posthumous temporality in which historical time is reopened, reimagined and retold, permits a mourning that is 'interminable. Inconsolable. Irreconcilable.'⁸³ Posthumousness marks this interminability, accommodating the spectre that appears to supplement but also seeks its own supplement, including its own narrator who might reconcile lived time and historical memory, and the reader who might share that.

The past buried, but as if still alive, Grossman fictionalises Schulz's death in *See Under: Love*: 'His body convulsed. I hid my face in my hands. I heard a strange sound, as if something big were being swallowed up by an invisible mouth. A heart-wrenching groan sounded through the sea, and a moment later Bruno was no longer with us.'⁸⁴ Momik later says to Shloma: 'if our life is only in the ebbing, then anything that helps that ebbing is the hidden collaborator of death, and we ourselves are accomplices to murder' (*Love*, p. 182). Remembering and reconstructing historical time is the work of mourning as a form of resistance against ebbing away. This is found in works on Schulz but also Freud's work on Moses, acknowledging that the absence of historical memory is also a call to remember. Posthumously, Freud is drawn to reconstruct a new sense of historical time, in which Moses is reimagined, not as a

⁸¹ Derrida, 'Lyotard and Us', *Mourning*, p. 240.

⁸² Jean-François Lyotard, *Le Différend* (Paris: Éd. de Minuit, 1983), p. 241.

⁸³ Derrida, 'Lyotard', p. 143.

⁸⁴ Grossman, *Love*, p. 181.

Schulzian creature but one whose life conceals another time altogether, encrypted within the archive, that Derrida refers to as the ‘*archive of the virtual*.’⁸⁵

In this space the novelist engages with and develops the relation between posthumous temporality and primal memories. De Certeau, writing on Freud’s Moses, states that ‘What is written in texts – and in Freud’s novel – is their [the gods’] mourning, since the labor of closing the eyes of the father also heralds the law of his return.’⁸⁶ Where there is a void, there is the potential for a return, both from the present and the future to the past, as well as from the past to the future. As writers return to Schulz and his mythological world, they anticipate and make the path for his survival and new life, against death and the ebbing away of historical time. The posthumous temporality not only reanimates the past but draws the line to the past for future returns – as we find with Yerushalmi’s return to Freud and Moses, in which the crypt is made into a productive space, a place of mourning that also allows for reimagining.

In Schulz’s story ‘Spring’, the narrator asks, ‘What is a spring dusk?’ He ventures to answer (p. 160):

You dip your face into that fluffy fur of dusk, and everything becomes impenetrable and airless like under the lid of a coffin. Then you must screw up your eyes and bully them, squeeze your sight through the impenetrable, push across the dull humus—and suddenly you are at your goal, on the other side; you are in the Deep, in the Underworld. And you can see...

This example of the view of primal memory within the posthumous is a place where new things form, where the posthumous might produce or enable new life. It is where, through imagination, narrative appears to incorporate and transform historical time, absorbing the past into a new literary palimpsest of mythology, a new encryption of memory, and the appearance of presences against voids of time.

⁸⁵ Derrida, *Archive*, p. 66.

⁸⁶ de Certeau, *Writing*, p. 328.

Conclusion

Posthumousness and fictional conjunctions and encryptions of historical time

1. Posthumousness and new senses of endings and temporal conjunctions

My readings of posthumousness in narratives have considered how fiction that incorporates posthumous temporality returns to the past and develops new senses of history, informing new understandings of historical time, as we have discovered by considering crypts of time in narratives ranging from Pessoa's *The Book of Disquiet* to Foer's *Tree of Codes*.

The posthumous activation of the past addresses historical time as transitional, anticipating how the past may be incorporated into narrative. These narratives are not just crypts of afterlives, but narratives of lives with a sense of historical time that demands the reader to reimagine the relationship between fictional time and historical time in terms of new conjunctions. At the end of Sebald's *Austerlitz*, Austerlitz says, if I am walking through the city and look into one of those quiet courtyards where nothing has changed for decades, I feel, almost physically, the current of time slowing down in the gravitational field of oblivion. It seems to me then as if all the moments of our life occupy the same space, as if future events already existed and were only waiting for us to find our way to them at last...¹

In this passage, posthumous temporality appears, as if the past is returning to the present, conjoining multiple times. It is an end point, a terminal conjunction, a future anterior conjoining the future, the past, the original and the present. Posthumousness in literature reveals layerings of temporality intrinsic to narrative, including locating presences of historical time. In his epilogue to *The Sense of an Ending*, Frank Kermode wrote 'to make sense of our lives from where we are, as it were, stranded in the middle, we need fictions of beginnings and fictions of ends, fictions which unite beginning and end and endow the interval between them with meaning.'² Posthumous literature changes our understanding of endings and beginnings. By narrating from an imagined end, after

¹ Sebald, *Austerlitz*, pp. 359-360.

² Frank Kermode, *The Sense of an Ending: Studies in the Theory of Fiction with a New Epilogue* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), p. 190.

death, the past is transformed, given new meanings in the context of this framing. This position is privileged, as Ricoeur states, writing how ‘the praise of the modern fuses together the presumed total reflection of history upon itself’,³ but it is also a site of questioning, uncertainty and openness.

My readings of posthumousness have developed ways of understanding how posthumous presences appear in modern narrative, and how they work with death’s space to create new understandings of historical time within fiction. The posthumous mode focuses attention on transformations of historical memory within literature. Novelists infuse historical time with a sense of ‘endness’, imagining it with a posthumous sense, the fictional end supplemented by dreams and animations of historical memory.

The posthumous perspective presents narratives at the end of a lived time, creating settings for alternative historical dramas, endings reimagined and replayed, reawakening senses of historical time, including its voids. The novelist inhabits these endings, using the future anterior to understand grief and desire, while also recognising latent potentialities hidden within past time, opening out the past to reimagine historical time, making ‘elements of this past live again... reenergized through their untimely or anachronistic recall in the present.’⁴

Posthumous presences in novels by Jensen, Pamuk, Saramago, Ozick and Grossman have shared narrative structures, with new versions of the past being created and incorporated within narrative. The more complex engagement with posthumous temporality within narrative that I have developed goes beyond how the archive or crypt exists within the text, having also the active idea of the text possessed by historical times, narratives incorporating reanimated bodies of the past that change understandings of historical time.

Posthumous temporality within fictional narrative makes historical time appear to be liveable within, as if we can enter the past, an open crypt in which the preserved body is given new life, while the hidden world of the past awaits the discovery of new stories. New narrative constructions of the past counter grief, offering resolutions through incorporation, recognitions of absence and new presences via supplementation. Conjoined temporalities of the past and the present not only counter grief but operate

³ Ricoeur, *Memory, History, Forgetting*, trans by Kathleen McLaughlin and David Pellauer (Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 2006), p. 307.

⁴ Grosz, *Nick*, p. 117.

with it, acknowledging cryptic memory. While posthumous fiction often represents a sense of ending, it also offers a supplement to historical memory, a place where endings can be replayed in a repetition of mourning and remembrance, and a performance or representation of the imagined past in the face of historical or temporal disjuncture.

The novelist infuses the historical with this sense of ‘endness’, imagining narrative with a posthumous sense, in which the end is supplemented by animations of historical memory. Fiction concerned with posthumous temporality creates this new sense of historical time, manifested in works of the ‘posthumous sublime’. Posthumous temporality opens out memory, offering to decipher history within fiction, caught in a pursuit of historical time, visible in other novels with a posthumous sense, including Adolfo Bioy Casares’ *The Invention of Morel* and Auster’s *Travels in the Scriptorium*, both of which show how narratives of memory may aspire to an infinite, repeating, posthumous form.

Benjamin’s vision of historical time, in terms of the ongoing nature of the past, envisioned in the mollusk, captures this persistence of historical time, but as a place where newness forms too. This developed, open future anterior position allows narrative to return to primal memory, forming new structures of historical time. At the point of the emergence of an idea of post-history, examined by Niethammer in *Posthistoire*, the concern for history’s loss or ending sends the author back to the past, the posthumous life of which promises a reimagining of history.

In the process of recollecting or reassembling the historical, the posthumous sometimes appears to emerge from the archive. Posthumous narrative inhabits the past as something that can be unravelled, reconsidered and reinterpreted. It marks both a new approach to endings, but also to transitions between times; the posthumous narrator creates this possibility of the past being redefined from a point of view of inclusion within a new future narration, defying the end, reimagining new beginnings.

2. Posthumousness and reimagined temporality in relation to death

Previous studies of posthumousness in literature, such as Tambling’s *Becoming Posthumous*, and studies of the the role of the afterlife, including Bennett’s, open up new possibilities of reinterpreting literature in its relation to death. I have considered narratives in terms of fiction’s relation to historical time via posthumous temporality.

Posthumous aspects of temporality change how we read narrative, in terms of its relation to historical time and how historical memory is incorporated within fiction.

The posthumous scene is a site of temporal conjunctions, a palimpsest in which different times are in contact with each other. Each text I have considered presents alternative ways of incorporating posthumous temporality within narrative; in common have been senses of encrypted historical time, including memories, desires and hidden selves, indicating how historical time may be re-interpreted via the novel.

Genette describes how ‘the Proustian novel is undoubtedly, as it proclaims, a novel of Time lost and found again, but it is also, more secretly perhaps, a novel of Time ruled, captured, bewitched, surreptitiously subverted, or better: perverted.’⁵ Posthumousness presents subversions of time; in the texts selected, narratives are mimetic of conjunctions of lived versions of time connecting the present, the past and the future. These narratives hint at omniscience, but they represent forms of temporal compression, the posthumous perspective conjoining historical time, the future and primal memories, the use of analepsis and the future anterior offering fictional narrative new relationships to historical time. Ricoeur notes this double movement of narrative re-enacting the ‘experience of time lost and regained’⁶ apparently irretrievably remaining in the past and yet made present.

In my Introduction I noted Currie’s consideration of the ‘synthesis of the future anterior and the messianic... as a reference to future time with built-in completion, or as an anticipation of something that cannot arrive’⁷ in his chapter ‘The Untimely and the Messianic’. He describes how ‘anticipation itself must refer to an event that is already past, in order to make sense of the ordinary conception of time as a series of present moments’ (*Untimely*, p. 95). The posthumous makes the phantasmal work in order to form the present of narrative, creating the sense of the imagined, actualised future anterior.

My analysis of posthumous temporality and the role of the posthumous scene in various texts has shown how fiction brings different times together, including historical time, a time not of closure, but of perpetual revision and reconsideration. Texts supplement other texts but also create new impressions; the scene of writing is a site of new narratives emerging. As we investigate meanings of historical time and memory, we discover how writing uses and engages with complex forms of temporality. In the texts I have considered, the analeptic has been key to their temporal structure,

⁵ Genette, *Narrative*, p. 160.

⁶ Ricoeur, *Time*, vol. ii, p. 87.

⁷ Currie, *Unexpected*, p. 95.

while the incompleteness of the past, the future not arriving and the present attempting to incorporate historical time creates a sense of ongoing absence and need for supplementation, and of the possibility of developing this site in relation to death.

Concern in fictions for historical time goes beyond reconstruction and mimesis; narrative incorporates historical time, developing how temporalities might be conjoined while also creating scenes of rupture relating to understandings of historical memory. Doubled time, like fictional time problematizes historical time, introducing new versions of historical memory. In *The Black Book* the murders of Celâl and Rüya themselves create a new void within the novel, confirming the posthumous temporality that Galip believes he has discovered and that he tries to inhabit via his taking over of Celâl's life, as if the fictional time within the novel is taking over the fictionalized historical time. The barber, named as the murderer of Celâl, insists his murder is because he cannot bear the fictionality of Celâl's histories. In killing Celâl and Rüya, he redefines the historical time of Galip's transformation.

Where Poe's Dupin reconstructed historical time in the void created or exposed by the murders in 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue', the temporality of *The Black Book* is confused, the posthumous presences uncovered by Galip suggesting hidden forces within historical time. Galip's attempt to resolve what has happened opens up historical time, exposing how fictional time has been interrupting historical time. The murderer has not solved historical time, but added a new mystery to the effect of fictional time's attempted incorporation of historical time.

Pamuk integrates fictional narrative with versions of historical time, including returning to primal memories. The posthumous temporality he creates is a form of mimesis of other narratives, including those of detective fiction, incorporating within narrative the sense of death in life. Pamuk's narrative creates new conjunctions of fictional and historical time through this mimesis. The posthumous attempt to represent and decrypt historical time via mimetic representation attempts to reproduce the voice and the perspective of the dead (every narrative eventually becoming the voice of the dead), creating a new posthumous temporality, as Sinclair and Lichtenstein do in relation to Rodinsky, and Saramago achieves in his reimagining of a posthumous life of Pessoa.

Posthumous temporal conjunctions make possible new connections between the past, the future and the present. De Certeau writes that 'writing plays the role of a burial rite... it exorcises death by inserting it into discourse. On the other hand, it possesses a signifying function; it allows a society to sinuate itself by giving itself a past

through language, and it thus opens to the present a space of its own.’⁸ In this space narratives may reimagine historical time in the form of a crypt that can be incorporated within new narratives. De Certeau comments that “‘To mark’ a past is to make a place for the dead, but also to redistribute the space of possibility, to determine negatively what must be done, and consequently to use the narrativity that buries the dead as a way of establishing a place for the living’ (*Writing*, p. 100). My analyses of texts have shown how fictions create a space for the dead while also making space for new life. Posthumous temporality is not simply an extenuation of time, for it also offers reinterpretations of historical time, reimagining, recreating and reusing traces of the past, including the primal.

This posthumous temporality is constitutive in its making the dead live again, breaking the imagined whole of historical memory. It produces, erupts and fragments, making historical time more complex. The narratives of Sebald and Pamuk recompose temporality within narrative, in which historical time appears to erupt, as if being written with a sense of this disruptive nature of historical time.

The posthumous scene, including death’s space, allows the discovery of different aspects of time, including origins, primal memories and posthumous reconstructions. The shadow, the supplement, the defacement, the image, its double and the spectral operate in this same space. Saramago’s Pessoa and Foer’s, Grossman’s and Ozick’s Schulz all offer versions of historical memory where there is death, these posthumous narratives seeking to incorporate the archive, the crypt, and aspects of the virtualised past that can be reanimated in the present. Posthumous temporalities bring the past into the present, this incorporation of posthumous temporality within fiction enacting a form of death scene in which historical narrative can be reconstructed.

The incorporation of primal memories within posthumous temporality disrupts understandings of history. Narrative creates a new relation to primal memory as that which resists final interpretation or closure and unresolved aspects of the unconscious. Narrative fragments link not just to the whole lost, prior world or text, but to fragments and primal elements from which new reconstructions of time can be formed.

Narrative adds to historical memory, offering supplementation where there is temporal conflict, voids or incompleteness. Fictional use of posthumous temporality presents signs of the repressed elements of the past. Writers’ concern for historical characters who were killed early in their life, including Schulz and Benjamin, marks an

⁸ de Certeau, *Writing*, p. 100.

attempt to decrypt desires buried within historical time. Like Pamuk's *The Black Book*, *See Under: Love* proliferates histories while fragmenting them, the four sections of the novel offering different perspectives on Momik's life. Grossman's novel attempts mimesis, while at the same time fragmenting representation and the relationship between the text and the life. Grossman's version of Schulz offers a posthumous vision of multiple alternative lives which disrupts the proposed mimetic unity of the life and the narrative created by the biographer or historiographer.

Sebald's *Austerlitz* also displays excesses of memory set against the appearance of loss. Austerlitz's returned memory is that which attempts to fill the voids that precede it, including the empty expanses of Antwerp Central Station and other monumental architecture. The death of his parents and the loss of his early childhood memories, like Perec's, creates an absence against which his new sense of his past takes on a new life and presence. Sebald's telling of Austerlitz's story is as if he is echoing elements of Benjamin's inhabitation of historical time, giving it a posthumous form.

3. Posthumousness and the emergence of new crypts of historical time

Signs of posthumousness – defacement, supplementation, phantoms, the archive, the crypt – all reflect perceived insufficiencies and excesses of narrative. The fictional narrative crypt is a site of temporal conjunctions, relating to a posthumous pursuit of historical time. Readings of posthumousness highlight the presence of the past within narration, and the ruptures in life outside the text that erupt within the text. Derrida's writings on Freud, particularly in his essay 'Freud and the Scene of Writing' and *Archive Fever*, show how approaches to temporality via the crypt enables us to consider alternative approaches to the production of historical time via the recognition of the posthumous. Posthumousness allows narrative incorporations of history, the posthumous scene of writing being open to complex forms of temporality within fiction.

Reading the posthumous, the crypt holds temporalities of hidden bodies or partial figures of bodies that remain in the text, invisible, disfigured, screened or distorted. As with Freud's Moses, we have to look past the layers of the palimpsest to find the hidden or repressed bodies of the text. These are more than spectres, and the author's attempt to bring them to life hints at their existence. The presence of the

posthumous in the void reaches out to the future reader, to what Derrida describes as ‘the ear of the other’.⁹

The crypt of historical time appears against this backdrop of the void, from the absent winter garden photo in Barthes’ *Camera Lucida*, to the lost childhood memories of Perec. The writer pursues this self against the void, as if going into a history that is unmoored from historical time, an X-ray that is bodily yet exists outside of the body, a text as if without a body, a voice appearing to exist only in language like Beckett’s *Unnamable* (p. 130),

...a voice like this, who can check it, it tries everything, it’s blind, it seeks me blindly, in the dark, it seeks a mouth, to enter into, who can query it, there is no other, you’d need a head, you’d need things... I don’t know, I look too often as if I knew, it’s the voice does that, it goes all knowing, to make me think I know, to make me think it’s mine, it has no interest in eyes.’

The *Unnamable* is like an unmediated speaking of the unconscious, Beckett uncovering the palimpsest of thoughts, articulating primal memories beyond bodily presence, voices buried underneath other voices, like previous layers of images found underneath paintings. Beckett’s posthumous scene creates a textual mimesis of an imagined time of the body outside historical time.

This fictional posthumous voice haunts a text, as if in search of its own body that brings it into existence. The text is a living crypt of a mind, adrift from its dead body, as if Beckett’s presentation of the time of the crypt rearticulates elements of Pessoa’s writing, living with death and the sense of non-existence. The posthumous time indicates a future opportunity of revelation, the virtual traces of the archive reawakened, releasing the desire held within the crypt. The final section of *The Black Book* opens into the scene of an endless writing of history, as if the author is doubled in an ongoing chain of supplementation, as if anticipating another voice or narrator, the ‘endless prosopoeia’¹⁰ of masks and fictional voices.

Posthumous fiction may supplement historical memory, but also offers its own voids in the chain of historical memory, marking the erased, the defaced and the fragmented, where supplements, palimpsests and new writings of historical narrative may find a new place. The supplement attempts new refigurations of historical time, part of the form of palimpsest, returning to hidden temporalities and primal memories.

⁹ Derrida, *The Ear of the Other*, trans. by Peggy Kamuf (Lincoln: University of Nebraska, 1988). The French title, *L’oreille de l’autre*, came from Derrida’s reading of a passage about a man with an enormous ear by Nietzsche in *Thus Spake Zarathustra* (“On Redemption”), which Derrida quotes, p. 3.

¹⁰ de Man, ‘Shelley Disfigured’, p. 122.

The use of posthumous temporality creates the space for new embryonic or metamorphic forms, in which new narratives and figures of historical time are created. Other supplementation, for example in relation to Auster's work, includes films – *The Inner Life of Martin Frost* (2007), directed by Auster, is based on a story within his novel *The Book of Illusions* (2002). Chabon's work also invites this consideration of the supplement, including his comic book *The Amazing Adventures of the Escapist* (2004), which supplements *The Amazing Adventures of Kavalier & Clay* (2000).

Posthumous fictions present returns to the past like masked, prosopopoeia of historical time, returns from the archive, like the infinitely repeating projections of Casares' *The Invention of Morel*. The conjunction of different times in posthumous temporality marks a point where historical time may be imagined, where mythological figures are found, and where angels, mothers, fathers, fairytale characters, heteronymic poets, doubles, surrogate Schulzes, may be freed and given a new historical time, giving new life to what Schulz described as 'events that have no place of their own in time' ('Age' p. 129). In 'Spring', Schulz describes another aspect of this, capturing the posthumous temporality in which historical time is released, writing (pp. 161-162):

We are on the nether side, at the lining of things, in gloom stitched with phosphorescence. We are here at the very bottom, in the dark foundations, among the Mothers. Here are the bottomless infernos, the hopeless Ossianic spaces, all those lamentable Nibelungs. Here are the great breeding grounds of history, factories of plots, hazy smoking rooms of fables and tales.

The posthumous life of the crypt is the unveiled desire of historical time given a new release – as we find in Pamuk's novels, but also *Gradiva*. Desire is refound, given a new time in the position of death, the disappeared past resurrected. The analeptic projection allows historical time to be both 'lost and regained',¹¹ as if in this search for meaning time is reconstructed, finding the site of absence where the event might be narrated. The creation of the site of posthumous temporality within narrative creates this temporal space – like Rodinsky's room, Schulz's nursery crypt, Barthes' apartment, Jensen's Pompeiian ruins, Sebald's train stations, Benjamin's arcades, Pessoa's graveyard and Freud's imagined tomb of Moses.

These sites also include the gallery of Schulz's paintings in Yad Vashem – where primal memory might reappear, posthumously. In this posthumous temporality, via analepsis, history is retold and reimagined in instalments, and where, as in Jensen's

¹¹ Ricoeur, *Time*, vol. ii, p. 87.

posthumous Pompeii, the dead may appear to take the place of the living, simply by appearing to be alive. Historical time appears to be encrypted, fictional time presenting mimeses of the past, creating a spectral, virtual presence that exists beyond the past. The past reappears, like Pessoa in the hotel room of Saramago's novel, as if encountered as a spectre, this posthumous vision of the primal, as if something will be revealed, in a revision of history.

The posthumous scene includes reappearance of the dead or disappeared like spectral beings in the dusk, suggesting the appearance of the primal in relation to the void, as in Foer's reworking of images within Schulz's *The Street of Crocodiles* (*Tree*, pp. 74-75):

Out of the depth of yesterday I wanted to turn inside out. I wrote in a notebook, added it all up. With eyes like miniscule mirrors, I could not contain the groaning, swelling, deep pulsation of the enormous awe, those colossal exuberances. The only living and knowing thing was me.

In this immersive, inside-out self-portrait, we return to the 'posthumous sublime', in Ozick's portrayal of Sebald, one that reappears throughout Sebald's writing, including in the final section of *Vertigo*, which follows in the footsteps of Kafka's character the Hunter Gracchus, who also has an afterlife. The posthumous sublime includes how posthumousness offers new life to the past, to crypts of memory that might otherwise be repressed, including primal memories. In Sebald's work, the narrator describes how as a child he had seen a local hunter, Schlag, having apparently indifferent sex with the barmaid at a village pub, and then witnessed his dead body after a riding accident, writing how, 'When I was at my schoolwork, all I had to do was lower my eyelids a little and I beheld Schlag the hunter lying dead at the bottom of the ravine.'¹²

The image of death is framed by the earlier erotic memory, Sebald describing Schlag as being like Hunter Gracchus, undead, as if surviving in memory because of the narrator's connection between the primal and the posthumous. This crypt of memory survives in its vivid lifelessness, set against the background of encrypted, masked desire. Guy Davenport refoiliates this image, for Kafka's Hunter Gracchus is a 'hunter turned into a butterfly',¹³ fluttering in the darkness of the Black Forest, his new posthumous life not obscured by, but always in the shadow of his past.

¹² Sebald, *Vertigo*, trans. by Michael Hulse (London: Harvill, 2000), p. 246.

¹³ Guy Davenport, 'The Hunter Gracchus', in *The Hunter Gracchus and Other Papers on Literature and Art* (Washington, D.C.: Counterpoint, 1997), p. 17.

Bibliography

- Abraham, Nicolas and Torok, Maria, *The Shell and the Kernel*, trans. by Nicholas Rand (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994)
- Abraham, Nicolas and Torok, Maria, *The Wolf Man's Magic Word: A Cryptonymy*, trans. by Nicholas Rand (Minneapolis: Minnesota University Press, 1986)
- Adair, Gilbert, *The Death of the Author* (London: Minerva Press, 1993)
- Agamben, Giorgio, *Infancy and History: The Destruction of Experience*, trans. by Liz Heron (London: Verso, 2007)
- Appelfield, Aharon, *The Age of Wonders* (London: Quartet Books, 1993)
- Auster, Paul, *The New York Trilogy* (London: Faber and Faber, 1988)
- Auster, Paul, *Travels in the Scriptorium* (London: Faber and Faber, 2007)
- Badmington, Neil, *The Afterlives of Roland Barthes* (London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2016)
- Banville, John, *Shroud* (London: Picador, 2003)
- Barthes, Roland, *Camera Lucida: Reflections on Photography* (London: Vintage, 1993)
- Barthes, Roland, 'The Death of the Author', in *The Rustle of Language*, trans. by Richard Howard (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1989), pp. 49-55
- Barthes, Roland, *Mourning Diary: October 26, 1977 – September 15, 1979*, trans. by Richard Howard (New York: Hill and Wang, 2010)
- Barthes, Roland, *Roland Barthes*, trans. by Richard Howard (London: Macmillan General Books, 1995)
- Barthes, Roland, *S/Z: An Essay*, trans. by Richard Miller (New York: Hill and Wang, 1974)
- Beckett, Samuel, *The Unnamable* (London: Faber and Faber, 2010)
- Bellamy, Elizabeth, *Affective Genealogies: Psychoanalysis, Postmodernism and the "Jewish Question" After Auschwitz* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1997)
- Bellos, David, *Georges Perec: A Life in Words* (London: Collins Harvill, 1993)
- Benjamin, Walter, *Berlin Childhood Around 1900*, trans. by Howard Eiland (Cambridge: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2006)
- Benjamin, Walter, *Illuminations*, ed. by Hannah Arendt, trans. by Harry Zorn (London: HarperCollins, 1992)
- Benjamin, Walter, 'N [Re the Theory of Knowledge, Theory of Progress]', in *Benjamin: Philosophy, Aesthetics, History*, ed. by Gary Smith (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1989)
- Bennett, Alice, *Afterlife and Narrative in Contemporary Fiction* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012)
- Berger, John, *A Fortunate Man* (London: Granta Books, 1989)
- Bernstein, Stephen, 'Auster's Sublime Closure', in *Beyond the Red Notebook: Essays on Paul Auster*, ed. by Dennis Barone (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press)
- Billier, Maxim, *Inside the Head of Bruno Schulz*, trans. by Anthea Bell (London: Pushkin Press, 2015)
- Blanchot, Maurice, *The Instant of My Death*, trans. by Elizabeth Rottenberg (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2000)
- Blanchot, Maurice, *The Space of Literature*, trans. by Ann Smock (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1982)

- Boldrini, Lucia, *Autobiographies of Others: Historical Subjects and Literary Fiction* (London: Routledge, 2012)
- Budick, Emily Miller, *The Subject of Holocaust Fiction* (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2015)
- Bull, Malcolm, *Seeing Things Hidden: Apocalypse, Vision and Totality* (London: Verso, 1999)
- Cacciari, Massimo, *Posthumous People: Vienna at the Turning Point*, trans. by Rodger Friedman (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996)
- Cadava, Eduardo, *Words of Light: Theses on the Photography of History* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997)
- Casares, Adolfo Bioy, *The Invention of Morel*, trans. by Ruth L.C. Simms (New York: New York Review Books, 1964)
- Castricano, Jodey, *Cryptomimesis: The Gothic and Jacques Derrida's Ghost Writing* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2001)
- Chabon, Michael, *The Amazing Adventures of Kavalier & Clay* (London: Fourth Estate, 2008)
- Chabon, Michael, *The Amazing Adventures of the Escapist* (New York: Dark Horse 2004)
- Chabon, Michael, *The Final Solution* (London: Harper Perennial, 2008)
- Currie, Mark, *About Time: Narrative, Fiction and the Philosophy of Time* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press: 2012)
- Currie, Mark, *The Unexpected: Narrative Temporality and the Philosophy of Surprise* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2015)
- Davenport, Guy, 'The Hunter Gracchus,' in *The Hunter Gracchus and Other Papers on Literature and Art* (Washington, D.C.: Counterpoint, 1997)
- de Certeau, Michel, *Heterologies: Discourse on the Other*, trans. by Brian Massumi (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2010)
- de Certeau, Michel, *The Writing of History*, trans. by Tom Conley (New York: Columbia University Press, 1988)
- de Man, Paul, *Allegories of Reading: Figural Language in Rousseau, Nietzsche, Rilke and Proust* (New Haven: Connecticut, 1979)
- de Man, Paul, *The Rhetoric of Romanticism* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1984)
- Derrida, Jacques, *Archive Fever: A Freudian Impression*, trans. by Eric Prenowitz (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996).
- Derrida, Jacques, *The Ear of the Other*, trans. by Peggy Kamuf (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1988)
- Derrida, Jacques, 'Foreword: *Fors*: The English Words of Nicolas Abraham and Maria Torok', trans. by Barbara Johnson, in Abraham, Nicolas and Torok, Maria, *The Wolf Man's Magic Word: A Cryptonymy*, trans. by Nicholas Rand (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986)
- Derrida, Jacques, *Memoires for Paul de Man*, trans. by Cecile Lindsay, Jonathan Culler, Eduardo Cadava and Peggy Kamuf (New York: Columbia University Press, 1989 revised edition)
- Derrida, Jacques, *Of Grammatology*, trans. by Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1976)
- Derrida, Jacques, *Psyche: Inventions of the Other*, vol. ii, trans. by Ruben Berezdivin and Peggy Kamuf (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2007)
- Derrida, Jacques, *Specters of Marx: The State of the Debt, the Work of Mourning & the New International*, trans. by Peggy Kamuf (London: Routledge, 1994)
- Derrida, Jacques, *Speech and Phenomena and Other Essays on Husserl's Theory of Signs*, trans. by David B. Allison and Newton Garver (Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1973)

- Derrida, Jacques, *The Work of Mourning*, trans. by Pascale-Anne Brault and Michael Naas (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2001)
- Derrida, Jacques, *Writing and Difference*, trans. by Alan Bass (London: Routledge, 2001)
- Erol, Sibel, 'The Chronotope of Istanbul in Orhan Pamuk's Memoir *Istanbul*', *International Journal of Middle Eastern Studies*, vol. 43, issue 4 (2011)
- Felman, Shoshana, *Testimony: Crises of Witnessing in Literature, Psychoanalysis, and History*, co-authored with Dori Laub (London: Routledge, 1992)
- Ficowski, Jerzy, 'Mimesis', in *Waiting for the Dog to Sleep*, trans. by Soren A. Gauger and Marcin Piekoszewski (Prague: Twisted Spoon Press, 2006)
- Ficowski, Jerzy, *Regions of the Great Heresy: Bruno Schulz, a Biographical Portrait*, trans. by Theodosia Robertson (New York: Norton, 2003)
- Fenton, James, 'On Statues', in *Leonardo's Nephew* (London: Penguin Books, 1999)
- Foer, Jonathan Safran, Foreword, in Bruno Schulz, *The Street of Crocodiles and Other Stories*, trans. by Celina Wieniewska (London: Penguin, 2008)
- Foer, Jonathan Safran, *Everything is Illuminated* (London: Penguin Books, 2003)
- Foer, Jonathan Safran, *Extremely Loud and Incredibly Close* (London: Penguin Books, 2006)
- Foer, Jonathan Safran, *Tree of Codes* (London: Visual Editions, 2010)
- Freud, Sigmund, 'Mourning and Melancholia', in *On Murder, Mourning and Melancholia*, trans. by Shaun Whiteside (London: Penguin Books, 2005)
- Freud, Sigmund, *Standard Edition*, vol. iii, *Early Psychoanalytic Publications (1893-1899)*, trans. by James Strachey (London: Vintage, 2001)
- Freud, Sigmund, *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud*, vol. ix, *Jensen's 'Gradiva' and Other Works (1906-1908)*, trans. by James Strachey (London: Vintage, 2001)
- Freud, Sigmund, *The Standard Edition of the Complete Works of Sigmund Freud*, vol. xvii, *An Infantile Neurosis and Other Works*, trans. by James Strachey (London: Vintage, 2001)
- Freud, Sigmund, *The Uncanny*, trans. by David McLintock (London: Penguin Books, 2003)
- Frier, David, *The Novels of José Saramago: Echoes From the Past, Pathways Into the Future* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2007)
- Gautier, Théophile, 'The Tourist', in *My Fantoms*, trans. by Richard Holmes (New York: New York Review Books, 2008),
- Genette, Gérard, *Narrative Discourse: An Essay in Method*, trans. by Jane E. Lewin (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1983)
- Gordon, Jaimy, 'The Strange Afterlife of Bruno Schulz', *Michigan Quarterly Review*, vol. xliii, issue 1, Winter 2004 [online, last accessed 19/2/18]
- Gray de Castro, Mariana (ed.), *Fernando Pessoa's Modernity Without Frontiers: Influences* (Suffolk: Boydell & Brewer, 2013).
- Green, André, *Time in Psychoanalysis: Some Contradictory Aspects*, trans. by Andrew Weller (London: Free Association Books, 2002)
- Grossman, David, *See Under: Love*, trans. by Betsy Rosenberg (London: Vintage, 1999)
- Grosz, Elizabeth, *The Nick of Time: Politics, Evolution and the Untimely* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2004)
- Hirsch, Marianne, *The Generation of Postmemory: Writing and Visual Culture After the Holocaust* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2012)
- Jackson, Kevin, *Invisible Forms: A Guide to Literary Curiosities* (New York: St Martin's Press, 2000)
- Jameson, Fredric, *Archaeologies of the Future: The Desire Called Utopia and Other Science Fictions* (London: Verso, 2005)
- Jensen, Wilhelm, *Gradiva*, trans. by Helen M. Downey (Copenhagen and Los Angeles: Green Integer, 2003)

- Kafka, Franz, 'In the Penal Colony', in *Franz Kafka: The Complete Stories*, trans. by Willa and Edwin Muir (New York: Schocken Books, 1971)
- Kermode, Frank, *The Sense of an Ending: Studies in the Theory of Fiction with a New Epilogue* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000)
- Kotowicz, Zbigniew, *Fernando Pessoa: Voices of a Nomadic Soul* (London: Menard Press, 1996)
- Krauss, Nicole, *Great House* (London: Penguin Books, 2011)
- Krauss, Nicole, *The History of Love* (London: Penguin Books, 2006)
- Lee, Hermione, 'How to End it All', in *Body Parts: Essays on Life-Writing* (London: Pimlico, 2008)
- Lee, Hermione, *Virginia Woolf* (London: Chatto & Windus, 1996)
- Lévi-Strauss, Claude, *The Origin of Table Manners*, trans. by John Weightmann and Doreen Weightmann (New York: Harper and Row, 1979)
- Lichtenstein, Rachel, *Rodinsky's Room*, co-written by Iain Sinclair (London: Granta Books, 2000)
- Lippit, Akira Mizuta, *Atomic Light (Shadow Optics)* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press 2005)
- Loeb, Paul S., *The Death of Zarathustra* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2010)
- Lukacher, Ned, *Primal Scenes: Literature, Philosophy, Psychoanalysis* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1988)
- Lyotard, Jean-François, *Le Différend* (Paris: Éd. de Minuit, 1983)
- Machado de Assis, Joaquim Maria, *Epitaph of a Small Winner*, trans. by William L. Grossman (London: Bloomsbury, 1997)
- McHale, Brian, *Postmodernist Fiction* (New York: Methuen, 1987)
- Meyrink, Gustav, *The Golem*, trans. by Mike Mitchell (Cambridgeshire: Dedalus, 2010)
- Müller, Heiner, 'Glücksgott' (1958), quoted in Lutz Niethammer, *Posthistoire: Has History Come to an End?*, trans. by Patrick Camiller (London: Verso, 1992)
- Nancy, Jean-Luc, *The Ground of the Image*, trans. by Jeff Fort (New York: Fordham University Press, 2005)
- Niethammer, Lutz, *Posthistoire: Has History Come to an End?*, trans. by Patrick Camiller (London: Verso, 1992)
- Nietzsche, Friedrich, *The Gay Science*, trans. by Josefine Nauckhoff (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001)
- Ozick, Cynthia, *The Messiah of Stockholm* (New York: Random House, 1988)
- Ozick, Cynthia, 'The Posthumous Sublime', in *Quarrel & Quandary* (New York: Knopf, 2000)
- Ozick, Cynthia, 'The Phantasmagoria of Bruno Schulz', in *Art & Ardor* (New York: E. P. Dutton, 1984)
- Pamuk, Orhan, *The New Life*, trans. by Güneli Gün (London: Faber and Faber, 1998)
- Pamuk, Orhan, 'Museums and Novels', in *The Naive and the Sentimental Novelist*, trans. by Nazim Dikbaş (London: Faber and Faber, 2011)
- Pamuk, Orhan, *The Museum of Innocence*, trans. by Maureen Freely (London: Faber and Faber, 2010)
- Pamuk, Orhan, *The Black Book*, trans. by Maureen Freely (London: Faber and Faber, 2006)
- Pamuk, Orhan, *My Name is Red*, trans. by Erdag M. Goknar (London: Faber and Faber, 2001)
- Perec, Georges, *Portrait of a Man*, trans. by David Bellos (London: MacLehose Press, 2014)
- Perec, Georges, *W or the Memory of Childhood*, trans. by David Bellos (London: Collins Harvill, 1988)

- Pessoa, Fernando, *Poems of Fernando Pessoa*, trans. by Edwin Honig and Susan M. Brown (San Francisco: City Lights Books, 1998)
- Pessoa, Fernando, *The Book of Disquiet*, trans. by Richard Zenith (London: Penguin, 2002)
- Poe, Edgar Allan, 'The Murders in the Rue Morgue', in *The Fall of the House of Usher and Other Writings* (London: Penguin Books, 2003)
- Rank, Otto, *The Double: A Psychoanalytic Study*, trans. by Harry Tucker Jr. (Chapel Hill: The University of Carolina Press, 1971)
- Rank, Otto, *The Trauma of Birth*, trans. unknown (New York: Robert Brunner, 1952)
- Richter, Gerhard, 'Introduction: Benjamin's Ghosts', in *Benjamin's Ghosts: Interventions in Contemporary Literature and Cultural Theory*, ed. by Gerhard Richter (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2002)
- Ricoeur, Paul, *Memory, History, Forgetting*, trans. by Kathleen Blamey and David Pellauer (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006)
- Ricoeur, Paul, *Time and Narrative*, vol. ii, trans. by Kathleen McLaughlin and David Pellauer (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1985)
- Ricoeur, Paul, *Time and Narrative*, vol. iii, trans. by Kathleen Blamey and David Pellauer (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990)
- Renger, Almut-Barbara, *Oedipus and the Sphinx: The Threshold Myth from Sophocles through Freud to Cocteau*, trans. by Duncan Alexander Smart and David Rice, with John T. Hamilton (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2013)
- Rose, Louis, *The Survival of Images: Art Historians, Psychoanalysts, and the Ancients* (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 2001)
- Rosenheim, Shawn James, *The Cryptographic Imagination* (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1997)
- Roth, Michael, *Psycho-Analysis as History: Negation and Freedom in Freud* (Ithaca: Cornell University, 1995)
- Roth, Philip, *The Prague Orgy* (London: Vintage, 1995)
- Santner, Eric L., *On Creaturely Life: Rilke, Benjamin, Sebald* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006)
- Saramago, José, *The Double*, trans. by Margaret Jull Costa (London: Vintage, 2005)
- Saramago, José, *The Year of the Death of Ricardo Reis*, trans. by Giovanni Pontiero (London: Harvill, 1998)
- Saunders, Max, *Self Impression: Life-Writing, Autobiografiction, and the Forms of Modern Literature* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013)
- Schulz, Bruno, *The Street of Crocodiles and Other Stories*, trans. by Celina Wieniewska (London: Penguin, 2008)
- Sebald, W. G., *Austerlitz*, trans. by Anthea Bell (London, Penguin Books, 2011)
- Sebald, W. G., *Vertigo*, trans. by Michael Hulse (London: Harvill, 2000)
- Sinclair, Iain, *American Smoke* (London: Penguin Books, 2014)
- Sinclair, Iain, *Rodinsky's Room*, co-written by Rachel Lichtenstein (London: Granta Books, 2000)
- Smith, Robert, *Derrida and Autobiography* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995)
- Sternberg, Meir, 'Telling in Time: Chronology, Teleology, Narrativity', *Poetics Today*, vol. 13, no. 3 (1992)
- Steiner, George, 'The Archives of Eden', in *No Passion Spent* (London: Faber and Faber, 1997)
- Suleiman, Susan Rubin, *Crises of Memory and the Second World War* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2006)
- Tabucchi, Antonio, 'The Last Three Days of Fernando Pessoa', in *Dreams of Dreams*, trans. by Nancy J. Peters (San Francisco: City Lights, 1992)

- Tambling, Jeremy, *Becoming Posthumous: Life and Death in Literary and Cultural Studies* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2001)
- Tarkovsky, Andrei, *Sculpting in Time*, trans. by Kitty Hunter-Blair (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1998)
- Thomas, Edward, *The Childhood of Edward Thomas: A Fragment of Autobiography* (London: Faber and Faber, 1983)
- Thomas, Sophie, *Romanticism and Visuality: Fragments, History, Spectacle* (New York: Routledge, 2008)
- Todorov, Tzvetan, 'The Typology of Detective Fiction,' in *Modern Criticism and Theory: A Reader*, 2nd edn., ed. by David Lodge with Nigel Wood (Harlow: Pearson Education, 2000)
- Warburg, Aby, *The Renewal of Pagan Antiquity*, trans. by David Britt (Los Angeles: Getty Research Institute, 1999)
- Wigley, Mark, *The Architecture of Deconstruction* (Cambridge, Ma.: MIT Press, 1995)
- Woodward, Christopher, *In Ruins* (London, Vintage, 2002)
- Wright, Patrick, *A Journey Through Ruins: The Last Days of London* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009)
- Yerushalmi, Yosef Hayim, *Freud's Moses* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1991)